

UiO : **Faculty of Law**
University of Oslo

The gendering of counter- terrorism

The role of women and women's rights organizations in promoting a
gender-sensitive counter-terrorism strategy in Indonesia

Candidate number: 8021

Advisor: Tore Lindholm

Submission deadline: 15.05.2017

Number of words: 19,873



Table of contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS I

ABBREVIATIONS III

1 INTRODUCTION.....1

 1.1.1 Aim and research question2

 1.1.2 Operationalization, definitions and limitations3

2 BACKGROUND5

2.1 Counter-terrorism and women in a global perspective5

 2.1.1 The Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy5

 2.1.2 The Women, Peace, and Security Agenda6

 2.1.3 The Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of human rights and
 fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism7

2.2 Terrorism, counter-terrorism, and women in Indonesia9

 2.2.1 Indonesia’s counter-terrorism strategy9

 2.2.2 Civil Society Participation11

 2.2.3 The radicalization of Indonesian women12

 2.2.4 The position of international law in Indonesia13

2.3 Why Indonesia must incorporate a gender lens in counter-terrorism13

 2.3.1 Efficiency14

 2.3.2 Legality15

3 THEORY17

3.1 Feminist approach17

3.2 Literature and previous research18

4 METHODOLOGY21

4.1 Research design21

4.2 Data collection22

 4.2.1 Sampling22

 4.2.2 Conducting the interviews23

4.3 Data analysis24

4.4 Reliability, validity, and generalizability25

5 EMPIRICAL ANALYSIS27

5.1	An issue of trust: The woman-to-woman connection	27
5.1.1	De-radicalization and vocational training for women by women	28
5.1.2	Lack of women in law enforcement	31
5.2	Fighting for attention: women’s rights as a non-issue	36
5.2.1	Lack of political will and attention	37
5.2.2	Gender blind spots	39
5.3	Stereotypes: Women as non-threatening	43
5.3.1	Women activists receiving ‘special treatment’	43
5.3.2	Harmful gender stereotypes	45
6	CONCLUSION	48
6.1	Recommendations and further research	49
	LIST OF REFERENCES*	51
	APPENDICES	63
	Appendix 1: Interview guide	63
	Appendix 2: List of informants	65

Abbreviations

BNPT	<i>Badan Nasional Penanggulangan Terorisme</i> (Indonesian National Counter-Terrorism Agency)
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women
CTC	United Nations Security Council Counter-Terrorism Committee
CVE	Countering Violent Extremism
Densus 88	Special Detachment 88
Fatayat NU	The Young Women of NU
FKPT	<i>Forum Koordinasi Pencegahan Terorisme</i> (Terrorism Prevention Coordination Forum)
FST	Feminist Security Theory
GCTF	Global Counterterrorism Forum
IS	Islamic State
Komnas HAM	<i>Komisi Nasional Hak Asasi Manusia</i> (National Commission on Human Rights)
Komnas Perempuan	<i>Komisi Nasional Anti Kekerasan Terhadap Perempuan</i> (National Commission on Violence against Women)
NGO	Non-governmental organization
NU	Nahdlatul Ulama
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
OSCE	Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
SAVE	Sisters Against Violent Extremism
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
WPS	Women, Peace and Security

1 Introduction

The recent arrests of a handful of female terrorist suspects, including would-be suicide bombers, in Indonesia have left the nation perplexed about the growing role of women in local terrorist networks.¹ While the participation of women in terrorism around the world is not a new phenomenon,² the number of female terrorists and suicide bombers has increased “several hundredfold in the past few years.”³ Yet, the roles of women as they relate to terrorism and counter-terrorism issues still remain generally unexplored by policymakers and international counter-terrorism actors.⁴ Observers have instead pointed out how terrorism and counter-terrorism tend to be seen primarily as a male issue, among people in general as well as governments.⁵ This is despite the fact that it is generally recognized that the human rights of women and girls are in fact disproportionately affected by acts of extremism and terrorism.⁶ As a result, we are left with significant knowledge gaps regarding the roles of women as terrorists as well as counter-terrorism and security actors, and how the struggle for women’s human rights relates to the struggle to counter terrorism and violent extremism.

Such knowledge gaps underscore the need for more research on the complex relationship between gender and counter-terrorism. This is also reflected in the gradual push for the introduction of a gender dimension into the United Nations Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy, as illustrated by the adoption of several resolutions in recent years.⁷ The Counter-Terrorism Committee (CTC) put these issues on the table in 2015 when it held an open briefing on ‘The Role of Women in Countering Terrorism and Violent Extremism,’ during which the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) expressed concerns about the adverse impacts that counter-terrorism policies and strategies might have on women’s human rights and women human rights defenders.⁸ As these issues—and a subsequent discussion of adopting gender-sensitive and human rights-compliant approaches to countering terrorism—are increasingly being put on the international agenda, the present thesis will focus on an examination of the specific case of Indonesia. The recent trend of Indonesian women joining militant terrorist groups is described as part of a global shift in strategy used by groups such as the

¹ Jakarta Post, Hanifah (2016), Halim et.al. (2016).

² See e.g. Lavina (2015) 5-8; Wienberg and Eubank (2011).

³ Bloom (2011) preface.

⁴ Fink et.al (2013).

⁵ See e.g. Satterthwaite and Huckerby (2013), Aoláin (2013) 2.

⁶ United States Institute of Peace (2015) 15.

⁷ See section 2.1.

⁸ OHCHR (2015).

so-called Islamic State (IS).⁹ This trend also coincides with concerns about the recent rise of fundamentalism in Indonesia, a subsequent push for more robust anti-terrorism legislation and measures, and the ongoing debate regarding proposed amendments to the country's anti-terrorism law. Significantly, the debate has also included voices that call for the active engagement of women in countering terrorism and radicalization, and the urgent need to include a gender dimension in Indonesia's counter-terrorism policy design.¹⁰ A case study analysis of the gendering of counter-terrorism in Indonesia should therefore be expected to add to the understanding of the interplay between women's rights and counter-terrorism, including specific benefits and challenges to incorporating a gender lens in counter-terrorism strategies. An incorporated gender lens would require the strategy to approach counter-terrorism measures by paying particular attention to the potentially different ways that women and men are or might be impacted.¹¹ In order to get an in-depth understanding of this process within the Indonesian context, the present thesis will approach the topic by examining the situation for women and women's rights organizations working in the context of counter-terrorism in Indonesia. Thus, the thesis is based on the premise that the incorporation of a gender lens will increase the efficiency and human rights compliance of Indonesia's counter-terrorism strategy, and that this requires the effective and safe participation of women and women's rights organizations.

1.1.1 Aim and research question

In light of the identified knowledge gaps the present thesis will examine the current situation regarding gender and counter-terrorism in Indonesia. The thesis will focus its data collection on the experiences of Indonesian female non-governmental organization (NGO) workers and women's rights activists, and their understanding of the role they play in countering terrorism. In doing so, the aim of the thesis is to contribute to the overall discussion of integrating a gender dimension into counter-terrorism strategies, and add to the understanding of gender-awareness as a tool to securing human rights. The thesis will not conduct a doctrinal analysis, but instead attempt to identify and analyze specific ways that women and women's rights groups contribute to a more gender-sensitive and thus human rights compliant counter-terrorism strategy. Secondly, it will attempt to identify and analyze possible constraints on their work and participation in countering terrorism, which will illustrate the shortcomings of the current strategy and the factors that hinder the incorporation of a gender lens.

⁹ The Jakarta Post, Hanifah (2016).

¹⁰ Ibid; The Jakarta Post, Anindya (2017)

¹¹ Neimanis (2005) 131.

Against this background, the aim of the present thesis is therefore to answer the following question: *Are women and women's rights organizations contributing to a more human rights compliant counter-terrorism strategy in Indonesia, and are they facing gender-specific challenges and barriers that hinder the incorporation of a gender lens in that strategy?*

In order to properly answer and address the research question, the following sub-questions will be considered throughout the study: 1. In what specific ways do female NGO workers promote and protect women's rights in the context of counter-terrorism? 2. Is Indonesia's current counter-terrorism strategy interfering with its obligations to protect women's human rights? 3. Do gendered challenges and barriers to the efficient participation of women and women's organizations exist?

1.1.2 Operationalization, definitions and limitations

Naturally, the time and resource constraints of the current thesis do not allow for a detailed discussion and identification of an exhaustive list of factors describing and affecting women's rights activists' role in countering terrorism in Indonesia. As such, the thesis will limit its scope to a discussion of the most significant findings as determined by the analysis of the collected data.

As the analysis will focus explicitly on counter-terrorism measures and not terrorism in itself, a discussion of the definition of terrorism is not necessary for the present study. However, it is important to note that the international community has so far been unable to agree on a common definition of terrorism.¹² In the current thesis, the use of 'terrorism' refers to the threat of domestic terrorism in Indonesia as posed by Islamist extremism. The term 'counter-terrorism' is operationalized as including all measures that are considered a part of the overall aim of countering terrorism, including prevention, de-radicalization (moving away from radical ideology), and reintegration. As such, it also entails the countering of violent extremism (CVE).¹³

The thesis subscribes to the definition of gender as not being synonymous with sex, but instead as the term "used to connote those roles, attributes, and capabilities that are socially assigned along the lines of sex and are co-constructed with other forms of identity and difference in a given context."¹⁴ It views gender as socially constructed, and therefore as inherently social and evidently political. Thus, 'gender-specific challenges' are operationalized as chal-

¹² UNGA Res 60/288 (2006).

¹³ Holmer (2013) 2.

¹⁴ Huckerby and Satterthwaite (2013): 5.

lenges faced by individuals based on their assigned gender, but also gender-specific factors that challenge and hinder the development of a gender-sensitive counter-terrorism approach. As this study is focusing on the experiences of individuals that affiliate with and are being perceived as women, such challenges will be limited to those that are based on the premise of being a woman, both for the subjects of this study and the groups that they are trying to assist. While the wider discussion of gender, security, and counter-terrorism involves the consideration of every aspect of gender, including sexual minorities, the current time and space restrictions of the thesis only allows for a focus on women. Furthermore, the incorporation of a 'gender lens' refers to the concept of integrating a gender-sensitive approach, which requires sensitivity to how women and women's human rights are affected by specific factors in a given context and an understanding of how to remedy their grievances. Incorporating a gender lens into a domestic counter-terrorism strategy therefore requires it to develop sensitivity to gendered drivers of radicalization, gendered grievances and motivations that fuel radicalization and extremism, and the specific needs of women in the context of counter-terrorism.

As such, the focus on women's rights organizations is based on the assumption that their understanding of gendered grievances and commitment to women's rights is vital to the development of a gender lens in this context. The thesis defines such NGOs as "self-governing, private, not-for-profit organizations that are geared to improving the quality of life for disadvantaged people,"¹⁵ and focuses on NGOs that are working to promote women's rights. While there are many different layers and components to the inclusion and participation of women in counter-terrorism, the analysis limits itself to one specific aspect of these components by focusing on the experiences of female NGO workers and activists.

¹⁵ Vakil (1997) 2060.

2 Background

This chapter will outline the background and context of the topic at hand, by discussing the issue of women and counter-terrorism on an international level as well as on a domestic level in Indonesia. The first section will examine the international agenda and normative framework on women and counter-terrorism as provided by the UN system, while the following section will provide a short discussion of the Indonesian counter-terrorism strategy, the attitude towards the inclusion of civil society, the radicalization of Indonesian women, and the status of international law in the Indonesian legal system.

2.1 Counter-terrorism and women in a global perspective

2.1.1 The Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy

Following the events of September 11, 2001, the UN Security Council passed resolution 1373 and effectively ordered Member States to “take the necessary steps to prevent the commission of terrorist acts.”¹⁶ In order to monitor the Member States’ implementation of such counter-terrorism efforts, the resolution also created the Counter-Terrorism Committee (CTC). The resolution marked the first time that the Council used its authority under Chapter VII of the UN Charter to pass binding resolutions on Member States, and it has been described as a ‘super-resolution’ as its mandatory requirements coupled with its perceived political weight for states makes compliance with the resolution a high priority.¹⁷ While this initial resolution received criticism for failing to stress the importance of human rights compliance while taking such steps, subsequent resolutions and statements have clarified that domestic counter-terrorism measures must be created in conformity with international human rights law.¹⁸ However, none of the positive and specific obligations regarding state behavior set forth by the resolution involved gender, the protection of women, or the impact that the counter-terrorism agenda would have on women. This was also the case when the Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy (hereinafter the Global Strategy) was adopted by the General Assembly in 2006, establishing the four pillars of the global operational framework to counter terrorism.¹⁹ However, a subsequent resolution adopted at the fourth biennial review of the Global Strategy encourages Member States, UN agencies, and international and regional organizations to “consider the participation of women in efforts to prevent and counter terrorism.”²⁰ This was also reflected in the Security Council resolution on the threat posed by foreign terrorist fighters, in which the Council significantly recognized the need to empower women as a mitigat-

¹⁶ UNSC Res 1373 (2001) para. 2(b).

¹⁷ Aoláin (2016) 9.

¹⁸ See, e.g., UNSC Res 1456 (2003) para 6; UNSC Res 1624 (2005) para 4.

¹⁹ UNGA Res 60/288 (2006).

²⁰ UNGA Res 68/276 (2014) 3.

ing factor to the increase of violent extremism and radicalization.²¹ Also emphasizing the obligations to protect women's rights, the General Assembly adopted resolution 68/178 on the protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism, which called on Member States "to shape, review and implement all counter-terrorism measures in accordance with the principles of gender equality and non-discrimination."²² Furthermore, in its Presidential Statement of October 2014, the Security Council encouraged Member States to engage with women and women's organizations in developing counter-terrorism strategies.²³ As a first step in meeting these requirements, the CTC held its first open briefing on *The Role of Women in Countering Terrorism and Violent Extremism* in 2015. The briefing included testimonies from women's rights activists from regions affected by terrorism and violent extremism, as well as statements from Member States and others.²⁴

2.1.2 The Women, Peace, and Security Agenda

Meanwhile, a year prior to the adoption of resolution 1373, the Security Council adopted a resolution on women, peace, and security. Resolution 1325 stressed the importance of women's participation in efforts for peace, the need to incorporate gender perspectives in the UN's peace and security strategies, and efforts to protect women and girls from gender-based violence.²⁵ In achieving this aim, the resolution stresses the need for an increase of representation of women in decision-making roles in organizations at national and international levels, including in the military and law enforcement fields.²⁶ It was the first resolution to address the disproportionate and unique impacts of armed conflict on women—simultaneously marking the first time that the UN has taken formal action on gender issues—and the first of the currently eight resolutions that make up the Women, Peace, and Security Agenda (WPS).²⁷ For many women's rights activists, the resolution was the finale of many years of activism aimed at international efforts addressing women's experience of war and conflict.²⁸ While the initial resolution did not expressly mention terrorism, the most recent of the subsequent resolutions did exactly that. Security Council resolution 2242, adopted unanimously in 2015, addresses the substantive links between women's participation and sustainable peace and security, including in the countering of violent extremism and terrorism. Noticeably, a record number of states (68) gave statements during the Security Council debate, as well as the North Atlantic

²¹ UNSC Res 2178 (2014).

²² UNGA Res 68/178 (2014): 5.

²³ UNSC Presidential Statement 21 (2014).

²⁴ UNSC Counter-Terrorism Committee (2016).

²⁵ UNSC Res 1325 (2000).

²⁶ *Ibid.*

²⁷ See UN Peacekeeping (no date).

²⁸ Nesiah (2013): 127.

Treaty Organization, the League of Arab States, the African Union, and others.²⁹ The resolution includes commitments to integrate a gender analysis on the drivers and impacts of terrorism and counter-terrorism, including the impacts of counter-terrorism strategies on women's human rights and women's organizations. It furthermore urges States and the UN to ensure the participation and leadership of women and women's organizations in developing strategies to counter terrorism and violent extremism.³⁰

By explicitly requesting the CTC and the Counter-Terrorism Committee Executive Directorate to “integrate gender as a cross-cutting issue throughout the activities,”³¹ the resolution effectively co-opted the WPS agenda as a part of the counter-terrorism agenda and expanded the WPS agenda to include women in the counterterrorism domain. Some critics have argued that the prioritization and execution of this requirement remains unlikely at both state and international levels, and that we should be cautious about the risk of turning the WPS agenda into nothing more than a security instrument.³² In other words, there is the possibility that the absorption of the WPS agenda into the counter-terrorism agenda could ‘instrumentalize’ women's rights, by viewing them as an instrumental tool for countering extremism instead of an end in and of themselves. Furthermore, such an instrumentalist approach might also provide opportunities for women's rights to be bartered away, should it be seen as beneficial to further national security in a given context.³³ The 2015 Global Study on the Implementation of United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325 echoed this, and stressed that the empowerment of women should “never be part of Chapter VII of the Charter on the use of force.”³⁴ Instead, emphasis should be placed on respecting the autonomy of local women peace activists and civil society organizations. Noticeably, in the survey that was undertaken among civil society organizations for the Global Study, 84 percent of the respondents considered violent extremism and counter-terrorism as the emerging issues of concern.³⁵

2.1.3 The Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism

The UN Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism (hereinafter the Special Rapporteur) has also outlined

²⁹ UNSC SC/12076 (2015).

