


The Ḥónglóu mèng 紅樓夢 and its Sequels: 
Paths towards and away from Modernity

Halvor Eifring
(Universitetet i Oslo)

Despite its display of an almost encyclopaedic knowledge of traditional Chinese culture, the mid-18th-century novel Ḥónglóu mèng 紅樓夢 by Cáo Xuéqīn 曹雪芹 has struck many readers as being surprisingly modern.¹ The novel represents a path to modernity in at least three respects. First, it is psychologically far subtler than any other work of traditional Chinese fiction, and it may be analysed as an exploration of psychological forces pitched against each other. Second, it has more poly-semantic complexity than any other work of traditional Chinese fiction, merging as it does a multiplicity of plots, themes, ideas and ideologies, some of them mutually contradictory, into a larger artistic whole. Third, it has a strong tragic element, and while tragedies are one of the oldest forms of literature in the Western literary canon, their introduction into China is strongly associated with modernity.²

If the Ḥónglóu mèng represents a path to modernity, however, the reception of this novel seems to represent a step backwards, a path away from modernity. The novel’s psychological subtleties tend to be lost,

¹ I would like to express my gratitude for comments from participants at the “Paths toward Modernity” conference in Prague, as well as scholars and students present at a lecture arranged by Kuo Yu-wen at the National Taiwan University in Taipei in November 2006.

² On the novel’s psychological subtletness and poly-semantic complexity, see Eifring 2004 and the references there. On the tragic element in Ḥónglóu mèng, see Wáng Guóweí 1984. On the introduction of the tragedy as a dramatic genre into Chinese literature, see Natascha Gentz’ contribution to this volume.
its multiple layers of meaning tend to be reduced, and wherever possible, its tragic elements are simply done away with and replaced with happy endings.

The reception of a complex novel like the *Honglou meng* almost by necessity consists in the reduction of the novel to manageable chunks of meaning. Different readers will emphasise different aspects of the novel, to the exclusion of other aspects. Confronting such interpretations with "the text itself" will hopefully reveal the one-sidedness of the interpretations and expand our understanding both of the novel and of the processes of reading and interpretation.

In the history of the reception of the *Honglou meng*, this one-sidedness has privileged Lin Daiyu and the romantic aspects of the novel with a much more central role than the less sentimental aspects of the novel represented by, among others, Wang Xifeng. In addition, the reception of the novel typically casts Xifeng as a more unequivocally evil person than she is in the original novel.

There are many interesting sources for the reception of *Honglou meng*, such as the critical commentaries that have followed the novel from the very beginning, the various prefaces also written right from the start, poems on the novel etc. One type of text that has been little explored as a source for the reception of the novel is the large number of sequels to the *Honglou meng*. This is what I will attempt to do in the present paper.

Seeing sequels as evidence for the reception of a novel is not unproblematic, and my approach must be seen as an experiment. Sequels, in a much more obvious way than commentaries, have an agenda of their own. They are not primarily constructed to give interpretations of the novel, but to work as literary pieces in their own regard. Still, sequels are always based on interpretations of the original work, and even when they clearly deviate from it, they presumably tell us something about how the author of the sequel (who is at the same time a reader of the original work) would have liked the original work to be.


**Hönglöu mèng and its sequels**

Depending on how we define the term "sequel", there exist anything between 13 and almost a hundred different sequels to the *Hönglöu mèng*. In a wide sense of the term, Zhao Jiànzhòng (1997) counts 98 sequels, including novels that borrow the names of the characters but not the storyline of the original, novels that borrow themes from the original but rewrite the plot, and more recent attempts to replace the last 40 chapters with alternative endings that modern textual research presumably shows to be more in line with Cão Xuëqìn's original intention. Many of these so-called sequels only have a very loose connection to the *Hönglöu mèng*.\(^4\) Zhao's main group of sequels, however, numbers only 13 works, of which most were written during the Qing dynasty. These are regular sequels in a narrow sense. While most of them build on the full 120-chapter version of the novel, three take off from Dàiyù's death in chapter 97, and one takes off from another sequel written by the same author.

In the present paper, I shall look into five of these sequels, viz. the first five sequels to appear after the novel was first printed in the early 1790s:

- *Hòu Hönglöu mèng* 後紅樓夢 by Xiàoyáozì 逍遥子 (printed 1796)
- *Xù Hönglöu mèng* 續紅樓夢 by Qín Zíchén 秦子忱 (printed 1799)
- *Qílōu chóngmèng* 綺樓重夢 by Wáng Lánzhī 王蘭沚 (printed ca. 1799)
- *Hönglöu fùmèng* 紅樓復夢 by Chén Shàohái 陳少海 (printed 1805)
- *Xù Hönglöu mèng* 續紅樓夢 by Hāipū zhùrén 海圃主人 (printed ca. 1805)

In order to understand the readings of the *Hönglöu mèng* represented by these sequels, however, it is also necessary to treat what is (and certainly was) usually regarded as the last 40 chapters of the novel as a sequel in its own right. This sequel, whether it was written by Gào È 高鹗 and Chéng Wéiyuán 程偉元 or somebody else, started a process of interpretation on which later sequels were forced to build. Although some readers continued to doubt the authenticity of the last 40 chapters,\(^5\) the repeated publication

---

\(^4\) As pointed out by McMahon (2004: 100), many independent novels, such as the *Ērnû yìngxióng zhuàn* 兒女英雄傳, *Pínhuā Bàojiàn* 品花寶鑑, and *Qínglōu mèng* 青樓夢, also build on the *Hönglöu mèng* and might be regarded as sequels, in which case the total number of sequels exceeds one hundred.
Paths Toward Modernity (Changing Conceptions)

in print of the full 120-chapter version from 1791 onwards made it impossible to disregard them. From now on, most readers, probably including the sequel writers, simply looked upon the 120-chapter version as the original work. My analysis, therefore, will start by looking into the readings imposed on the novel by the last 40 chapters, which is in fact the very first sequel to the unfinished 80-chapter novel written by Cáo Xuêqín. For simplicity, I will continue to refer to them as “the last 40 chapters” and to Cáo’s original work as “the first 80 chapters”.

