

The Professionalization of the Norwegian Advertising Trade, 1914-1918

Amund Smidt Lysaker



Masteroppgave i Historie

Institutt for arkeologi, konservering og historie

Høst 2014

Universitetet i Oslo

12.11.2014



On the front page of *Romilla Revue* for November 1915, the advertising consultant (in the bottom) is juxtaposed to the established professions doctor, dentist, architect and lawyer.

© Amund Smidt Lysaker

2014

The Professionalization of the Norwegian Advertising Trade, 1914-1918

Amund Smidt Lysaker

<http://www.duo.uio.no/>

Trykk: Allkopi Parkveien, Oslo

Foreword

First of all, I should thank my good friend and cousin Anders. If he had not introduced me to the BBC-series “Century of the self” a couple of years ago, I would probably never have attained such an interest in the development of psychological techniques and its significance for the development of advertising and public relations in the early 20th century, which made my choice of topic for a master thesis obvious. Then I would like to thank my mentor Veronique for guiding me down the right path and reminding me to stay critical when analyzing the thoughts of the inherently manipulative Norwegian advertising pioneers. A big thanks also to Jan Messel for all the constructive feedback, and thanks to all the good people at Senter for Profesjonsstudier for moral support and comments on my drafts in GPPS. Thank you to all my study-buddies at Blindern for both social and professional interaction. Finally I would like to thank my mother, father and girlfriend for all the moral support.

Amund Smidt Lysaker

12.11.2014

Contents:

Introduction.....	1
Subject and Context	1
Research questions	6
Sources	7
Methodology and delimitation	10
Theory	12
Structure	14
A failed professionalization? A few historical lines	15
Chapter 1: Robert Millar and the religious foundation of Norwegian advertising	16
Who was Robert Millar?	17
Millar in Norway	19
Headhunted	20
New knowledge.....	20
Millar’s first campaign.....	21
The foundation of <i>Romilla Revue</i>	23
Advertising and Christianity	23
Christian advertising	24
The principles of advertising and Christianity	26
Conclusion: “A pervasive spirit”	28
Chapter 2: Facilitating the professionalization: The first Norwegian Advertising Clubs and Associations	31
Professional Associations.....	32
American advertising associations and its influence on Norwegian pioneers	33
British clubs as model	36
Invoking the advertising class.....	37
The advertising club of Trondheim.....	39
The Advertising Experts	40
The Newspapers	43
The Advertisers	44
Expanding the club-movement to Kristiania.....	47
Diverging club conceptions: The Advertising Association of Kristiania	51

The founding years of the Advertising Association and Millar's takeover	55
The Advertising Congress: Ambitions of a National Association	58
Conclusion.....	62
Chapter 3: Knowledge, Education and Science.....	66
Concepts of education	67
Lecturing the advertisers	68
Educating the advertising experts	70
Means of education	72
<i>Romilla Revue</i> and the first advertising textbook	72
Education in the trading schools	74
The Advertising School is established	78
Ambitions of an advertising science	84
Conclusion.....	90
Chapter 4: Licensing and Control	93
Advertising ventures and agents	94
Initial efforts of control and the weakness of the advertisers.....	98
Ideas for control	100
Registration and identification	101
Identification to reform practices	103
Administration.....	104
A fruitful cooperation: The process of establishing a control office.....	105
Conclusion.....	110
Conclusion	114
Introduction	114
The Phases of Professionalization.....	115
Advertising consultants	121
Dual professionalization.....	123
The end of the first professionalization process.....	125
Reflections on future research possibilities.....	125
Sources and Bibliography	127

Introduction

Subject and Context

The purpose of this thesis is to analyze how advertising pioneers endeavored to professionalize the advertising trade in Norway in the years 1914-1918. Professionalization is usually understood as a process whereby an occupation goes through a transformation to become a profession, or a development of an occupation towards gaining the characteristics of a profession.¹

Professionalization however, is a disputed term and the question of how such processes should be understood is still debated among scholars. In the theory section further down, I have attempted to give a characteristic of what might define a professionalization process. Interpreting the reform work of Norwegian advertising pioneers in this period in the light of such a process might contribute with new insight in the discussion.

But why interpret this reform work as a professionalization process and why in this period of time? Advertising pioneers or reformers attempting to professionalize one or several occupations within the advertising trade is typical of the period from the end of 19th to the beginning of the 20th century in Europe and the U.S. Norwegian advertising pioneers were influenced by professionalization efforts in countries where the advertising trade was prominent. The reform work of the Norwegian pioneers indicate developments that are characteristic of professionalization efforts by advertising reformers in for example Great Britain and especially the U.S. At the same time, my period of research falls within a period of Norwegian social history characterized by middle class occupations striving for professional status. In light of this context the sources indicate that we are dealing with a professionalization effort as Norwegian advertising pioneers often compared the need for advertising experts to that of doctors, lawyers and architects. Regarding the delimitation, this period of time marks what I have seen as an initial period of professionalization. Because these years are characterized by a high density of discourse and exchange of ideas but also a lot of activity and fundamental achievements, I have focused on a thorough analysis of this period. I elaborate on the choice of delimitation further down. The main research question for my thesis is thus how Norwegian advertising pioneers

¹ Molander, Terum, "Profesjonsstudier – en introduksjon", p 20.

Siegrist, "Professionalization as a process: patterns, progression and discontinuity", p 177.

endeavored to professionalize the Norwegian advertising trade in the years 1914-1918, and how this effort can be seen as the beginning of a professionalization process. What were their intentions and ideas for professionalization and what actions did it lead to? In the section on research questions I have elaborated this with additional secondary questions.

Today the term “profession” is often connected with traditional professions such as doctors, lawyers, priests, architects and dentists and welfare professions such as teachers, nurses and childcare. When the Norwegian advertising pioneers endeavored to establish an advertising profession, their models were the traditional professions. The goal was to establish an advertising profession, in the shape of an advertising consultant that enjoyed a similar status and was seen as equally important to the established or traditional professions. But, unlike some professionalization processes, there was no broad occupational group representing a single occupation endeavoring to organize and reach professional status. Although there existed a few advertising experts who could have established themselves as a consultant, the position was very much an imagined profession, the realization of which would come about incrementally as more and more consultants were established.² Norwegian advertising pioneers were inspired by how advertising experts operated in the U.S and Great Britain, and these foreign experts were a model or ideal for the development of the advertising consultant. Further, these consultants would, as the few existing experts did, have a different kind of clientele than many of the traditional professions. The clients of the traditional professions were often the parts of the public who could afford their services. In other words, these professionals were in a direct relationship with the public. The clients of the advertising experts and future consultants were the businesses, mainly wholesalers and retail shops but increasingly also manufacturers and businesses within the tourist industry. As such, these potential professionals were in an indirect relation to the public and functioned as intermediaries or agents of communication between the businesses and the public.³ This implies that they were, as marketing historian Stefan Schwarzkopf explains, in a “triadic

² By “imagined profession” I am not thinking so much in terms of Benedict Anderson’s theory of imagined communities. See Anderson, *Imagined Communities*. What I am implying by imagined is that the advertising consultant was the product of the imagination of a few advertising pioneers. There was no broad group of practitioners claiming the function or position of such a profession. On the contrary it was the idea of a few Norwegian advertising pioneers to create and develop a group of professionals through an education that did not yet exist.

³ Myrvang, *Forbruksagentene*, pp 132.

relationship”⁴ consisting of themselves, the businesses and the media, in our case predominantly the newspapers.

I will briefly also mention Schwarzkopf here as a source of ideas for my thesis. For example, his article “What was Advertising? The Invention, Rise, Demise, and Disappearance of Advertising Concepts in Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Europe and America” published in 2009, was an inspiration to focus on a conceptual history of advertising that shows how the triadic relationship has grown in Norway, which might also contribute with new insights in global comparisons of advertising history. In this article Schwarzkopf introduces a new model for interpreting the historical development of advertising. He argues that advertising practitioners had different conceptions of the nature and function of advertising in different periods. He therefore challenges the historiographical understandings of advertising practices as for example “American”, “European” or “modern” and furthers the idea of writing advertising history as a history of discourse.⁵ Considering the triadic relationship, another source of inspiration is Jürgen Habermas and his theory on *Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere*. His conception of how advertising changed the key-institution of the public sphere, the press, is particularly interesting. This implied a development where commercial advertising became the economic basis of the newspapers and thus a dominance of private interests in the public sphere, where private interests manipulate and influence public opinion. This also led the state bureaucracy to employ techniques of opinion management for the publicity needs of the state. Eventually, Habermas predicts that the public sphere will disappear altogether, and all that remains is a mass uncritical public.⁶ This might be worth keeping in mind when looking at the professionalization of the Norwegian advertising trade, which depended on the cooperation of the newspapers and considering the fact that Norwegian advertising pioneers were convinced that advertising should have a more central and powerful function in the newspapers than being an economic basis.

Regarding the sociology of the professions, the position of an eventual advertising consultant opens for an interesting discussion, as it is apparently an incompatible position which might explain why an advertising profession has never materialized. For example, sociologist Talcott Parsons argued that a profession is an occupation that represents and works for “the common good” in contrast to the “market which is regulated by optimizing the self-interest of the

⁴ Schwarzkopf, “What Was Advertising?”, p 1.

⁵ Ibid. pp 2.

⁶ Habermas, *Borgerlig Offentlighet –Dens Fremvekst og Forfall*, pp 169.

individual.”⁷ However, the position of an advertising consultant would be to help their clients create markets and thus communicate products to individuals. How is it possible to claim professional status by working to create that which promotes self-interest and contrasts the function of a profession?

Further, the process entailed not only the professionalization of a single occupation, but of the advertising trade as a whole. This sort of dual professionalization, where reformers also aim to professionalize a trade that includes several, interdependent occupational groups, might represent a rare concept and development in the history of professions. This might owe, among other factors, to the peculiar position of a potential advertising profession between advertisers and the media. Regarding historiography, a similar account of professionalization can be found in Pamela Walker Laird’s work *Advertising Progress: American Business and the Rise of Consumer Marketing* from 1998. Laird describes how different advertising practitioners in the U.S sought to professionalize and gain legitimacy for their profession in public and among advertisers. She emphasizes that American advertising reformers sought to professionalize the advertising field or trade in which they operated and explain how they endeavored to implement different measures in this effort. This sort of professionalization might thus be typical for the advertising field in several countries, perhaps owing to its complex nature. It is therefore useful to look at developments in the U.S for a similar example on how such a process developed, also because Norwegian advertising pioneers were influenced by these developments. Even so, it is important to note that the Norwegian advertising trade developed under very different circumstances than the American, notably because of a different market structure and market size where the Norwegian market was considerably smaller. So even though there are some striking similarities in the development of the two trades, the development of Norwegian advertising must be seen in the context of social and economic developments in Norway, where advertising pioneers were clearly inspired by influences from abroad but also developed their own concepts of how to reform and professionalize the advertising trade.

The advertising trade was constituted by the newspapers which represented the most valuable advertising media at the time. Further, it consisted of printers, typographers and various artists such as writers and draftsmen. Then were the advertisement agencies and the advertisers themselves that included various businesses. The advertising agents were another group and

⁷ Parsons, "Professions", pp 536-547.

finally there existed a few advertising experts or managers, who usually organized the advertising for larger companies. It was especially one of these early experts or pioneers that would initiate professionalization and become the driving force of the process, namely Robert Millar. Millar introduced the concept of the advertising consultant and attempted to consolidate the different occupational groups of the advertising trade, to clear up the field and establish the advertising trade as a professional area within the economic system.

In a broad context, historian Jan Eivind Myhre describes the period from 1870-1940 as the period of the “professional society”. What characterized this society was its vertical hierarchies of expertise and distinction that followed the dissolution of a preindustrial class society and the development of the Norwegian middle class, where middle class occupations constantly attempted to professionalize on the model of traditional professions such as doctors and lawyers.⁸ Professionalization efforts were thus common in this period among middle class occupations, and the reform movement of the advertising trade must be seen as part of this development. In a narrower context, the initial professionalization coincides with the period of the First World War.

Although Norway was a neutral country, the Great War had profound implications on the Norwegian economy and thus for the professionalization of the advertising trade. The boom period of the Norwegian economy (“jobbetid”) that commenced with the beginning of the War, was characterized by intense speculation in stocks (predominantly shipping shares as Norway was capitalizing off its extensive shipping fleet) which, combined with an expansive monetary policy, overflowed the country with capital.⁹ This implied increased revenue for newspapers, advertisement agencies and printers as these facilitated the advertising of stocks, together with advertising agents. Journalist and advertising pioneer Einar Munthe-Kaas explained that, under these extraordinary circumstances, newspapers and printers could renew and modernize technically. At the same time advertising consultants and advertising draftsmen began to establish themselves, and advertisement agencies to hire specialists. It was in this period also that advertising became “visible” for the business community and the public, and acknowledged as a necessary facility in trading (for better or worse) claimed Munthe-Kaas.¹⁰ He explicated with some fervor that,

⁸ Myhre, “Mellomklassens fremstød”, p 52.

⁹ Myrvang, *Temmet eller Uhemmet*, p 93.

¹⁰ Munthe-Kaas, *Reklameforeningen*, p 118.

“In these mad times, when money is flowing in and out just as fast, when fortunes are disposed before they are gained, when the entrepreneur is in the seat of honor, when no mercantile idea is too mad to finance – in these times the Norwegian advertising is born!”¹¹

It is debatable if the boom period alone can explain the “birth” of Norwegian advertising. Even though it certainly affected some of the developments of the advertising trade, it was mainly the pioneers that facilitated these developments. Further, scarcity of goods applied to every branch of business during the war, which necessarily led to a reduced demand for advertising consumer goods. The scarcity of goods also led to a rising price level that was devastating for the less wealthy majority of the population. This period of high cost of living (“dyrtid”) coincided with the boom period.¹² Considering the common perception among the public that advertising made a product more expensive, underlines the obvious challenge of gaining legitimacy for the advertising trade. The implications of the War thus at the same time facilitated the professionalization and created challenges for the pioneers.

In 1940, Einar Munthe-Kaas wrote a 25-year anniversary publication for the Advertising Association of Kristiania (present day Oslo). In the booklet he reflected on the circumstances and tasks that confronted the Norwegian advertising pioneers in 1915: “the situation was not so pleasant, it was a newly discovered jungle they would infiltrate, clear up and cultivate, there was no road or path”.¹³ The advertising trade at the time was chaotic and unsettled. There was no clear understanding among the public, the advertisers or the many different occupational groups involved with advertising, of what constituted the field of advertising. A British advertising expert described the Norwegian advertising trade as being in its infancy. Compared to developments in the U.S, this is a typical analogy for the early phase of professionalization in advertising, where the advertising field is seen as valuable, yet in need of improvement.¹⁴

Research questions

I have divided my primary research question into to three secondary questions. First, what were the intentions of the advertising pioneers to professionalize the advertising trade as a whole and

¹¹ Ibid.

¹² Myrvang, *Temmet eller Uhemmet*, p 95.

¹³ Ibid.

¹⁴ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, p 305.

how can the actions of the pioneers be seen as phases in a professionalization process. By researching this question I will attempt to establish the ideas and intentions of Norwegian advertising pioneers that must be seen as ambitions of professionalization. Then, by researching the actions and results of these intentions, I will establish if and how these can be seen as phases in professionalizing the advertising trade and how the economic boom period during World War 1 affected these developments. One peculiar point is that the advertising pioneers endeavored to professionalize a trade and an occupation.

Second, how did Robert Millar develop the concept of an advertising consultant and how did the advertising pioneers endeavor to develop and establish these consultants. Because this was to a large extent an imagined occupation, I will analyze the argumentation for why this occupation should have professional status and which functions this profession would have. I will also research if there were any practical efforts towards this. The issue of how these consultants were to be developed also brings us to a third secondary question.

The third question is to understand how the endeavor to professionalize the advertising trade was connected with the idea of developing advertising consultants. While researching this question I will establish arguments to illuminate how realizing the idea of establishing advertising consultants was dependent on the effort of professionalizing the advertising trade in which these consultants would operate.