³⁰ UNSC Res 2242 (2015) para 13.

³¹ Ibid para 11.

³² See e.g., Aoláin (2016): 4. This is also reflected in the study on the US and UK experiences mentioned in section 1.1.

³³ Huckerby (2015).

³⁴ UN Women (2015) 229.

³⁵ *ibid* 20.

and identified issues and risks regarding women's rights and counter-terrorism. In the resolutions outlining the mandate of the Special Rapporteur, the Human Rights Council requested that he, *inter alia*, "integrate a gender perspective throughout the work of his/her mandate."³⁶ Accordingly, particularly two reports presented by the Special Rapporteur have dealt explicitly with the issue of gender, violent extremism, and counter-terrorism. Most significantly, the 2009 annual thematic report to the General Assembly thoroughly confronted the gender dimensions of terrorism and counter-terrorism. The report notes that states are required to ensure the rights to gender equality and non-discrimination independently of countering terrorism, but that a gender perspective is also integral to countering the conditions conducive to the growth of extremism and terrorism.³⁷ It also stresses that women are not only victims of terrorism and counter-terrorism measures, but also terrorists and "should be considered as key stakeholders in counter-terrorism measures" and that it is "important to appreciate that women have a role in the design and implementation of counter-terrorism measures."³⁸ Significantly, the report also identified challenges posed by restrictive terrorism financing laws that restrict donations to women's rights organizations and undermine their work.³⁹ The governments' massive political attack and backlash against the report⁴⁰ illustrated how states have resisted applying a gender lens to their counter-terrorism practices, and suggests that implementing such gender lenses is not a straightforward process in many states.

The more recent 2016 annual thematic report to the Human Rights Council by the Special Rapporteur also included a section concerning violent extremism and gender, noting "that efforts to include women have tended to emphasize their engagement only at the informal or local level and often in ways that use and reinforce gender stereotypes."⁴¹ Such stereotypes include a focus on women as victims of terrorism and as mothers, instead of agents of terrorism or counter-terrorism. The Special Rapporteur also referenced the risk of instrumentalizing women's engagement, as mentioned above, and underlined the risk of backlash against gender equality and women's rights defenders in situations where women's rights become identified with a broader agenda. Hence, the way in which women and women's rights are included in counter-terrorism strategies matter.

³⁶ HRC Res 6/28 (2007) para. 2(c).

³⁷ The Special Rapporteur A/64/211 (2009) para. 32.

³⁸ A/64/211 (2009) para. 46 - 47.

³⁹ *ibid* para. 42.

⁴⁰ Cheinin (2013) xiii: The UN General Assembly decided to delete all references to the report from its annual resolution on human rights and counter-terrorism.

⁴¹ The Special Rapporteur A/HRC/31/65 (2016) para. 53.

2.2 Terrorism, counter-terrorism, and women in Indonesia

2.2.1 Indonesia's counter-terrorism strategy

Indonesia has experienced a remarkable transition towards electoral democracy and the rule of law since the fall of Suharto's authoritarian regime in 1998. Their role in international and regional affairs has increased, and they have signed a significant amount of international treaties including most of the core human rights instruments.⁴² However, serious challenges remain including widespread corruption and insufficient accountability in the police and the justice system.⁴³ In addition to self-determination movements in the regions of Aceh and Papua, the new democratic regime has faced the challenge of militant Islamic groups that have carried out several terror attacks. Such attacks include the 2002 Bali bombing, the 2003 Marriott Hotel bombing, the 2004 Australian Embassy bombing, the 2005 Bali bombing, the 2009 simultaneous bombings of Marriott Hotel and the Ritz Carlton Hotel, and most recently the January 2016 attacks in Jakarta.⁴⁴ The country is currently facing a growth of religious conservatism and a rise in the visibility of Islamist hardline organizations such as the Islamic Defenders Front (FPI).⁴⁵ Shortly following the 2002 Bali bombing, the government issued an anti-terrorism regulation, which was confirmed by the legislature in 2003.⁴⁶ However, a much-debated draft revision of the terrorism bill is currently tabled at the House of Representatives. The heated debate has mostly focused on the inclusion of an official role for the Indonesian Military (TNI) in countering terrorism, which some critics are worried could potentially challenge Indonesia's protection of human rights and its criminal justice system.⁴⁷ The supporters of the draft are pushing for a stronger terrorism law, and the strengthening of the counter-terrorism units.⁴⁸

The Indonesian National Counter-Terrorist Agency (BNPT) and the elite counter-terrorism police unit Special Detachment 88 (Densus 88), established in the aftermath of the 2002 Bali bombings, head the Indonesian counter-terrorism efforts.⁴⁹ The BNPT reports directly to the president, and is in charge of formulating the national strategy, policy, and program on counter-terrorism, as well as coordinating terrorism-related information and intelligence among stakeholder agencies.⁵⁰ The Indonesian strategy is frequently described as 'holistic' in nature,

⁴² Lecarte (2014).

⁴³ Horowitz (2013) 207-260.

⁴⁴ Time, Rivett-Carnac (2016).

⁴⁵ ABC News, Harvey (2017).

⁴⁶ Law No 15 (2003). For a detailed outline of the legislation, see Ramraj (2012).

⁴⁷ The Jakarta Post, Araf and Evitarossi (2017); Dewi (2016); Human Rights Watch (2016).

⁴⁸ The Jakarta Post, Ramadhani (2017).

⁴⁹ ICCT, Hasan (2011). Australia and the US assist in the training of Densus 88.

⁵⁰ US Department of State (2016).

as it has gradually developed into a model that comprises both ‘hard’ and ‘soft’ measures. Firstly, the ‘hard approach’ remains a key measure and is not without controversy. Densus 88 has reportedly arrested 1,000 alleged terrorists and militants since its establishment, and its use of lethal force has resulted in the deaths of numerous suspects during raids and in custody.⁵¹ Questions have been raised by human rights organizations, at home and abroad, calling for investigations of alleged human rights violations and police accountability.⁵² Still, the anti-terrorism unit has been described as one of the most successful counter-terrorism groups in the world, having prevented and foiled at least 54 plots or attacks since 2010.⁵³

Secondly, a ‘soft approach’ is deployed through various de-radicalization measures that specifically target the individual perpetrator. The police has also achieved a degree of success with these largely *ad hoc* programs for detainees in prisons, which have resulted in a significant number of former militants working with the police in de-radicalization efforts.⁵⁴ The BNPT outlined this approach in its ‘Deradicalization Blueprint,’ finalized in 2013, which focused on the need for a broad approach of collecting data on detainees, then providing rehabilitation, re-education, and finally reintegration.⁵⁵ The programs also focus on the families of detainees, having offered services like transportation, covering the costs of children’s tuition, and even arranging weddings inside the prisons.⁵⁶ In other words, this strategy aims at altering the beliefs and ideologies of extremists to fit more moderate views as well as strengthening their family units. This is based on the presumption that if detainees are treated humanely and their Islamic faith respected, they are likely to cooperate and less likely to resume terrorist activities when they are released. However, this soft approach has also faced recent criticism, including self-criticism, regarding the program’s ability to completely rehabilitate the terrorist convicts and avoid recidivism. The de-radicalization program has also been called “under-financed, understaffed, and not terribly institutionalized,”⁵⁷ and the BNPT has admitted that several hundred former terrorist inmates have not joined their post-release de-radicalization program, as participation is voluntary.⁵⁸

⁵¹ The Jakarta Post, Halim et al (2016); Jakarta Globe, Sihaloho (2016).

⁵² Amnesty International (2016).

⁵³ Reuters, Allard and Kapoor (2016).

⁵⁴ The Jakarta Post, Ramadhani & Aritonang (2017).

⁵⁵ IPAC Report No. 11 (2014): 6.

⁵⁶ Wulan (2015) 5; Brown (2013) 42.

⁵⁷ Horgan and Braddock (2010) 247.

⁵⁸ The Diplomat, Sumpter (2017).

2.2.2 Civil Society Participation

While the present thesis will attempt to gain further and deeper understand of the participation of women's rights activists and NGOs in the context of counter-terrorism in Indonesia, there are a couple of well-known cases of civil society organizations cooperating with government agencies to apply the soft approach of their counter-terrorism strategy. Large faith-based organizations, with Nahdatul Ulama (NU) and Muhammadiyah at the forefront, have been actively collaborating with the Indonesian government in strengthening a non-extremist narrative of Islam, through campaigns and networks based in schools, mosques, and other public spaces and at the grass root level.⁵⁹ Fatayat NU (The Young Women of NU), an 'autonomous body' of NU for women between the ages of 20 and 40,⁶⁰ has also participated in such counter-terrorism efforts. Their cooperation with the government agencies has mostly involved online campaigns, forums and workshops.⁶¹

Arguably, however, the government's willingness to involve civil society in counter-terrorism efforts derives largely from the lack of resources and the country's scattered territories,⁶² which makes it hard to provide a comprehensive counter-terrorism strategy for all of the 34 provinces. Thus, the government efforts have been supplemented with efforts from various civil society organizations, beyond the collaboration with the large Muslim organizations. Small but committed NGOs have often filled in the gaps when the government agencies have come up short, particularly concerning de-radicalization and societal reintegration of terrorist convicts. They have succeeded in creating employment opportunities, providing training, and building trust between the former extremists and their communities.⁶³ This is also true regarding the Terrorism Prevention Coordination Forums (FKPT), established by BNPT in 2012. As of 2015, there were FKPTs in almost all the provinces, consisting mainly of clerics, youth organizations, academics and civil society leaders.⁶⁴ They are primarily tasked with coordinating counter-extremism activities including hosting 'Terrorism Prevention Dialogues' between 'moderates' and 'radicals' in their communities, often featuring presentations from former terrorists, survivors of terrorism, law enforcement, and religious leaders.⁶⁵ However, the forums are challenged by resource constraints as they do not have a budget on their own, and funding for activities is provided by the local government or outside donors.⁶⁶ Thus, fac-

⁵⁹ ICCT, van Ginkel (2012) 6; U.S. Department of State (2015).

⁶⁰ Arnez (2010) 63.

⁶¹ Wulan (2015) 6.

⁶² U.S. State Country Report on Terrorism (2015).

⁶³ The Diplomat, Sumpter (2017).

⁶⁴ IPAC (2014) 5.

⁶⁵ *ibid*; U.S. Department of State (2015)

⁶⁶ IPAC (2014): 5.

tions of Indonesian civil society are collaborating with the government to prevent radicalism and terrorism, albeit often constrained by the lack of financial support. The amount of information and statements regarding the participation of women's rights groups or activists is also very limited, which underlines the need for further inquiry into the topic.

2.2.3 The radicalization of Indonesian women

While the evolution of Indonesian women's participation in extremist movements and violent conflicts stretches back several decades, the first arrest of two female would-be suicide bombers in Jakarta in December 2016 indicates the wish of Indonesian women to play a more active role in violent extremism.⁶⁷ The recent increase in activism among women has been linked to the rise of IS, but also to the ability of women to benefit from the development of social media technology. The new technology enables them to take part in radical chat forums, read extremist propaganda, find like-minded friends, and meet men.⁶⁸ As such, this provides them with an alternative way of joining extremist groups, which stands in contrast to the assumption that women are solely victims of brainwashing and are usually married into such groups. Such assumptions within policy and public discourses undermine and underestimate women's agency and personal motivations to join violent groups, while women have in fact displayed a wide array of motivations for supporting and joining extremist groups, including gendered grievances.⁶⁹ A recent report from the Institute for Policy Analysis of Conflict (IPAC) in Jakarta established that "chatter on social media [...] as well as evidence from the small number of women arrested, has shown that the Indonesian women themselves are looking for a more active role."⁷⁰ The report outlines several emerging subsets of Indonesian women extremists, including Indonesian overseas migrant workers in East Asia and the Middle East, women who have joined IS in Syria as part of family units (sometimes being the ones pushing for the family to leave), and women deportees who tried to cross over the Turkish border to get to Syria but were arrested and deported back to Indonesia.⁷¹ The latter is described as a group of potential activists, who are not being sufficiently monitored or subjected to programs that can assist in their de-radicalization and reintegration.⁷² A recent example is the case of 75 deportees, who were sent back to Indonesia in February this year. Among them were 24 women and 34 children, who were interrogated by Densus 88 before being placed in

⁶⁷ For a detailed narrative of the evolution of women in Indonesian extremist movements, see IPAC Report No. 35 (2017).

⁶⁸ IPAC (2017) 1.

⁶⁹ Huckerby (2015).

⁷⁰ IPAC (2017) 24.

⁷¹ IPAC (2017) 1-2.

⁷² IPAC (2017) 2; Jones quoted in ABC News, Harvey (2017).

custody with the rest of the group as part of a de-radicalization program at a government-owned shelter in Jakarta.⁷³

2.2.4 The position of international law in Indonesia

Finally, it is necessary to shortly address the position of international law within the Indonesian legal system. While Indonesia has ratified eight of the nine core human rights conventions, observers have pointed out the uncertainty regarding the status of the ratified treaties within the system, and whether they automatically form part of Indonesian law. As the law is silent on the status of these treaties in domestic law, there is an unresolved legal debate about whether Indonesia follows a *monist* or *dualist* approach in their application of international law.⁷⁴ Butt argues that this uncertainty has allowed the Indonesian government to convince the international community that the ratified treaties have automatic application, while also refusing to grant such rights to citizens by claiming that treaties have no domestic application unless incorporated by an Indonesian legal instrument.⁷⁵ Yet, the Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia includes a range of provisions of basic human rights and fundamental freedoms, including civil and political rights and social rights.⁷⁶ Significantly, Law 39/1999 on human rights also includes a section on women's rights in its provisions of fundamental rights and duties of citizens of Indonesia, and specifies that the government is obligated to protect, promote and implement all human rights and freedoms.⁷⁷ The law also reinforced the creation of the National Commission on Human Rights (Komnas HAM), initially established under a presidential decree in 1999.⁷⁸ Moreover, the government has set up a number of national institutions relevant to the protection and promotion of human rights and the rule of law, including the National Commission on Violence Against Women (Komnas Perempuan).⁷⁹ The independent institution has a special mandate to eradicate all forms of violence against women, and has carried out fact-finding and strategic studies, monitoring, and provided insight to encourage policies for the fulfillment of the rights of women and human rights in general.⁸⁰

2.3 Why Indonesia must incorporate a gender lens in counter-terrorism

The following sections will present the rationale for why the topic at hand should be further subjected to human rights analysis, and why the Indonesian government must address and

⁷³ The Jakarta Post, Halim (2017).

⁷⁴ See Butt (2014) for a detailed discussion of the position of international law within the Indonesian legal system.

⁷⁵ Butt (2014) 1.

⁷⁶ Chapter XA of the Constitution.

⁷⁷ Law 39/1999 section 9 arts 45-51; Art. 2.

⁷⁸ Law 39/1999 arts 75-99.

⁷⁹ Established by Presidential Decree 181/1998.

⁸⁰ Komnas Perempuan (no date).

facilitate the incorporation of a gender sensitive lens in their counter-terrorism approach. The following subsections will therefore address two main arguments, first an argument from efficiency, and second an argument from legality. The sections outline how the failure to integrate gender-sensitivity in counter-terrorism can undermine both human rights and counter-terrorism goals.

2.3.1 Efficiency

First, incorporating a gender lens in counter-terrorism strategies may increase efficiency. It has been argued that the increased inclusion and direct participation of women in acts of terrorism can increase its effectiveness and thus pose unique security threats. Reasons for this include the fact that women may be perceived as less suspect by law enforcement and security officers, which means that they may be able to hide weapons and explosives under their clothes, act as couriers when visiting prisons, and generally avoid the attention of intelligence agencies.⁸¹ A study on the effectiveness of women as suicide bombers found that women are more lethal compared to their male counterparts, as women claimed a higher average number of victims in individual attacks than men.⁸² In other words, it is unrealistic and inefficient to counter terrorism under the premise that all women are inherently more peaceful than men and thus less willing to resort to violence for political ends. By approaching gender in such an inadequate way, national and international strategies are neglecting key elements that fuel terrorism and radicalization, and consequently miss opportunities for more efficient counter-terrorism measures.⁸³

Thus, the expansion of women's roles in terrorism networks highlights the need to efficiently include the voices of NGOs that work with women's rights issues and thus hold expertise that is needed to create sound and gender sensitive counter-terrorism strategies. Such knowledge includes the gender-specific grievances of radicalized women as well as women affected by terrorism and counter-terrorism measures. Disregard of such issues and a lack of measures to remedy these grievances and needs undermine the aim of counter-terrorism and de-radicalization, and might contribute to recidivism and further radicalization. The inclusion, support, and safety of women and women's rights groups working in the context of counter-terrorism is therefore crucial, so that they can challenge extremism and help women as part of a comprehensive strategy to counter terrorism and promote human rights.⁸⁴ Omitting to engage women may instead reinforce possible biases about the opinion of women being inferior

⁸¹ Wulan (2015); Sidney Jones quoted in ABC News, Harvey (2017).