Beyond triangular love

The most conventional view of Hónglóu mèng is as a triangular love story. Lín Dàiyù is seen as the second most important character in the novel, after Jià Bāoyù 賈寶玉. Their love story, and the cruel intrusion of Xuè Bāochāi 薛寶釵, eventually leading (in the last 40 chapters) to the marriage of Bāoyù and Bāochāi and the death of Dàiyù, is viewed as the main storyline. The main focus of the novel is understood to be life in the Dàguān yuán 大觀園 and the sentimental love that unfolds there, as well as the equally sentimental sadness at the falling apart of life in the garden and the loss of love. Of the “two worlds” of the Hónglóu mèng discussed by Yú Yǐngshí (1978), the conventional view gives clear priority to the world of love and sadness and the doomed relation between Bāoyù and Dàiyù.

Nobody would seriously dispute the importance of the triangular love story and of the role of Dàiyù in large parts of the novel. But the Hónglóu mèng is a polyphonic novel, with several themes, plots and storylines working alongside each other, none of them having absolute priority over the other. The problem with the conventional view is not so much that it is wrong, as that it tends to reduce to background material aspects of the novel that do not fit into the triangular love story.

The many themes, plots and storylines associated with Wáng Xífèng are a case in point. Because the conventional view sees her primarily as an evil and destructive force, her role in the novel tends to be played down. A close reading of the text, however, not only shows how her greed and lust for power are balanced by a number of positive traits (her administrative
talent, her charm, her humour, her care for and protection of others, and her rare ability to face the dire consequences of her own misdeeds with some degree of self-reflection), but also that she is a much more central character than usually assumed. Along with Bāoyù, she is one of the two main axes (or pillars) around which the narrative of the Hönglöu méng revolves and evolves. The novel takes great pains to create a close structural relation between these two characters.

Xifeng vs. Daiyü

Before we go on to look at the sequels, therefore, it will be useful to look briefly at Xifeng's role in the first 80 chapters.

Xifeng is actually a more central person in the novel than Daiyü. Quantitatively, the love relation between Bāoyù and Dāiyù has been calculated to account for only one tenth of the novel, and in most of the novel there is no reference to their love relation at all. Direct descriptions of the love relation between Bāoyù and Dāiyù are mainly concentrated in chapters 17–36, and after chapter 45, the triangular love relation is not a central motif. As for Xifeng, her various names are mentioned more often than Dāiyù's, direct descriptions of her are more frequent, and a larger number of chapters have a substantial text on her. After chapter 45, Dāiyù is a quite peripheral character, and even Bāoyù is less central than Xifeng.

---

9 The names (Wáng) Xifeng 王熙凤, Fèngjiē(r) 凤姐兒, Fènggē(r) 凤哥兒, Fèng làizi 凤辣子, Fèng gūniang 凤姑娘, Fèng yātou 凤丫头, Fèng ér 凤兒, Lián ér năinai 琦二奶奶 occur 1319 times in the first 80 chapters of the novel, as opposed to 1100 times for (Lín) Dāiyù 林黛玉, Lin mēimei 林妹妹, Lin gūniang 林姑娘, Lin yātou 林丫头, Xiāoxiāng fēizi 清湘妃子, Pin'ér 颦兒, Pin-pin 颦颦, Pin yātou 颦丫头, Pin qīng 请卿.
10 According to Hū Wénwéi (1995), 23 percent of the novel contains direct descriptions of Xifeng, while only 20 percent contains direct descriptions of Dāiyù.
11 According to Zhōu Wūchún (1997: 226f.), 44 chapters have a text of more than 500 characters concerning Xifeng, as opposed to only 37 chapters concerning Dāiyù.
More important than quantitative comparisons is the fact that Xifēng is a highly autonomous character, whose role is largely independent of Bāoyù. She often acts as the main character in passages where Bāoyù is absent, or even in passages where he is present but less central, and she is clearly a driving force behind the progression of the narrative. As a character, she stands out as the one who shows the clearest development in the course of the novel, from a self-assured and power-oriented character to a fearful person with deteriorating health and diminishing power, and with an increasing propensity for self-reflection. In contrast, Dàiyù is largely a satellite circling around Bāoyù. She plays virtually no independent role in bringing the narrative forward, and she hardly develops at all as a character. Her autonomy as a character is restricted to a few lyrical—and admittedly unforgettable—passages, such as her burial of flowers, or her reading of the Mùdāntīng 牡丹亭. Apart from such passages, her relative centrality in the novel derives from her emotional intimacy and locational proximity to Bāoyù.