Sources

The journal *Romilla Revue* is the main primary source for this thesis. It was the first advertising journal published by Robert Millar from October 1914 to May 1918. Nasjonalbiblioteket in Oslo has an incomplete collection of the journals where three editions are missing.¹⁵ However, Gunnerusbiblioteket in Trondheim has the complete collection. It was initially intended as a monthly journal, but from the Fall of 1916 it was published infrequently, probably because Millar was too occupied with other work. The journal was the first of its kind in Northern Europe. Its purpose was to be a forum for advertising people and advertisers, where knowledge of advertising could be exchanged and ideas for reform could be discussed. Thus, it is of itself a part of the professionalization process. The fact that Millar named the journal *Romilla Revue* is interesting as it is an abbreviation of his own name. This indicates that the journal was a part of

¹⁵ The missing editions are Vol 4, Nr 4, 5 and 6.

his personal reform project. *Romilla Revue* has provided invaluable insight into the thoughts, motives and activities of the Norwegian advertising pioneers, especially Robert Millar who produced the bulk of the articles. Because Millar and other Norwegian advertising pioneers wrote the articles, it is important to be aware that the journal displays a rather one-sided outlook. The circumstances displayed in the journal are thus not necessarily representative of reality and it is important to underline that it is the pioneers' depiction of the situation. In any event, it is important to evaluate the sources in relation to the research questions mentioned above. If I were to write about the actual state of the advertising trade my sources would not prove as useful. But, since I am analyzing intentions and ideas, the sources are excellent.

Millar often used pseudonyms such as "Miro", "Romilla", "Kimi", "Eni", according to which topic he was discussing. When I refer to Millar in the text the reference may often include one of these pseudonyms.

Other primary sources are newspapers from the period. A few newspaper articles contain interviews with Millar and reports on the work and progress of the reform. These sources have contributed with objective but also valuable supplementary information regarding certain topics. Further, Millar's first textbook on advertising *Lærebok i Reklame* published in 1916, was useful when writing the chapters on advertising clubs and education. This source is available at Nasjonalbiblioteket. I have also searched for other primary sources, such as summaries from the meetings of the advertising clubs, without results.

The category of secondary sources I have employed with the closest proximity to the primary sources contain Einar Munthe-Kaas' booklet from 1940 on the 25-year anniversary of the Advertising Association of Kristiania, *Reklameforeningen i Oslo Gjennom 25 år*, and Trygve Dalseg's book *Fra Markskrigeri til Markedsføring: Et Reklamehistorisk Tilbakeblikk* from 1965. These works have contributed with valuable context. Further, Munthe-Kaas and Dalseg were both part of the early professionalization and their works provided insight and contributed to fill gaps and holes in the primary sources, even though they were written at a later stage. Dalseg's book is a relatively extensive chronology on the history of Oslo Salgs –og Reklameforening (Sales and Advertising Association of Oslo), originally Reklameforeningen i Kristiania (Advertising Association of Kristiania), that stretches from 1915-1965, but the book also fathoms more general developments in the Norwegian advertising trade. I should also mention Dalseg's brochure from 1983, *RRF-50 år, IFM-25 år: Registrerte reklamebyråers forening 1933-1983*,

Instituttet for markedsføring 1958-1983, where he focuses on the development of advertising agencies in Norway. The author and journalist Per Vogt who lived in Norway during the First World War, portrayed the circumstances of the period in his book *Jerntid og Jobbetid* from 1938. This book has been useful for context on Norwegian commerce during the War.

Another valuable resource for supplementing the primary sources is the manuscript for an unfinished biography of Millar. Upon contacting Trondheim Markedsforening (Marketing Association of Trondheim) for information on Robert Millar, I was directed to Bertil Lien, who works for Bennett Marketing AS in Trondheim. Lien sent me a manuscript of Millar's biography that had been started by Svein Linge Solberg but was never finished. Solberg is a former Assistant Professor of Handelshøyskolen i Trondheim (Sør-Trøndelag University College). He was not able to finish the book due to ill health. In any event, the manuscript has been very useful for example by referring to relevant newspaper articles from the period, which I have consulted and found of use but also for additional information on the work of the advertising pioneers. Most importantly, it has provided a relatively detailed history of Millar's background. Together with Linge Solberg's manuscript, Kathrine Skretting's article "Ikke bare Reklame" published in the brochure *25.11.-29.12.1989: utstilling i Nordenfjeldske kunstindustrimuseum i anledning Trondheim markedsforenings 75-årsjubileum* and Bertil Lien's brochure, *Den Moderne reklamen i Norden startet i Trondheim: med en irsk prest* from 1998, enabled me to give a rich account of Millar and his importance for the development of the Norwegian advertising trade. This literature has also been useful to understand Millar's way of thinking. In their anniversary publication for Norges Markedshøyskole (Norwegian School of Marketing) named *75 år 25 Oktober 1993: Glimt fra en historie. Fra Reklame til Markedsføring*, the authors Martin Steen and Børge Olsen, provides a useful account on the initiation and development of the first advertising school in Norway. The publication was thus useful for my chapter on education.

For a more analytical basis, I have employed different works on advertising, consumer, social, and to a certain extent economic history. Christine Myrvang's book *Temmet eller Uhemmet: Historiske Perspektiver på Konsum, Kultur og Dannelse* from 2004, has provided useful material for contextualizing the thesis, together with Jan Eivind Myhre's article in *Dugnad* "'Mellomklassens fremstød": Middelklassen i norsk samfunnsformasjon og kultur ca. 1870-1940 i et internasjonalt perspektiv", from 1994. Fritz Hodne's book *God Handel: Norges Handelsstands Forbund Gjennom 100 År* from 1989, has been useful for economic history but

also for insight on Handelsstandens Fællesforening (National Association of the Business Community), which Norwegian advertising pioneers often cooperated with.

For equivalent examples of professionalization in advertising, I have mainly used American advertising literature. Pamela Walker Laird's work *Advertising Progress*, has been especially useful. Because American advertising influenced Norwegian pioneers, Laird's work has been valuable to interpret how and which developments in America were most influential. Although Laird provides a rich account, I have supplemented it with Stephen Fox's *The Mirror Makers: A history of American Advertising and its creators* from 1984, to get some different perspectives on the work of American reformers. For a more detailed description on some of the important efforts of these reformers I have employed Quentin J. Schultze's articles "'An Honorable Place': The Quest for Professional Advertising Education, 1900-1917" from 1982 and "Professionalism in Advertising: The Origin of Ethical Codes" published in 1981. In the former Schultze gives a useful account on the work of American advertising associations to implement an education for advertising professionals. In the latter he explains how American advertising reformers established ethical codes for the advertising business that became part of promoting an ideology of advertising professionalism.¹⁶ Further, Herbert W. Hess' "History and the present status of the "Truth-in-Advertising" from 1922, gives a useful account on the "Truth in Advertising" movement which became an important influence and motivator for the Norwegian advertising pioneers.

Finally, I have employed a few web pages to get an overview of the advertising trade today. I have looked up the pages of the major Norwegian advertising associations, educational institutions and advertising agencies. See the bibliography for references.

Methodology and delimitation

When writing this thesis I have employed mainly a qualitative analysis. I have endeavored to employ qualitative techniques and a hermeneutic approach to perform a relatively thorough analysis of the primary sources. Because this period and process contains such a high density of ideas, discussions and debates, it seemed natural to tap into this discourse and try to understand

¹⁶ "Professionalism" is also a disputed term in the sociology of professions, but in the case of Schultze denotes an ideology by which occupational groups endeavor to gain control over an area of work and thus attain professional status. See for example Johnson, *Professions And Power*, p 32.

how the people involved in the process conceived of the situation and what their goals were, and further how they thought these goals could be reached. In a hermeneutic approach, the focus is on understanding the actors' way of thinking and thus how their actions are seen as means to a goal.¹⁷ Thus, I have also analyzed the concrete actions of the people involved in the process, to fulfill their goals. Considering the sources, I have seen them as a part of the historical reality in which they were produced. With a basis in *Romilla Revue* I have thus attempted to reconstruct the situation in which it originated, in other words the professionalization process. This implies that I have used the journal as a source to the thoughts and ideas of the Norwegian advertising pioneers and how they conceived of the circumstances. The sources are very useful for this purpose. On the other hand, considering that assertions in the journal are made by people with an often-similar outlook and as such are relatively biased, the sources are not suitable to reconstruct the historical reality outside of itself. When analyzing the sources I have employed different principles of investigation of sources (kildegrensning).¹⁸ I might also mention that in business history, a certain skepticism should be a common approach to sources that are self-produced by advertising or marketing practitioners. This is necessary because advertising practitioners advertise themselves first of all, and we should therefore question the trustworthiness of their assertions.¹⁹

The methodology has affected the delimitation of my thesis. Because I wanted to do a thorough study of the initial professionalization, I have limited the thesis to the years 1914-1918, in other words to the years *Romilla Revue* was published. It is interesting in itself that the journal's period of publication coincides almost completely with the period of the First World War.²⁰ Using secondary literature I have also covered the developments in the last half of 1918 to get a complete analysis of important developments in this short period. The year 1914 generally represents a milestone in the development of the Norwegian advertising trade, and particularly for its professionalization. Although professional ambitions are discernable among Norwegian advertising pioneers from around 1913, 1914 concretely marks the beginning of a professionalization effort, as the first advertising journal and advertising club was established in Trondheim. The period until 1918 was dramatic, where Norwegian advertising pioneers organized, exchanged ideas and engaged in discussions of reform. Several attainments took place

¹⁷ Kjeldstadli, *Fortida er ikke hva den en gang var*, p 116.

¹⁸ Ibid. pp 161.

¹⁹ Berghoff, Scranton, Spiekermann, "The Origins of Marketing and Market Research", pp 6.

²⁰ For additional context on Norway during the First World War see Brandal, Brazier, Teige, *De Ukjente Krigerne*.

in this period, ending with two momentous achievements in the end of 1918, which indicated that the advertising trade had entered a new phase. Further, after these achievements the advertising pioneers went into a brief period of low activity. As I have elaborated later in the text, there may be several reasons for this. For example, a period of vacuum might be a natural reaction to a period of high activity after the actual goals are made. A generally low interest in advertising in society that must be seen in context of the consequences brought by the ending of the War, could provide another explanation. I have thus focused on the period of 1914-1918 as the initial period of professionalization, where much of the foundation was laid for a second period of professionalization that commenced from the beginning of the 1920's.

Theory

To develop a theoretical framework for my research questions and raise the discussions in my analytical chapters, I have employed several theoretical works, mainly issued from the sociology of professions and the area of research called professional studies (*Profesjonsstudier*).²¹

A basic theory for my thesis is that of professionalization. Professionalization has been a pivotal point of the sociology of professions but also an area of much debate. As I explained above, it is a process whereby an occupation goes through a transformation to become a profession or the effort of an occupation to reach professional status. In the 1950's and 60's American sociologists developed different generalized models of professionalization based on empirical studies of occupations. The goal was to uncover a "natural history" of professionalism, in other words a universal and homogenous professionalization. This process consisted of different phases which occupational groups went through to become a profession. Examples of these phases are: the establishment of an occupational association or organization; development of an ethical code of conduct on which the professionals base their work; establishment of educational or training facilities, in or outside the university system; activities to gain support among the public and the authorities, sometimes with the goal of attaining legally controlled licensing for an area of work. The empirical studies of professionalization were criticized because they were established on the premise that all such studies must be based on the development of the established professions. E.g., in choosing this basis it was taken for granted that the occupation of doctors, seen by many researchers as the prototype of a profession, had gone

²¹ Molander, Terum, *Profesjonsstudier*.

through a professionalization that was typical for all professions. The critics argued that this approach disregarded the fact that, established professions had developed in a specific historical context and was culturally contingent.²² Even if it proved problematic to establish a natural history of professionalism, these empirical studies point to phases and developments that were typical for many different professions, and hence they serve as a theoretical tool to recognize and compare similar developments in the professionalization of the advertising trade.

When analyzing the sources I have thus searched for similarities with these empirical studies but also differences, while being conscious of historical and cultural contingencies and arbitrariness in the development of the phases. While looking at differences I have used the empirical studies as a contrast against which I have put my own findings. With this approach I have also endeavored to uncover what makes the professionalization of the Norwegian advertising trade different from other processes and thus an interesting historical phenomenon as a special case of professionalization. In the conclusion I will address the question of professionalization according to my findings. Examples of works I have employed are Harold Wilensky's "The Professionalization of Everyone?" from 1964, Geoffrey Millerson's *The Qualifying Associations* also from 1964 and Bernard Barber's "Some Problems in the Sociology of the Professions" published in 1963. I have chosen these works because they provide different interpretations of how a professionalization process might develop and concrete examples of developments or phases which characterize a professionalization process.

Another central part of the sociology of professions is *trust*, implying trust between professional and client. I have seen trust as an essential theoretical tool to understand the thoughts and actions of the Norwegian pioneers. I have relied mainly on Harald Grimen's chapter "Profesjon og Tillit" in *Profesjonsstudier*, which I supplemented with parts of Everett C. Hughes work *The Sociological Eye* from 1971.

The speech of the American educator Abraham Flexner "Is Social Work a Profession?" from 1915 was one of the first attempts to define what a profession is and how an occupation endeavors to reach professional status. This early theory has been useful to see what was understood by "profession" in the same period as the Norwegian advertising pioneers were professionalizing. The speech has also provided tools for analyzing the ideas of Millar and other Norwegian reformers.

²² Fauske, "Profesjonsforskningens faser og stridsspørsmål", pp 37.

Structure

Apart from the Introduction chapter and a Conclusion chapter, the thesis consists of four analytical chapters. The structure represents what I see as the different parts of the professionalization. Chapter 1 is biographical, where I give an account of Robert Millar's background. Because Millar was of utmost importance for the development of the Norwegian advertising trade, it is important to have a good understanding of his background. Understanding his background also contributes to understand his thinking. In this chapter, I also discuss how Millar was influenced by American and British advertising literature with implications for how he sought to reform the Norwegian advertising trade. Finally, I discuss Millar's idea of a connection between advertising and Christianity and how this can be seen as part of the professionalization.

Chapter 2 treats the development of the first Norwegian advertising clubs. Here I analyze the ideas of the Norwegian advertising pioneers for the purpose and function of these clubs, how the first two advertising clubs in Norway were established and what they achieved. The development of these clubs was particularly important as they facilitated the professionalization. Further, I look at Millar's ideas for a Landsforening for Reklame or National Association of Advertising, to underline his professional ambitions.

In Chapter 3, I discuss the thoughts and development of education and advertising science. This is another pivotal yet complex development. I analyze the advertising pioneers' ideas of education by employing two different concepts as analytical tools and then look at the means employed to realize these ideas. Further, I explain Millar's concepts of an advertising science and his effort to establish research in this field, and how science and research would be connected with education.

Chapter 4 deals with the establishment of a kontrollkontor or control office. Here I have analyzed how Millar and some of his peers perceived of the situation regarding fraudulent advertising agents and ventures, and their argumentation for the need to implement control with these. Further, I explain how they endeavored to establish a control office, where the cooperation between the different parts of the advertising trade became especially important. Ideally, the control office would serve several important functions in the professionalization.

In the final chapter, the Conclusion, I discuss what I have discovered in my analytical chapters against my research questions and theoretical approach. Finally, I make a few reflections on possibilities for further research in this area.

A failed professionalization? A few historical lines

Looking at the advertising trade in Norway today it is clear that although the advertising trade has become professional we find no advertising profession or occupation with status as a profession. My thesis is thus the history of the beginning of a professionalization that was never completed. The reasons for this poses questions regarding the history of the professions, towards which my thesis may provide some approaches. Even if it was an incomplete process, it would be wrong to call it a failed process as considerable achievements were made. The work and idea development of Robert Millar and his fellow advertising pioneers has reverberated to this day and in some ways formed the basis of the present Norwegian advertising trade. For example, several of today's advertising associations trace their historical lines directly to the initial advertising clubs. The development of advertising knowledge, education and educational facilities has expanded continuously, spanning the 20th century and contributed to the significant position of advertising in business and communication educations of today. On the other hand, there were failures in the professionalization, which might have had consequences for why an advertising profession never materialized, such as the failure of the control office. This implied not only the loss of a potentially important institution for regulating the advertising trade, but also an important platform of cooperation between advertising pioneers and powerful members of the business community. So how did it all begin? We shall now turn to my analysis, first of all to the pillar of my narrative, Robert Millar.