⁸² O'Rourke (2009).

⁸³ United States Institute of Peace, Huckerby (2015) 12.

⁸⁴ United States Institute of Peace, Millar (2015) 10.

to that of men, as well as leave significant loopholes in assessments and subsequent counter-terrorism programs and policies.⁸⁵

Furthermore, a noticeable amount of research has shown a positive correlation between the participation of women in peace processes and the success of such processes and peace agreements.⁸⁶ While the countering of terrorism differs slightly from peace building, there are clear parallels between the two and such research has been connected to the importance of creating spaces for women to voice their views on counter-terrorism.⁸⁷ This of course includes the views and effective participation of women's rights groups. Thus, as stressed in a report by the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE), it is vital for the efficiency and success of counter-terrorism strategies that the factors that obstruct women and women's rights promoters' active participation in countering terrorism be removed.⁸⁸

2.3.2 Legality

Second, incorporating a gender lens improves compliance with human rights and international law. Just as states are required to develop an efficient counter-terrorism strategy, they have to ensure that none of their counter-terrorism efforts challenge their international human rights obligations. Paying attention to gender-issues and gendered grievances is therefore crucial since it will enhance the legality of a counter-terrorism strategy, as stressed by the international counter-terrorism and security norms developed by the UN system.⁸⁹ As outlined in these norms, Indonesia and the other Member States are obligated to incorporate a gender lens in their strategies, which includes ensuring the participation and leadership of women and women's rights organizations. As a party to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), Indonesia is obligated to respect, protect, and fulfill the specific human rights norms regarding women. In its general recommendation No. 30 on women in conflict prevention, conflict and post-conflict situations, the CEDAW Committee stresses that compliance with the Convention requires the inclusion of female stakeholders and a gendered analysis when developing conflict prevention measures.⁹⁰ It also recommends that States "enhance collaboration with civil society and non-governmental organizations working on the implementation of the Security Council agenda on women, peace, and

⁸⁵ Morris (no date) 72.

⁸⁶ See e.g. Stone (2015) When women are included in a peace process, the probability of an agreement lasting at least two years increases with 20 percent, and the probability of it lasting at least 15 years increases with 35 percent.

⁸⁷ Gunaratna & Bin Ali (Eds.) (2015) 91.

⁸⁸ OSCE (2013).

⁸⁹ See 2.1.

⁹⁰ CEDAW, *General Recommendation No. 30*, para 30.

security.⁹¹ Thus, failure to take women's rights and issues into consideration while countering terrorism is likely to violate both international human rights law and domestic law. This is true when the strategy fails to recognize the danger of women's participation in extremism, when it fails to recognize the gender-specific needs and grievances of women in the context of terrorism and counter-terrorism, and when it fails to recognize that the participation and engagement of women in counter-terrorism involves specific security concerns. These concerns therefore provide a strong legal incentive for Indonesia to ensure the efficient participation of women and women's rights NGOs in their strategy, as a vital part of incorporating a gender sensitive approach.

⁹¹ CEDAW, *General Recommendation No. 30*, para 28(d).

3 Theory

Building on the abovementioned arguments of efficiency and legality, this chapter will briefly discuss the theoretical assumptions relative to this thesis. While it is intended to be more exploratory in nature as opposed to a test of specific theories, the thesis will draw on certain theoretical assumptions and expectations as developed by existing research and literature on the issues. In order to gain further insight into the dynamics of gender, women's rights activism, and counter-terrorism in Indonesia, there is a need to further discuss *why* the role and experience of women in this context are expected to be different from those of men. Thus, the first subsection will discuss the feminist approach of the study, while the second subsection will further discuss relevant existing research and literature.

3.1 Feminist approach

The current thesis employs a feminist approach, and thus aims at adding to the understanding of how women are treated in various settings and institutions by filling in knowledge gaps on the experiences of women in specific contexts. It is grounded in the feminist epistemological tradition that values women's unique and situated experiences as a unique and valuable source of knowledge.⁹² Hence, it follows the practice of applying a gender lens to research, as this approach "illuminates interactional patterns and institutional practices and sharpens our view of power, privilege, and priorities."⁹³ Drawing on arguments and ideas from *feminist security theory* scholarship (FST), the thesis builds on the argument that "in a rapidly changing, post-9/11 world, feminist voices must be heard if the international system is to achieve a more comprehensive security in the face of terror networks, technowar, and mounting civilian casualties."⁹⁴ FST contests discourses that link women unreflectively with peace, and questions the assumed nonexistence and irrelevance of women in international security politics.⁹⁵ It furthermore challenges the notion of protection as justification for state power, and some scholars argue that the state typically denies women the opportunity to be societal 'protectors,' by instead assigning them the role of 'protected.'⁹⁶ Thus, FST scholars have described the adoption of Security Council resolution 1325 as providing "many new research opportunities to study the ways the incorporation of a gender perspective and female participation affect peacekeeping and the security of women and men."⁹⁷ One such opportunity is explored in this study, by focusing on a specific group of female participants working with countering terrorism and securing peace within a specific country.

⁹² Hesse-Biber (ed) (2012) 9.

⁹³ *ibid* 476.

⁹⁴ Blanchard (2003) 1.

⁹⁵ *ibid* 3.

⁹⁶ Stiehm (1983).

⁹⁷ Blanchard (2003) 20.

3.2 Literature and previous research

Despite recent developments, historical and essentialist patterns of male combatancy and female victimhood remain alive and well in terrorism and counter-terrorism discourses.⁹⁸ Several scholars point out how human rights analysis of counter-terrorism is characterized by the often unspoken assumption that men suffer the most in this context, something that has obscured the diverse ways that the different genders experience counter-terrorism and effectively rendered the full scope of gender-based rights violations invisible to policy makers as well as the human rights community.⁹⁹ In other words, the extent of human rights research related to counter-terrorism and women is scant, and this is a problem for the effective protection of the rights of women. Hence, there has been no in-depth academic research conducted regarding women and women's rights activists in the context of counter-terrorism in Indonesia, and very little written on the involvement of women's rights organization in countering terrorism in Indonesia. Noticeably, however, Brown includes Indonesia as one of several cases in her discussion of women and emerging counter-terror measures.¹⁰⁰ Focusing on the treatment of women in relation to Indonesian counter-terrorism measures, she describes two ways in which women are denied agency and instead treated as subjects of policy. First, the essentializing of 'the Muslim woman' in counter- and de-radicalization measures denies the multiple experiences and identities of these women.¹⁰¹ This happens as women are constructed in policies and programs "via a materialist logic that understands women's participation and presence in counter-radicalization measures according to their expected gender and racialized role as mothers."¹⁰² Hence, women are assumed to be driven by maternal instincts, and inherently peaceful. Second, women are denied agency "through the extension of the gendered and culturally constructed paternalist logic that justifies state intervention in their daily lives in the name of their security, yet fails to provide that protection."¹⁰³ In the Indonesian case, the de-radicalization programs consider the family of detainees as a coherent unit, and Brown argues that the support offered to the families is premised on the belief that women act as moderating influences.¹⁰⁴ This also assumes that women's agency is located via the family. This perception of women in counter-terrorism settings is in stark contrast to the presentation of state agents, particularly Densus 88 members, as heroes through live coverage of their operations as well as their own blog that, among other things, lists types of weaponry used in their

⁹⁸ Aoláin (2013): 2.

⁹⁹ Huckerby and Satterthwaite (2013): 2.

¹⁰⁰ Brown (2013) 36-59.

¹⁰¹ *ibid* 41.

¹⁰² *ibid*.

¹⁰³ *ibid*.

¹⁰⁴ Brown (2013) 42.

raids.¹⁰⁵ Brown describes this as typical of a hegemonic militarized masculinity, as noted by feminists.¹⁰⁶

Furthermore, a couple of studies have been conducted in relation to gender in the counter-terrorism strategies of other countries, on national and international levels. Kassem explored the practices regarding rendition, detention, and interrogation that were deployed extraterritorially in the United States' global 'War on Terror,' and identified specific missed encounters with women. Among these were women as the principal population indirectly affected by such practices, women as key actors among those that implement such practices, and finally as direct targets of the counter-terrorism measures. His examination of these gendered erasures concluded that the failure to address the gender dimension of the 'War on Terror' resulted in incomplete evaluations of policies and practices as well as the oversight of human rights violations.¹⁰⁷

Aoláin discusses the case of Northern Ireland during 'the Troubles,' and the different ways that women participated in counterinsurgency measures during the conflict. She stresses that women were on the front line of enforcing the state's counter-terrorism policies, working as police, military personnel, and prison officers, and that women were actively engaged in making, shaping, and enforcing counter-terrorism policies, laws, and strategies.¹⁰⁸ She describes their participation as "an intersection that feminists should not ignore as we reflect on the intersectionalities that coexist for women in the counterinsurgency sphere, and the varied presence of women within these settings."¹⁰⁹ Meanwhile, research by Huckerby and Fakih on the counter-terrorism strategies deployed by the United Kingdom and the United States exposed situations where counter-terrorism measures have attempted to explicitly engage women, solely on the premise that they can be valuable tools in the global fight against terrorism. These situations suggest that such securitization can increase alienation, heighten women's insecurity, and create a concern of women being 'used' by the government, rather than being empowered to participate fully in society and overcome the barriers they face.¹¹⁰ Moreover, in the rare cases that strategies do support women as agents of counter-terrorism, they often do so in ways that strengthen harmful gender stereotypes, such as "those that focus on the role of mothers in influencing radicalization of male family members, stress the victimhood status of women as female victims of terrorism, or assumes that women are inherently more peaceful

¹⁰⁵ See <http://densus88-antiteror.blogspot.no/>

¹⁰⁶ Brown (2013) 49.

¹⁰⁷ Kassem (2013) 10.

¹⁰⁸ Aoláin (2013) 1107.

¹⁰⁹ *ibid* 1107-1108.

¹¹⁰ Center for Human Rights and Global Justice (2012): 13.

than men.”¹¹¹ Therefore, such findings demonstrate how utilizing women as agents of counter-terrorism is not the same as incorporating a proper gender perspective in countering terrorism, as the latter requires sensitiveness to specific gender issues that might put women at risk.

Thus, as evident from previous studies, women’s agency and grievances are arguably poorly understood within the counter-terrorism context and strategies. A tendency to stereotype women based on their expected behavior and role as mothers and victims pose serious barriers to the promotion of gender sensitive approaches, and this is likely to also affect the experiences of female NGO workers and women’s rights promoters in the Indonesian context. Yet, their experiences may provide insight into how they might be challenging, working around, and coping with such barriers.

¹¹¹ Huckerby (2014) 171; Huckerby and Fakhri (2011) 26.

4 Methodology

This chapter will outline the methodological approach of the thesis. It will discuss the rationale behind the choice of methods and how they are applied. The first subsection will present a qualitative single case study approach as the choice of research design, and discuss the operationalization of concepts. The second subsection will discuss the process of collecting data, focusing on the use of semi-structured interviews as the chosen method. The third subsection presents the selected data analysis approach, before the final subsection briefly considers issues of validity, reliability, and generalizability.

4.1 Research design

To answer the research question at hand, the thesis will conduct a single case study that is qualitative in nature. The study will gather and analyze qualitative empirical data in order to understand the specific situation in the chosen country, and thus contribute to the overall discussion of gender, counter-terrorism, and human rights. As the gendering of counter-terrorism is a fairly new and understudied topic in the Indonesian context, using a single case study research design allows for an in-depth exploration of the topic at an initial stage. This is because a case study design allows for detailed and intensive inquiry of a single case, by investigating “a contemporary phenomenon in-depth and within its real-life context; especially when the boundaries between phenomenon and context are not clearly evident.”¹¹² While the aim of the thesis is not to test a specific theory by analyzing empirical data on a specific issue, it is grounded in certain theoretical perspectives as elaborated on in the previous chapter. The study can therefore be described as a combination inductive and deductive of in nature, which falls within Levy’s description of a *theory-guided case study*.¹¹³ Such studies are ideographic in nature, in which the purpose is to interpret and understand a single case as an end in itself, as opposed to using it as a tool for developing broader theoretical generalizations. Yet, the studies are structured by specific theoretical assumptions.

The unit of analysis in the present thesis is female members of women’s rights groups working with counter-terrorism in Indonesia. While the NGOs are not necessarily strictly women’s rights groups, they all work with some aspect of the promotion of women’s human rights. Thus, the study is limited to a specific group of actors, within a specific context, in a specific country. As Indonesia implemented its anti-terrorism law in 2003, effectively launching its counter-terrorism strategy, the study also has a restricted timeframe.

¹¹² Yin (2009) 18; Bryman (2012) 66.

¹¹³ Levy (2008) 4.

There are a couple of main justifications for the choice of unit of analysis. First, the inclusion and participation of women's rights activists and organizations is a key part of the international normative framework on counter-terrorism, which makes their experiences and perspectives vital indicators of the success and challenges of incorporating a gender lens in Indonesia's counter-terrorism strategy. Second, they hold first-hand knowledge and expertise on issues of women's human rights, and are likely to have a better understanding of the topic at hand. Third, as discussed in the background section, Indonesian civil society has already been involved in counter-terrorism and de-radicalization efforts. As a significant part of the Indonesian 'soft approach,' it is realistic to assume that specific fractions of civil society have gained knowledge and first-hand experience regarding the specific role of gender within this context. In other words, the experience and insight of women working in women's rights NGOs are directly linked to the inclusion of a gender perspective, and is more likely to reflect the actual situation regarding women's rights and counter-terrorism as opposed to the input from publicly available data and government officials.

4.2 Data collection

The current thesis uses *semi-structured interviews* as its main method for gathering data. The method is chosen based on its open and flexible nature, which allows for a more efficient and in-depth exploration of a relatively unexplored topic. While providing flexibility, it also follows a set of themes pre-decided by the interviewer, which provides a certain structure and aim.¹¹⁴ As the aim of the thesis is to gain further understanding of the role of gender and women's human rights within the Indonesian counter-terrorism context, obtaining internal accounts and experiences from women working in women's rights NGOs within this setting through interviews is appropriate. As this topic is a fairly new issue on the policy agenda in the Indonesian context, interviewing allows for capturing more informal developments and concerns not accessible elsewhere.¹¹⁵ In order to support the findings of the primary data, certain secondary data was also collected, including relevant reports, surveys and documents.

4.2.1 Sampling

Purposeful sampling was conducted to find an appropriate sample for the study. Thus, the selection process was guided by the purpose of the study and the researcher's knowledge of the population.¹¹⁶ The process involved a search and review of the relevant organizations, as well as the help of contacts gained during an internship in Indonesia in 2016.¹¹⁷ The interview subjects were therefore not randomly sampled, but chosen based on the relevance of their

¹¹⁴ Bryman (2012) 471.

¹¹⁵ Beyers et al (2014) 176.

¹¹⁶ Tansey (2007) 770.

¹¹⁷ The author interned with the Indonesia Programme at the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights in 2016.

work and experience. As some of the initial informants recommended other informants that were eventually also included in the study, *snowball sampling* also contributed to the selection process. It has been suggested that this technique is advantageous for research conducted in conflict environments,¹¹⁸ which is relevant for a study in the context of extremism and counter-terrorism.

Six informants were interviewed, all of whom were women currently working with women's rights in the context of counter-terrorism in Indonesia.¹¹⁹ All of the informants work in NGOs, four of which are national organizations and one that operates on a regional level. Two of the informants worked in the same organization, while the others worked in different NGOs, and all of them were primarily based in Jakarta. While the group of informants is small, the sampling attempted to include a somewhat varied group of informants. Their work includes most layers of the soft approach to counter-terrorism, including de-radicalization in and outside of prisons and detention centers, aiding families of convicts, promotion of moderate religious narratives through workshops and education, moderating negotiations, field research and data collection, and policy discussions. Most of the informants had already worked with these issues a couple of years, albeit not exclusively, while one had just recently begun working in this context.

The decision to keep the informants anonymous was based on ethical considerations as well as the wishes of some of the informants, relating to instances where certain organizations working in this setting have received threats from radical networks. Thus, there was no personal or sensitive information stored during the process.