Xifēng and Bāoyù

Xifēng's centrality in the novel may also be seen from the way the author carefully constructs a number of structural links between her and Bāoyù. Very roughly speaking, Bāoyù stands at the head of the emotion-oriented and lyrical parts of the novel, while Xifēng stands at the head of the action-oriented and narrative (and at times quite dramatic) parts of the novel. The two are pillars on which the novel is founded. These two pillars act more or less like a pair in binary opposition, having some features in common and features of contrast. This is obvious from their very first appearance in the novel, in chapter 3, where they have a number of things in common:

Both arrive late, giving room for two lines of narrative, each focusing on one of them.
Both are heard before they are seen.
The two are the only persons of whom Dàiyù has hear her mother talk.
The clothing and appearance of both are described in some detail in long stretches of parallel prose.
Both of them are described as lacking in manners.
Some of these parallels are enforced by similarities in the tiny details of the wording:

也曾聽見母親說過 (Xìfēng)
亦常聽得母親說過 (Bàoyù)

一語未了，只聽後院中有人笑聲 (Xìfēng)
一語未了，只聽外面一陣腳不響 (Bàoyù)

心下想時，只見一群媳婦丫鬟圍著一個人從後門進來 (Xìfēng)
心中想著，忽見丫鬟話未報完，已進來了一位年輕的公子 (Bàoyù)

The parallelism between the two is reinforced in a number of other chapters. For instance, the two are shown to have a uniquely intimate relation to Qín Kēqing 秦可卿 and Qín Zhōng 秦鍾. Because of their leading roles in the family, they are also uniquely singled out for feelings of jealousy, especially from Jiā Húán 賈環 and Zhào yíníáng 趙姨娘, who almost manage to kill them by means of sorcery (chapter 25). Both of them have personalities untypical of their gender, Bàoyù being an effeminate young man, while Xìfēng is a young woman with many traits usually associated with masculine values. Some of the parallels even work from one chapter to another at no little distance, as when Bàoyù is conspicuously absent in a large part of Xìfēng’s birthday party in chapter 43, while Xìfēng is absent in Bàoyù’s birthday party in chapter 63.

This interpretation of the Hónglóu mèng is, of course, but another reading of the novel. Counterarguments to the view that Xìfēng is more central than Dàiyù are not difficult to find. For instance, chapter 1 fails to mention Xìfēng, but contains a sweet little story about the heavenly predecessors to Bàoyù and Dàiyù. And while chapter 2 does contain interesting parallels between Bàoyù and Xìfēng, it gives Dàiyù separate treatment and thereby seems to award her greater autonomy than Xìfēng. And, most obviously, the parallels between Bàoyù and Xìfēng in chapter 3 are almost exclusively seen through the eyes of Dàiyù, again emphasising her role as an independent observer. Furthermore, the fact that Dàiyù does not bring forward the narrative of her own accord may be seen simply as a function of her part as a lyrical heroine, for whom narrative progression is
less central than emotional lyricism (as in the flower burial and her reading of the Mudān tíng). My main point, therefore, is not to deny the importance of Dàiyù, but to highlight the role of Xìfēng and aspects of the novel that others have been far too willing to overlook. By looking at some of the sequels, I will try to trace the early development of the one-sided view of the novel.

The last 40 chapters

The first sequel is what is usually described as the last 40 chapters of the novel. This sequel has a clear purpose: to create a readable end to the unfinished 80-chapter manuscript left behind by Cáo Xuēqín. Almost the entire 40-chapter work may be read in this light. Although not lacking in creativity, it hardly introduces any new plots or characters, apart from those that are carefully constructed to lead the story toward its final conclusion. This is in sharp contrast to the first 80 chapters, where new plots and characters are brought in continuously. As late as in chapter 79, for instance, Xià Jínguì 夏金桂 and the drama surrounding her are introduced for the first time as if the author has no plans of bringing his novel to an end. In contrast, as soon as we move beyond chapter 80, virtually every single passage may be read as an element in the large web of plots and subplots eventually leading to the conclusion of the novel.

The last 40 chapters take great pains to build on hints in the first 80 chapters, to be consistent (though not always successfully), and to pick up a number of loose ends that need to be completed before the novel can be brought to an end. Hints in the first 80 chapters that the last 40 chapters build on include indications that:

- Dàiyù will die from sickness
- Bào yü and Báochāi will marry
- Bào yü will eventually become a monk
- Xìfēng will be sick and die
- The Jiá family will have their property confiscated

But the way this is done is the creation of the author of the last 40 chapters. It is the work of a highly creative writer. Although the quality of the last 40 chapters is generally held to be lower than that of the first 80 chap-
Most importantly, the author of the last 40 chapters almost immediately gives Dàiyù back the prominence that she had in chapters 17-36, by focusing on the triangular love affair that had become quite peripheral after chapter 45. In chapters 81-98, other plots and subplots are largely subordinate to the main plot leading to Bàoyù and Bàocháí’s marriage and Dàiyù’s death.

Already in chapter 81, the relation between Bàoyù and Dàiyù is reintroduced as a focus of interest, and the common assumption that they will marry is taken up in chapter 82. In the same chapter, Dàiyù has a nightmare in which she is sent out of the family to marry somebody else. In chapter 84, Xìfēng proposes for the first time that Bàocháí would be a better match for Bàoyù than Dàiyù, and Grandmother Jiā agrees. The story culminates when Xìfēng sets up her trap in chapter 96 and the marriage takes place and Dàiyù dies in chapters 97-98.

The story of Dàiyù’s death at the very moment when Bàoyù is fooled into marrying Bàocháí is exceedingly sentimental, but it is also one of the most innovative and memorable highlights of the last 40 chapters. The success of this story has undoubtedly been an important factor in establishing the popular reading of the Hónglóu mèng as a triangular love story.

After chapter 98, however, Dàiyù is dead and largely absent, except in Bàoyù’s and a few other people’s thoughts, in a few mentions of her coffin and burial, and in a scene in which Bàoyù’s soul leaves his body and sees Dàiyù in another realm of existence (chapter 116). Even in the last 40 chapters, therefore, Dàiyù is absent or nearly absent in well over half of the chapters.

One can hardly claim that the last 40 chapters treat Xìfēng as a peripheral character. On the contrary, from the very beginning, she is the main driving force behind the plot leading to the marriage of Bàoyù and Bàocháí and the death of Dàiyù. And she remains a central character long after Dàiyù is dead, until she herself finally dies after prolonged illness in chapter 114. Still, the last 40 chapters lay the foundation for the interpretations of later generations of readers in at least two respects:

First, from chapter 81 until Dàiyù dies, Xìfēng’s centrality in the novel is basically due to her role in Dàiyù’s tragic life and death. Her presence is important for its emotional impact, but because it helps
to create the plot surrounding the triangular love story. In this sense, her role is subordinate to that of Dàiyù.