Chapter 1

Robert Millar and the religious foundation of Norwegian advertising

“Advertising demand servants, who are enthusiastic – people who will endeavor to convert their fellow man, people who cannot help but to make propaganda for their cause. It demands ‘missionaries’, preachers.” – Serviss Kinnear.²³

Robert Millar was an educated priest and radical theologian from Northern Ireland who came to Norway in 1903, at the age of 25. He is often regarded as the ”father of advertising” in Norway.²⁴ This distinction is well grounded. Millar founded *Romilla Revue* which may be viewed as the first girder of what was to become “den Nye Reklamebevægelse” or “the New Advertising movement”. This was an institution through which the Norwegian advertising experts sought to legitimize their trade in society, accumulate and disseminate advertising know-how and propagandize for the need to unite all advertising interests in society, in order to rationalize and modernize the advertising trade in Norway.

In this chapter, I argue that part of the way in which this legitimation was sought is a peculiar one, when compared to developments in other countries where the advertising trade was prominent. *Romilla Revue* is permeated by religious or Christian connotations and metaphors. Considering the fact that Millar was an educated priest, at first glance the connection between Christianity and advertising might be interpreted as Millar’s personal conviction. However, when looking at Millar’s background, it becomes clear that the use of Christian principles and metaphors, in a trade journal for advertising, has a more comprehensive significance. The advertising trade in Norway at the turn of the 20th century had no schools or associations, from which a professionalization process could be initiated. Further, the term of “advertising”, both in the business community and in public, had a negative connotation. A common perception was that advertising consisted of ballyhoo, boasting and exaggerations. It was a business conducted by dubious persons. To advertise a product was to “give it a boasting, false recommendation”.²⁵ Historian Kathrine Skretting claims that the term of advertising was almost synonymous with the

²³ Kinnear, ”Reklame og Kristendom”, pp 5.

²⁴ Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, p 161.

²⁵ Meyer, ”Réclame”, pp 3.

word “humbug”.²⁶ According to Millar and other pioneers of Norwegian advertising, these allegations had nothing to do with advertising in its true state and purpose. The problem was that the advertising trade had become subject to swindlers and other untrustworthy persons who used advertising in various forms to fool people for a quick profit, bringing a bad reputation to the trade in the process.²⁷ Thus, both business owners and the public at large had to be convinced and persuaded of the *real* nature and function of advertising, if the trade was to gain legitimacy.

Could Robert Millar’s connection between Christianity and advertising be seen as a first attempt at persuading advertisers and the public that advertising in its true form had an important place in modern society? His knowledge of Christianity and influences from American advertising, combined with his background both as a priest and advertising expert could have given Millar the relevant premises to reform the advertising trade in Norway. A connection between Christianity and advertising would no doubt contribute in legitimating the trade in a Christian society. At the same time new knowledge of advertising corresponded with several Christian principles, in fact giving a rationalizing process a root in the Bible as well. As Millar also directed his arguments towards other advertising practitioners, the connection could be seen as an attempt to establish an ethical code for the advertising trade. To substantiate these arguments, it is important to examine Millar’s background.

Who was Robert Millar?

Robert Millar was born in Ballymena, Northern Ireland in 1878. Here he grew up in a strongly religious environment, in a Presbyterian community. For reasons unknown, Millar was given foster parents at a young age. His foster parents were devout people and very ambitious. They taught Millar to read, write and do arithmetic before he started school. Like all Presbyterian children, Millar went to Sunday school, where at the age of 16 he became a teacher himself. The year after he went to Belfast to study at the Royal Academic Institution and later at Queens University. Exactly what he studied there is unclear, but most likely it was social-economics and art history. After graduating from Queens University, Millar continued studies at Assembly College to become a priest in the Presbyterian Church. This was most likely under pressure from

²⁶ Skretting, ”Ikke bare Reklame”, pp 27.

²⁷ Kimi, ”Kimis brev”, p 2.

Miro, ”Bør Ikke Reklamenæringen Beskyttes?”, p 4.

his foster parents, as Millar had stated earlier in his life that priesthood did not befit him. In fact he was never ordained as priest, though he was licensed to preach in 1902.²⁸

A reason that he was never ordained might be found in the rather radical view of Christianity which Millar developed. His opinions on the Bible and the orthodox teachings of the church changed so fundamentally during his educational years that he never passed his trial sermon. In his last year of studying theology at New College in Edinburgh, he developed certain theological qualms. Looking at the book Millar published in 1917 called *En Gud vi kan elske* (*A God we can love*), might illuminate how he was influenced and what new ideas he developed. In his student days, he said, he had professors who cultivated a new critique of the Bible. In this way he became a critic and a modern theologian. He was strongly influenced by two radical teachers who emphasized the new scientific directions of Darwin's theory of evolution and the literary-critical method.²⁹

For Millar then, the old, Christian view of life was not befitting our modern way of life, as it was not consistent with new scientific research. As a theology student Millar learned to use the literary-critical method on the Bible. Through this Millar discovered that the Bible was a piece of literature just like any other. In his book, Millar described it as a composite work, borrowing from Asian and Greek literature amongst others. He further criticized the conception of the Bible as containing truth only. He concluded that it was not really important for a modern, religious view of life and part of it should be considered superstition.³⁰

Regardless of his critical view on orthodox Christianity, Millar did work as a priest in the Presbyterian Church from 1902-1903. In his first years in Norway, after arriving in Trondheim in 1903, he wore the civilian attire of the priest to show that he was a man of the church. He also worked for some time as a minister to seamen. This could have been for purely economic reasons, more than a wish to spread the gospel. In any event, his talent for preaching was in fact a premise on which he would take charge of developing the advertising trade in Norway.³¹

²⁸ Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, pp 7-8.

²⁹ Ibid. pp 8, 119.

³⁰ Skretting, "Ikke bare Reklame", pp 31.

³¹ Skretting, "Ikke bare Reklame", pp 30.

Millar in Norway

The reason Millar came to Norway was allegedly because of the amounting challenges in his life, mostly a result of his theological studies. His radical views must have caused him much adversity, which had worn him out. In Norway, on the other hand, Millar made good use of his theological education. He used his skills as a pedagogue and teacher to find work as a language teacher in Trondheim. Already in 1905, only two years after his arrival, Millar published his first textbook. It was designed for Norwegian emigrants who needed to learn English, and called *Engelsk A.B.C. En tolk for Emigranter (English A.B.C. An interpreter for Emigrants)*. His second textbook, *First English Reader* was published in 1908, together with an exercise book for practical exercise in verbal English. When writing these books, Millar was deeply engaged in founding his teachings on the learning difficulties of his students. This is a principle which today is called “problem based learning”. Further, Svein Linge Solberg argues that Millar subsequently transferred this principal to his theory on advertising. Here he emphasizes the importance of “seeing things from the customers side of the counter”.³² This principle however, could also be found in American advertising theory from the time. Millar became strongly influenced by developments in America, where the advertising trade was more advanced.³³

Millar’s literary interest combined with a fascination for the Norwegian nature, soon led him into the tourist industry. He saw great potential in Norway as a destination for travelers and wanted to advertise this. In 1905 he established the magazine *The Tourist News* in collaboration with the assistant editor of the newspaper *Dagsposten*. This might be seen as Millar’s first step into the advertising business. Part from the editorial section having the purpose of advertising, the magazine was financed exclusively by advertisements. Millar soon learned the importance of advertisements as an economic foundation for publishing journals and newspapers. The readers were encouraged to read the advertisements, which had been “selected with care and discrimination”³⁴. At this point Millar also worked as an advertising agent. He sold advertising space in his own magazine to companies that wanted to advertise. The advertisements themselves were not very advanced at this point, compared to their level in other countries, especially the U.S. In his strategy of placing the advertisements however, Millar revealed himself as a pioneer in the trade. He balanced the ratio of advertisements and text and organized them carefully. In

³² Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, pp 9.

³³ Lien, *Den Moderne reklamen i Norden startet i Trondheim*, pp 2.

³⁴ Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, pp 15.

this way “the advertisements would represent something new, that would catch the eye, and pointed forward”.³⁵ To make the tourist industry of Trondheim into a more effective economic enterprise, especially for the business community, Millar was encouraged to establish a tourist association. He thus established Turisttrafikkforeningen for Trondhjem (Tourist Association of Trondheim) in 1906, where he expanded his work with advertising Norway as a destination. After this he was regarded as the “advertising-boss” of the city.³⁶

Headhunted

In 1909 Millar was headhunted by Nordenfjeldske Dampskibsselskab or NFDS, a Norwegian steamship company. The company was very interested in the tourist industry, which naturally constituted a valuable market for a steamship company at the time. However, competition was strong and the manager saw the need to establish a department of advertising, to meet this competition head on. Millar, having created quite a name for himself at this point, seemed the obvious choice to lead this department. He took the title “reklamesjef” (“advertising manager”) as the first of his kind in Norway.³⁷ Millar’s work was to travel the tourist routes in Norway and to England in order to “propose practical advertising arrangements for the tourist industry”³⁸. Furthermore, he would continue to make tourist magazines, which were disseminated all over Europe and was in this way a “great propaganda for the company”.³⁹ In 1912 or 1913, the sources vary, Millar contributed in the establishment of “The Norway travel Bureau” in Norway House, London. NFDS had close connections with the British railroad company “Great Northern”, and the establishment of the travel bureau was a result of an intimate connection between the two. It was implemented to function as a sales-office for ship - and railroad travel in Norway.⁴⁰

New knowledge

Through the connection between the two companies, Millar got in touch with the advertising manager of “Great Northern”, H. J. Jewell. It was Jewell who sent Millar his first copy of the

³⁵ Ibid.

³⁶ Lien, *Den Moderne reklamen i Norden startet i Trondheim*, pp 3-4.

³⁷ Ibid.

³⁸ Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, pp 26.

³⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁰ Lien, *Den Moderne reklamen i Norden startet i Trondheim*, pp 3.

important American trade journal for advertising, *Printers Ink*. This influence was of great significance for Millar, as it gave him both inspiration and a new basis of knowledge from which to build up advertising expertise. “The content of the journal aroused my interest”, said Millar

“Consequently I started reading advertising trade literature. For every number I read my interest grew, and soon I started writing about advertising. Then I held a lecture in the Mercantile Club of the city, and the interest this invoked, made me want to try and see what results a systematically planned and executed advertising campaign might bring.”⁴¹

Thirsting for new knowledge, Millar also purchased copies of other American trade journals for example *Advertiser's Weekly*, *The Advertising World* and *Advertising and Selling*. He further acquired the few textbooks on advertising available. In the U.S, the advertising trade had undergone a highly dynamic development since the last decades of the 19th century. Debates had been going on constantly between advertising experts, about what was the most effective form of advertising. Advertising techniques had thus gone through many cycles of change.⁴² One important debate from the beginning of the 20th century, was whether advertising should be seen as science or as an art form. Eventually the scientific approach became dominant, and it was this approach that fascinated and inspired Millar.⁴³ But, he did also emphasize the artistic element of advertising.⁴⁴ To Millar, advertising was both a science and an art. This view is also typical in the discourse of American advertising reformers at the end of the 19th century. This underlines the often loose conception of the term “science” among advertising people in this period. For example, reformers would connect advertising with or refer to it as a science simply to gain respectability and authority for the trade.⁴⁵

Millar's first campaign

After he received a positive response for his new ideas in the Mercantile Club, Millar was eager to test his new knowledge and put his ideas to life. As noted above he wanted to systematically plan and execute an advertising campaign. Millar recapitulates the process in an article in one of

⁴¹ Romilla, ”Et Reklame-Felttog”, pp 4.

⁴² Fox, *The Mirror Makers*, pp 41.

⁴³ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, pp 316.

⁴⁴ Romilla, ”Reklamestandens Opgaver”, p 4.

Romilla, ”Tegninger og Plakater”, p 4.

⁴⁵ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, p 317.

the earlier editions of *Romilla Revue*: the first step wrote Millar, was to give his plan the necessary foundation, by ensuring technical assistance. Therefore, he went first to the business manager of the newspaper *Dagsposten* based in Trondheim. There he requested a fixed amount for a year's worth of advertising. The amount was to "comprise drawings from the creative section of the paper, clichés ditto, and editorial assistance for writing and editing the advertisement."⁴⁶

Next, he would turn to the glassware department store, "one of Trondhjems (...) major companies, conducted with competence by its consul, Andreas Moe."⁴⁷ With the offer from *Dagsposten*, he went to consul Moe who immediately accepted. The idea of the plan continued Millar, was that the advertisements constituted a sequence, with a uniform appearance. The advertisements "begin with the name, big and clear. After that a few lines with an interesting preliminary text, that relates something about the principles on which you conduct your business".⁴⁸ Further said Millar, it would be wise to omit the word "advertisement" and instead use "announcement".⁴⁹ Perhaps to avoid any negative connotations. The first announcement should occupy an entire page. In this, the goal was to explain to the public that an arrangement had been made with the newspaper (*Dagsposten*), so that an announcement would be found there every Tuesday and Thursday. Through the year, Millar built a campaign where pictures were published at regular intervals, that gave supplementary explanations and prices of the various products in the department store. Then, in the preliminary text, Millar went through orderly arguments based on experience. This experience indicated that when presenting the customer on the other side of the counter with the product, it usually lead to a sale. According to Millar himself, the campaign was a success: "The plan was executed and it invoked a strong interest. People became increasingly interested in the Tuesday and Thursday papers because they knew it would contain a new announcement".⁵⁰ How effective the campaign actually was is difficult to measure. What is certain is that Millar had introduced one of many new advertising techniques that constituted a break with the previous forms employed in Norway.

⁴⁶ Romilla, "Et Reklame-Felttog", p 4.

⁴⁷ Ibid.

⁴⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁹ Ibid.

⁵⁰ Ibid.

The foundation of *Romilla Revue*

Millar not only caught the interest of the business community with his new advertising knowledge and ideas. The lecture he held in the Mercantile Club, called “Expert-Advertising”, was printed in *Dagsposten* but also in *Verdens Gang*, one of the major Norwegian newspapers. The editor of *Verdens Gang* became interested in the topic, and asked Millar if he could write a more elaborate article for the paper. The article was called “Forsømmer de norske avisene sine plikter like overfor reklame?” (“Are the Norwegian Newspapers neglecting their duties to advertising?”). It was never printed.⁵¹ Millar was too critical of the Norwegian press because of its lacking of understanding of advertising.

Millar at this point, had probably built up substantial knowledge of the new “scientific” advertising that he wanted to systematize and disseminate to his colleagues. At the same time he realized that a profound understanding of the important function of the advertising trade was mostly lacking in society. Millar was convinced that advertising, in its optimal state, was a highly necessary part of a smoothly functioning economic system, as a premise for progress in society. He thus saw the need to organize all those with an interest in advertising for the common cause of reaching this optimal state, that is, to professionalize the advertising trade. This process would entail the persuasion of newspapers, advertisement agencies, the business community and any other relevant actor, that the advertising trade had to be reformed, to the benefit of all parts involved.⁵²

All these factors combined, and inspired by the American trade journals, Millar saw the need to establish the first Norwegian trade journal *Romilla Revue*. The first issue was published in October 1914. The first article in the journal is not surprisingly the article that was never printed in *Verdens Gang*.

Advertising and Christianity

Romilla Revue became the first platform from which a process of persuasion could be initiated. Given Millar’s turbulent religious past and critique of Christianity, it is conspicuous that Millar not only used Christian metaphors when writing about advertising, but also claimed a direct connection between fundamental Christian principles and advertising. During the course of his

⁵¹ Lien, *Den Moderne reklamen i Norden startet i Trondheim*, pp 5.

⁵² Romilla, ”Reklamestandens Opgaver”, p 4.

life, Millar would become ever more detached from a Christian view of life.⁵³ Under the pseudonym Serviss Kinnear he wrote the article “Reklame og Kristendom” (“Advertising and Christianity”) in January 1915. How detached he was at this point is difficult to assess. The book *En Gud vi kan elske*, suggests a cautious detachment according to Skretting. Having discarded parts of the Bible as superstition, he still might have seen value in other fundamental Biblical doctrines.⁵⁴

Though Millar did not make his views public in a book until 1917, his history displays that these critical views on Christianity had been with him for quite some time, also when he wrote the article in 1915. This gives me reason to believe that more than a personal conviction, Millar carried out his connection between Christianity and advertising as a form of persuasion, and as part of a more comprehensive plan to legitimate the advertising trade, but also to establish an informal ethical code. Published in one of the first editions of *Romilla Revue*, through this article he obviously wanted to establish a firm foundation on which to build up advertising expertise. How can his article “Advertising and Christianity” be seen as an attempt at persuasion and legitimization?