4.2.2 Conducting the interviews

The interviews were conducted throughout March and early April 2016, all of them via Skype. The interviews were conducted in English, and lasted from 1 hour to 1 hour and 15 minutes. Some follow-up questions were conducted via phone with some of the informants. The interviews loosely followed an interview guide, comprising a list of topics and questions that created a framework for discussion while also allowing for new ideas to be brought up and explored. This interview guide was prepared in advance, shaped by the research question at hand as well as previous research and relevant documents and reports.¹²⁰ A few questions and topics were added and amended following the initial interview, as new issues were

¹¹⁸ Cohen and Arieli (2011) 424

¹¹⁹ See Appendix 2 (The informants will be referred to by their corresponding number in the appendix)

¹²⁰ Documents and reports included "Good Practices on Women and Countering Violent Extremism," GCTF (2015) and "Supporting Civil Society Initiatives to Empower Women's Roles in Countering Violent Extremism and Radicalization that Lead to Terrorism," GCTF-OSCE (2014).

brought up.¹²¹ All informants were informed about the aim of the study, issues of consent regarding their participation and the recording of the interviews, and the choice to stay anonymous. While the interviews were recorded, as agreed by the subjects, no personal information was included in these recordings, which were destroyed upon completion of the study. While the informants noted that counter-terrorism is a sensitive topic of discussion in Indonesia, as it is closely connected to religion, this is less of an issue when interviewing individuals working with the topic on a professional level rather than victims or individuals directly affected by counter-terrorism measures. Thus, no major ethical issues were encountered during the research process.

4.3 Data analysis

In order to analyze the data, the study applies a *thematic analysis*. This technique is essentially a method for identifying and analyzing patterns in qualitative data, which allows the researcher to systematize the data into overall themes that are subsequently analyzed and interpreted in order to address the research question.¹²² It can be used to analyze interviews, and works well with both large and small data sets, which makes it an appropriate method for this study.

Accordingly, Clarke and Braun's six phases of thematic analysis was applied.¹²³ By following these six steps, and going back and forth between the different phases, the data was gradually organized into specific themes. The initial stage involved familiarization with the data, which was done by transcribing the interviews and actively reading through the entire data set while writing down initial ideas and observations. The second phase then involved the analytic process of labeling important features of the data as it related to the research topic. By creating a list of initial codes, the relevant data was organized into them. Like most qualitative analyses, the coding included a combination of both *data-driven* and *concept-driven* coding. This allowed the study to start out with some theoretical ideas derived from literature and research questions, while also discover new ideas and explanations in the data.¹²⁴ Having organized the relevant data by codes, the third phase comprised a search for potential themes. Per Clarke and Braun's definition, a theme is a coherent and meaningful pattern in the data relevant to the research question, which is not simply discovered but constructed by the researcher.¹²⁵ Thus, this stage requires an analysis of the identified codes in order to decide how different codes may combine to form an overarching theme. Visual representation in the form of an

¹²¹ See Appendix 1 for a final list of topics.

¹²² Clarke and Braun (2013) 3.

¹²³ *ibid* 4.

¹²⁴ Gibbs (2007) 45-46.

¹²⁵ Clarke and Braun (2013) 4.

initial thematic map was used, where the potential themes and sub-themes were written on a separate sheet of paper in order to explore the relationship between them. Phase four involved the refinement of this set of candidate themes. Furthermore, the validity of the candidate themes was considered in relation to the data set as a whole, and the themes and sub-themes were then defined according to their ‘essence’ and assigned names in phase five. Moreover, the general guiding principle used to locate themes throughout the analysis was relevance to the research question. Three main techniques were used to do this, namely the identification of *repetition* of concepts within and across the interviews, instances of *theory-related material*, and by *cutting and sorting* relevant quotes and expressions.¹²⁶ The process was done manually, as allowed by the small sample size. In the final phase, the final analysis of the data was produced, as presented in the following chapter. The final analysis of the identified themes was supplemented by the CEDAW Committee’s general recommendations, as well as additional secondary sources and sources of soft law such as relevant reports, guidelines, recommendations, and other documents. Thus, the final analysis aimed at presenting and discussing the findings of the study, and contextualizing them in relation to existing literature.

4.4 Reliability, validity, and generalizability

The concepts of *reliability* and *validity* are increasingly being used to assess qualitative research, and to ensure objectivity and credibility of the research.¹²⁷ Reliability refers to the reproducibility and coherence of the data,¹²⁸ which can often prove difficult considering the complex and flexible nature of qualitative research. As such, scholars have stressed the importance of being transparent about the research process,¹²⁹ and this chapter has therefore attempted to be open and detailed about the process of gathering and analyzing the data in order to allow for replication of similar studies. While the anonymity of the informants is a limitation, the list of informants in the appendix attempts to provide a certain background and situate them in the counter-terrorism context.

The validity of the qualitative research refers to the extent to which the findings are an accurate representation of the phenomena they are intended to measure.¹³⁰ According to Stenbacka, validity is achieved “when using the method of non-forcing interviews with strategically well-chosen informants.”¹³¹ Thus, the study attempted to identify an appropriate sample of informants, and make sure that they represented an, albeit small, group of individuals with

¹²⁶ Ryan and Bernard (2003) 89, 93-94, 94.

¹²⁷ Anderson (2010) 2.

¹²⁸ *ibid.*

¹²⁹ Stenbacka (2001) 552.

¹³⁰ Anderson (2010) 2.

¹³¹ Stenbacka (2001) 552.

the relevant experience and background. While one limitation of single case studies—that are restricted to a small sample of people—is that it is often considered difficult to generalize the findings to a larger population, Anderson argues that they can nonetheless be transferable to another setting.¹³² The current thesis is limited by a small sample, which cannot be generalized to reflect the entire population of female NGO worker and women’s rights group in Indonesia. Yet, the number of women and women’s rights organizations working within this sphere is still limited, as the current topic is a relatively new and unexplored topic in the Indonesian context. Thus, the findings of the current study might reflect the situation for women in similar settings and situations within Indonesia. Arguably, the experiences of a single informant can reveal a number of shortcomings of the Indonesian counter-terrorism strategy as it relates to women’s rights and issues, and ways that female women’s rights activists can contribute to more gender-sensitivity.

¹³² Bryman (2012) 69; Anderson (2010) 2.

5 Empirical analysis

The current chapter presents and discusses the findings as reflected in the empirical data collected through semi-structured interviews. In order to assess whether women and women's rights organizations are contributing to a more human rights compliant counter-terrorism approach in Indonesia, and whether they are facing gender-specific challenges and barriers that hinder the incorporation of a gender lens, the findings have been organized into three overarching themes with two sub-themes each. The identified themes and sub-themes are discussed and contextualized in relation to existing literature and secondary sources and data. As reflected in chapter 3 on theory, it is necessary to go beyond an individualist approach and instead explore the varied presence of women in the counter-terrorism setting and how it relates to wider societal structures.

The chapter is divided into three main parts. Each part shortly introduces the identified theme before going more into detail about its significance, effects, and consequences by discussing the identified sub-themes. The three parts discuss the role of trust and collaboration between women, the lack of attention to women's rights and women's issues, and the role of gender stereotypes in the context of counter-terrorism.

5.1 An issue of trust: The woman-to-woman connection

One of the overarching statements made by informants was that their gender plays a key role in their work in the context of counter-terrorism, most importantly because it is vital to building trust between them and the women that they are working with. All of the informants were of the perception that this trust could only be gained on the basis of being a woman, as the women they work with believe that only fellow women would understand their worries and concerns. One informant expressed that women in this setting would only open up to other women as they would not feel comfortable talking about 'women issues' with male personnel: *"[...] they will only talk to women, because they think we understand their 'women issues' [...] most of them are not really comfortable talking to men, and therefore we are they only ones who can do that job."*¹³³ This was the case for women subjected to the counter-terrorism regime as detainees themselves and as relatives of detainees and terror convicts, and thus a crucial component of the specific work of the female NGO workers. The informants largely attributed this preference to cultural gender norms as well as the women's personal ideologies.

Consequently, female NGO workers contribute to a more gender-sensitive approach to counter-terrorism by often being the only ones who can reach out to women in this context and

¹³³ [1]

create a setting where the women feel comfortable enough to discuss their beliefs, concerns, and reintegration. In order to create such settings and make sure that women are met with this feeling of trust, the ‘woman-to-woman connection’ proved to be an important component in de-radicalization efforts as well as an issue of concern regarding the ‘hard’ counter-terrorism measures. Regarding the latter issue, the informants expressed their frustration with the lack of women in law enforcement and among first responders. This frustration was twofold, as they were concerned about the lack of this specific trust in women’s experiences with police, as well as the need for trust between women’s rights activists and law enforcement agencies. The tendency of women to trust other women more than men has been observed in several different settings and disciplines,¹³⁴ and was also clearly reflected in the testimonies of the female NGO workers. They used words like ‘sisterhood’ and ‘fellow ladies’ to describe their own experiences of collaborating with other female activists and politicians, and expressed a need to increase the presence and participation of women in all the counter-terrorism units:

I met with female [Members of Parliament] that are working on the draft for the new terrorism law [...] I felt like they were much more open to me because I was a woman [...] We really need to increase participation of women in politics and especially the police [...] I think it is a comfortable link—woman-to-woman [...] and we need this link to incorporate a gender lens.¹³⁵

This woman-to-woman connection therefore plays an integral part in ensuring a gender-sensitive approach and securing women’s human rights in the context of counter-terrorism in Indonesia. This is something that female NGO workers and activists can provide, and while it might seem fairly straightforward, it proved to be an important component of the activists’ efforts to contribute to a more human rights compliant and efficient counter-terrorism approach. Building trust with convicts, detainees and at-risk communities is essential to countering violent extremism and radicalization, and this has been highlighted as one of the key areas where civil society and NGOs can contribute. As such, it is one of the reasons why governments have been recommended to build strong partnerships with such groups.¹³⁶ The following subsections will go further into detail on the role of this element of trust, by discussing two identified sub-themes.

5.1.1 De-radicalization and vocational training for women by women

Firstly, the trust between women proved important in the NGO workers’ efforts to provide de-radicalization programs and support for women. Most of the informants were engaged in de-radicalization and reintegration efforts, some working with women during and after their stay in prisons and detention centers (although the number of women in this setting has been low

¹³⁴ See e.g. De Vita (2009) on trust between women in the workplace; Höglund & Holmström (2008) on the woman-to-woman connection in health care.

¹³⁵ [3]

¹³⁶ OSCE-GCTF (2014) para 16.

until recently) and others with wives and relatives of male suspects and terror convicts. The recent dramatic increase of women and children being deported from other countries and detained in Indonesia, after attempting to travel to Syria, poses new concerns and a need for attention to the de-radicalization of women, making the involvement of women and women's rights organizations imperative to the success of the de-radicalization programs:

As women's rights activists and as women, we have a big job to do [because] all of the women in these situations prefer to talk to other women and this is very important [in order to] make sure that they are reintegrated into their communities and that they do not go back to the radical groups.¹³⁷

The informants explained that being able to connect with the women in these situations is a prerequisite to 'changing' their ideologies, as well as successfully providing them with the help and support that is needed to secure both their survival and their break with religious extremism. The first involves talks and religious discussions between the women and the NGO workers, and the informants described their experiences as mainly positive and that many of the women 'opened up' to them.¹³⁸ In general, the informants described the women as eager to share their thoughts and concerns, but only in the company of other women. One informant described this need to share as a way for them to 'cope' with their situations.¹³⁹

Similarly, the informants described this trust as vital in their work with reintegrating the women into society. Several of the informants described in detail their and their organizations' work with providing the appropriate training and employment for the women, making sure that they had access to a source of income, a new feeling of empowerment, and a new environment:¹⁴⁰ *"We assist them with training and equipment, not money. We provide them with new environments; they get involved in new activities. [...] Some women I worked with discovered that they were good at harvesting dragon fruit, they enjoyed it [and] they felt a sense of empowerment."*¹⁴¹ The informants stressed that they believe their gender makes the whole process easier, as the women were more accepting of their help and advice because of their shared gender identity. This corresponds with the argument that female mentors will be more effective working with women that are undergoing de-radicalization programs. Saltman and Frenett argue that this is due to the fact that the female mentors can recognize and create 'cognitive openings' and are better equipped to build relationships with these women.¹⁴² During such cognitive openings, the individual becomes receptive to different and new ideas, which is a key part of the process of de-radicalization (as well as radicalization)—often occur-

¹³⁷ [5]

¹³⁸ [1,2,5,6]

¹³⁹ [1]

¹⁴⁰ The NGO workers' reintegration efforts are further discussed in section 5.2.2.

¹⁴¹ [1]

¹⁴² Saltman and Frenett (2016) 157.

ring at the beginning of de-radicalization process as a result of a traumatic event, emotional crisis, or by gradual realization.¹⁴³ Field research conducted in several countries by Women Without Borders/Sisters Against Violent Extremism (SAVE)—the world’s first international research-based female counter-terrorism platform—also showed that mothers trust other mothers the most but have very little trust in local authorities regarding the countering of extremist influences among their children. They expressed a wish to meet with other mothers, gain knowledge of religion, and access support from social organizations.¹⁴⁴ While their research focused on the role of mothers in countering radicalization of their children and in their communities, it highlights the tendency of women to specifically trust other women in the context of CVE. Thus, women and women’s organizations can play a vital role in building the trust that is needed to work with women in de-radicalization contexts, and act as valuable mediators in settings where women are involved.

Taking the importance of the woman-to-woman connection into consideration is therefore necessary, as effective de-radicalization interventions must be hand-tailored to the individual radicalization process.¹⁴⁵ Accordingly, this connection was also mentioned by the informants in relation to counter-radicalization efforts that are targeted at at-risk women. As explained in the IPAC report on the radicalization of Indonesian women, one of the emerging subsets of Indonesian women extremists are the Indonesian migrant workers living abroad in the neighboring countries. The informants stressed that this is a group in need of more attention from counter-terrorism efforts, something that was confirmed by the arrests of the two first female would-be suicide bombers in 2016 as they had both been radicalized online while working as domestic workers overseas.¹⁴⁶ The informants described this group as vulnerable because of their isolation and loneliness, and that it was important to reach out to them and provide alternatives to the narrative that they are presented with from extremist networks. Some of them expressed frustration over the state agencies’ lack of understanding of these women’s potential to engage in violent extremism. However, another informant noted that Komnas Perempuan has engaged in some discussions with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Minister of Manpower and Transmigration concerning this issue.¹⁴⁷ Regarding the specific importance of the woman-to-woman connection in this setting, one informant described her current work with organizing counseling and religious discussions between female religious leaders and at-risk women and girls, including migrant workers:

¹⁴³ Rabasa, et al (2010) 12, 14.

¹⁴⁴ SAVE (2015) 4.

¹⁴⁵ Koehler (2010).

¹⁴⁶ The Guardian, Lamb (2017).

¹⁴⁷ [6]

We [the organization] are working with female religious leaders to connect them with the women who are working abroad, [the migrant workers] are very vulnerable, they are lonely, and they turn to their faith. [They are] far away from home and have no social network around them, they go online to engage in religious discussions. And so they might end up in extremist online networks and find Islamist propaganda. [...] So we also use technology to connect with them, to provide support and talk about their faith, about Islam, about their concerns. [...] They like talking to other Indonesian women.¹⁴⁸

The female religious leaders' and NGO workers' ability to get in contact with and build trust with the at-risk female migrant workers is therefore imperative to tackling this potential source of violent extremism. This is also reiterated by the recommendations derived from an international workshop on civil society initiatives and women's empowerment in the context of counter-terrorism, arranged by the Global Counterterrorism Forum (GCTF) and the OSCE, stating that "female religious leaders and scholars should be encouraged to engage with their communities, especially women and girls, on issues related to (violent) extremism for instance by acting as role models or mentors, or to provide counsel and guidance to at-risk individuals."¹⁴⁹ Such initiatives should therefore also include women migrant workers.

In sum, the female NGO workers are contributing to a more comprehensive and efficient counter-terrorism strategy based on their gender identity and ability to connect with at-risk and radicalized women. In accordance with existing research, the women in this setting are able to reach a wider audience of those at risk of radicalization and bring innovation into the counter-terrorism sector.¹⁵⁰ As such, the woman-to-woman connection is an important component throughout their work in the context of counter-terrorism, and one of the ways that the participation of women is crucial to the effectiveness and human rights compliance of counter-terrorism strategies.

5.1.2 Lack of women in law enforcement

Secondly, the woman-to-woman connection was widely mentioned by the informants in relation to their frustration with the lack of women in the state agencies involved in counter-terrorism, above all, the lack of women in law enforcement, as the main actor in Indonesia's counter-terrorism approach. While the Indonesian National Police has repeatedly emphasized that female recruits are a priority, female police officers still make up only about 3.5 percent of the total force—a total of around 13,000 women.¹⁵¹ Low numbers of women involved in law enforcement has been stressed as a serious challenge to the inclusion of a gender perspective in counter-terrorism programming, based on the assumption that female law enforcement

¹⁴⁸ [4]

¹⁴⁹ GCTF-OSCE (2014) para 27.