Second, both before and after Dàiyù’s death, the last 40 chapters treat Xìfèng as a much more unequivocally evil person. By now, the whole story surrounding her centres on her guilt. The three tragedies at the centre of the narrative may all be seen as the results of her misdeeds: Bāoyù and Bāochāi’s unhappy marriage, Dàiyù’s death, and the fall of the Jīa family. In the end, her gradual weakening and painful and lonely death is seen as a just retribution for her own illdoings. Despite a few redeeming traits, like her care for her daughter Qiăojie and her positive relation to Līu láolao, Xìfèng’s wickedness and guilt are taken much further in this sequel than in the first 80 chapters.

Although both the first 80 chapters and the Red Inkstone commentary contain hints that Dàiyù will die and Bāoyù and Bāochāi marry, the idea of Xìfèng being the culprit, not to speak of her setting up a quite unlikely trap to achieve her goal, is the product of the author of the last 40 chapters. In 1819, a certain Xījī shānqiăo claims to have seen an original version where the imperial concubine Yuáncūn is the one who orders the marriage between Bāoyù and Bāochāi. And while we have no guarantee that the version seen by him was any more original than the last 40 chapters as we read them today, this highlights the fact that the last 40 chapters reflect only one possible reading of the novel. It is, however, the one that all later sequels build on, and that has formed the popular and even the scholarly reception of the novel.

The sequels

The main overview of sequels to the Hônglòu mèng in English, by Keith McMahon (2004), has three sections: "The Improvement of Baoyu", "The Vindication of Daiyu", and "The Resolution of the Love Affair between Baoyu and Daiyu". The titles of these three sections tell us a number of things that bear on our subject.

First, the sequels in various ways transform the tragedy of the original work into a happy ending, and thus seek to restore justice for characters for whom the readers of the novel have invested positive feelings. This
40 chapters do not resolve the love affair between Bao yu and Dai yu, they do at least partly restore the honour and the property of the Ji family, after the family has first been raided and had all its possessions confiscated.

Second, the “improvement” of Bao yu refers to the process of turning Bao yu into a more conventional and therefore more acceptable person, who fulfils his duties to the family and to society. This process also starts in the last 40 chapters, where Bao yu does his duty as a filial son, taking his exams and producing an heir, before he eventually enters another realm as a bodhisattva-like figure.

Third, the titles of McMahon’s article indicate that the two main characters of both the novel and the sequels are Bao yu and Dai yu, and that the main theme is the love affair between them. As we have seen, this view is also largely a product of the heart-rending story of love and loss in the last 40 chapters.

To some extent, the same impression is given by the main Chinese and Taiwanese works on Hong lou meng sequels, by Zhao Jianzhong (1997), Lin Yixuan (1999) and Wang Xuchuan (2004). For instance, Wang Xuchuan (pp. 294ff.) divides the sequels into three groups: those favouring Dai yu over Baochai, those favouring Baochai over Dai yu, and those praising both Dai yu and Baochai. Three of the four groups into which Lin Yixuan (pp. 52ff.) divides the sequels also focus on the triangular love relation between Bao yu, Dai yu and Baochai.

At the same time, these works make it clear that the sequels are much more complex and varied than this simple division would indicate. For instance, Wang Xuchuan (2004: 295) is unable to place two of the sequels into any of his three categories, one of them being the Qilou chong meng discussed below. He also points out that in the sequels favouring Baochai over Dai yu, the latter is usually either a peripheral character or not part of the sequel at all. Not all sequels, therefore, support a reading of the Hong lou meng in which Dai yu occupies one of the most central positions.

Still, the impression given is that most of the sequels focus on Bao yu and either Dai yu or Baochai or both—or their reincarnations or second-generation representations. If this is correct, the author of the last 40 chapters seems to have so successfully managed to establish the triangular
love story as the main storyline of the *Hónglóu mèng* that later sequel writers simply took it for granted.

While Xīfēng (in otherworldly, resurrected or reincarnated form) is not entirely absent from the sequels, she is not their primary focus. At least, she is not the primary focus of the scholars who have studied the sequels. As we shall see below, she does play an important role in some sequels, and her lack of importance in the scholarly work on the sequels may be partly due to the same preconceived ideas that so often reduce her position in scholarly interpretations of the *Hónglóu mèng* itself.

Xīāoyáozī: Hòu Hónglóu mèng

It took only five years from the publication of the full 120-chapter version of the *Hónglóu mèng* to the publication of its first sequel, *Hòu Hónglóu mèng* by Xīāoyáozī.

The narrative of this sequel clearly grows out of a wish to thoroughly turn the tragedies of the original work into happy endings. First of all, Dàiyù and Qīngwén 睛雯 are brought back to life, the former in her original body (which had been preserved intact due to an amulet she kept in her mouth when she died), the latter in the body of the now dead Wū'èr 五兒. Second, Dàiyù is not only married to Bāoyù, but is even given status as first wife before Bāochāi. Third, the former inhabitants of the Dàguān yuán move back to the garden. Fourth, the Jiā family regains its former property and status. Fifth, Bāoyù takes the *jìnshì* 進士 exam and is appointed *shídù xuēshì* 侍讀學士. Sixth, Xīchūn 懿春 is appointed imperial concubine and visits her home, just like Yuánchūn 元春 had done before her, only this time the extravagance of the first visit is replaced by a more frugal style.