Christian advertising

“Advertising and Christianity” begins the article,

“its bare composition will leave many wondering: What in the world does the one have to do with the other? But if you have a Bible and a little knowledge of the basic principles of advertising (...) it will not be difficult to discover how intimate the relation between these really are.”⁵⁵

Christianity, Millar continued, had always been advertising, although advertising had not always been Christian. But, he said, “the *good* Christianity is advertising-minded, and the *good* advertising must build on the principles of Christianity”.⁵⁶ And further that “the one is unthinkable without the other – Christianity advertising and the teachings of Christianity as the basis and foundation of advertising”.⁵⁷ Millar tied advertising to something deeply rooted in

⁵³ Skretting, ”Ikke bare reklame”, p 35.

⁵⁴ Skretting, ”Ikke bare reklame”, p 35, 31.

⁵⁵ Kinnear, ”Reklame og Kristendom”, pp 4.

⁵⁶ Ibid.

⁵⁷ Ibid.

society. Christianity he claimed, had always employed the various forms of advertising. First of all the simplest form: verbal advertising through the disciples as shown in the gospel of John. Then the written advertising through Paul who wrote his letters to the Romans, Corinthians and Galatians, advertising the master to which he had dedicated his life. And further the Evangelists, Apostles and Church Fathers who wrote their recommendations on the gospel, through many hundreds of years. In this way advertising was given a significant and legitimate history. The Bible in itself said Millar, was a perfect example of how well Christianity advertised itself. It had the most extensive circulation of any book in the world, it had been translated into numerous languages, and could be sold very cheap. In other words the advertising had worked.

The last category of Christian advertising is what Millar has called “equipment-advertising”:

“What is the spire of the church that rises above the landscape and points to the sky, – what is the ringing of bells calling the congregation to worship – what is the song of the congregation, the delightful tunes of the organ, what is the coloured illustration of the windows, the lights on the altar, the splendid attire of the priest and the sweet smell of incense, what is all this other than consecrated advertising, the outer shapes by which the crowd is attracted to reach the inner reality of Christianity.”⁵⁸

This might be seen an attempt at legitimizing advertising in its manipulation of crowds of people or the masses. It is done to reach a higher form of reality. Further, said Millar, Christianity *must* advertise. God himself decreed his disciples to do it: “travel around the whole world and preach the gospel to every creature (...)”. In addition, any form of Christian advertising existed by the order of the One, whose gospel should be preached to “all creatures to the end of the world”.⁵⁹ Advertising then, was initiated by God himself, making it a fundamental and necessary part of human life and society. It would also be employed in missionary work. Here it is interesting to note the etymology of “propaganda”, where “propaganda fide” comes from the Catholic Church. Pope Gregory the XV established a Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith (Congregatio de propaganda fide) in 1622. One view is that the intention of this Congregation was not directly to persuade people of the Catholic faith, but control of doctrinal purity in the missionary

⁵⁸ Ibid.

⁵⁹ Ibid.

operations of the Church.⁶⁰ In any event, this might add to the explanation of why Millar, as a theologian, saw a fundamental connection between advertising and Christianity.

The principles of advertising and Christianity

Christianity then, had always been advertising, but how could advertising be seen as Christian in its principles? According to Millar, the rules of advertising experts as a basis for all proper advertising, was closely related to the principles on which the Christian doctrine was built. One of these rules was compassion: the advertising experts claimed that in all good advertising, the advertiser must forget himself and his own part in the matter. He must look at his products from the customer's point of view or "side of the counter".⁶¹ He must learn to understand the thoughts, wishes and needs of others, before he can advertise convincingly. It was the Christian Master, said Millar, who taught his disciples the first principles of compassion, through a life and a doctrine which was built on an absolute self-sacrificing compassion.⁶²

This doctrine in advertising of putting oneself in the position of the customer, one can also find in Millar's first textbook for advertising – *Lærebok i Reklame*.⁶³ Millar as noted above, became strongly influenced by American advertising. In America, this doctrine of compassion was part of what was called "scientific advertising", where American advertising experts claimed to have established scientific laws of advertising.⁶⁴ Thus, it is just as much a "scientific" doctrine as a Christian one. When writing his textbook, Millar was probably influenced by the American "scientific" doctrine. At the same time he saw how conveniently this doctrine could be compared with the Biblical one. Giving advertising doctrines a Biblical comparison in this way, would probably be more persuasive at the time, especially towards the advertisers, than attempting to argue from a more scientific point of view.

Referring to a passage from the Bible, Millar goes on to explain that "the learned men of advertising demands that advertising speaks the truth. They emphasize that everything which is deemed as falsehood, is like the worm in the fruit – it means certain death."⁶⁵ Advertising then, built on a doctrine of truthfulness, as also found in the Bible. This is clearly an attempt to rid

⁶⁰ Cunningham, *The Idea of Propaganda*, pp 15.

⁶¹ Kinnear, "Reklame og Kristendom", pp 4

⁶² Ibid.

⁶³ Romilla, *Lærebok i Reklame*, p 35.

⁶⁴ Laird, *Advertising progress*, p 318.

⁶⁵ Kinnear, "Reklame og Kristendom", pp 4-5.

advertising of its bad reputation as a false and boasting trade, but also to raise the standard of practice among advertising practitioners and advertisers who arranged their own advertising. Again this doctrine can be found in Millar's textbook. In a passage where he is writing about "humbug-advertising", he explains that: "experience has shown that only honest advertising is profitable. Advertising is only profitable when the customer buys a product repeatedly...". If the advertising is false on the other hand, though it might render an immediate profit, in the long run the customer loses faith in the advertiser.⁶⁶ Raising the standard of practice and thus counteracting dubious forms of advertising among advertising practitioners, would be necessary to render advertising its rightful standing in society.

Further, by claiming a close connection between the rules on which advertising experts conducted "good advertising" and the principles of Christianity, Millar might have attempted to introduce an informal ethical code to the advertising trade. Compassion for the customer and truthfulness when advertising a product would apply to any advertising practitioner. Millar constantly underlined that advertising experts followed these ethical guidelines, but also emphasized that the teachings of Christianity was a basis for advertising. An effort to establish a code of ethics is typical in a professionalization process. Accounts such as Millerson's *Qualifying Associations* and Wilensky's "Professionalization of Everyone?", emphasize a formal code of ethics, which members of a profession must adhere to. An ethical code determines for example what is correct conduct between professional and client and between the professionals themselves. An ethical code might also be, most likely in the initial stages of professionalization, an informal understanding.⁶⁷ Millar endeavored to introduce an ethical understanding that applied not only to advertising experts as eventual professionals, but to the advertising trade in general. In the terms of Wilensky, Millar's informal ethical argument, could be an early effort of eliminating "the unqualified and unscrupulous".⁶⁸ Further, as will be seen in the next chapter, these ethical guidelines can also be seen as a means to reduce internal competition or discrepancies. In our case, this implied a better cooperation between different actors of the advertising trade, which was a premise for professionalization.

Finally, advertising was based on a principle of optimism. Advertising said Millar, demanded actors with an idealistic view of life and human activities. Pessimists were of no use in

⁶⁶ Romilla, *Lærebok i Reklame*, p 12-13.

⁶⁷ Millerson, *The Qualifying Associations*, p 149.

⁶⁸ Wilensky, "The Professionalization of Everyone?", p 145.

the advertising trade, he continued. The advertiser had to think well about his fellow humans, before he could try to influence them. Optimism was a Christian discovery Millar claimed, by referring to a passage from the Bible: “By its cradle the choir of angles sang: ‘For look, I preach to You a great pleasure,’ and its whole gospel is filled with messages of light and hope and comfort”.⁶⁹ Millar was convinced that advertising brought progress and hope. According to Kathrine Skretting this optimism must be seen in coherence with the belief in progress brought by the industrialization. Although Millar was critical of Christianity, he was still a religious man. In *En Gud vi kan elske*, he developed a new religious view of life. This entailed a greater plan of God that was perpetual progress towards a perfect society. Further, every man should be Gods instrument in this progress. Millar believed advertising had an important part in driving this progress, says Skretting, which is why he advocated it so strongly.⁷⁰

Conclusion: “A pervasive spirit”⁷¹

The duties of life are numerous, wrote Millar in the closing paragraph of the article. Human nature, he continued, had many aspects and its activities stretched over countless areas. In every corner (of life) the “same spirit that was in Christ, must pierce through to transform human failure to the perfect image...”.⁷² This image was exemplified by the Christ. In the same way said Millar, advertising was only *one* part of the “sales-machinery”. It cooperates with other parts, but its *spirit* must pervade the whole process of selling.⁷³ By making this connection, Millar could appeal to all parts of the advertising trade at once. Advertising was key to a smoothly functioning economy and would benefit all the parts included. Therefore, every advertising interest, be it the business community or the newspapers, should open their eyes to this. This could also contribute to unravel whatever doubts they might have had about the nature of advertising.

Himself a radical theologian, Millar probably realized from his own experience that exposing radical views on Christianity at the time did not create many followers. Having developed his own religious view of life, he still recognized advertising and Christianity as “two of the greatest powers of our time”.⁷⁴ Hence, creating a connection between the two could have

⁶⁹ Kinnear, ”Reklame og Kristendom”, pp 5.

⁷⁰ Skretting, ”Ikke bare reklame”, p 32, 35.

⁷¹ Kinnear, ”Reklame og Kristendom”, p 5.

⁷² Ibid.

⁷³ Ibid.

⁷⁴ Kinnear, ”Reklame og Kristendom”, p 5.

obvious advantages when legitimating the advertising trade. As noted above this connection would also give advertising a legitimate and proud past, rooting it in the history of Christianity. To root advertising knowledge in Christian doctrines, and claiming that advertising was decreed by God, could further contribute to render this knowledge a sense of objectivity, and hence more easily accepted by society.⁷⁵

As will be discussed further in this thesis, Millar and his fellow admen in *Romilla Revue*, employed various methods of persuasion to legitimate their trade. In the initial stages, I believe that the connection with Christianity was a superior form of persuasion as it transcended both the public and the various actors in the advertising trade. This further explains why Christian metaphors permeate the journal. It was a constant reminder of the foundation of advertising.

We have seen how Millar became an advertising expert through years of experience, working with advertising in different ways. Impulses from countries where the advertising trade was more advanced were significant for his personal development, but can also be seen as a catalyst for the professionalization of the Norwegian advertising trade. It was after Millar started preaching his newfound knowledge that he ended up in a quarrel with the newspapers, which led him to found his own journal. The foundation of *Romilla Revue* was a first and important phase in the professionalization.

One of Millar's motives for reform was to make the newspapers care more about how they arranged their advertising sections, given that they were dependent on advertising for their economic subsistence.⁷⁶ In the next chapter I elaborate on how he envisaged a reform of the newspapers' practices to become a more efficient platform for advertising. Having worked up significant experience, knowledge and skills, Millar probably viewed himself as a professional and was convinced that his work had a function in society equally important to that of established professions. At the same time he recognized the disarray of the advertising trade and the unfair reputation of advertising in general, which implied that honest workers such as himself were often disdained.⁷⁷ Given the circumstances, he might have realized that in order for experts such as himself but also future advertising experts to thrive and find a meaningful area of work, the advertising trade needed to be reformed and rationalized.

⁷⁵ Larson, *The Rise of Professionalism*, pp 40.

⁷⁶ Romilla, "En Reklamedebat", pp 3.

⁷⁷ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, p 22.

With *Romilla Revue*, he had established a forum where exchange of knowledge and ideas between Norwegian advertising pioneers could be initiated, of how to reform the advertising trade. It was a medium through which pioneers and experts could advertise themselves and the advertising trade to their potential clients, the advertisers, but also the public. The connection between Christianity and advertising was one example of this effort to gain legitimacy. This connection, I have argued, might also be seen as the beginning of another phase of professionalization, with the effort of establishing ethical guidelines for the advertising trade.

With the establishment of the journal, Millar had a medium through which he could call upon the advertising people of the country to organize and he immediately embarked on the task of establishing advertising clubs that could actively lead the effort to reform the advertising trade.

Chapter 2

Facilitating the professionalization: The first Norwegian Advertising Clubs and Associations

Today there is an advertising or marketing association in every major Norwegian town or city. These associations typically function as a hub and meeting place for people working in sales and marketing. They are forums for exchanging knowledge, building networks and working to improve marketing practices. Their membership is quite versatile, consisting of a wide range of different occupational groups connected to advertising and marketing. Most of these associations are members of the central organization Markedsforbundet (The Marketing Association). On its home page, this association is described as an independent, ideal organization working to increase the use and understanding of professional marketing in Norway. It is an umbrella organization with two thousand members, making it the largest network for marketing communication in the country. Seemingly the associations of today are resourceful and employ a wide range of activities.⁷⁸

Most of the local associations such as Trondheim, Oslo and Bergen, but also the central association located in Bergen, are direct descendants of the first Norwegian advertising clubs and associations. Interestingly, the associations of today are still working with similar tasks and have similar visions as their predecessors.⁷⁹ Robert Millar established the first advertising club in Trondheim in 1914 with the purpose of working for a better understanding of advertising in society. Further, the club was established as a meeting place for the various actors in the advertising trade, where knowledge and experience could be exchanged. Network building between the different actors was perhaps the most important task. At this initial stage, establishing networks was important to reform the advertising field and develop a more coherent advertising trade.

In this chapter I focus on the Trondheim club and the Advertising Association of Kristiania as these were the first and most important clubs, and attempt to develop how these clubs can be seen as professional associations. Analyzing the development of these clubs is important because they were the base of and facilitated the professional reform work of the Norwegian advertising

⁷⁸ Markedsforbundet, “Om Markedsforbundet”, <http://markedsforbundet.no/om-oss/>, found 30.9.2014.

⁷⁹ Markedsforbundet, “Lokalforeninger”, <http://markedsforbundet.no/lokalforeninger/>, found 30.9.2014.

pioneers that became known as the “club-movement”.⁸⁰ The establishment of these clubs are part of a period of Norwegian social history characterized by a “spirit of association”, from the 1840s to the beginning of the 20th century.⁸¹ This implied an upsurge of organized activity where the middle classes were the most active. Formation of occupational and professional associations was typical and the middle classes organized to advance the status of their occupations and defend economic interests. Towards the end of 19th century, middle-class employees organizing across borders was not unusual.⁸²

First I will explain what characterizes a professional association and how Norwegian advertising pioneers were influenced by professional reformers and advertising associations in the U.S and Great Britain. Looking at examples from the U.S is interesting because it provides a useful example of how professional advertising associations developed in a country where the advertising trade was prominent. Then I will move on to look at Millar’s concept of an advertising club and how the first club in Trondheim was established, before explaining how the Advertising Association of Kristiania was established and what made their concept of a club different from Millar’s. Finally I will analyze Millar’s concept of a National Association as he presented it at the first advertising congress arranged by the Trondheim club. The congress in itself was an important event and potentially a forceful institution for reform, where powerful actors from different areas of the advertising trade came together.

Professional Associations

In professional theory,⁸³ the formation of associations has been a central aspect of the concept of professionalization. However, various research on the topic has failed to establish a general theory of how and why these associations are established. Professional associations might be established in a number of ways for a number of reasons in the process of forming a profession.⁸⁴ Perhaps typical of these associations is that its members gather around their occupation or work area and knowledge base, often as a homogenous occupational group. Occupational groups organize to gain exclusive rights to an area of work, work for their occupation to reach

⁸⁰ “Reklamens Mænd Og Deres Samarbeide”, *Romilla Revue*, (December 1914), p 6.

⁸¹ Hodne, *God Handel*, pp 29.

⁸² Myhre, ”The Middle Classes of Norway, 1840-1940”, pp 130.

⁸³ Molander, Terum, *Profesjonsstudier*.

⁸⁴ Abbott, *The System of Professions*, p 11.

professional status and control the entry to their eventual profession.⁸⁵ The advertising associations on the other hand, did not consist of a single occupational group, but had representatives from different occupations involved with and interested in advertising. This sort of professionalization where the association is an early and fundamental development and where anyone with an interest in the area can become a member is not very common but can be found, apart from advertising, in such professions as social work and librarians.⁸⁶ Professional associations can be both local and national. There are examples of national professional associations being established initially without regard to local associations, where local associations later become members of the national association.⁸⁷ A different development is found where local associations establish first, which then combine to establish a national association. Establishing a national association is crucial in a professionalization process because such a process must be implemented on a national level to be successful. Any isolated local process is not sufficient.⁸⁸

American advertising associations and its influence on Norwegian pioneers

In his work *The System of Professions*, Andrew Abbot connects the rise of advertising associations with the effort of advertising specialists to claim *professional jurisdiction* in the area of distribution, now called marketing. With developments in America as a basis, Abbott claims that advertising contested the groups of economics, journalism and psychology for this jurisdiction and that “For advertising, it provided a potential avenue to professional status...”.⁸⁹ To explain how advertising specialists sought to claim this jurisdiction, Abbott draws on the work of Quentin Schultze in his article ““An Honorable Place”: The Quest for Professional Advertising Education, 1900-1917”. Abbott emphasizes how the central organization The Associated Advertising Clubs of America (AACCA) “embarked on serious structural professionalization”⁹⁰, where he briefly discusses how this association sought to implement an advertising education and why it was not successful.⁹¹

⁸⁵ Millerson, *The Qualifying Associations*, pp 13.