¹⁵⁰ Saltman and Smith (2015) 71.

¹⁵¹ The Conversation, Baker (2014); Interpol (no date).

personnel are better at dealing with and have a better understanding of gender sensitivities.¹⁵² This may also make them better suited to obtain intelligence and produce information-driven results in relation to female detainees, and contribute to a safer process as “traditional confession-driven interrogation techniques performed without an understanding of gender sensitivities might result in coerced and false confessions or human rights abuses.”¹⁵³ Observers have therefore stressed that the overall effectiveness of counter-terrorism programs and policy implementation would be enhanced by increasing the participation of women in the security sector, and security organs such as the OSCE has emphasized that it is essential that law enforcement personnel involved in counter-terrorism related measures include women.¹⁵⁴ However, the widespread misconception that women are not involved in terrorism and violent extremism often exacerbates women’s underrepresentation among law enforcement officers and security personnel.¹⁵⁵ The informants were of the opinion that this is also the case in Indonesia.

The informants were concerned that the process of interrogation and de-radicalization, particularly inside prisons and detention centers, is not accommodating (or considering) the need to build trust between the police and the female detainees. They argued that special measures needs to be taken to increase the presence of female police in these settings, as the woman-to-woman connection is vital also in this setting:

[The police and the BNPT] have ignored that women can also be dangerous and participate in violent extremism, but now they have to understand that the presence of female police is very important [...] The female detainees and suspects prefer to be interviewed and handled by women police, and it will make the process better for everyone.¹⁵⁶

Another informant cited data that a fellow activist and researcher had gathered, confirming that female detainees and suspects prefer to be interviewed and handled by female police officers.¹⁵⁷ This should be highly relevant for the Indonesian approach, as their de-radicalization strategy requires the police to treat the prisoners in a humane way and to develop bonds of trust. Significantly, Indonesia’s individualistic approach to de-radicalization stresses the use of ‘cultural interrogation,’ which “requires the interrogator to be immersed in the culture of the detainee, understand his hopes and fear, and speak his language.”¹⁵⁸ The informants argued that this approach has to include a consideration of the female detainees’ sensitivity to the gender of the interrogators and police officers: “[...] *particularly the radicalized women*

¹⁵² Fink, et al (2013) 6-7.

¹⁵³ Fink, et al(2013) 7.

¹⁵⁴ Dharmapuri (2016) 12; OSCE (2013).

¹⁵⁵ OSCE (2011) 5.

¹⁵⁶ [4]

¹⁵⁷ [6]

¹⁵⁸ Rabasa, et al (2010) 107.

*are much more comfortable with female police. [...] Because the de-radicalization programs have to focus on specific individuals, this means that they should also make sure that the women are handled by female police.*¹⁵⁹ As the development of relationships of trust with case officers is a key part of the Indonesian rehabilitation process,¹⁶⁰ the significance of the gender of the case officers should be a reasonable consideration in the de-radicalization approach. Relatedly, the CEDAW Committee specifically recommends that State Parties use gender-sensitive practices, such as the use of female police officers, in investigations of violations during and after conflict.¹⁶¹ The Committee thus connects the use of female police officers with the assurance that violations by state and non-state actors are identified and addressed,¹⁶² underlining the connection between female police and the protection of women's rights.

Furthermore, several of the informants said that they were worried about the lack of gender-sensitivity in the approach taken by police and particularly Densus 88 during their raids and arrests of alleged terrorists. They expressed concern about the often traumatic and upsetting experiences of women witnessing the arrest of their husbands and male relatives, and that it is important to attend to them in a way that does not cause further stress:

We think there should be women police among the first responders to terrorism-related incidents and arrests. [...] We cannot ignore how such a traumatic event will affect the women, both the wives and alleged female terrorist and radicals [...] If they are taken care of by female police, they will be more comfortable [and] more trusting, and there will be less resentment.¹⁶³

The informants stressed that the raids and arrests often involve the invasion of private homes, and that the sudden invasion of heavily armed police into their homes has been very distressing for the women that they have talked to. Significantly, this has been a topic of discussion in recent feminist literature, addressing the effect of home disruptions on women. Aoláin stresses that “when harms or effects are measured, there is a marked emphasis on public, not private acts,” which often causes “violations within the home or close to private, intimate spaces that women describe as central to their experiences of vulnerability, lack of security, and violation [to be] deemed to fall within the ‘private’ domain in most legal and social systems, and frequently outside the circle of notice and accountability.”¹⁶⁴ This tendency therefore ignores the gender-specific effects and consequences of such police intervention, which illustrates a need to consider where and how the effects of counter-terrorism measures harm women. The

¹⁵⁹ [6]

¹⁶⁰ Rabasa, et al (2010) 97.

¹⁶¹ CEDAW, General Recommendation No. 30, para 17 (d).

¹⁶² *ibid* para 17 (d).

¹⁶³ [4]

¹⁶⁴ Aoláin (2013) 1119.

informants stressed that such gender-specific concerns in these settings are largely disregarded.

Furthermore, the informants underscored how the presence of female police officers can ease the difficulties that are sometimes tied to gendered cultural expectations: “[...] *the female police can sometimes intervene in ways that do not challenge the gender norms.*”¹⁶⁵ Likewise, Dharmapuri argues that “increasing the number of women in the security sector can improve efforts to stop female suicide bombers,” citing an example from Iraq where female security personnel were able to cross the “strict taboo of women interacting with men who are not family members.”¹⁶⁶ The informants underlined that such cultural norms were often more of a concern in counter-terrorism and CVE settings, as “*the radicals follow stricter gender norms and stereotypes.*”¹⁶⁷

As the informants themselves are not present in such ‘hard approach’ settings, they expressed a need for collaboration and trust between them and female police officers, as an important next step in ensuring a more gender-sensitive counter-terrorism approach. Thus, their work in this setting will also greatly benefit from an increase of and focus on female police officers engaging in counter-terrorism measures. One of the informants specifically mentioned that the presence of female police officers made her feel safe in a setting where the absolute majority of people present were men: “*There were three women police there, and the presence of other women made me feel safe and more comfortable among all the men [to do] my job.*”¹⁶⁸ Other informants also expressed that they felt more comfortable interacting with female members of the police force, and that their work in the context of counter-terrorism would be eased with an increase of women in law enforcement.

However, the more pressing issue for informants was the need to build valuable connections and coalitions with women in law enforcement, which they described as having the potential to ensure a “*much more gender-sensitive and women’s rights compliant strategy.*”¹⁶⁹ Another informant referred to women in law enforcement (and in government in general) as “*allies,*”¹⁷⁰ suggesting that women across sectors naturally have a common goal and purpose on the virtue of being women. They argue that the woman-to-woman connection makes it easier for them to discuss women’s issues and concerns with the officers, and the increased engage-

¹⁶⁵ [5]

¹⁶⁶ Dharmapuri (2016) 45.

¹⁶⁷ [4]

¹⁶⁸ [3]

¹⁶⁹ [5]

¹⁷⁰ [3]

ment of female police officers would open up for collaboration on ensuring adequate training for the security sector on issues related to gender-sensitivity. The GCTF's 'Good Practices on Women and Countering Violent Extremism' echoes the importance of the development of such genuine partnerships between the police and women's organizations, and stress that "women and civil society actors working with women can help build the capacity of the security sector through training, research, and expert advice on gender issues."¹⁷¹ This requires increased recruitment, retention, and advancement of women in the security sector, which, they argue, will in turn improve the assessments and create more efficient responses to terrorism that also minimize potential (and unintended) consequences on women and girls.¹⁷² The informants suggested that collaboration with and training of women in the police could improve law enforcement's understanding of gender-specific drivers of radicalization and violent extremism, as well as women's needs and grievances in the context of counter-terrorism. They argue that this would greatly improve the interactions with women when responding to extremist-related incidents and when working with detainees and convicts in prison programs.

The treatment of women in prisons and detention centers has been highlighted in literature as an area of concern, as pointed out in the case of Northern Ireland where prisons "were one of the main points of contentious interface for female paramilitaries with the state."¹⁷³ Aoláin describes the experiences of women imprisoned for terrorist offences as distinctly different than that of men, as men were considered to be "ordinary decent criminals."¹⁷⁴ The female convicts were instead exposed to a range of gender-specific management techniques, such as strip searches that included their internal cavities and that were generally carried out in the presence of male guards.¹⁷⁵ As such, female police and guards trained by and cooperating with women's organizations will potentially play an important part in counterbalancing and avoiding differential and degrading treatment and violations of women's human rights in prisons and detention centers. This is also relevant in relation to the growing discourse on gender and security sector reform, and the perception that security sector reforms pose a 'window of opportunity' for integrating gender concerns and the recruitment of more women into security and oversight institutions.¹⁷⁶ The informants' statements align with the gender and security reform discourse arguing that increasing the participation of women in the security sector will "increase police responsiveness to women's security issues," and that collaboration with women's organizations is encouraged in order to "make the security sector more

¹⁷¹ GCTF (2015): 11.

¹⁷² *ibid.*

¹⁷³ Aoláin (2013): 1109.

¹⁷⁴ *ibid.*

¹⁷⁵ Aoláin (2013): 1109-1110.

¹⁷⁶ Kunz (2014) 604, 608.

accountable and participatory.”¹⁷⁷ While critics have argued that gender and security reform discourse continues to frequently view women as victims—as also seen in counter-terrorism discourse—it is nevertheless relevant to the discussion of gendering counter-terrorism in Indonesia. Indonesian human rights NGOs, such as Imparsial and KontraS, were actively involved in the security sector reform of the Indonesian military,¹⁷⁸ and their continued advocacy for further security reform could be a constructive intersection for discussion of gender, security, and counter-terrorism.

Incidentally, however, the recruitment of female police officers also poses in itself a serious challenge for women’s human rights in Indonesia. Two of the informants expressed serious concerns regarding the highly discriminatory recruitment process of Indonesia’s National Police. Referring to the ‘virginity tests’ that female police academy applicants are subjected to as part of the physical exam, the informants stressed that such discriminatory and degrading treatment is a significant barrier to the increase of policewomen and gender mainstreaming in law enforcement. Komnas Perempuan has repeatedly asserted that the tests are a form of sexual violence against women, and as such in conflict with the Indonesian constitution, domestic laws, and international law prohibiting discrimination and degrading treatment.¹⁷⁹

In sum, the lack of women in the Indonesian police force, and the discriminatory recruitment process, pose a serious challenge to the work of women’s rights groups to promote gender-sensitivity in the counter-terrorism approach. According to the informants, a higher presence of female police officers in counter-terrorism settings will contribute to improved gender-sensitivity in police operations and treatment of female suspects, detainees, and affected family members. Furthermore, their strengthened collaboration with women’s rights organizations will foster a more efficient and human rights compliant counter-terrorism strategy.

5.2 Fighting for attention: women’s rights as a non-issue

A second overarching topic in the data was the informants’ frustration with the lack of attention to women’s issues and more specifically with the notion that women’s rights are generally a non-issue in the context of countering terrorism. The informants described the terrorism and counter-terrorism discourses in Indonesia as “*still very masculine—still male issues*,” which in practice means that they are still fighting for attention to women’s issues. Accordingly, Komnas Perempuan has observed a lack of comprehensive understanding on human rights and gender equality among Indonesian government officials, and described it as a hur-

¹⁷⁷ Kunz (2014) 609.

¹⁷⁸ Sukma (2012) 153.

¹⁷⁹ Komnas Perempuan, *Press Release* (2013), *Position Statement* (2013). See Human Rights Watch (2014) for further information on virginity testing in the Indonesian police and military.

dle preventing improvement.¹⁸⁰ This lack of understanding and lack of attention to women's issues and grievances naturally present serious challenges to the work of women's rights activists' and the incorporation of a gender lens in Indonesia's counter-terrorism strategy. Thus, the informants discussed the struggle to have their voices heard, as well as the problematic gender blind spots and loopholes in the counter-terrorism strategy created by this lack of attention—and how they are working to remedy these deficiencies. The following subsections further discuss the two prominent ways that this overarching theme of insufficient attention to women's rights was reflected in the data.

5.2.1 Lack of political will and attention

The informants repeatedly referred to the lack of attention to women's issues, grievances, and agency. One informant pointed to the fact that Indonesia still does not have a plan to incorporate Security Council resolution 1325 (even though civil society organizations have spent many years assisting the government to develop a National Action Plan to implement the resolution),¹⁸¹ and that the government is “*still not paying attention to the [Women, Peace, and Security] agenda, and all the different issues related to women, terrorism, and counter-terrorism.*”¹⁸² As such, they explained that many women's organizations are currently spending a lot of time and effort pushing for attention to these issues. Some of the informants are part of working groups made up of different women's rights organizations, one of which is pushing for the inclusion of gender issues in the draft amendments to the terrorism law. The informants were concerned about the missing gender dimension of the current law, and explained that the women's rights activists in the aforementioned working group is pushing for attention from the BNPT and advocating for a gender dimension to be included in the amendments. The working group is currently working on a policy paper outlining the importance of the draft amendments to the terrorism law to be gender-sensitive.¹⁸³ The informants explained how the gender dimension of counter-terrorism was still overlooked by the BNPT and the government, and that they are largely viewing women as victims of radicalization and terrorism: “*To them, women are still only victims, they do not understand women's agency in terrorism or in counter-terrorism. We try to change that.*”¹⁸⁴

However, the general experience among the informants was that there was a lack of political will and a general lack of attention to women's rights as a political issue in itself. Similar sentiments were also reflected in a study by the Women Peacemakers Program (WPP), in which

¹⁸⁰ Komnas Perempuan (2011) para 12.

¹⁸¹ The Global Network for Women Peacebuilders (2015) 30-31.

¹⁸² [2]

¹⁸³ [4]

¹⁸⁴ [6]

informants from civil society around the globe described the lack of political commitment to women's participation in peace and security as a 'deep rooted obstacle,' and as a further consequence of patriarchal norms.¹⁸⁵ Respondents to the civil society survey conducted as part of the Global Study on the implementation of resolution 1325 found that civil society around the world are concerned that implementation of the WPS agenda is hindered by the lack of political will, the "false perception that [UN Security Council resolutions are] nonbinding and attempts by governments to bypass international frameworks."¹⁸⁶ The informants of the present study described how this tendency makes their cooperation with the BNPT and other agencies unpredictable: "*Sometimes they just don't show up to meetings and events as planned. [...] Those things happen, but it does feel like they do not take us seriously.*"¹⁸⁷ Most of the informants stated that they generally felt that their voices are not heard. This was also the central message from women civil society leaders from Africa and Asia who participated in an international seminar hosted by the U.S. Institute of Peace on the role of women and women's organizations in counter-terrorism and CVE in 2015, including representatives from Indonesia. They stressed that this is true for them and women in their communities at large, and that in their respective countries and cultures, the majority of "women are not asked for their opinions," and are "not supposed to be heard, just seen."¹⁸⁸ Thus, much of their work focuses on creating platforms and safe spaces for women to voice their concerns to the government and come together to exchange experience, knowledge, and support.

However, the informants stressed that the BNPT has shown recent signs of concern regarding the perceived increase of radicalization of women in Indonesia, particularly following the 2016 arrests of the female would-be suicide bombers. The agency has again approached Fatayat NU in an attempt to reach Muslim women, and recently signed a memorandum of understanding with the group as part of the launching of a new anti-radicalism campaign.¹⁸⁹ In April, the BNPT and Fatayat NU held a joint workshop and discussion on the prevention and understanding of radicalism and terrorism, with the aim of preventing radicalism among women.¹⁹⁰ The launching of the new collaboration included the inauguration of 1,000 'anti-radicalism preachers' from Fatayat NU as 'strategic partners' to the BNPT in the work to counter the spread of radical ideologies among women.¹⁹¹ At the event, the BNPT expressed concern about the rise of radicalism and acknowledged that this also affects women and chil-

¹⁸⁵ McMinn, WPP and GPPAC (2015) 31.

¹⁸⁶ The Global Network for Women Peacebuilders (2015) 27.

¹⁸⁷ [1]

¹⁸⁸ Oudraat (2016) 23-24.

¹⁸⁹ [4]

¹⁹⁰ Tribunnews, no author (2017) (translated from Indonesian).