A problem that many sequels encounter is how to write about characters that are already dead by the time the sequel starts. The present sequel solves the problem by means of resurrection. It is quite sparing in its use of this method, however, and only allows Bāoyù's most intimate soulmates, Dàiyù and Qīngwén, to be come back to life.

Xīfēng is, of course, dead before the sequel starts, and she does not return to life. She is, however, mentioned quite a few times, and by quite a
Misdeeds described both in the first 80 chapters and in the last 40 chapters are recounted, such as her driving Dàiyù, Jiā Ruì 賈瑞, and Yóu ěrjìè 尤二姐 to death, as well as almost bringing down the family through her usury and bribery. Interestingly, this sequel adds its own interpretation of Xīfēng's motivation for having Bāoyù marry Bāochāì and thereby driving Dàiyù to death. In the first chapter of this sequel, Jiā Zhèng 賈政 thinks to himself about Xīfēng:

"After all, she was jealous of Dàiyù and feared that if Dàiyù became Bāoyù's wife, she would grab a seat at the accountant's office. Therefore she secretly set up a trap and eventually made Dàiyù die from anger. This would also please Wáng fùrén 侍夫人 [who was Bāochāì's aunt], and by marrying Bāochāì into the family, she got a loyal and week-willed person who did not mind other people's business, so that she herself could hold power over the whole mansion for ever."

Thus, this sequel takes over the strong guilt-orientation of the last 40 chapters, but brings it one step further.

The main protagonist of this sequel is Dàiyù, who is even more central than Bāoyù. However, the Dàiyù of this sequel is quite different from the Dàiyù of the original work. At the beginning, she is an avid practitioner of Buddhist and Daoist meditation and seems reserved and aloof. Gradually, however, she develops into a capable and competent household manager, comparing favourably to the now dead Xīfēng. She not only sets strict rules for the servants (as Xīfēng did in chapter 13 of the original work), but even acts as advisor for Jiā Zhèng in his work as government official, and in the end she reveals that she would like to do something for the country, in the spirit of the famous military heroine Huā Mùlán 花木蘭. Thus, what we get is an "improved" version of Dàiyù, more conventionally acceptable than the frail and sometimes ill-tempered poor girl of the original work. Since she inherits many of Xīfēng's traits, we could even call her an "improved" version of Xīfēng, keeping Xīfēng's talents but not her greed and selfishness.
Qín Zíchén: Xù Hónglóu mèng

Three years after the Hòu Hónglóu mèng, in 1799, the next sequel appeared. It was the first of two sequels titled Xù Hónglóu mèng, this one written by Qín Zíchén.

This sequel makes use of many of the same elements as the Hòu Hónglóu mèng. Like its predecessor, it brings dead people back to life, and in this case as many as 11 persons are resurrected. In addition, this sequel creates another way of including dead characters in the narrative: by making a large part of the sequel take place in the various otherworldly realms of the dead, especially the Tàixū huànjīng 太虚幻境 and the Dīfū 地府. Basically, the first half of the sequel takes place in the otherworldly realms, while most of the second half takes place in the world of mortals (and resurrected immortals). There is even contact between the worldly and otherworldly realms, allowing all characters both dead and alive to continue to interact.

Like its predecessor, this sequel turns the tragic endings of the Hónglóu mèng into happy endings, by recreating the pleasures of the Dàguān yuán (both in the earthly Dàguān yuán and in the Tàixū huànjīng), by including a second visit to the garden by an imperial concubine (in this case, the resurrected Yuánchún), by letting Bāoyù marry both Dàiyù and Bāochāi, and by making Bāoyù take the jìnshì exam and be given a high official title (in this case hànlin shì 贺林士). This sequel goes even further than its predecessor, by including a large number of marriages and childbirths, by giving official ranks to a number of characters, and by eventually rephrasing all negatively charged names and inscriptions, so that, for instance, Līhèn tiān 離恨天 ‘Realm of Separation’ becomes Būhèn tiān 補恨天 ‘Realm of Consolament’ and Bómìng sì 薄命司 ‘Department of Ill Fate’ becomes Zhōngqīng sì 鍾倩司 ‘Department of Deep Love’.

The development of the triangular relation between Bāoyù, Dàiyù and Bāochāi is central in this sequel as it was in its predecessor, but now has more competition from other plots and subplots. Dàiyù is still an important character, but no longer dominates the narrative.

The first half of this sequel has a strong focus on guilt and karmic retribution. For instance, Xuè Pán's 薛蟠 killing of Féng Yuán 鳳淵 is made up
a prostitute who then serves as Féng Yuǎn’s concubine. In another case, Jià Yìngchūn’s 賈迎春 sadistic husband Sūn Shàozū 孫紹祖 is made into a husband who cares for and dotes on his wife. In both cases, justice is perceived as being restored. While the theme of guilt is largely inherited from the last 40 chapters, the possibility of atonement is more strongly emphasised in this sequel. It is the atonement of the first half of the sequel that makes possible the more idyllic scenes of the second half.