⁸⁶ Ansteinsson, “Norsk Bibliotekforening gjennom 25 år”, p 6.
Messel, “Sosialarbeiderne”, pp 526.

⁸⁷ See for example Slagstad, Messel, *Profesjonshistorier*.

⁸⁸ Millerson, *The Qualifying Associations*, pp 51, p 115.

⁸⁹ Abbott, *The System of Professions*, pp 234.

⁹⁰ Ibid.

⁹¹ Ibid.

Although advertising education is the main theme of Schultze's article, it was only one of many endeavors of the AACA. According to Schultze's article the overarching purpose of the AACA was to "advance the advertising profession".⁹² Exactly what this profession entailed is unclear though. Advertising historian Pamela Walker Laird gives a more detailed account of what the American "advertising profession" entailed at the time, or the specialized work on which advertising men claimed professional status, as it was not a closed profession. In the U.S advertising "professionals" usually worked for or managed an advertising agency where their specialized area of work was the placing of advertisements in newspapers for the advertisers. As the American advertising trade developed, copywriting and planning the advertising for businesses became additional specialized work areas on which advertising men claimed professional status.⁹³ In other words the term "advertising profession" entail different specialized occupations in the American context. To advance this profession, Schultze claimed that the AACA emulated medicine and law and addressed typical characteristics of professionalism such as certification and licensing restrictions, ethical codes and educational requirements. Formal advertising instruction was implemented to establish scientific principles of advertising and advertising clubs were established to assist the formation of this "science". The AACA further envisaged that an advertising education could be employed in combination with licensing and certification to regulate access to the profession.⁹⁴

This central organization also initiated the "Truth in advertising" movement with the purpose of establishing standards for advertising practice through self-regulation, but also to some extent educate advertisers on correct practice.⁹⁵ With false and fraudulent advertising a widespread problem and an increasing alertness in society of the influence of advertising on public opinion, advertising "professionals" were subjected to the threat of external government regulation.⁹⁶ Laird maintains that the movement was very much a public relations campaign which "directed its collective efforts at the public's opinion explicitly in order to forestall regulation." The self-regulation was based on the establishment of vigilance committees that worked to suppress false advertising and thus "improve consumers' and state officials'

⁹² Schultze, "'An Honorable Place", pp 22.

⁹³ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, pp 304.

⁹⁴ Ibid.

⁹⁵ Hess, "History and the present status of the "Truth-in-Advertising" Movement", pp 211.

⁹⁶ Fox, *The Mirror Makers*, pp 65.

confidence in what remained.”⁹⁷ It was in this environment that “advertising for advertising” developed. This implied that advertising experts employed their expertise of persuasion for public relations needs as well.⁹⁸

The AACA was founded by the consolidation of many local advertising clubs. In the U.S. local advertising clubs had been developing since the 1890’s with 74 clubs established by 1914. The Sphinx Club of New York was one of the most influential. It was organized in 1896 with the purpose of promoting “a clearer understanding of the problems of advertising and a betterment of advertising”.⁹⁹ This was to be achieved through discussions between its members who represented different advertising institutions, generally advertising specialists from an agency, advertising managers of various publications and advertising managers employed by advertisers (predominantly manufacturers). The Sphinx Club established the National Society for the Investigation and Suppression of Fraudulent Advertising in 1902, to protect readers of newspapers and magazines against fraudulent advertisements and to improve the public’s overall confidence in advertisements.¹⁰⁰ This was praised by publishers and manufacturers alike, and the American advertising journal *Mahin’s Magazine* stated that “The club idea in advertising”, was a blessing to “the development of advertising as a profession.”¹⁰¹

In advertising journals such as *Advertiser’s Weekly*, Millar read about American advertising clubs with great interest. What was perhaps a catalyst for Millar to start working for establishing advertising clubs in Norway, was the first international advertising congress arranged in the U.S in the summer of 1914. Millar read summaries from this congress where the “Truth in Advertising” movement was an important part of the agenda.¹⁰² These journals were read with curiosity by other advertising men in the country as well, most importantly in the capital.¹⁰³ Prominent among these was the advertising expert Harry Høst, who was an expert in journalistic advertisements, conducted editing and delivered clichés and other apparatus for advertisements through his “advertising business”, the stock company A/S Harry Høst. Høst also worked with Millar in *Romilla Revue*, writing articles on various advertising topics as a correspondent for

⁹⁷ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, p 241.

⁹⁸ Ibid. pp 242-243.

⁹⁹ Ibid. p 241.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid.

¹⁰¹ Cited in Laird, *Advertising Progress*, p 241

¹⁰² Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, p 58.

¹⁰³ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, pp 33.

Kristiania.¹⁰⁴ Høst and Millar developed different conceptions on how advertising clubs should be established and organized, with implications for how the association of Kristiania was formed and the course the club-movement took. What especially caught the interest of the Norwegian pioneers, was the effort of the American clubs to counteract fraudulent advertising and work for a greater understanding of advertising in society.

British clubs as model

Great Britain was another country where the advertising trade was prominent and significantly more advanced than in Norway. Conveniently, Millar had contacts there such as his old business partner, the advertising manager of Great Northern Railway Co. H. J. Jewell. When Millar introduced the idea of advertising clubs to the Norwegian advertising trade, he could thus call upon the assistance of his colleague to give an idea “of how advertising clubs operate in countries, which are more advanced in their advertising course than Norway.”¹⁰⁵ Although this idea had been “discussed in advertising circles with great interest” there had been differences of opinion and misunderstandings of how such clubs should be arranged.¹⁰⁶ This implies that the concept of advertising clubs was not familiar to everyone in the Norwegian advertising field.

In an article in *Romilla Revue*, Jewell explained that there existed many active clubs in Great Britain. These clubs were established with the exclusive purpose, by means of convivial gathering and debate, to discuss different matters pertaining to advertising and reform of the advertising trade. Membership to these clubs were quite limited it seems, ranging from half a dozen to a dozen members. Surprisingly Jewell said nothing on qualifications for entry. An array of different topics were discussed among which counteracting fraudulent or “humbug-advertising” and implementing advertising education were important.¹⁰⁷

Many of the British clubs were members of the central institution British Association of Advertising, stated Jewell. Conclusively he wondered if there was a significant number of advertising men in Norway, who were interested in establishing clubs in the larger towns and cities, with a central institution in Kristiania. To anyone who was interested in establishing a

¹⁰⁴ Ibid. p 35, 62.

¹⁰⁵ Jewell, “Om reklameklubber”, p 6.

¹⁰⁶ “Reklame-klubber”, *Romilla Revue*, (November 1914), p 6.

¹⁰⁷ Jewell, “Om reklameklubber”, p 6.

club, Jewell declared that he would be delighted to supply them with copies of statutes from British clubs.¹⁰⁸

Invoking the advertising class

When Millar probed the Norwegian advertising environment of the willingness to establish advertising clubs, one of his first ideas was to refer to developments overseas. Abroad claimed Millar, “advertising for advertising” had become a slogan and advertising people were working hard to advertise their own trade.¹⁰⁹ In Norway then,

“such an energetic work of propaganda among the advertising public is no less required than abroad, but it is an absolute condition for a good result, that advertising people here consolidate and support each other. To this end an association or *advertising club* would be an effective facility”.¹¹⁰

One of the initial purposes of advertising clubs in Millar’s mind was to persuade what he describes as the advertising public of the importance of the advertising trade. By advertising public he is probably referring to the advertisers themselves, such as manufacturers, wholesalers and retailers, in other words businesses. Millar recognized that these advertisers employed a wide range of different practitioners to prepare or develop their advertising, or in many cases performed these tasks themselves. He realized that the consumption of advertising had increased significantly in the last couple of years, paralleling the continuous growth in trade. Advertising had thus become an extensive and versatile field, which was ever evolving and expanding, and to Millar’s mind in dire need of organization.¹¹¹

Millar’s conception was that all the different practitioners in the field belonged to what he called “reklamestanden”, which may be translated to the “advertising class”.¹¹² Millar wondered why the feeling of belonging to a class was so insignificant among these different practitioners, or “advertising people”.¹¹³ I have chosen the term “class” as I believe this translation best describes the wide array of practitioners Millar wanted to consolidate. “Stand” might also be

¹⁰⁸ Jewell, “Om reklameklubber”, p 6.

¹⁰⁹ Millar, “Reklame og Reklamens Mænd: Hvorfor er standsfølelsen så liten hos Norske Reklamefolk?”, p 6.

¹¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹¹ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, p 28.

¹¹² Millar, “Reklame og Reklamens Mænd: Hvorfor er standsfølelsen så liten hos Norske Reklamefolk?”, p 6.

¹¹³ Ibid.

translated to “group” or “profession”, but in my opinion “group” signifies a smaller entity, and the use of “profession” would be inappropriate as this class consisted of many different occupations. Historian Jan Eivind Myhre explains that “Contemporary terminology in the nineteenth and early twentieth century (...) employed ‘*stand*’ for a variety of purposes...”, but that in the twentieth century its usage was “mainly transferred to the rising middle class, to lines of business or industry (*handelsstanden* [the commercial profession]), and to an indefinite number of small social groups, mainly occupational groups (...).”¹¹⁴ Millar’s usage of “stand” probably refers to the advertising line of business. Within this business there existed a number of occupational groups employed with advertising in various forms. However, in Norwegian the term “stand” was in certain cases used interchangeably with the term “class”. I.e. the labor movement sometimes used the term *arbeiderstanden* to “denote the class-conscious collective of workers.”¹¹⁵ Millar also talked about a class attachment and argued that belonging to an advertising club made the members conscious of belonging to a class.¹¹⁶ It thus seems that Millar was attempting to invoke an attachment among the various practitioners in the advertising field, that was deeper than belonging to the same line of business.

Millar’s contemporary Abraham Flexner stated in 1915 that when a profession is organized, a strong class consciousness develops. This is a result of the organization of professional men around a professional nucleus, which implies a base of professional knowledge and practice.¹¹⁷ The new knowledge of advertising Millar and his fellow pioneers received from abroad and knowledge they had developed with years of experience in the advertising business, could be interpreted as a base of knowledge or professional nucleus. Further, as the advertising business consisted of many different practitioners with different skills Millar argued that it was important to incorporate these and expand the base of knowledge.¹¹⁸ The advertising clubs would thus function as a forum where the advertising class could exchange knowledge and consolidate a knowledge base.

¹¹⁴ Myhre, ”The Middle Classes of Norway, 1840-1940”, pp 110.

¹¹⁵ *Ibid.*

¹¹⁶ Millar, “Reklameklubber og Reklameopgaver”, bilag.

¹¹⁷ Flexner, “Is Social Work a Profession?”, p 156.

¹¹⁸ Romilla, “Reklamestandens Opgaver”, p 4.

The advertising club of Trondheim

After Millar employed *Romilla Revue* to advertise the need for advertising clubs the first to respond was a newspaperman. Millar was contacted by Johannes Knudsen, assistant editor of the Trondheim newspaper *Dagsposten*. Millar later narrated their initial phone call as such:

“John the Baptist was called the voice shouting in the desert. Johannes Knudsen is known in the advertising-circles of this country as the voice in the phone, the one who responded immediately when (...) the first issue of “Romilla Revue” was published in October 1914 with an appeal to the advertising people of this country to initiate the establishment of advertising clubs.”¹¹⁹

According to advertising expert and historian Trygve Dalseg, Knudsen simply telephoned Millar and asked him if they should establish an advertising club. Millar was not sure if it could be done on such a short notice, but Knudsen told him he already knew four persons interested.¹²⁰ That same evening statutes were propounded before a small group of advertising people. On the 12th of November a preparatory meeting was held in Knudsen’s editorial office. Thirteen days later a general meeting was held and the club was founded as the first of its kind in Northern Europe. The club was originally called Reklameklubben Romilla but Millar mostly referred to it as Trondhjemsklubben (the Trondheim club).¹²¹

According to Millar, “all advertising interests” were represented at the meeting. Apart from Millar and Knudsen it was the draftsman Georg Keller; manager of the printing house Aktietrykkeriet Carl Nielsen; Johan Setsaas, director of the advertisement agency Nordenfjeldske Annoncebureau; wholesale dealer B. J. Brodersen; W. Bull Jansen, owner of the tourist hotel Fjældbek, Principal Olav Mykland of Myklands Handelsskole (Mykland Trading School); stockbroker Hans Bell who was also employed at the trading school K. Solberg’s Handelsskole, and finally G.O. Goffeng who was a department manager of the retail company A. Dahl.¹²² In other words this was quite a composite group. If this group was representative of Millar’s advertising class, it consisted of advertising experts, draftsmen and printers, representatives of advertisement agencies and various advertisers including a representative of the tourist industry. These were people who were working directly with advertising in some way. It was also

¹¹⁹ Quote in Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, p 58.

¹²⁰ Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, pp 58-59.

¹²¹ Ibid.

¹²² Ibid.

represented by the newspapers and directors of trading-schools whom Millar hoped would initiate an advertising education in their schools.

In its actual shape this first club resembled the British local clubs. The statutes displayed its simple purpose: to work for a better understanding of advertising, implying among the different members of the advertising class and the public. This was done through discussion and debate in convivial circumstances between its few, dedicated members.¹²³ In the last part of the lecture “The tasks of the advertising class”, held at this meeting, Millar expressed hope of what might be achieved through consolidation and discussion. He appealed to all the members of his advertising class in turn.

The Advertising Experts

First, for the advertising experts, the task was to work for an even deeper understanding of “this grand trade”, in order to grow out of their dilettante state which was based on inexact discretion (“skipperskjønnstadium”), and really become specialists in their trade.¹²⁴ By inexact discretion, Millar was probably implying that most of their knowledge was based on experience and not modern advertising doctrines. Who were these advertising experts? First of all, Millar was referring to already established advertising experts. These were most likely advertising managers such as himself, who managed the advertising department of a company. This could imply a major company or manufacturer or smaller wholesalers and retailers. Companies with their own advertising department was not usual at the time. A few major companies and manufacturers had their own advertising department with a full-time advertising manager.¹²⁵ Apparently, among the wholesalers who had a separate advertising department, the owner himself was the advertising expert and it was not yet a specialized position.¹²⁶ Further, Millar was probably referring to managers of “annoncebureauer” or “annonce-expeditioner” which I have translated to advertisement agencies. These were mainly experts in expediting advertisements for the advertisers, that is, placing advertisements in the newspapers. Some agencies increasingly began to undertake other specialized functions in this period, such as assisting the advertiser with

¹²³ “Reklamens Mænd Og Deres Samarbeide”, *Romilla Revue*, (December 1914), p 6.

¹²⁴ Romilla, ”Reklamestandens Opgaver”, p 4.

¹²⁵ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, pp 38.

¹²⁶ Brodersen, “Min Reklame for “Kronekaffe””, p 6.
Berg, “Lundgreens Enke’s Reklame”, p 6.

shaping and editing advertisements and advertising after a system.¹²⁷ These different established experts were self-taught and had gained their expertise through years of experience in their work. To Millar's mind such experts were the older generation. Millar envisioned that this generation would soon be replaced by a new generation of experts who not only gained their expertise from experience but also from education.¹²⁸ He intended for both old and new experts to be part of the advertising clubs.

In his initial articles on the work and qualifications of these new experts, it seems that Millar had two different conceptions. First of all the advertising trade should consist of many types of experts and specialists. These were copywriters, draftsmen and typographers.