¹⁹¹ Jakarta Globe, (no author) (2017).

dren, emphasizing that they want the Fatayat NU partners to reach out to communities and work with families in order to stem the spread of radicalism. However, their focus on women is still highlighting the notion that women are victims, as the BNPT's statements focused on the danger of women being 'used' and targeted by radicals, particularly the danger of radicals taking advantage of the women's 'weaknesses' and 'nature.'¹⁹² Thus, while these recent developments are illustrating an intention by the government to bring the issue of women and radicalization onto the political agenda, their interest is arguably rooted in the ambition to counter terrorism and not to protect and promote women's rights in and of themselves. As such, this approach could potentially lead to measures that instrumentalize women's empowerment and participation in counter-terrorism, as seen in the research on the U.S. and U.K. strategies.¹⁹³ However, the informants were positive to this continuance of the strengthening of ties between the BNPT and civil society, but stressed that a larger number of women's organizations should be consulted, and that attention should be brought to the entire spectrum of gendered issues in the context of counter-terrorism.

Furthermore, two informants also mentioned that there was a lack of attention and understanding of these issues among Indonesian women's rights organizations. One informant expressed a wish to create wider cooperation with more women's groups on these issues, reiterating the fact that women's NGOs in general rarely count counter-terrorism among their priority concerns.¹⁹⁴ She pointed out that strong coalitions of women's groups and civil society have been very effective in the past, specifically mentioning the push and advocacy for the domestic violence bill that was successfully passed in 2004.¹⁹⁵ Thus, spreading awareness among women's groups is part of the struggle to ensure a gender-sensitive counter-terrorism approach.

In sum, women's rights activists and groups still spend a significant amount of their time and effort pushing for attention to issues relating to women and counter-terrorism. A perceived lack of political will, and the feeling of not being heard or taken seriously, is challenging their efforts to promote gender-sensitivity and women's rights in the context of counter-terrorism.

5.2.2 Gender blind spots

All of the informants explained that the notion of women's rights as a non-issue in Indonesian counter-terrorism discourse and policies also creates significant blind spots in the counter-terrorism strategy. Especially, ignoring the gender-dimension of de-radicalization efforts cre-

¹⁹² Tribunnews, no author (2017) (translated from Indonesian).

¹⁹³ Center for Human Rights and Global Justice (2012); Huckerby & Fakhri (2011).

¹⁹⁴ OSCE (2011) para 27.

¹⁹⁵ Law 23/2004 regarding the Elimination of Domestic Violence.

ates critical blind spots that trigger gendered grievances and enhances the risk of recidivism. The informants described how they are working to remedy these blind spots, particularly through reintegration programs. Primarily, the informants expressed frustration regarding the lack of any cohesive plan for the rehabilitation and reintegration of female detainees, specifically the recent wave of women who are deported back to Indonesia after attempting to migrate to Syria. While they said that the BNPT has expressed a wish to reintegrate these women back into their communities, particularly two of the informants were worried about the lack of attention to these women and their post-detention situations. This blind spot ignores their specific needs, vulnerability, and the possibility that they might decide to return to extremist networks. One informant explained that “[the government] forgets that these women are in vulnerable situations, [that they] often are left alone to care for the family, or have been rejected by their family. [...] They are able to return to the jihadists if they want to or have to.”¹⁹⁶

Relatedly, the participants of an expert seminar held by the UN Counter-Terrorism Implementation Task Force in 2008, relating to the work of the Working Group on Protecting Human Rights While Countering Terrorism, noted that the special impact of counter-terrorism measures on women and children’s social and economic rights is often disregarded.¹⁹⁷ The Special Rapporteur has also underlined such gendered collateral effects of counter-terrorism measures, particularly on female family members “who bear the burden of anxiety, harassment, social exclusion and economic hardship.”¹⁹⁸ While counter-terrorism discourse focuses on men and boys as subjects of counter-terrorism intervention, these gendered collateral impacts go unnoticed.¹⁹⁹ These concerns underline the danger of counter-terrorism measures affecting the rights of female family members, while the informants in the current study also described similar concerns for de-radicalized women returning to their communities. The CEDAW Committee has also underlined the specific challenges that women face as ex-combatants and as women associated with militant groups, and the tendency of demobilization and reintegration programs to discount these distinct needs, and sometimes exclude women entirely.²⁰⁰ As confirmed by the informants, the Committee stresses that women might face rejection and stigmatization by their families and community. Failing to address these concerns and the specific experiences of women might make it impossible for them to suc-

¹⁹⁶ [6]

¹⁹⁷ UN Counter-Terrorism Implementation Task Force Working Group (2008) para 27.

¹⁹⁸ The Special Rapporteur A/64/211 (2009) para 30.

¹⁹⁹ Huckerby (2016) 567-568.

²⁰⁰ CEDAW, *General Recommendation No. 30*, para 67.

cessfully reintegrate into family and community life.²⁰¹ In turn, the human rights of these women are put at risk:

We are worried about the specific stigma faced by women and mothers in this setting. [...] They are likely to be rejected by their communities—perhaps people will think that they failed as a mother. [...] Their former connection with the radicals makes it difficult for some of them to access basic rights [so] it is very important that we help them with new training and employment.²⁰²

Another informant described the current de-radicalization approach as “[...] *just not good enough. [Not] paying attention to their personal motivations, grievances, and hardship of managing on their own is not helpful. [...] We try to bring attention to this, and we try to step in.*”²⁰³ The informants explained that they were trying to provide these women with alternatives—alternative narratives, means of survival, and support. Consequently, the work that women’s organizations do to help remedy these situations, as also referenced in section 5.1.1, is a vital part of securing a more gender-sensitive approach to countering terrorism. As stressed by the GCTF and OSCE,²⁰⁴ this is one way that women’s organizations can play an important role as substitute service providers, for women in at-risk communities, women who are affected by counter-terrorism measures, and women who have been involved in extremist groups and terrorism activities. Most of the informants described how of their organizations have successfully provided the necessary support, vocational training, and ideological discussions (both while the women were detained and after) needed to give these women a new start or a way to reconnect with their families and communities. They explained how their abilities—as female NGO workers—to reach and build the necessary trust with the women in de-radicalization programs, and in other at-risk situations, significantly contribute to the protection and fulfillment of these women’s human rights. Additionally, the informants emphasized that they are also trying to provide safe exit-strategies for radicalized women and women involved in extremist groups, another gap in the counter-terrorism strategy that they are trying to fill. One informant mentioned that her organization was involved in plans to establish FKPTs, or similar units, specifically for women in at-risk situations and communities.²⁰⁵

Moreover, the informants stressed that the gender blind spots in the government’s counter-terrorism strategy is not only putting women’s rights at risk, but also ignores the potential for the women to be further alienated, return to extremist groups of their own free will, or plan further attacks. Their concerns are supported by the IPAC report, stressing that the women detainees who attempted to migrate to Syria pose a serious risk if they are not sufficiently

²⁰¹ CEDAW, *General Recommendation No. 30*, para 67.

²⁰² [1]

²⁰³ [5]

²⁰⁴ GCTF-OSCE (2014) 16.

²⁰⁵ [1]

accommodated and reintegrated. It points out that “they were radicalized enough to want to leave; and they may be frustrated by not having achieved their goal,” underscoring that they therefore constitute a potential source of terrorist activity.²⁰⁶ Accordingly, the informants stated that particularly this group needs urgent attention, and that the government must take their reintegration seriously: “[*The BNPT*] do not understand the consequences of neglecting these women, they will be rejected from their communities [and] return to the radical groups [...] It is a vicious circle.” Such loopholes in the de-radicalization efforts might therefore increase recidivism, or even encourage more women to plan attacks, though more research is needed on the radicalization of women in order to establish direct causal links. Women visiting their husbands who are serving time in prison for terrorist offences have also been shown to sometimes form cliques themselves, mirroring their husbands’ friendship circles.²⁰⁷ As such, Indonesia’s family oriented de-radicalization strategy—frequently facilitating visits in prisons—fails to consider the potential of these wives to act in the same way and on the same motivations as their husbands.

Moreover, women in such situations might also become the target of competing donors. While the police are assisting their families with the expectation that the women will support their husbands’ withdrawal from terrorist activities and extremist groups, there are also examples of extremist charities that believe that they are obligated to support families of detained jihadists and to reinforce their commitment to jihad.²⁰⁸ The informants were worried that the women would be inclined to accept help from such extremist charities, especially if they do not have the means of supporting themselves and their children. Without gender-sensitive de-radicalization and reintegration programs being available to them, the informants believed that some women would feel like they had little choice but to return to extremist networks. One informant suggested that stigma and shame might make it hard for the mothers to enroll their children in schools, which could lead them to turn to radical Islamic boarding schools and cause further radicalization.²⁰⁹ Relatedly, a former terrorist convict recently founded the first boarding school for children of terrorists in North Sumatra, after witnessing how the children were alienated in their neighborhoods and often did not attend school due to financial problems. Supported by the BNPT and financed by private donors, the school is meant to keep the children away from radical Islamic teachings and ensure their safe return to society.²¹⁰ The CEDAW Committee has also emphasized the serious consequences of not developing gender-sensitive reintegration programs, stressing that “isolation and economic disem-

²⁰⁶ IPAC (2017): 2.

²⁰⁷ *ibid* 9.

²⁰⁸ *ibid*.

²⁰⁹ [4]

²¹⁰ The Jakarta Post, Gunawan (2017).

powerment can force some women to remain in exploitative situations [...] or force them into new ones if they have to turn to illicit activities to provide for themselves and their dependents.²¹¹

Thus, in sum, the reintegration efforts by women's organizations are essential in tending to the consequences of gender blind spots in Indonesia's counter-terrorism strategy. By tending to women in this setting, the organizations are lowering the risk of recidivism, further exploitation, and violations of particularly their social rights. Yet, the informants underscored that funding is still a major concern, and hoped that increased attention to these issues and recognition of the importance of their work would eventually allow them to organize more long-term initiatives.

5.3 Stereotypes: Women as non-threatening

A third predominant topic in the data was the role of gender stereotypes.²¹² As suggested by literature, the informants all confirmed that gender roles and prejudices had an effect on their work in the counter-terrorism context. As an overall theme, the informants described the stereotypes of women in this context as accumulating into a notion of women being 'non-threatening,' both as 'challengers' to the heavily masculine counter-terrorism environment and as inherently peaceful and moderating influences on their 'dangerous' male husbands and relatives. Interestingly, the informants described this notion as discounting their agency as counter-terrorism actors, but also partly as a reason why they were let into the conversation in the first place. In the de-radicalization efforts, however, these prejudices were found to strengthen harmful stereotypes and contribute to the potential instrumentalization of women as tools in de-radicalization efforts as opposed to protecting their rights. The informants explained that there was a subsequent need for them to provide a counter-narrative to these prevalent stereotypes, in order to prevent negative effects and negligence of women's rights in the context of counter-terrorism. The following subsections will discuss the two identified sub-themes.

5.3.1 Women activists receiving 'special treatment'

All of the informants described their encounters and collaboration with men in the context of counter-terrorism as permeated by gendered expectations. As women, they felt that they were expected to behave in a 'ladylike' manner, also in this context. As such, they often experi-

²¹¹ CEDAW, *General Recommendation No. 30*, para 68.

²¹² While there is no definition of the term 'gender stereotypes' in any international human rights treaty, for the purposes of this study, gender stereotyping refers to the practice of ascribing to an individual woman or man specific attributes, characteristics, or roles by reason only of her or his membership in the social group of women or men, OHCHR.org.

enced that they had to ‘prove’ themselves in order to justify their presence: “*I was met with the general perceptions and stereotypes. [...] I felt like they started to listen after hearing me out—I had to prove myself for them.*”²¹³ This statement was part of one informant’s description of her experience as a moderator in meetings between the BNPT, the police, and religious groups. Significantly, the police had reached out to her and asked for her participation, but also explicitly stated that they invited her because she was a woman: “*They said, a bit jokingly, that all the participants and speakers were men [and they were] tired of looking at just men. [...] It was a kind of sexist joke. [...]*”²¹⁴ While other informants mentioned similar incidents of being met with such attitudes, the overarching impression of the informants was that their participation and presence in such settings—albeit limited—was accepted based on the general notion among the men that they, as women, did not pose a threat to their agenda or dominance.

One informant described her meetings with male Members of Parliament as pleasant, in the way that the men were actively changing their demeanor because she was a woman: “*They viewed me—a young woman—as having no hidden motive, as being naïve. They showed their ‘softer side.’*”²¹⁵ This particular observation—that the male government officials, police, politicians and others, viewed them as ‘non-threatening’ and consciously changed their conduct in the presence of ‘ladies’—was present in most of the interviews. It was discussed in several different settings within the sphere of counter-terrorism. While the informants did not indicate that they particularly appreciated being met with such prejudices, several of them did explain that such stereotypes gave them a form of leeway into the conversation, and the ability to approach the male actors in different ways than other men. One informant called this “a blessing in disguise,” because it made it easier for her to speak up and avoid being pushed aside or dismissed: “*the men and police treated me nicely—they were nicer to me than to the other [men] there. [...] It made me feel less nervous, and they let me speak first. [...] I felt like they were very understanding.*”²¹⁶ Similarly, the informant who described her experience as a moderator explained that she believed that her gender made it more ‘acceptable’ for her to interrupt the speakers when their time was up. Another informant pointed out that how she, surprisingly, had similar experiences in meetings with radicals and people in at-risk communities: “*It was surprising to me, how open they were with me [and other women activists], talking about their grievances and beliefs. They are more welcoming than expected. [...] I felt confident—that I could contribute.*”²¹⁷ This access to radical networks was described as cru-

²¹³ [3]

²¹⁴ [3]

²¹⁵ [5]

²¹⁶ [6]

²¹⁷ [1]

cial to strengthen the connection with women in these settings, as well as a way to gather more data and gain further understanding of their situation, motivations, and grievances.

Yet, despite the perceived benefits of this ‘special treatment,’ the informants also explained that they were offered this attention and ‘kindness’ mainly because they were viewed as having a certain kind of ‘value’ as women: “*They viewed me as a beautiful young woman, and therefore they think that I have value.*”²¹⁸ As such, the special treatment might enable the women’s rights activists to voice their concerns for women’s issues in the context of counter-terrorism in certain settings, as well as being welcomed more warmly by the radicals. However, as related to the discussion in section 5.2.1, the informants nonetheless felt like their actual concerns for women’s rights are still not being taken seriously, and that they themselves are generally not taken seriously as counter-terrorism actors but instead perceived as ‘ladies’ that must be treated nicely. Thus, the informants are arguably also affected by the notion of women being inherently peaceful and moderate, causing them to be welcomed and treated nicely in certain settings, but ultimately not taken seriously unless it was deemed beneficial by the state agencies.

Ultimately, the differential and prejudicial treatment of female rights activists poses the danger of overlooking their special potential in countering terrorism, and instead limiting them to stereotypical roles.²¹⁹ Thus, such stereotypes hinder the incorporation of a comprehensive gender lens in Indonesia’s counter-terrorism strategy.

5.3.2 Harmful gender stereotypes

The informants also expressed concerns about Indonesia’s current de-radicalization methodology and its contribution to the strengthening of harmful stereotypes. They were mainly concerned with the way the police approach the wives and female relatives of terrorist convicts and suspects, emphasizing the logic of women as non-threatening, nurturing, and moderate. As the soft de-radicalization measures heavily promote the reunification of convicts with their families, expecting the contact with mothers, wives, and children to motivate the terrorists to leave jihad behind, the informants were worried that they strengthen the stereotypes and expectations that assign women the specific societal roles of “*mothers, wives, and as belonging to the private domestic sphere.*”²²⁰ Several of the informants stressed that the persistence of this approach challenges their efforts to bring attention to the needs and safety of women in

²¹⁸ [3]

²¹⁹ OSCE (2014) 142.

²²⁰ [5]

the context of counter-terrorism, as well as the issues related to the participation of women in radical networks and terrorism.

The emphasis on the role of women as moderating mothers and wives denies their diverse experiences in counter-terrorism settings, and disregards their potential needs and grievances: *“The police and the BNPT view them as part of how they can ‘fix’ their husbands and sons. [...] As always peaceful and willing to help, but I worry that these women are not really taken care of.”*²²¹ Some of the informants stressed that such stereotypes suggest that women, as mothers and wives, instinctively knows what to do to convince their male relatives to abandon their ‘jihadi aspirations’ or that their presence alone is enough to achieve this. Some of the informants explained that they try to help these women by making sure that they are comfortable with the visits in prison and with being a part of their relatives’ ‘rehabilitation.’ Their concerns relate back to the literature on the dangers of securitization and instrumentalization of women as assets in security and counter-terrorism strategies, and how it might place them in vulnerable situations. As also stressed by Brown, essentializing women in the de-radicalization setting as moderating influences on violent men denies their multiple experiences and identities. Consequently, as expressed by the informants, the current de-radicalization program is overlooking the fact that the female relatives of terrorist convicts have vastly different experiences and priorities, and the possibility that dedicating themselves to the rehabilitation of their male relatives might not be the best option for them. However, the level of concern regarding this issue varied among the informants. While the majority of them referred to these stereotypes as a challenge to the development of a more gender-sensitive approach, two of them only briefly mentioned that stereotyping women as inherently peaceful is problematic, but did not state that they view this as a major issue regarding the well-being of women affected by the de-radicalization efforts.