This sequel differs from its predecessor in including Xīfèng in the narrative. She enters the story in chapter 2, as a new (i.e. recently dead) inhabitant of the Tāixū huānjīng, and the theme of guilt and atonement follows her in the first part of the sequel. As soon as she enters the Tāixū huānjīng, her past misdeeds are held against her by former victims like Yòu ěrjiē and Lín Dàiyù, as well as by the imperial concubine Yuǎnchūn. After first trying to deny her guilt, Xīfèng ends up asking for forgiveness. At one point, she is allowed a glimpse into the world of the living, and on seeing her husband Jià Liān 賈璖 embracing the lascivious wife of Duò-húnchóng 多淫蟲, she faints. She is also allowed a sightseeing tour in one of the hells. Here she meets with Jià Ruì, who asks her to save him, but without success. She is then threatened by a woman named Zhāng Jingē 張金哥, who had killed herself after Xīfèng abused her power to force Jingē’s parents to drop her fiancé and accept another husband for her, and only by repenting and by having Jingē and her fiancé brought together is she spared. She also meets with her old archenemy Zhào yǐniáng and the sorceress Mǎ dàopó 马道婆, who had tried to kill Xīfèng and now asks her forgiveness and help (eventually getting it not from Xīfèng but from Jià mù 賈母). And in the end, she sees and is embraced by a naked woman who looks exactly like herself, but who is full of vinegar, a symbol of her jealousy. In the end, she attains some kind of enlightenment. After this long tour of hell, her sins seem to have been more or less atoned for, and from now guilt is no longer a central theme in the sequel. Xīfèng is one of the eleven dead persons who are resurrected, and she is one of equally many characters who give birth to a child towards the end of the sequel. She and her daughter Qiàojiē each happen to give birth to a son on the very same day. Xīfèng has now been thoroughly redeemed.
Wáng Lánzhi: Qīlóu chōngmèng

Another sequel published around 1799 is Qīlóu chōngmèng by Wáng Lánzhi. This sequel differs from its predecessors in several respects:

First, it makes dead characters reenter the world of mortals through reincarnation rather than simple resurrection, all being reincarnated as sons and daughters of the characters of the original novel. The most extraordinary form of reincarnation is that of Bāoyù, who is not dead but has followed the monk and the Daoist to the otherworldly realms as part of a spiritual journey, and who is reincarnated as Bāochāi’s son Xiǎoyù, who is actually his own son! Dàiyù is reincarnated as Shī Xiāngyún’s daughter Shùnhuá, Qīngwén as Xiānglíng’s daughter Dànrú, and Yuānyāng as Jiā Lán’s daughter. The fact that Bāoyù is now Bāochāi’s son effectively removes Bāochāi as an obstacle to the marriage between him and Dàiyù (Shùnhuá).

Second, the characters of this sequel have outstanding success not only in civil life, but also in war. After having learnt a number of supernatural military tricks, Xiǎoyù is appointed Generalissimo in Charge of Crushing the Japanese Pirates (píng wō dà yuánshuài, with several female family members as high commanders. Together they eventually manage to crush the Japanese army, restoring the lost honour of the family.

Third, Xiǎoyù is a notorious lecher, whose sexual escapades drive three girls out of the garden, one of them after having had an abortion. After this he finds his objects of desire outside the garden, where his sexual prowess is further intensified. In the end, he does marry Shùnhuá (Dàiyù’s incarnation), but only as one of four equal wives, conferred upon him by the Emperor.

In spite of these differences, this sequel shares many elements with its predecessors: happy life in the garden, love and eventual marriage between Bāoyù (Xiǎoyù) and Dàiyù (Shùnhuá), high official titles conferred by the Emperor, imperial concubines from the family (in this case two of the girls are chosen for the imperial harem), the family’s loss of honour and material wealth followed by the restoration of both, a large number of marriages etc. In this respect, this sequel carries on the heritage from earlier sequels, including the last 40 chapters.
This sequel takes further than any earlier sequel the tendency to relegate Xifeng to the periphery. The book says nothing about her reincarnation, and with one insignificant exception (chapter 5) she is not even mentioned.

Chén Shàohāi: Hónglóu fùmèng

Two sequels were printed around 1805, the first one being Hónglóu fùmèng by Chén Shàohāi. Like the Qílóu chóngmèng, it primarily brings the dead back to the world of mortals by means of reincarnation. But this time, people are not reincarnated into the Jiā family, but into other families with whom the Jiā family are in close contact. The effect is the same: bringing together both dead and living characters from the original work. In addition, the dead sometimes communicate directly with the living through dreams and altered states of mind, and the borderline between the world of mortals and the otherworldly realms is quite fluid.

This sequel clearly belongs to the group of Hónglóu mèng sequels that favour Bāochāi over Dàiyù. While Dàiyù’s incarnation Sōng Cāizhī 松彩芝 is married to Bāoyù’s incarnation Zhù Mèngyù 祝夢玉, she is only one of his large retinue of wives and concubines, and she does not seem to be favoured over the others. Bāochāi, on the other hand, receives lavish praise for her administrative talent (described as better than Xifeng), good character (loved by the servants) and great wisdom (e.g. by acting coolly under a kitchen fire). She becomes a close friend of Mèngyù. The theme of war, and more specifically women at war, introduced by the Qílóu chóngmèng, is brought further when Bāochāi is appointed commander-in-chief for an army of women that successfully crushes attacking tribes of barbarians. In the end, Bāochāi looks through the world of dust, cultivates her mind and ends up in the world of immortals.

In contrast to the Xiāoyù of Qílóu chóngmèng, the Mèngyù of Hónglóu fùmèng is not very interested in sex. Still, towards the end of the sequel, his many wives and concubines produce an impressive number of offspring. With regard to scholarship, Mèngyù takes the jīnshī exam and gets a position in the Hànlin Academy, just like Xiāoyù in the earlier sequel.

Like earlier sequels, this one also has a happy ending. At one point, however, the Jiā family sells the Dàguǎn yuán and moves back to the south,
fortunately, they are able to return to the capital and repurchase the gar­
den. And even before that, the garden idyll still lives on in the garden of
the Zhū family, called the Rúshí yuán 如是园.

In large parts of this sequel, guilt and atonement (or even punishment)
are central themes, and Xīfēng plays a major role in their treatment. In a
number of chapters at the beginning of the sequel, Jiā Liān leads a group of
family members to visit her in hell. She begs them to help her atone for
her sins, so that she can avoid further suffering and be reincarnated on
earth. She is specifically concerned that measures are taken to right the
wrongs she has inflicted on Zhāng Jīngē and Yóu èrjiē, and to return to its
proper ownership a Buddha figure that she once stole. Jiā Liān helps her
with this and in the process reaches enlightenment and becomes a monk
who often returns later in the sequel to help family members.