Then there was the solitary and versatile expert, which was perhaps a reflection of Millar himself. Such an expert had expertise and experience in business and some degree of "business-sense". It was not enough to know the task of advertising alone. This expert should comprehend "all of the machinery that needs to be set in motion to create sales".¹²⁹ Any advertising expert needed an understanding of advertising techniques, its cultural and economic significance. Knowledge of newspaper advertising was essential. This included knowledge of prizes, terms, distribution and what parts of the public were reading the different papers. The expert should have knowledge of printing houses and poster art and be able to create circularies and brochures. This required technical knowledge of formats, drawings, photos and clichés and knowing how and to whom circularies and brochures should be distributed. Further, the expert needed qualifications such as eloquence to be able to talk people into buying a product, and writing skills with the ability to write a "suggesting text" to sell the product.¹³⁰ Suggestion was a psychological tool, which Millar emphasized as essential in leading the customer to buy the product. "The purpose of advertising is selling", he stated, "it is in that direction you must lead the thoughts of the reader and he must be led to make up his mind *now*".¹³¹ Conclusively, "The premises were in the elaborate information, you have given of the product, and in your recommendation that it will fit the needs of the customer, but the conclusion is in the suggestion: buy the product, and buy it now."¹³² In other words, knowledge of psychology was needed. The influence of American

¹²⁷ Dalseg, *RRF-50 år, IFM-25 år*, p 21.

¹²⁸ Romilla, "Manden som kommer", p 6.

¹²⁹ Ibid.

¹³⁰ Romilla, "Den Lokale Reklamemand", p 2.

¹³¹ Romilla, "Den bedste reklame og hvad den er", p 2.

¹³² Ibid.

advertising is apparent. The technique of suggestion was a central component of advertising psychology, a field pioneered by the American Walter Dill Scott shortly after the turn of 20th century. Suggestion might be seen as a mental process, where the individual is influenced to act in certain way, i.e. purchase a product. Suggestion is defined as “influencing a person by submitting it to certain ideas while the independent activity of thought and will are made obsolete.”¹³³

On these premises the expert should be able to work out and plan an entire advertising campaign for a business, implying all their advertising for about a year’s time. Finally, there was also some religious element connected to this expert. What was required to become an expert was not only education and experience in the fields alluded to above. It required a kind of “spark” said Millar, and a balance of imagination and common sense gifted by “Providence”.¹³⁴ This might perhaps be an analogy to a vocational calling.

In his textbook, Millar referred to these experts as “the professional advertising men”.¹³⁵ He referred longingly to how these professionals operated in England: he explained that they worked in an advertising agency as experts together with other specialists such as draftsmen and copywriters. A similar kind of experts Millar hoped to develop in Norway.¹³⁶ For these eventual advertising professionals, Millar adopted the name “advertising consultant”.¹³⁷

Now we have an idea of how Millar envisaged the advertising experts and how a new generation of experts would become the advertising professionals. In order to create these professionals, the cooperation of the other members of the advertising club was essential. I have already mentioned above Millar’s hopes that the trading-school directors would implement advertising as part of their curriculum. Millar thought these trading schools should be able to offer a scientific education in advertising. “Why” inquired Millar, “should we have educated priests, doctors and architects and not educated advertising experts.”¹³⁸ How these consultants would operate I elaborate in Chapter 3.

¹³³ Scott, *The Psychology of Advertising*, p 174.

¹³⁴ Romilla, “Den Lokale Reklamemand”, p 3.

¹³⁵ Romilla, *Lærebok i Reklame*, p 57.

¹³⁶ Romilla, “Manden som kommer”, p 6.

¹³⁷ Romilla, *Lærebok i Reklame*, p 57.

¹³⁸ Romilla, “En Reklamedebat”, p 7.

The Newspapers

In Chapter 1, I explained how *Romilla Revue* was established as a consequence of an article Millar wrote, where he criticized the newspapers for their lacking understanding of advertising. Millar and other advertising pioneers argued that the newspapers formed an important part of the advertising trade as it was by far the most valuable platform for advertising. Millar concluded: “To reach the people who are potential buyers, no instrument, can outdo a well edited advertisement in the daily press. The newspaper is admitted in every home and is read by anyone with purchasing power.”¹³⁹ What Millar had criticized the newspapers of in his article, he now reiterated to them as part of the advertising class: the newspapers lacked a proper system for how their advertising sections were organized and guidance for the readers to find the type of advertisements they were looking for. Further, the newspapers should be more concerned with limiting the freedom of the advertisers to shape the advertisements.¹⁴⁰ Several advertising pioneers at the time described newspaper advertising as chaotic and were dissatisfied that the advertisements were often accumulated in the latter section of the paper.¹⁴¹ According to Millar the advertisements were composed in different sizes and shapes, and placed without much care for organizing them according to the product being advertised.¹⁴²

Millar wanted to persuade the newspapers to reorganize their system of placing advertisements. The advertising section, he thought, should be organized in a lucid and instructive way, similar to the editorial section.¹⁴³ In addition, the editorial section should be employed to guide the potential buyers on when to buy different products, such as Christmas presents and summer holidays, and in this way prepare the buyers for the coming advertisements. For this purpose, Millar envisioned the position of a sales-journalist working for the papers. E.g., this journalist would cooperate with the advertisers and their advertising campaigns. Finally, Millar urged the newspapers to hire specialists to assist with the editing and typography of the advertisements to make them effective, and to assist with the practical organizing of the advertising section. The goal of this reform was to make the newspapers a more effective platform for advertising to ensure that the advertisements were profitable to the advertisers.¹⁴⁴ An

¹³⁹ Romilla, “Den bedste reklame og hvad den er”, p 2.

¹⁴⁰ Romilla, “En Reklamedebat”, p 5.

¹⁴¹ Jewell, “Om Reklame”, p 2.

¹⁴² Romilla, “En Reklamedebat”, p 5.

¹⁴³ Romilla, “Reklamestandens Opgaver”, p 4.

¹⁴⁴ Romilla, “Knut Framgaards Avis”, p 4.

effective use of the businesses advertising budget, would convince the businesses to advertise more. This in turn meant more revenue for the newspapers and an ever expanding advertising field. A more advanced and rationalized advertising system also enhanced the need for advertising experts to assist the advertisers with planning campaigns and shaping advertisements.¹⁴⁵ It was thus an important move to increase the efficiency of the advertising system.

The Advertisers

Millar then turned to the advertisers themselves. The businesses were the cornerstone of the advertising trade, as they made it possible in the first place through investing money in it. But Millar reminded them that advertising was not their field and that accordingly they should hire experts. You employ doctors and lawyers said Millar, “why not advertising experts for your advertising?”¹⁴⁶ He then implored them to give expertise a chance and let an expert work out an advertising plan for their business, by introducing him to the business and products, and giving him time and material with which to build the plan.¹⁴⁷

This persuasion of the advertisers to hire experts can be seen as an effort to gain the trust of the advertisers as clients. According to the Norwegian philosopher Harald Grimen, the issue of trust has been a debated topic in the discussion of modern professions from early on. Grimen emphasized that a client’s trust in a professional implies a trust in the expertise of the professional.¹⁴⁸ A basis for this sort of trust might be found in sociologist Everett C. Hughes’ etymological explanation of *profession*. He claimed that professionals “*professed* to know better than others the nature of certain matters, and to know better than their clients what ails (...) their affairs.” Since the professional profess, Hughes asserted, he asks to be trusted. The client must give the professional all the details pertaining to the task at hand and trust in the skill and judgment of the professional. In turn the professional has an ethical duty to put the interest of his/her client ahead of their own (*credat emptor*).¹⁴⁹ This ethical duty or service ideal is also something emphasized by Harold L. Wilensky in his work “The Professionalization of

¹⁴⁵ Romilla, “En Reklamedebat”, p 5.

¹⁴⁶ Romilla, “Reklamestandens Opgaver”, p 4.

¹⁴⁷ Ibid.

¹⁴⁸ Grimen, “Profesjon og tillit”, p 200.

¹⁴⁹ Hughes, *The Sociological Eye: Selected Papers*, pp 375-376.

Everyone?”, where he describes the service ideal as a pivot around which the moral claim to professional status revolves.¹⁵⁰ An obvious challenge was that trust between professional and client had to be established *before* an actual advertising profession was established. Trust had to be gained partly in order to establish a profession in the first place. Further, Grimen defined the relations between professionals and clients as asymmetric. Thus, those who faithfully entrusts something to the custody of professionals, entrusts it to someone who are more capable than themselves. In other words, these relations are characterized by an *epistemic asymmetry*. The professionals possess knowledge that their client lack but require.¹⁵¹

According to Millar and other established experts it was common for various businesses, hence potential clients, to manage their own advertising. Many expressed their frustration with the ignorance and delusion of the advertisers who were often convinced that advertising brought more expenses than income, that they could save expenses by making their own advertisements and that they could not afford to hire expertise.¹⁵² Millar lamented that many advertisers thought it was better to manage their own advertising because they knew their business better than any external expert and that a number of businesses did not advertise at all.¹⁵³ He and other pioneers argued that the result brought by expertly planned advertising would significantly increase the yield. Thus, hiring expertise was more profitable than cheap advertising because it resulted in a significantly higher income. It was not the price of an advertisement that mattered but the result it gave.¹⁵⁴ Millar used the term “the helpless advertiser” and considered that advertisers were generally in an unhappy position: they were no experts in advertising and they did not possess the insight to leave their advertising to experts.¹⁵⁵ Foremost then, the established experts had to convince the advertisers that there existed an epistemic asymmetry and then gain their trust as clients. Further, because a client is vulnerable, he must be led to believe that the professional is adhering to a service ideal and is working in the service of the client and not only out of commercial motives.¹⁵⁶ Millar’s argumentation for the advertisers’ need to hire experts, underlines a service ideal as the experts worked for the benefit of the advertiser. It also reveals

¹⁵⁰ Wilensky, “The Professionalization of Everyone”, pp 140.

¹⁵¹ Grimen, “Profesjon og tillit”, p 200.

¹⁵² Eni, “Reklame-konsulenter”, p 6.

¹⁵³ “Hvordan Vi Kan Hjælpe Hverandre”, *Romilla Revue* (Juli 1915), p 6.

Romilla, “En Reklamemand med Bran(d)chekundskap”, p 2.

¹⁵⁴ Eni, “Reklame-konsulenter”, p 6.

¹⁵⁵ Miro, “Bør Ikke Reklamenæringen Beskyttes”, p 4.

¹⁵⁶ Wilensky, “The Professionalization of Everyone?”, pp 140.

ambitions of gaining control of an area of work for these experts by persuading the advertisers to stop making their own advertisements.

Millar had some clear ambitions and expectations of the specific tasks of the respective interests of the club. He was convinced that the various practitioners would gain a greater understanding of each other's work and challenges by coming together. In this way they would all get a "prouder feeling of belonging to the advertising class".¹⁵⁷ By uniting their forces, they would "raise the class" and "raise the public esteem of those who belong to it"¹⁵⁸. Regarding professionalization processes of single occupational groups, a usual trait is that professional associations endeavor to acquire status for its members on a collective group basis. Further, Millerson argued that professionalization is a process by which high status is attained.¹⁵⁹ In Millar's vision the advertising clubs would endeavor to raise the status of the different occupational groups that belonged to it and thus the status of the class as a whole.

As a measure to raise the status of the advertising class, the clubs worked to "cleanse advertising of its many strange outgrowths, presently representing it before the public", in Millar's words.¹⁶⁰ By "strange outgrowths" Millar referred to fraudulent practitioners and various forms of fraud in the trade. Finally he asserted, that with this club they had initiated a movement that would spread across Scandinavia. Trondheim being the only advertising club in the Nordic countries at the time, Millar was convinced it would soon be one in a chain of small societies binding together the advertising people of Norway, Sweden and Denmark.¹⁶¹ This initiated the club-movement. In available literature on Millar, authors often describe the initiative of the Trondheim club as the foundation of a Nordic advertising movement, leading to the establishment of Sveriges Reklameförbund (Advertising Association of Sweden) in 1919 and Dansk Reklameförbund (Advertising Association of Denmark) in 1924, and subsequently Nordic Advertising Congresses, the first of these organized in Copenhagen, 1931.¹⁶²

Millar's notion of the advertising class and its consolidation in clubs is interesting because it was not only constituted by advertising "professionals", but also by various businesses, which

¹⁵⁷ Romilla, "Reklamestandens Opgaver", p 4.

¹⁵⁸ Ibid.

¹⁵⁹ Millerson, *The Qualifying Associations*, pp 10.

¹⁶⁰ Romilla, "Reklamestandens Opgaver", p 4.

¹⁶¹ Ibid.

¹⁶² Lien, *Den Moderne reklamen i Norden startet i Trondheim*, p 6.

Dansk Reklame-Forening og Nordisk Reklamekongress, *Nordisk Reklamekongress i København 1931*.

were the potential clients of these professionals. On the other hand, the apparent willingness on the part of these clients and the newspapers to form such a club, might say something of their motivation for a more organized trade, for their own economic reasons. With this club, Millar had shown that such a collaboration between those involved in the advertising trade was indeed possible, arousing interest around the country, most importantly in the capital.

Expanding the club-movement to Kristiania

The advertising club of Trondheim was a forum where Millar could discuss his ideas and ambitions. However, Trygve Dalseg asserted that the people he appealed to were not very responsive. What Millar needed then, was a foothold in the capital. Kristiania was a significantly larger city where commerce was prominent. The business community in the city was dominated by wholesalers who were also the main advertisers. It was especially these wholesalers Millar wanted to convince with his ideas of expert advertising, as potential clients and powerful members of an advertising club. The capital was also home to a great number of newspapers, including all the major national papers.¹⁶³ Gaining the membership of these would be essential in the effort to rationalize the advertising trade.

As in Trondheim, a newspaperman took interest in Millar's idea. Using *Romilla Revue*, Millar provoked advertising people in the capital by inquiring as to whom "of the friends of advertising in the capital would raise the question of clubs...".¹⁶⁴ Ulrik Ludwigsen was business manager of the paper *Dagbladet* at the time. He answered Millar's call by sending *Romilla Revue* a few small notices containing information on the newspapers and advertisement agencies of Kristiania and their interest in establishing an advertising club. After this, Millar went to Kristiania to pay Ludwigsen a visit where he also met with other advertising personalities. In the March issue of *Romilla Revue* Millar informed that he found many of the advertising men of the capital interested in the idea. However he said, the more prominent of these advertising men claimed that they did not have the time to front such a club. Others were reluctant to take responsibility for summoning the first meeting. Ludwigsen said that he had been reading *Advertiser's Weekly*, and that he was aware of the many tasks of such a club. Still he did not want to be the promoter of establishing an advertising club in the city. He explained his predicament as

¹⁶³ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, p 39.

¹⁶⁴ "Klubmeddelelser", *Romilla Revue*, (Januar 1915), p 6.

follows: "...would not the public in all likelihood find it somewhat ambiguous, that I who lived of advertisements should invite businessmen to establish a club, which purpose it was to force even more advertisements from them."¹⁶⁵ The advertisement agencies probably had the same conclusion said Ludwigsen.¹⁶⁶ As Harry Høst later stated, the advertisers and newspapers had inherently conflicting interests as the former were interested in the lowest possible prize when buying advertising space in a newspaper, and the latter wanted the highest possible prize when selling advertising space.¹⁶⁷

Millar was frustrated by this distrustfulness and wondered if this sort of tension existed as strongly in other trades as in the world of advertising. He then referred to the article "Advertising and Christianity" and asserted that to "develop the sort of compassion preached by Serviss Kinnear (...) the future advertising club has a great mission. When people just get together, many misunderstandings fall away."¹⁶⁸ Millar, pragmatic as ever, then appealed to someone of a more neutral standing who did not make their livelihood from advertisements. Having previously worked in the tourist industry, Millar used his network and reached out to the secretary of Reisetforeningen (The Travel Association) also known as Landsforening for Reiselivet i Norge (The National Association of Norwegian Tourism), Arne Bratsberg. This might explain why the association initially came to be dominated by representatives of the tourist industry, although the tourist industry at the time generally seemed interested in reforming the advertising trade. Ludwigsen considered it a fortunate choice: Bratsberg was neutral, had experience in managing the advertising for his association, and he was set on the task of eliminating worthless enterprises of advertising with which he had first-hand experience from the tourist industry.¹⁶⁹

Bratsberg also had an aptitude for organizing. At Millar's behest he began on March 20th 1915 by sending out a circular to 67 persons with different interests in advertising, and it took him no more than a month to arrange a general meeting. On the 16th of April they held the meeting in the offices of Christiania Handelsstands Forening (Association of the Christiania Business Community). Of the 67 initial addressees, 22 were present at the meeting and another 16 were indisposed but sent a written endorsement. Of those in attendance, one third represented

¹⁶⁵ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, pp 24-26.