Furthermore, the de-radicalization program is also strengthening the expected gender roles by attempting to remind the male convicts of their “earthly responsibilities as husbands and fathers,”²²² based on the logic that it contrasts the “jihadist lifestyle, which is seen to be devoid of such family life.”²²³ Brown underscores that this “notion of paternalism and the ideal family into which terrorists are to be reintegrated [...] further reaffirm the logic of protecting women,” reflecting the informants’ argument that the family oriented program strengthens the notion of women being helpless and in need of men to protect them. Likewise, the Indonesian program has also been criticized for “rest[ing] on questionable assumptions, such as the idea

²²¹ [2]

²²² A former head of Densus 88, cited in Martin (2007).

²²³ Brown (2013) 49.

that prisoner's wives and families are necessary in need of economic assistance, or that families are always pro-government and will honor their commitment to ensuring 'good behavior.'"²²⁴ Ultimately, this de-radicalization approach reinforces the idea that women's agency is located via their families, which in the context of counter-terrorism means influencing their male relatives to be less radical. Significantly, the informants explained that they felt that this approach to de-radicalization and rehabilitation also disregards their own potential to participate and contribute to the countering of terrorism, as it reinforces the idea that women's role in this setting is located in the private and domestic spheres: "*It suggests that women's issues [as well as their] agency in terrorism and counter-terrorism is not located outside the home.*"²²⁵ This further underlines the notion that terrorism and counter-terrorism are issues that affect men in the public sphere, as opposed to women, whose peaceful nature as mothers and wives remain in the private sphere—where the radicalized and violent extremist men should return to in order to leave their extremist ideologies and violent tendencies behind.

In sum, engaging female relatives of terrorist suspects and convicts in de-radicalization efforts, based on the presumption that they exclusively act as moderating and peaceful influences, contribute to the persistence of harmful gender stereotypes. The majority of the informants also perceived such stereotypes as a hindrance to their efforts to bring attention to these women's security and rights, as well as the participation of women and women's organizations in the heavily 'masculine' counter-terrorism sphere.

²²⁴ Neumann (2010) 54.

²²⁵ [2]

6 Conclusion

This thesis has studied the relationship between gender, women's rights, and counter-terrorism in Indonesia. The topic was approached by asking whether women and women's rights organizations are contributing to a more human rights compliant counter-terrorism strategy in Indonesia, and whether they are facing gender-specific challenges and barriers that hinder the incorporation of a gender lens in this strategy. In order to answer the research question, semi-structured interviews were conducted with six Indonesian women working in NGOs and with women in the context of counter-terrorism in Indonesia. The topic was approached within a broader feminist theoretical framework, drawing on arguments from feminist security theory that contests the exclusion of women's and feminist voices within counter-terrorism and international security discourses.

The findings demonstrated that women and women's rights organizations play a crucial role in promoting women's security and human rights in Indonesia's current counter-terrorism approach, and that they are facing specific gendered challenges that should be addressed as a part of integrating a gender-sensitive lens in the strategy. The three identified main themes, and their corresponding sub-themes, revealed that women and women's rights organizations are stepping in where women's issues are neglected or deemed irrelevant, pushing for attention to these issues, remedying blind spots in the strategy caused by lack of attention, lack of political will, and gender stereotypes. Their gender proved an important factor in their work, as the 'woman-to-woman connection' enables the female NGO workers to reach and gain trust among women in the counter-terrorism context and at-risk communities. Thus, they are able to aid women through de-radicalization and reintegration programs, providing vocational training, counter-narratives to extremism, and social support. The findings revealed that the lack of women in law enforcement is a significant challenge and barrier to the development of a more gender-sensitive strategy, as female police officers in counter-terrorism settings are able to provide the 'woman-to-woman connection' and potentially develop important collaboration with women's groups. Gender stereotypes were found to affect the way female NGO workers are occasionally included in the discussions, as the informants cited the feeling of being perceived as 'non-threatening' to the 'masculine' agenda and as needing 'special treatment' on the virtue of being women, instead of being included on the merits of their vital insight and contribution to a more efficient and human rights compliant counter-terrorism strategy. Moreover, the gender stereotypes reflected in the de-radicalization programs strengthen the harmful idea that women's issues remain in the private sphere, and further dismiss the diverse experiences and grievances of women in counter-terrorism settings. As such, the Indonesian government's counter-terrorism strategy is heavily gendered by resting on notions of paternalism and maternalism, while simultaneously lacking a comprehensive gender lens that would ensure the protection of women's rights and avoid further radicalization of women.

The study largely reflects the existing literature on gender and counter-terrorism, as the findings confirm that missed encounters with women in counter-terrorism also exist in Indonesia's strategy. As reflected in the literature, the study identified the presence of harmful gender stereotypes, and the persistent notion of women being inherently peaceful. However, as there is a lack of government attention to women in this setting—beyond their role as wives and mothers—the study did not identify large-scale securitization and instrumentalization of women's rights and empowerment, although it stresses that this is a potential danger that should be avoided as issues related to women's radicalization get more attention. Yet, as the existing literature and research is limited and largely focused on the extraterritorial 'War on Terror,' the main contribution of this thesis is the more detailed exploration of and insight into a highly relevant domestic setting characterized by a recent increase of women's participation in radical networks and a domestic counter-terrorism strategy that has so far been deemed as fairly successful. The findings confirm that women's rights groups and activists are currently contributing to a more efficient and human rights compliant strategy, and provides initial understanding of where and how this is happening, as well as identifying the most pressing barriers and challenges that need to be addressed in order to accommodate their work. This initial empirical evidence confirms that women's rights discourses should be concerned with issues of counter-terrorism, provides a foundation for further inquiry, as well as important direction for development of gender-sensitive policies and amendment of current counter-terrorism policies.

6.1 Recommendations and further research

Based on the findings, the Indonesian government and the relevant agencies should focus their attention on women in the counter-terrorism context by going beyond stereotypes and look at the wide range of roles that they can play in counter-terrorism, as well as their various needs and concerns as direct and indirect targets of counter-terrorism measures. The incorporation of a gender lens requires increased awareness within the counter-terrorism agencies as well as attention to the underlying societal stereotypes and prejudices that hinder the gendering of counter-terrorism. Removing discriminatory barriers to the recruitment of women in law enforcement is crucial in order to increase gender-sensitivity within the hard and soft approach, and women's rights groups should receive increased recognition and support for their de-radicalization and rehabilitation programs directed at women. The NGOs programs and monitoring in prisons and in the community should be acknowledged as key in developing a more efficient and human rights compliant strategy, as required by the international legal framework.

Given the time and resource constraints of the current thesis, a number of issues were beyond its scope and aim. The study is limited to a relatively small sample and strictly qualitative data, and focuses on identifying overall themes within a relatively new discourse. Future stud-

ies would benefit from a wider scope and the inclusion of women in other sectors, as well as government agencies, to get a broader and perhaps more varied picture of the situation. Similar studies could also be conducted regarding sexual minorities. Finally, replicating similar studies within and across other countries, particularly other Southeast Asian nations such as Singapore and Malaysia, would add to the gradually increasing knowledge and understanding of this relatively new topic. Hopefully, the current case study has provided valuable initial insight into the significance of gender in the relationship between human rights and counter-terrorism.

List of references*

Treaties

CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women (Adopted and opened for signature, ratification and accession by General Assembly resolution 34/180 of 18 December 1979) 1249 UNTS 13

United Nations Resolutions

UN General Assembly, Res 60/288 (2006), *The United Nations Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy*, 8 September 2006, U.N. Doc. A/RES/60/288

UN General Assembly, Res 68/276 (2014), *The United Nations Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy Review*, 13 June 2014, U.N. Doc. A/RES/68/276

UN General Assembly, Res 68/178 (2014), Protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism, 18 December 2013, U.N. Doc. A/RES/68/178

UN Security Council, Res 1325 (2000), [*on women and peace and security*], 31 October 2000, S/RES/1325

UN Security Council, Res 1373 (2001), [*on threats to international peace and security caused by terrorist acts*], 28 September 2001, S/RES/1373

UN Security Council, Res 1456 (2003), [*on combating terrorism*], 20 January 2003, S/RES/1456

UN Security Council, Res 1624 (2005), [*on threats to international peace and security*], 14 September 2005, S/RES/1624

UN Security Council, Res 2178 (2014), [*on combating terrorism*], 24 September 2014, S/RES/2178

UN Security Council, Res 2242 (2015), [*on women and peace and security*], 13 October 2015, S/RES/2242

UN Human Rights Council, Res 6/28 (2007), *Protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism: mandate of the Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism*, 14 December 2007, A/HRC/RES/6/28

General Comments

UN Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women, *General recommendation No. 30 on women in conflict prevention, conflict and post-conflict situations*, 2013

Domestic laws and regulations

Indonesia: Presidential Decree No. 181 of 1998, *on the National Commission on Anti-Violence Against Women*, 9 October 1998.

Indonesia: Law No. 39 of 1999, *on Human Rights*, 23 September 1999.

Indonesia: Law No. 15 of 2003, *on Combating Terrorism*, 4 April 2003.

Indonesia: Law No. 23 of 2004, *on the Elimination of Domestic Violence*, 22 September 2004.

Other documents and reports

Butt, S., 2014, 'The Position of International Law Within the Indonesian Legal System,' *Emory International Law Review*, Vol. 28, No. 1, pp. 1-28

Fink, C. N., Barakat, R. and Shetret, L., 2013, 'Policy Brief: The Roles of Women in Terrorism, Conflict, and Violent Extremism: Lessons for the United Nations and International Actors' *Center on Global Counterterrorism and Cooperation*

Global Counterterrorism Forum (GCTF) and Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE), 2014, 'GCTF-OSCE International Workshop on 'Supporting Civil Society Initiatives to Empower Women's Roles in Countering Violent Extremism and Radicalization that Lead to Terrorism,' Istanbul, 13-14 May 2014

Global Counterterrorism Forum (GCTF), 2015, *Good Practices on Women and Countering Violent Extremism*

Holmer, G., 2013, 'Countering Violent Extremism: A Peacebuilding Perspective,' *United States Institute of Peace*

Human Rights Watch, 2014, 'Indonesia: 'Virginity Tests' for female Police: 'Testing' Applicants is Discriminatory, Cruel, Degrading,' available from:

<https://www.hrw.org/news/2014/11/17/indonesia-virginity-tests-female-police>

Indonesia National Commission on Violence against Women (Komnas Perempuan), 2011, *National Human Rights Institution Independent Report: Regarding the Implementation of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women in Indonesia, 2007-2011* (Submitted to the CEDAW Committee, 8 October 2011)

Institute for Police Analysis of Conflict (IPAC), 2017, 'Mothers to Bombers: The Evolution of Indonesian Women Extremists,' *IPAC Report No. 35*

Institute for Policy Analysis of Conflict (IPAC), 2014, 'Countering Violent Extremism in Indonesia: Need for a Rethink,' *IPAC Report No. 11*

McMinn, K., 2015, *Candid Voices from the Field: Obstacles to a Transformative Women, Peace and Security Agenda and to Women's Meaningful Participation in Building Peace and Security*, Women Peacemakers Program (WPP), Global Partnership for the Prevention of Armed Conflict and Cordaid

Neimanis, A., 2005, *Gender Mainstreaming in Practice: A Handbook*, UNPD Regional Centre for Europe and the CIS (UNDP RBEC)

Neumann, P. R., 2010, *Prisons and Terrorism, Radicalisation and De-radicalisation in 15 countries*, International Centre for the Study of Radicalisation and Political Violence (ICSR)

O'Rourke, L., 2009, 'What's Special about Female Suicide Terrorism?' *Security Studies*, Vol. 18, No. 4, pp. 681-718

Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE), 2013, *Women and Terrorist Radicalization: Final Report*

Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE), 2014, *Preventing Terrorism and Countering Violent Extremism and Radicalization that Lead to Terrorism: A Community—Policing Approach*

The Global Network of Women Peacebuilders, 2015, *Global Report: Civil Society Organization (CSO) Survey for the Global Study on Women, Peace and Security—CSO Perspectives on UNSCR 1325 Implementation 15 Years after Adoption*

U.S. Department of State, 2016, *Country Reports on Terrorism 2015*, pp. 67-72, available at: <https://www.state.gov/j/ct/rls/crt/2015/257515.htm>

UN Counter-Terrorism Implementation Task Force Working Group, 2008, 'Protecting Human Rights while Countering Terrorism,' Expert Seminar on 'The Impact of Terrorism and Counter-terrorism Measures on the Enjoyment of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ESCR)

UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, 2015, 'Open Briefing – Remarks from OHCHR – the United Nations,' available from: <http://www.un.org/en/sc/ctc/docs/2015/Open%20Briefing%20-%20OHCHR%20Remarks.pdf>

UN Report of the Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism, 2016, U.N. Doc. A/HRC/31/65

UN Security Council Counter-Terrorism Committee, 2016, 'In a first for the counter-terrorism committee, the security council holds open briefing on the role of women in countering terrorism and violent extremism,' available at: https://www.un.org/en/sc/ctc/news/2015-08-20_Role_of_Women.html

UN Security Council, 2014, 'Statement by the President of the Security Council,' 28 October 2014, S/PRST/2014/21

UN Security Council, 2015, 'Security Council Unanimously Adopts Resolution 2242 (2015) to Improve Implementation of Landmark Text on Women, Peace, Security Agenda,' 7533RD Meeting (AM), SC/12076, available at: <https://www.un.org/press/en/2015/sc12076.doc.htm>

UN Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism, 2009, U.N. Doc. A/64/211

UN Women, 2015, *Preventing Conflict, Transforming Justice, Securing the Peace – A Global Study on the Implementation of United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325*, available at: <http://wps.unwomen.org/en>

United States Institute of Peace, 2015, *Charting a New Course: Thought for Action Kit, Women Preventing Violent Extremism*

Secondary Literature

Amnesty International, 2016, 'Indonesia: Police chief's shocking torture admission only tip of iceberg.' Available at: <https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2016/04/indonesia-police-chief-shocking-torture-admission-only-tip-of-iceberg/>

Anderson, C., 2010, 'Presenting and Evaluating Qualitative Research,' *American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education*, Vol. 78, No. 8, pp. 1-7

Aoláin, F. N., 2013, 'Situating Women in Counterterrorism Discourses: Undulating Masculinities and Liminal Femininities,' *Boston University Law Review*, Vol. 93, No. 3, pp. 1085-1122

Aoláin, F. N., 2016, 'The 'War on Terror' and Extremism: Assessing the Relevance of the Women, Peace and Security Agenda,' *International Affairs*, Vol. 92, No. 2, pp. 275-291

Arnez, M., 2010, 'Empowering Women Through Islam: Fatayat NU Between Tradition and Change,' *Journal of Islamic Studies*, Vol. 21, No. 1, pp. 59-88

Beyers, J., Braun, C., Marshall, D and De Bruycker, I., 2014, 'Let's Talk! On the practice and method of interviewing policy experts,' *Interest Groups & Advocacy*, Vol. 3, No. 2, pp. 174-187

Blanchard, E. M., 2003, 'Gender, International Relations, and the Development of Feminist Security Theory,' *Signs*, Vol. 28, No. 4, pp. 1289-1321

Bloom, M., 2012, *Bombshell: Women and Terrorism*, University of Pennsylvania Press

Brown, K. E., 2013, 'Gender and counter-radicalization: women and emerging counter-terror measures,' in Satterthwaite M. L. and Huckerby J. C. (Eds.), *Gender, National Security, and Counter-Terrorism: Human Rights Perspectives*, Routledge, pp. 36-59.

Bryman, A., 2012, *Social research methods*, 4th ed. Oxford University Press

Center for Human Rights and Global Justice, 2012, *Women and Preventing Violent Extremism: The U.S. and U.K. Experiences*, NYU School of Law

Clarke, V. and Braun, V., 2013, 'Teaching thematic analysis: Overcoming challenges and development strategies for effective learning.' *The Psychologist*, Vol. 26, No. 2, pp. 120-123

Cohen, N. and Arieli, T., 2011, 'Field research in conflict environments: Methodological challenges and snowball sampling,' *Journal of Peace and Research*, Vol. 48, No. 4, pp. 423-435

De Vita, E., 2009, 'Do You Trust Your Boss?' *Management Today*, 1 September 2009, pp. 44-48.