After having atoned for her sins, Xīfēng is reincarnated twice in the
course of the sequel. First, she becomes Zhōu Wānzhēn 周婉真, the daugh­
ter of a servant in the Zhū family. Wānzhēn’s physical appearance resem­
bles that of Xīfēng, but unlike Xīfēng she is well liked by everybody. As in
Qín Zhīchén’s Xù Hónglóu mèng, the process of atonement seems to have
removed her negative character traits. The guilt theme, however, returns
with a vengeance when in chapters 58–59 Wānzhēn is sexually molested
and killed by her cousin Zhōng Qīng 鍾晴. Zhōng Qīng is the reincarnation
of Jiā Rùi, who in chapter 11–12 in the original Hónglóu mèng had fallen in
love with Xīfēng but been driven to death by her. The killing of Wānzhēn,
therefore, is an act of karmic retribution. Later, Xīfēng is reincarnated
once more, this time as the little girl Bāozhū 珠. She is born blind and
with eyes closed, but after having been reminded of her true identity, she
opens her eyes and sees clearly.

Hāipū zhūrén: Xù Hónglóu mèng

The second of the two sequels printed around 1805 was also the second of
two sequels titled Xù Hónglóu mèng, this one by Hāipū zhūrén. Unlike
earlier sequels, this one is not primarily concerned with bringing dead
characters back to the narrative by reincarnation, resurrection or visits to
otherworldly realms. The main protagonist is Bāoyù’s and Bāochāi’s son Jiā
Mào 賈茂, who marries Xuē Bǎoqín's 薛寶琴 daughter Yuè'é 月娥. Many of the old family members are still alive and play central roles in the narrative.

The bonds to the otherworldly realms, however, are far from completely broken. Bāoyù still plays a central role from his otherworldly existence as Fùwén zhēnrén 敷文真人. He helps many of the mortals in their worldly pursuits, especially when they participate in the many examinations described. Even Dàiyù, in her otherworldly existence as Xiǎoxiāng xiānzi 潘湘仙子, is briefly brought back to earth in a planchette writing séance, but unfortunately she does not remember anything from her mortal existence.

More importantly, Jiā Mào is born holding a jade in his hand identical to the one Bāoyù kept in his mouth at birth, so in a way Jiā Mào is a continuation of his father Bāoyù. And Yuè'é, who becomes Jiā Mào’s wife, is born holding a golden talisman in her hand, reminiscent of the golden amulet kept by her aunt Bāochāi. The marriage between Jiā Mào and Yuè'é, which is clearly predestined, may be seen as a confirmation of the bond between gold (Bāochāi) and jade (Bāoyù) in the original Hónglóu mèng. In a roundabout way, therefore, this sequel also has a focus on the triangular love story and seems to belong to the group of sequels favouring Bāochāi over Dàiyù (whose spirit, at the very outset of the sequel, is sent to the Tàixū huānjing 陶虛幻境 to cultivate her mind and overcome her bad speech habits).

Even more than in earlier sequels, the protagonists have conventional values and are highly successful. Jiā Mào has great success in examinations, and the emperor personally appoints him zhuàngyuán 状元. Like in the Hòu Hónglóu mèng, the emperor appoints Xīchūn imperial concubine. The good name of the Jiā family, therefore, is completely restored. Bāochāi and Tānchūn order a thorough renovation of the Dàguān yuàn, and the Poetry Club is re-established. The novel ends with joyful celebrations of Jiā Zhèng’s 100th anniversary.

Xīfēng has no part in this sequel. Memories of her are mentioned a few times, primarily because of the likeness between her and her daughter Qiāojíě. Qiāojíě is married into the Zhōu 周 family, as promised in the last 40 chapters of the Hónglóu mèng, but often returns to visit her old friends and relatives.
Modernity vs. high culture

Let us now return to the theme of modernity mentioned at the beginning of this paper. To what extent does our discussion of these six sequels (including the last 40 chapters) confirm our suspicion that the *Hónglòu mèng* represents a possible path towards modernity, while the readings of the novel that underlie the sequels represent a step backwards, a path away from modernity?

The fact that the triangular love relation between Bāoyù, Dāiyù and Bāochāi becomes a more central focus in the sequels than in the 80-chapter *Hónglòu mèng*, while the storyline relating to Xífèng is either lost or reduced to one focusing on guilt and atonement, points to a simplification of the plot structure, thematics and ideology underlying the novel. This begins in the last 40 chapters, but is taken much further in the later sequels.

The fact that the protagonists end up with much more conventional (so-called Confucian) values in the sequels than in the original points in the same direction. Again this starts in the last 40 chapters, but is taken further in later sequels.

And the fact that all the sequels (to some extent even the last 40 chapters) have happy endings show how uncomfortable many readers must have been with the tragic element of the original novel.

So far, I have not had much to say about psychological subtleties in these sequels. The reason is simple. Apart from the last 40 chapters, the sequels show little interest in nuanced psychological description. They are mostly action-oriented, and even their lyrical descriptions are more often external than internal. The feelings expressed are simple and straightforward: happiness, sadness, anger, desire etc.

We have seen how all sequels pick up elements from preceding sequels, so that each sequel builds on a reading not only of the 80-chapter *Hónglòu mèng*, but also of other sequels.