¹⁶⁶ *Ibid.*

¹⁶⁷ Høst, "Hvad Vi Arbejder For", p 6.

¹⁶⁸ Kimi, Editorial, p 2.

¹⁶⁹ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, p 27.

the tourist industry. The rest were about equally divided among representatives from advertisers, newspapers, printers, advertisement agencies and cliché shops.¹⁷⁰ Most of the attendants were probably new to the idea of advertising clubs, so Millar had prepared a speech on the tasks of such an association. In many ways similar to the speech he held for the Trondheim club, it was refined and elaborated.

Looking at this speech, we can argue that to Millar, the establishment of advertising clubs was a means not only to reform the advertising trade but actually to reinvent it. Millar expressed his views that the various actors involved in advertising were not conscious of belonging to a delimited trade. He had an idea of how the advertising trade should be developed and function. In order to realize this it was necessary to gather the different actors of the advertising trade in clubs, to make them cooperate and make them conscious that they were part of a trade but also a class. At the same time he was conscious of the versatility of the attendants and what different interests they would have in advertising. Millar emphasized this and argued that the different members had more common than individual interests. Having experienced the distrustfulness between various parts of the trade Millar underlined some ethical contemplations. Consolidation in clubs would prevent injustices between members of the trade with conflicting or competing interests, such as the advertisers, newspapers and advertisement agencies. It would also lead the members to respect and appreciate each-others work.¹⁷¹ The club was thus a basis for a more ethical conduct between the parts of the trade which interacted in various ways and a premise for consolidation. Problems of consolidating parts of the advertising trade with conflicting interests are perhaps inherent for the formation of advertising clubs and associations. For example, the AACA faced similar difficulties after it had been in operation for several years, where advertisers and advertising agencies left to found their own associations.¹⁷²

Millar also emphasized the negative standing of advertising in the public mind. Because of patent medicine producers and other fraudulent enterprises which had misused advertising to sell their false products, advertising had become connected with deception and humbug in the mind of the public. “We who work in the trade”, he continued, “...we know that he who advertises a good product or a useful invention, does society a great service, and that advertising advances the

¹⁷⁰ Ibid.

¹⁷¹ Millar, “Reklameklubber og Reklameopgaver”, bilag.

¹⁷² Fox, *The Mirror Makers*, pp 68-69.

civilization of our time with unprecedented velocity.”¹⁷³ The notion that advertising contributes to progress in society is typical of the time but perhaps more common in the U.S. It is likely that Millar was drawing on American discourse when making this statement. During the Progressive Era, advertising apologists in the U.S increasingly emphasized the function of advertising in the development of business and thus the material progress of the nation. By raising the level of material progress advertising in turn raised the level of civilization. For example, by subsidizing the press advertising made possible popular education. It enlightened the public of new commodities that was made for the public’s comfort and convenience (e.g. health foods, vacuum cleaners, sanitary arrangements, plumbing) and educated the public to use and to demand these products, thereby serving the public and promoting cultural progress.¹⁷⁴ Millar’s notion might also be interpreted by looking at Flexner who stated that under democratic conditions, organized groups of “professionals” are inclined to be “more responsive to public interest than are unorganized and isolated individuals.”¹⁷⁵ Therefore, under the pressure of public opinion, which the advertising field certainly was, professional groups view themselves as “organs contrived for the achievement of social ends (...)”.¹⁷⁶ Flexner regarded this rationale as a general trait of professional associations at the time, and predicted that the idea of the professional organization as an explicit instrument for the advancement of common social interest could become “a mark of professional character”.¹⁷⁷ For Millar it was not only important to convince the public that the advertising trade worked in the service of society, but also to inspire this rationalization among his peers. The notion that the various parts of the advertising trade contributed to progress in society by working together was perhaps an attempt to motivate better cooperation.

Finally said Millar, the club was of great significance “for the understanding of our own trade.”¹⁷⁸ In contrast to so many other professions, he complained, for advertising people there was no education in the trade of advertising in any school or educational institution. The advertising people then, were autodidact and until an education could be established it was the advertising club that provided “a deeper understanding of our trade’s “why and how””.¹⁷⁹ This

¹⁷³ Millar, “Reklameklubber og Reklameopgaver”, bilag.

¹⁷⁴ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, pp 354-356.

¹⁷⁵ Flexner, “Is Social Work a Profession?”, p 156.

¹⁷⁶ *Ibid.*

¹⁷⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁷⁸ Millar, “Reklameklubber og Reklameopgaver”, bilag.

¹⁷⁹ *Ibid.*

underlines my argument that the clubs, in Millar's concept, was an arena where a base of knowledge could be established, around which the different parts of the advertising trade could gather. To lead a forthcoming education, Millar envisaged a National Association. This was the first time Millar expressed his idea of a National Association that would become central to his plans for how the club-movement would evolve and organize. He was certain that when the advertising clubs had been active for a while, they would demand the establishment of a central association, a project that I develop at the end of this chapter.

With his speech, Millar had hoped to stimulate to a discussion on the topics he underlined. Compared to the speech he held in Trondheim before a group of friends, he was now addressing opinion-shaping forces in the field of advertising.¹⁸⁰ Even if he had moderated his ambitions somewhat for this meeting, Millar did not get the response he had hoped for. Not to say his initiative did not stimulate action. Millar proposed that a club should be constituted immediately along the lines of the Trondheim club with its seven statutes, and that it was best fitted to perform its tasks in the shape of a private discussion club. He later expressed that the following discussion had exceeded this frame. The members of the meeting wanted to start working on more comprehensive tasks, such as control with fraudulent advertising agents. This and all the other work that awaited the advertising class, required a bigger frame and a greater authority than any private club could possess, thought Millar.¹⁸¹ He imagined that a National Association would endeavor to work on such tasks, but that it was necessary to establish smaller clubs initially, on which to build up a larger organization.

Diverging club conceptions: The Advertising Association of Kristiania

Instead of a club, an association was constituted according to the proposal of Harry Høst. Høst's conception was that the private discussion clubs did not fit the larger circumstances of the city. A more effective association needed to be founded on the membership of the *managers* of the interested businesses and agencies.¹⁸² Exactly how Høst came to this conception of a club or association is an interesting question. He might have been inspired by the work of the AACA but unlike Millar thought that a more extensive association could be established immediately.

¹⁸⁰ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, p 33.

¹⁸¹ Editorial, *Romilla Revue*, (April 1915), p 2.

¹⁸² Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, p 35.

Another general meeting was arranged, this time without Millar, where 15 gentlemen consolidated to found Reklameforeningen (The Advertising Association). The name indicates that it was meant to be a central association from the start. In its ranks it counted many new members. At the same time many of the attendants from the initial meeting had disappeared. Only Bratsberg was now left to represent the tourist industry. The most significant representatives were from newspapers, advertisement agencies and various printing houses. Høst's statute proposals were discussed and passed. Important for this process was H. Scheibler, a book printer and advertising expert who published a textbook for advertising in the same year. He was very active in the discussion of the laws with proposals for alterations and additions.¹⁸³ The Association was officially established on the 28th of May 1915, with ten statutes adopted. Ambitions of a more effective and forceful association was now apparent: The membership statute stated that the association admitted members who were managers or directors of newspapers, advertisement agencies, book and lithographic printers, cliché shops and similar technical businesses and also consumers of advertising, meaning the advertisers.¹⁸⁴

Høst was elected chairman. Its other members were vice chairman Rasmus Høydahl Ohme, director of the advertisement agency carrying the same name; H. Jacobsen, director of the newspaper *Norske Intelligenssedler*; A. Vethe, head of the lithographic printer Norsk Litografisk Officin; R. Sandberg, director of A/S Lysannoncer, a company specializing in neon sign advertising; Alf Adler, director of the advertisement agency Heroldens Annoncebureau; Ludwigsen, the business manager of *Dagbladet*; H. Scheibler, A. Clewe, the office manager of the manufacturer Kiellands Fabrik and finally Bratsberg was reinstated as secretary.¹⁸⁵ Thus, the newspapers and advertisement agencies were especially important in the founding period of the association. These actors were also prominent in Høst's ideas to reform the advertising trade.

On the first membership meeting in September 1915, Høst clarified the tasks of the association. He specified that it was the main task of the association to make sure that the substantial amount of money being invested in advertising yielded real profit, in other words to make the advertising business more effective and rational. He described the advertising market as a "big and chaotic field" and the Advertising Association would do its best to "plow and fertilize

¹⁸³ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, pp 33.

¹⁸⁴ Romilla, "Reklamens Mænd i Samarbeide", p 6.

¹⁸⁵ Munthe-Kaas, *Reklameforeningen*, pp 115.

it with enlightenment.”¹⁸⁶ The chaotic circumstances, Høst contemplated, was a result of the rapid developments in the advertising field where the turnover had increased significantly in the last decades. To rationalize the trade, Høst had the similar conception as Millar that advertisers, newspapers and other publishers should consolidate in clubs. Høst believed the two groups could come to terms that were beneficial to both of them with the assistance of experts who functioned as advisers between the groups. Høst also proposed to introduce control with advertising ventures and agents as a measure to rationalize the advertising trade and develop ethical standards.¹⁸⁷ This task or function was similar to that of the forthcoming control office. The topic is therefore discussed in Chapter 4.

Høst also visualized a more extensive cooperation between the advertising clubs and the newspapers. He argued that the newspapers used too much of their space on art and literature, ousting news pertaining to practical life. The newspapers had an immense power, he continued, because what they wrote affected the cultural life of the population (“åndsliv”), and therefore they should be more practically oriented.¹⁸⁸ In other words the newspapers should use more of their space to advertise consumer products supplied by trade or industry as news, not only place their advertisements in the advertising section of the paper. If any newspaper objected that their readers were not interested in such things, Høst argued that it was the newspapers that set the tone and educated their readers of what their interests should be.¹⁸⁹ Again we find evidence that Norwegian advertising pioneers were affected by Progressive Era discourse where advertising, in this case newspaper advertising in particular, was regarded as a leader of cultural progress. According to Høst’s idea, newspaper advertising could even decide what culture was. It was not art and literature but things significant to practical life. The newspapers should write about practical products because it gave people an increased zest for life, which in turn raised profits enabling a more powerful advertising. Høst claimed that it was tremendously difficult for the newspapers to assess what should be regarded as news and what should be regarded as advertising. In order to select which products should be advertised as news, Høst asserted, the newspapers needed the assistance of an advertising association.¹⁹⁰ Høst’s statement is an early

¹⁸⁶ Høst, “Hvad Vi Arbejder For”, p 6.

¹⁸⁷ Ibid.

¹⁸⁸ Ibid. p 7.

¹⁸⁹ Ibid.

¹⁹⁰ Ibid.

sign that society was becoming consumer-oriented. His notion of the newspaper as a more effective advertising platform is somewhat similar to that of Millar's, where advertising was given a more central and editorial function.

The Advertising Association would also work for the development of advertising experts by putting some pressure on the newspapers. Høst claimed that only major advertisers had the opportunity to hire experts to manage their advertising. He believed that businesses without this opportunity should seek out an expert to handle their advertising to make their advertising effective, and that it would be natural for the advertisement agencies to offer expert assistance with for example arranging and editing the advertisements. This kind of full service agency was not usual in Norway at the time. The first full-time copywriter and draftsman were hired in 1917 by the "reklamebyrå" or advertising agency Fabritius Reklamebyrå.¹⁹¹ The difference between an advertisement agency, which worked mainly with expediting advertisements and an advertising or full service agency offering other specialized services was that the first received its remuneration from the newspapers, whereas the latter would receive remuneration from the advertiser for which it performed additional service.¹⁹²

Høst had established his own advertising agency in the spring of 1915 named A/S Universalreklame. The purpose of the agency was to offer expertise in all the different parts of the advertising trade, such as editing advertisements, posters, clichés etc. Even though a few agencies, such as his own, had begun to offer some specialized services, Høst thought the newspapers' lacking understanding of the need for a profitable advertising was to blame for the underdeveloped expertise in the agencies. He was probably implying that the newspapers should not allow the advertisers to shape and edit their own advertisements, as this often made them muddled and ineffective. Instead the advertisers should be directed to the expertise of the agencies, and the newspapers should reorganize their advertising system to accommodate a more lucid and organized advertising.¹⁹³ In any event, it is interesting to note Høst's focus on developing advertising experts inside the advertisement agencies compared to the conception of Millar, where advertising consultants established their own agencies, as we shall see in the next chapter.

¹⁹¹ Dalseg, *RRF-50 år, IFM-25 år*, p 21.

¹⁹² Romilla, *Lærebok i Reklame*, p 58.

¹⁹³ Høst, "Hvad Vi Arbejder For", pp 6-7.

The founding years of the Advertising Association and Millar's takeover

The first action of the association was neither an effort to counteract fraud nor directed at the newspapers. In cooperation with and influenced by the Trondheim club, the Kristiania association started to work for the development of advertising education. The association sought the cooperation of the “leading institution of mercantile education at the time” Kristiania Handelsgymnasium (Kristiania College of Trade). Even though the college was well disposed the initiative was never realized.¹⁹⁴

In the first founding years of the association, it seemed to be facing many difficulties. After its first assembly in September 1915, it was basically inactive for two years. Einar Munthe-Kaas who was an early member, explained this inactivity by making the association a victim of its circumstances.¹⁹⁵ Even though Munthe-Kaas regards the period as the birthplace of Norwegian advertising, it nearly signified the death of Reklameforeningen i Kristiania or the Advertising Association of Kristiania, as it was subsequently named. “In such times”, he asked, “who cares for associations and cooperation without the purpose of profit?”¹⁹⁶ There was simply no time to waste, went the argument, on the effort of regulating and clearing up a trade where the members barely knew each other. In fact, concluded Munthe-Kaas, why should they have when there was so much to gain from advertising all the hectic activity, unimpeded by regulation and without responsibility for the quality of the practice.¹⁹⁷ Even at a time when advertising was becoming crystalized as an important facility in the business system, the incentive for cooperation to establish some boundaries and order in the advertising trade was lost in the tide of the shipping stock market.

Høst, who remained as chairman of the association from 1915-1917, described his tenure as a “particularly ungrateful task”.¹⁹⁸ He found it arduous to assemble meetings because “the only product people did not need was advertising.”¹⁹⁹ Dalseg emphasized that the affluence and accessibility to high profits created by the boom period made business people apathetic of expenditures. Under these circumstances, it might seem obvious that the association struggled to gain adherents to their cause. There was little interest, claimed Dalseg, in working to counteract

¹⁹⁴ Munthe-Kaas, *Reklameforeningen*, p 115.

¹⁹⁵ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁶ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁸ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, p 70.

¹⁹⁹ *Ibid.*

fraudulent advertising agents at a time when the newspapers were bulging with dubious offers for subscription in stocks compared to which, advertising fraud was insignificant.²⁰⁰ Most newspapers probably did not care much for how their advertising sections were organized in such a time. Only two newspapermen were actively part of the foundation, and these represented two of the smallest papers. The larger newspapers deemed such associational work inessential. Some newspapermen in the capital described Millar as “despicable” the way he dared to lecture *them* on advertising and a newspaper director exclaimed that he was “too big to show any interest in simple things such as advertisements or advertising people.”²⁰¹

Although full of ambition, Høst and his colleagues struggled to make these ambitions come to life. A discussion was started on the possibility and necessity of establishing a control office for certification of advertising agents, but only after this idea had first been debated in the Trondheim club.²⁰² This topic was also the basis for discussion at the second membership meeting that was held in February 1916, a discussion that did not prove fruitful for the further development of the association.²⁰³ The amount of time between the two meetings, the first one arranged in September 1915, indicates Høst’s difficulties in assembling a meeting. After the second meeting the association suffered from inertia. It lay dormant until April 1917 when Millar and the Trondheim club sparked its resurrection. The Trondheim club kept working diligently under Millar’s regime. It had established a “National Committee for the establishment of a control office for advertising ventures.”²⁰⁴ Millar and Brodersen called a meeting on April 23rd 1917 to work out how this office should be funded. For assistance in this matter, Millar invoked the cooperation of the Kristiania association, and suggested that the board of the association could function as a fund-raising committee. At the meeting, three of the members from the association met: Bratsberg, Vethe and Jacobsen but Høst himself was absent. Millar’s plan was for the office to be directed by the National Association of the Business Community. It was agreed that these propositions would be presented on the next and long awaited general meeting of the Kristiania association that was to be arranged on May 15th.²⁰⁵

²⁰⁰ Ibid.