Dharmapuri, S., 2016, 'UN Security Council Resolution 1325 and Countering Violent Extremism: Using a Gender Perspective to Enhance Operational Effectiveness,' in in CVE,' in Fink N. C. and Zeiger S. (Eds.), *A Man's World? Exploring the Roles of Women in Countering Terrorism and Violent Extremism*, Hadayah and the Global Center on Cooperative Security, pp. 36-52

Gibbs, G. R., 2007, *Analyzing qualitative data*. London: Sage

Gunaratna, R. and Bin Ali, M. (Eds.), 2015, *Terrorist Rehabilitation: A New Frontier in Counter-Terrorism*, Imperial College Press

Hesse-Biber, S. N. (Ed.), 2012, *The Handbook of Feminist Research, Theory and Praxis*. 2nd Edition, Sage

Höglund, A. T and Theol, D., 2008, 'It's easier to talk to a woman.' Aspects of gender in Swedish telenursing,' *Journal of Clinical Nursing*, 17, pp. 2979-2986

Horgan, J. and Braddock K., 2010, 'Rehabilitating the Terrorists?: Challenges in Assessing the Effectiveness of De-radicalization Programs,' *Terrorism and Political Violence*, Vol. 22, No. 2, pp. 267-291

Horowitz, D. L., 2013, *Constitutional Change and Democracy in Indonesia*, Cambridge University Press

Huckerby, J. C. and Fakih, L., 2011, *A Decade Lost: Locating Gender in U.S. Counter-Terrorism*, Center for Human Rights and Global Justice (CHR&GJ)

Huckerby, J. C., 2014, 'Gender, counter-terrorism and international law,' in Saul B. (Ed.), *Research Handbook on International Law and Terrorism*, Edward Elgar, pp. 163-176

Huckerby, J., 2015, 'Blindspots,' in *Charting a New Course: Thought for Action Kit, Women Preventing Violent Extremism*, United States Institute of Peace, pp. 12

Huckerby, J., 2015, 'Gender, Violent Extremism, and Countering Violent Extremism,' *Just Security*, Available at: <https://www.justsecurity.org/20620/gender-violent-extremism-countering-violent-extremism-cve/>

Huckerby, J., 2016, 'Feminism and International Law in the Post-9/11 Era,' *Fordham International Law Journal*, Vol. 39, No. 533, pp. 533-590

Human Rights Watch, 2016, 'Indonesia: Terror Law Amendments Should Not Threaten Rights.' Available at: <https://www.hrw.org/news/2016/02/09/indonesia-terror-law-amendments-should-not-threaten-rights>

Kassem, R., 2013, 'Gendered erasure in the global 'War on Terror': An unmasked interrogation,' in Satterthwaite M. L. and Huckerby J. C. (Eds.), *Gender, National Security, and Counter-Terrorism: Human Rights Perspectives*, Routledge, pp. 15-35

Koehler, D., 2010, *Understanding Deradicalization: Methods, Tools and Programs for Countering Violent Extremism*, Routledge

Kunz, R., 2014, 'Gender and Security Sector Reform: Gendering Differently?' *International Peacekeeping*, Vol. 21, No. 5, pp. 604-622

Lavina, R., 2015, Note, 'Women in Terrorism: How the Rise of Female Terrorists Impacts International Law,' *30 Connecticut Journal of International Law*, 241

Lecarte, J., 2014, 'Indonesia: Human Rights Situation.' European Parliamentary Research Service Blog, available at: <https://epthinktank.eu/2014/10/29/indonesia-human-rights-situation/>

Levy J. S., 2008, 'Case Studies: Types, Designs, and Logic of Interference,' *Conflict Management and Peace Science*, Vol. 25, No. 1, pp. 1-18

Millar, A., 2015, 'Women on the Front Lines,' in *Charting a New Course: Thought for Action Kit, Women Preventing Violent Extremism*, United States Institute of Peace, pp. 9-10

Morris, J. M., 'Women, Terrorism, and Counterterrorism: Crafting Effective Security Policies,' in *Women on the Frontlines of Peace and Security*, National Defense University Press

Nesiah V., 2013, 'Feminism as counter-terrorism: the seduction of power,' in Satterthwaite M. L. and Huckerby J. C. (Eds.), *Gender, National Security, and Counter-Terrorism: Human Rights Perspectives*, Routledge, pp. 127-151

Noorhaidi, H., 2011, 'Towards a Population-Centric Strategy: Indonesian Experience in Countering Islamist Radicalism and Terrorism.' *International Centre for Counter-Terrorism – The Hague (ICCT)*, available at: <https://icct.nl/publication/towards-a-population-centric-strategy-indonesian-experience-in-countering-islamist-radicalism-and-terrorism/>

Oudraat, C. J., 2016, 'Preventing and Countering Violent Extremism: The Role of Women and Women's Organizations,' in Fink N. C. and Zeiger S. (Eds.), *A Man's World? Exploring the Roles of Women in Countering Terrorism and Violent Extremism*, Hadayah and the Global Center on Cooperative Security, pp. 18-35

Rabasa, A., Pettyjohn, S. L., Ghez, J. J. and Boucek, C., 2010, *Deradicalizing Islamist Extremists*, National Security Research Division

Ramraj V., 2012, 'Anti-terrorism efforts in Indonesia,' in Ramraj V., Hor M., Roach K., and Williams G. (Eds.), *Global Anti-Terrorism Law and Policy*, 2nd Edition, Cambridge University Press, pp. 290-309

Ryan, G. W. and Bernard, H. R., 2003, 'Techniques to Identify Themes,' *Field Methods*, Vol. 15, No. 1, pp. 85-109

Saltman, E. M. and Frenett, R., 2016, 'Female Radicalization in ISIS and the Role of Women in CVE,' in Fink N. C. and Zeiger S. (Eds.), *A Man's World? Exploring the Roles of Women in Countering Terrorism and Violent Extremism*, Hadayah and the Global Center on Cooperative Security, pp. 142-162

Saltman, E. M. and Smith, M., 2015, "'T Martyrdom Do Us Part' *Gender and the ISIS Phenomenon*," Institute for Strategic Dialogue

Satterthwaite M. L., and Huckerby J. C., 2013, *Gender, National Security, and Counter-Terrorism: Human Rights Perspectives*, Routledge

Scheinin M., 2013, 'Foreword: Gender and counter-terrorism – reflections by a former United Nations Special Rapporteur,' in Satterthwaite M. L. and Huckerby J. C. (Eds.), *Gender, National Security, and Counter-Terrorism: Human Rights Perspectives*, Routledge

Sisters Against Violent Extremism (SAVE), Schlaffer, E. and Kropiunigg, U., 2015, *Can Mothers Challenge Extremism? Mother's perceptions and attitudes of radicalization and violent extremism*, Women Without Borders

Stenbacka, C., 2001, 'Qualitative research requires quality concepts of its own,' *Management Decision*, Vol. 39, No. 7, pp. 551-555

Stiehm, J. H. (Ed.), 1983, *Women and Men's Wars*. Oxford: Pergamon

Stone, L., 2015, 'Quantitative Analysis of Women's participation in Peace Processes' in Marie O'Reilley, Andrea Ó Súilleabháin and Thania Paffenholz (Eds), *Reimagining Peacemaking: Women's Roles in Peace Processes*, International Peace Institute, pp. 34, available from: <https://www.ipinst.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/06/IPI-E-pub-Reimagining-Peacemaking-rev.pdf>

Sukma, R., 2012, 'The Role of Civil Society in Indonesia's Military Reform.' in Jürgen Rüländ, Maria-Gabriela Manea, and Hans Born (Eds.), *The Politics of Military Reform Experiences from Indonesia and Nigeria*, Springer, pp. 147-160

Sumpter, C., 2017, 'Reintegrating Extremist Prisoners in Indonesia: Easier Said Than Done.' *The Diplomat*, available at: <http://thediplomat.com/2017/03/reintegrating-extremist-prisoners-in-indonesia-easier-said-than-done/>

Tansey, O., 2007, 'Process Tracing and Elite Interviewing: A Case for Non-Probability Sampling,' *PS: Political Science & Politics*, Vol. 40, No. 4, pp. 765-772

Vakil, A., 1997, 'Confronting the classification problem: toward a taxonomy of NGOs,' *World Development*, Vol. 25, No. 12, pp. 2057-2071

Van Ginkel, B., 2012, 'Engaging Civil Society in Countering Violent Extremism: Experiences with the UN Global Counter-Terrorism Strategy,' *International Centre for Counter-Terrorism – The Hague (ICCT)*

Wienberg, L. and Eubank, W., 2011, 'Women's Involvement in Terrorism,' *Gender Issues*, Vol. 28, No. 1, pp. 22-49.

Wulan, L., 2015, 'Alumni Perspectives: Enhancing the Role of Women in Indonesia to Counter Terrorism,' *Asia Pacific Center for Security Studies*, 20 January 2015

Yin, R. K., 2009, *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*, 4th ed. Sage

News stories and electronic sources

ABC News, 2007, Martin, D. 'Bali bomber now campaigns to stop terrorism.' Available at: <http://www.abc.net.au/news/2007-09-20/bali-bomber-now-campaigns-to-stop-terrorism/676116>

ABS News, Harvey, A., 2017, 'Indonesia not prepared to deal with female extremist threat, expert says,' available at: <http://www.abc.net.au/news/2017-01-14/indonesia-not-prepared-for-potential-female-terrorists-expert/8181796>

Interpol (no date), 'Indonesia,' available at: <https://www.interpol.int/Member-countries/Asia-South-Pacific/Indonesia>

Jakarta Globe, 2017, no author, 'Indonesian Women Urged to Unite Against Radicalism.' Available at: <http://www.jakartaglobe.beritasatu.com/news/indonesian-women-urged-to-unite-against-radicalism/>

Komnas Perempuan (no date) *Profile*, available at: <http://en.komnasperempuan.go.id/about/profil/>

Komnas Perempuan, 2013, 'Komnas Perempuan Press Release: Discriminative Policies against the Constitution,' available from: <http://en.komnasperempuan.go.id/2013/08/komnas-perempuan-press-release-discriminative-policies-against-the-constitution/>

Komnas Perempuan, 2013, 'Position Statement: Virginitiy Test is against the Constitution and Impedes Efforts to Eliminate Violence against Women,' available from: <http://en.komnasperempuan.go.id/2013/08/position-statement-virginitiy-test-is-against-the-constitution-and-impedes-efforts-to-eliminate-violence-against-women/>

Office of the High Commissioner of Human Rights, (no date), *Gender stereotypes/stereotyping*, available at: <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Women/WRGS/Pages/GenderStereotypes.aspx>

Reuters, 2016, Allard, T. and Kapoor, K., 'Fighting back: How Indonesia's elite police turned the tide on militants.' Available at: <http://www.reuters.com/article/us-indonesia-security-idUSKBN14C0X3>

The Conversation, Baker, J., 2014, 'Indonesia's police 'virginity tests' fit pattern of flagrant rights abuses,' available at: <http://theconversation.com/indonesias-police-virginity-tests-fit-pattern-of-flagrant-rights-abuses-34801>

The Guardian, 2017, Lamb, K., 'Indonesian women being radicalised into would-be suicide bombers – report.' Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/feb/04/indonesian-women-being-radicalised-into-would-be-suicide-bombers-report>

The Jakarta Globe, 2016, Sihaloho, M. J., 'PAN Calls for Densus 88 Audit After Terror Suspect's Death.' 2016. Available at: <http://www.jakartaglobe.beritasatu.com/news/pan-calls-densus-88-audit-terror-suspects-death/>

The Jakarta Post, 2016, Halim, H., Dipa A. and Fadli. 'Police step up cyberoperation.' Available at: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2016/12/23/police-step-up-cyberoperation.html>

The Jakarta Post, 2017, Araf, A. and Evitarossi, S. 'Antiterrorism bill threatens law enforcement system.' Available from: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2017/01/06/antiterrorism-bill-threatens-law-enforcement-system.html>

The Jakarta Post, 2017, Gunawan, A. 'New school aims to care for children of terrorists.' Available at: <https://www.pressreader.com/indonesia/the-jakarta-post/20170227/281659664817830>

The Jakarta Post, 2017, Halim, H. 'Bahrin Naim's Wife among deportees housed in shelter.' Available at: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2017/02/07/bahrin-naims-wife-among-deportees-housed-in-shelter.html>

The Jakarta Post, 2017, Ramadhani, N. F., 'House calls for stronger terrorism law.' Available at: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2017/03/06/house-calls-for-stronger-terrorism-law.html>

The Jakarta Post, Anindya, C. R., 2017, 'Deradicalization must involve women,' available from: <https://www.pressreader.com/indonesia/the-jakarta-post/20170208/281659664781469>

The Jakarta Post, Dewi, E. A., 2016, 'Terrorism Law revision continues despite criticism,' available at: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2016/07/31/terrorism-law-revision-continues-despite-criticism.html>

The Jakarta Post, Hanifah, H., 2016, 'Gendering terrorism in Indonesia,' available at: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/academia/2016/12/30/gendering-terrorism-in-indonesia>

The Jakarta Post, Ramadhani, N. F. and Aritonang, M. S., 2017, 'Deradicalization efforts failing: Police,' available from: <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2017/03/01/deradicalization-efforts-failing-police.html>

Time, 2016, Rivett-Carnac, M., 'These Are the Last Six Major Terrorist Attacks in Indonesia.' Available at: <http://time.com/4180220/indonesia-terrorist-attacks-history-jakarta/>

Tribunnews, 2017, no author, 'BNPT dan Fatayat NU Melantik 500 Daiyah Anti Radikalism Fatayat NU.' Available at: <http://www.tribunnews.com/nasional/2017/04/21/bnpt-dan-fatayat-nu-melantik-500-daiyah-anti-radikalisme-fatayat-nu>

United Nations Peacekeeping, (no date), *Women, peace and security*, available at: <http://www.un.org/en/peacekeeping/issues/women/wps.shtml>

* All electronic sources were accessed 15 May 2017.

Appendices

Appendix 1: Interview guide

Interview Guide for Semi-Structured Interviews (topics for discussion)

Introduction:

- Introductions: *name, program, university.*
- Objective and aim of the thesis: *explaining the topic of interest, the aim, and expectations for the interview.*
- Issues of confidentiality and consent: *interviews are voluntary and informant can terminate the interview at any point. Question of anonymity. Ask whether the interview can be recorded. Inform the informant that the recordings will be destroyed upon completion of the study.*

Background information:

- *Could you briefly explain your work, the contents of your job, and how it relates to women's rights?*
 - *Where*
 - *What kind of organization*
 - *Focus of organization*
- *Could you explain how your work relates to countering terrorism and CVE in Indonesia?*
 - *To what degree*
 - *Directly/indirectly*
 - *Relation/connection to government agencies, strategy*

Main questions:

- *Do you feel that you are able to participate and contribute to the countering of terrorism in Indonesia?*
 - *How*
 - *[Why not]*
- *What is the significance of your gender in this setting?*
 - *Positive/negative*
 - *Compared to men*
 - *Working with men/women*
- *To what degree is gender and counter-terrorism/radicalization a topic of discussion?*
 - *Public discourse*
 - *Civil society, NGOs*
 - *Government*
 - *Sensitive topic, etc.*

- *To your knowledge/in your opinion, how is the promotion and protection of women's rights related to counter-terrorism in Indonesia (in general)?*
 - *Specific grievances, issues, challenges*
 - *Relationship between counter-terrorism strategy and obligations under CEDAW, etc.*
 - *Soft approach*
 - *Hard approach*
- *To your knowledge/in your opinion, are women's rights organizations/groups in general contributing to counter-terrorism and de-radicalization efforts in Indonesia?*
 - *How*
 - *To what degree*
 - *Increasing relevance, radicalization of women*
- *In general, how/where can women act as efficient counter-terrorism actors?*
- *Are you and your organization/colleagues facing gender-specific challenges when working within the context of counter-terrorism?*
 - *What kind of challenges*
 - *How is it affecting the participation of women's and women's rights organization in this context*
 - *How to challenge and change this*
- *Any recent (significant) developments (regarding strategy, approach)?*
 - *Positive/negative*
- *In your opinion, what are some steps/changes needed to develop a comprehensive gender-lens in Indonesia?*
 - *Policies, legislation, measures*
 - *Civil society*

Summing up/end:

- *Anything to add? Last questions?*
- Thank the informant, end the interview and the recording.

Appendix 2: List of informants

Informant	Date	Communication	Type of organization
1	13.03.2017	Interview via Skype	National NGO, focusing on peace building and reintegration
2	15.03.2017	Interview via Skype	National NGO, focusing on peace building and reintegration
3	19.03.2017	Interview via Skype	Local women’s rights NGO
4	29.03.2017	Interview via Skype	National women’s rights NGO, also a faith-based civil society group
5	05.04.2017	Interview via Skype	Regional human rights NGO
6	06.04.2017	Interview via Skype	National women’s rights NGO