When all is said and done, however, it is not obvious that the subtleties and complexities of the original 80-chapter *Hónglòu mèng* are due to its modernity, nor is it obvious that the lack of such in the sequels is due to their being less modern. To a large extent, the features in question belong to the fictional and/or lyrical tradition that the *Hónglòu mèng* grew out of.
no earlier work may compare with the ingenuity of the Hönglöu mēng, but this is also true of later Chinese works of fiction, no matter how “modern” or even “post-modern”.

As suggested to me by Kuo Yu-wen (personal communication), an equally plausible view is that the original Hönglöu mēng represents the high culture of scholars and literati, while its sequels cater to the low culture of a much larger group of “ordinary” people. It is this low culture that demands happy endings, conventional values and simple theme and plot structures. Tragic or unresolved endings, for instance, are not new in Chinese literature (cf. the Jin Píng Méi, the Yīngyīng zhuàn, or an enormous corpus of poetry concerned with loss, sadness and sorrow, starting from the Chūcì), but they are typically avoided in most genres catering to the general public, such as drama (cf. the happy ending of the Xīxiāng jì, as opposed to the original story in the Yīngyīng zhuàn).

It remains true that the original 80-chapter Hönglöu mēng shows a keen interest in the psychological dimensions and the complex and tragic aspects of human life, and that we often associate this with modernity. It also remains true that these features are largely lost in the sequels, and that the readings of the novel on which the sequels build now seem dated and, well, unmodern. Tragic endings are no longer provocative, and the same is true of unconventional heroes. In fact, after the May 4th period, it has probably become easier to accept Bāoyù as an unconventional (and anti-Confucian) hero than a conventional one. However, some of the un-modern features of the readings on which the sequels build are still current both in popular views and among scholars. One of these regards the exaggerated focus on the triangular love story and the accompanying focus on Dàiyu, at the expense of the less romantic aspects of the novel, including the rise and fall of Xīfēng. If the Hönglöu mēng represents a path to modernity, therefore, we have yet to walk a substantial distance before we reach the final destination of this path.

Works cited


Hu Siao-chen (2004). “In the Name of Correctness: Ding Yaokang’s Xu jin Ping Mei as a Reading of Jin Ping Mei”. In Snakes’ Legs: Sequels, Continuations, Rewritings, and Chinese Fiction, ed. by Martin W. Huang, 75–97.


晚清辞书视野中的“文学”：
以黄人的编纂活动为中心

陈平原
(北京大学)

1899年，梁启超在《清议报》上连载“自由书”，曾接过日本人犬养毅的话头，
论证为何要将学校、报纸、演说作为“传播文明三利器”。学校培育人才，古今
概莫例外；倒是报纸与演说的关系，值得一说：“大抵国民识字多者，当利用
报纸；国民识字少者，当利用演说。”①此说不胫而走，不只深刻影响晚清的
思想文化进程，也为后世史家之“进入晚清”，提供了极大的便利。但“报纸”、
“演说”多见即兴之作，且主要针对时下，有启蒙之功，却非知识增长的最佳途径
。费时费力较多、讲究通力合作，故无法千里走单骑马的辞书出版以及教科
书编撰，如强劲的后卫，支撑着整个社会的学术积累与知识创新。正如商务
印书馆早期功臣高梦旦在《新字典序》（1912）中所说的，“教育之普及，常
识之备具，教科书辞书之功为多”。辞书及教科书之不取先锋姿态，而以系统
论述见长，与“百年树人”的教育宗旨更为吻合。在这个意义上，不妨将学校、
辞书、教科书作为另一个“传播文明三利器”。

就在晚清王朝寿终正寝的前夕，上海国学扶轮社出版了东吴大学教授黄人
（1866-1913，字摩西）编著的《普通百科新大辞典》和《中国文学史》。刚
刚崛起的社会组织（大学、出版社）与新型出版物（百科辞书、教科书），二
者的合作竟如此天衣无缝，让我们得以一窥晚清学东渐的蹒跚步伐。考虑到
黄摩西在东吴大学教的是“国文”与“国学”，本文将以其编纂活动为中心，
讨论现代中国的“文学”概念，是如何在晚清辞书的视野中得以浮现的。

①《饮冰室自由书·传播文明三利器》，《饮冰室合集·专集》第一册，上海：中华书
局，1936年。
PATHS
TOWARD MODERNITY
Conference to Mark
the Centenary of Jaroslav Průšek

Edited by Olga Lomová

Prague 2008
Charles University in Prague
The Karolinum Press

This publication has been financially supported by the Chiang Ching-kuo Foundation International Sinological Centre at Charles University and was completed as part of the Major Research Program MSM 0021620824.

Reviewed by: Doc. Věna Hrdličková, CSc.
PhDr. Vladimír Liščák, CSc.
## CONTENTS

### Introduction

**Olga Lomová** .......................................................... 7

### The Conception of Chinese Lyricism:
**Průšek’s Reading of Chinese Literary Tradition**

**K. K. Leonard Chan** ................................................. 19

### THE LITERATI CITY

**The Artisanal Body of Gu Erniang (ca. 1662-ca. 1724; fl. 1700-1724),**
A Female Inkstone Carver

**Dorothy Ko** ............................................................ 35

**Bidding Farewell to Late Ming Nanjing: Literary Accounts**
of Politics, Pleasure and Disruption

**Li Hsiao-t’i** ............................................................ 61

**聲色西湖: 「聲音」與杭州文學景味的創造**
**胡曉真 (Hu Siao-chen)** ......................................... 99

**The Concept of Chinese Polygamy**

**Keith McMahon** ...................................................... 127

### CHANGING CONCEPTIONS

**Do all Paths Lead to Modernity?**
**The Kangxi Emperor (1662–1722) and the Sciences**

**Catherine Jami** ...................................................... 151

**The Hónglóu mèng 紅樓夢 and its Sequels:**
**Paths towards and away from Modernity**

**Halvor Eifring** ....................................................... 171