²⁰¹ Ibid. p 71.

²⁰² “Klubmeddelelser”, *Romilla Revue*, (Juni 1915), p 7.

²⁰³ “Klubmeddelelser”, *Romilla Revue*, (Februar 1916), p 7.

²⁰⁴ Munthe-Kaas, *Reklameforeningen*, p 120.

²⁰⁵ Ibid.

When the meeting was finally arranged the agenda said nothing of a discussion on a control office. The only proposal for the members present came from Høst, who in fact proposed that the association should dissolve. But as Høst never presented himself at the meeting, Bratsberg again took charge of things. The meeting passed a resolution stating that the association would continue and called for a new general meeting.²⁰⁶ Millar had moved to the capital during the summer of 1917 where he had established an agency and started working as an advertising consultant. He was now elected chairman of an association reborn. Together with Millar the board consisted of Ulrik Ludwigsen as secretary; Ludvig Pedersen, the director of the advertisement agency A/S Reklames Annoncebureau as cashier; as vice-chairman Christian Berg-Hansen of the travel bureau Berg-Hansens Reisebureau and as board member the advertising agent Fr. G Haldor.²⁰⁷ Millar's first undertaking was to gain more support for the association. Dalseg explained that by this time Millar had become famous and respected among the advertising people of the capital through *Romilla Revue*, and he was therefore apt to be a unifying nucleus.

As with the Trondheim club, Millar wanted the association to represent anyone with an interest in advertising or anyone working in the advertising trade. To the first membership meeting Millar managed to gather 50 persons with various occupational backgrounds. Looking at the first membership list of the association from 1917, it was now represented by several newspapers. Among these were the major papers such as *Verdens Gang*, which Ludwigsen was now director of, and *Morgenbladet*. Strongly represented were the tourist industry, wholesalers and printers. All the major advertisement agencies were also on the list.²⁰⁸ Of interest is another group of practitioners Millar invited to the association and appealed to for cooperation. The advertising agents were a numerous group, many perhaps spawned in the possibilities offered by the boom period. These agents worked for different publications or publishers, where their job was to travel around to advertisers and sell advertising space or solicit advertisements. Millar imagined that these agents could form a separate group within the association. The agents on their hand found little interest in this proposition and would subsequently establish their own association, although some individual agents became members.²⁰⁹ The reason for their reluctance to join is unclear but again a conflict of interest is a possibility.

²⁰⁶ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, p 71.

²⁰⁷ Ibid.

²⁰⁸ Munthe-Kaas, *Reklameforeningen*, p 122.

²⁰⁹ Ibid.

Even if Millar did not succeed in gaining the interest of every group of workers in the advertising trade to join the association, it soon became a highly active and influential force in the capital. Millar introduced a new method of discussion that was employed during membership meetings. He would pick certain members to start a discussion on one of the several tasks of the club-movement, such as the relations between the newspapers and advertisement agencies, the position of the advertising consultant, control with advertising agents among other topics. According to Munthe-Kaas, this method ensured a high degree of activity within the association, fruitful debates and the development of a better cooperation between the different parts of the advertising trade. Millar also transferred the system of establishing committees to work with the different tasks. The first committee that was established had the task of clarifying the position of the forthcoming advertising expert or consultant, in relation to the businesses or potential clients.²¹⁰ Shortly after Millar's takeover, the association began working on the momentous task of establishing an advertising school in Kristiania. This task would constitute the bulk of its activities in the next year, in addition to the renowned Statslånskampanjen or Government loan campaign of 1918.²¹¹ These topics are elaborated in the next chapter.

The Advertising Congress: Ambitions of a National Association

Boom period notwithstanding, the club in Trondheim remained highly active. Perhaps easier to keep active because of its smaller, private character or kept going by Millar's fervor, the club kept clearing the ground for reform. In January 1916 Millar informed that "From Trondheim it is reported from the one successful club meeting after the other. New members are registered, new questions put up for discussion, and new problems are pursued."²¹² Perhaps as a note directed at Høst, Millar emphasized how the Trondheim club had developed: It started out very carefully, "afraid to row too far out before one had some experience of the circumstances of the water."²¹³ Before such confidence was gained they worked modestly. The result, concluded Millar, proved that this approach was the right one. The club established a program and several working committees to implement the tasks at hand. As Johannes Knudsen expressed it in March 1916, the Trondheim club had gradually begun to undertake more extensive tasks as their knowledge of

²¹⁰ "Klubmeddelelser", *Romilla Revue*, (April 1918), p 2.

²¹¹ Munthe-Kaas, *Reklameforeningen*, pp 126.

²¹² "Klubmeddelelser", *Romilla Revue*, (Januar 1916), p 6.

²¹³ *Ibid.*

the advertising field had increased. Knudsen and Millar believed that in order to develop and gain support for the ideas of a control office, advertising education and a National Association, among the different members of the advertising class, it would be beneficial to arrange a congress where all these ideas and people were brought together.²¹⁴ They might have been inspired by advertising congresses and conventions that were organized regularly in the U.S. in this period.²¹⁵

Conventions have also been an important institution in the professionalization of other occupational groups such as librarians.²¹⁶ A committee was set up to prepare and organize this, led by the stockbroker Hans Bell. The congress was planned to take place on July 6th 1916, coinciding with the annual meetings of Boktrykkerforeningen (The Book-Printers Association) and Norsk Bladeierforening (The Magazine-owners Association), whom Millar hoped would partake in a joint meeting with the Trondheim club. The committee also invited Annoncebureauernes Landsforening (National Association of Advertisement Agencies) to have a meeting in Trondheim in the same period, to gain their cooperation. In addition any person in the country with an interest in advertising was invited.²¹⁷

The congress was implemented with considerable success. 50 people from many different parts of the country were present, including representatives from the Book-Printers Association and the Magazine-owners Association. Several associations and companies, i.e. the Tourist Association and Den Norske Amerikalinje sent endorsements. Lectures were held on the work of the different committees of the Trondheim club. Finally, Millar gave a speech where he explained that, fulfilling these measures constituted the work of “the New Advertising Movement”. The New Advertising Movement was, according to Millar, a term implemented by the newspapers to describe the work and endeavors of the advertising clubs to reform the advertising field. It was thus the continuation of the club-movement.²¹⁸ To lead this movement, Millar believed it was paramount to establish a Landsforening for Reklame or National Association of Advertising. He emphasized that a National Association would work with educating advertising consultants that could appropriate the planning of the businesses’ advertising, and further to move the business

²¹⁴ Knudsen, “Hvad Vi Vil”, p 2.

²¹⁵ Fox, *The Mirror Makers*, pp 68.

²¹⁶ Ansteinsson, “Norsk Bibliotekforening gjennom 25 år“, pp 5.

²¹⁷ “Reklamekongressen”, *Romilla Revue*, (Vaarnummer Mai/Juni 1916), p 7.

“Klubmeddelelser”, *Romilla Revue*, (Januar 1916), p 6.

²¹⁸ Millar, “Den Nye Reklamebevægelse”, (Oktobernummer 1916), p 4.

community to employ these experts.²¹⁹ The National Association would introduce advertising instruction in the trading schools to lecture the advertisers themselves in advertising, and work for a better education of anyone who wanted to work in the advertising trade. The subsections of the proposal reflect many of the challenges the advertising pioneers were facing. E.g., it stated that the National Association sought to influence any publication containing advertisements to institute more system and order in their advertising sections.

It would also work for reform by preventing *all* exaggerations and lies in advertisements and counteracting fraudulent actors by supporting the forthcoming control office.²²⁰ These ambitions were similar to those of the “Truth in Advertising” movement. Forces within this movement had established statutes of ethical codes to counteract fraudulent advertising and raise the standard of advertising practices. Schultze argues that ethical codes are the most characteristic expression of professionalism in the history of the American advertising business. Further, he states that by 1914 these ethical codes were only vehicles for “publicly promoting an ideology of professionalism based on the mythical ideal of public or consumer service.”²²¹ The Norwegian advertising pioneers at this point had not established any formalized ethical code, although as explained in Chapter 1, *Romilla Revue* contained articles that were meant to introduce a more ethical practice among advertisers and advertising practitioners. Even so, we have seen how Millar and Høst adhered to the conception that advertising worked in the service of society. The National Association Millar envisioned, would have the important function of promoting this conception and work for a better understanding of the nature, purpose and method of advertising among the public by the use of propaganda in newspapers, lectures and other media.²²²

Sociologist Bernard Barber stated that leaders of a professionalization process, because of their desire for prestige and support from the general public will engage in a “program of public information”.²²³ In such campaigns aspiring professionals emphasize the professional service they provide and their orientation towards community service. Aspiring professions advertising themselves to the public is thus usual in such a process. We can say that for Millar, propaganda work was a means to gain prestige or status for the advertising trade as whole. Such a campaign

²¹⁹ “Landsforeningen”, *Romilla Revue*, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 4.

²²⁰ Ibid.

²²¹ Schultze, “Professionalism in Advertising”, pp 64.

²²² “Landsforeningen”, *Romilla Revue*, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 4.

²²² Ibid.

²²³ Barber, “Some Problems in the Sociology of professions”, p 678.

would probably not only be directed at the broad public but also at the consumers of advertising and the newspapers in order to legitimate advertising as a more influential and important power in society which these groups depended on.

Finally, the National Association would also work for the establishment of additional local advertising clubs and associations. Millar had prepared thirteen laws or statutes according to which this association would operate. The proposed membership statute stated that the association would admit as members any association, institution, business or person with an interest in advertising.²²⁴ This association would thus have a broad and open membership access.

Although the congress in itself was a success, managing to gather a considerable group of participants and discussing important tasks, the particular task of establishing a National Association was perhaps too ambitious at the time. The congress did endorse Millar's proposal for the establishment of this association, and further requested the advertising clubs in Trondheim (a female club had also been established) to designate a national committee to subscribe members and summon a general meeting.²²⁵ It is difficult to find any evidence of what was practically achieved towards establishing this association after the congress. Through *Romilla Revue* Millar kept arguing for the pressing need to designate a committee for this purpose, but this never materialized. It seems that any interest in the matter rapidly diminished after the congress. Why the National Association did not materialize at this point might be explained by looking at the difficulties of the Kristiania association. Although the Trondheim club received some assistance from the Magazine-owners Association, the Book-Printers Association and the Travel Association, it seemed far-fetched that Trondheim, as the only fully operational advertising club, should establish a national association on its own. Even as late as 1922, when the Kristiania association had been operational for some time, the Trondheim club sent them an appeal to resuscitate the question. To this the Kristiania association answered that as long as only two advertising associations existed in the country, a national association would be nothing more than "a hollow frame."²²⁶ (At this point Millar was no longer chairman of the Kristiania association) Another reason might have been the failure to arrange consecutive congresses and thus keep the discussions alive and ensure a broader, more forceful cooperation between the different actors of the advertising trade. The Trondheim club appealed to the Kristiania association several times to

²²⁴ "Landsforeningen", *Romilla Revue*, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 4.

²²⁵ Romilla, "Reklame-Kongressen", p 2.

²²⁶ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, p 149.

arrange a second congress in the capital, to no avail.²²⁷ A second congress was not arranged until 1928, actually after the National Association was established.²²⁸ Thus, it was not until 1927, after the Kristiania association had become a powerful organization and another advertising club had been established in Bergen, that the Norwegian Association of Advertising was established.²²⁹

Conclusion

The first two advertising clubs in Norway represented two different concepts of how such clubs should be organized. Even so, the fundamental goals and tasks of the clubs were similar and they sought to cooperate to fulfill these goals and expand the club-movement. Both concepts were clearly influenced by the work of professional reformers and advertising clubs in the U.S and Great Britain. Although the Norwegian advertising trade received much influence from abroad, the circumstances of the Norwegian advertising trade was considerably different from the American and British. The Norwegian pioneers thus displayed many similar ideas as their colleagues abroad, but had their own intentions for establishing advertising clubs. Foreign influence provided a basis of ideas, which the Norwegian reformers built on and developed their own concepts of advertising clubs to fit the circumstances as they saw it.

It seems that Millar was simply more patient than Høst and saw the need to establish local clubs first, and then slowly but surely establish a more extensive and forceful National Association. Høst wanted to establish a more forceful association immediately, without a base of local clubs that could prepare the ground. This might also explain why the Kristiania association had a troublesome founding period as Høst and his colleagues in the capital overreached their abilities. The circumstances of the boom period also affected its development and might explain why Millar's idea of advertising clubs was more viable. It was less demanding to gather a small amount of members for discussing topics they were interested in, than gathering various managers who were probably busy with other duties, to immediately start working with other major tasks. Especially at a time when, as Millar claimed, the different actors of the advertising trade had little understanding for each-others work. Many of these were probably also more occupied with benefitting from the boom period. It seems that to many within the advertising

²²⁷ Millar, "En Reklameklubs Opgaver", p 4.

²²⁸ Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, p 102.

²²⁹ Ibid.

community, establishing advertising clubs was a novel concept and as such was met with some degree of skepticism. Conflicting interests between parts of the potential members also complicated matters.

Even though Høst and Millar differed on the issue of how the membership of a club should be constituted, the essence of the membership was still the same. Both Høst and Millar wanted the clubs to represent the different and most important actors of the advertising trade. Millar employed the term “reklamestanden” and endeavored to invoke what he called a class attachment between these different actors. By giving the various actors the feeling of belonging to a class Millar hoped to ensure a better cooperation and understanding between them, in turn making the advertising trade an effective and rational system that was more profitable to all parts of the business. Consolidation in the clubs would also have the function of creating trust between the various actors of the trade. It laid the basis for a more ethical conduct between those who were usually in competition or had conflicting interests, as they were members of the same club and became conscious of common interests. Millar also wanted the clubs to be an arena for exchange of knowledge, where the various occupational groups could learn from each other’s experience but also from new advertising doctrines. Until an education could be established the clubs would function as a base from which the various practitioners could gain knowledge and raise the standard of their practice and expertise. Millar saw these functions as a premise to reinvent the trade to become a lucid, delimited and more professional area.

Further, by consolidating the advertisers and newspapers in the clubs, it was possible for the advertising experts to convince these two groups of the need for expertise. Convivial discussion was a means to create trust between the advertisers and these experts, by underlining the epistemic asymmetry between them. The newspapers also had to be convinced to restrict the freedom of the advertisers to shape and edit their own advertisements, forcing them instead to hire experts, either independent advertising consultants or in an advertisement agency. At the same time they had to be persuaded to reform their system to accommodate a more effective advertising. The trading school directors were another important group in the advertising clubs. Millar wanted to persuade these to lecture advertisers in advertising, but potentially also educate advertising experts, as I elaborate in the next chapter. Although Høst had a different conception on how advertising experts should be developed, both advertising clubs had a dual mission of both consolidating and reforming the advertising trade, thereby preparing the ground for

advertising experts or consultants. This underlines my argument that the reform work of the Norwegian pioneers can be seen as a dual professionalization process.

As a collective force the clubs worked to clean up the advertising trade and impede fraudulent advertising practices and practitioners, which might be seen as an effort to give the advertising trade a more serious appearance and legitimate its place in society, but also contribute to rationalize it. Both Millar and Høst argued that advertising contributed to the progress of society and was an important part of the business system. The influence of the “Truth in Advertising” movement is obvious. By counteracting dubious advertising the National Association would gain trust in the trade as a whole. Propaganda for advertising was in Millar’s conception to be the main function of this association. His idea was to enlighten the advertising public and newspapers of their need for advertising. At the same time he wanted to convince the public that the advertising trade worked in the service of society. Millar’s notions can be interpreted as two different service ideals. One involved a service to society and another a service to the clients, where advertisers had to be convinced that advertising experts or consultants adhered to a service ideal and worked in their interest. This could also substantiate my argument of a dual professionalization, where the trade as whole was legitimized before the society and the position of an advertising expert before potential clients. Propaganda efforts were also meant to raise the status of the advertising class. Raising the status of the class as a whole was perhaps a premise for an advertising consultant to gain professional status.

Because the spread of local clubs proved slow, Millar changed his notion that a National Association should be established on the basis of several local clubs and hoped that such an association could be established, which could then work for the development of local clubs. Although the National Association would not be established for quite some time, the Trondheim club did manage to arrange an advertising congress that must be seen as an important milestone in the professionalization process. With this congress Millar and his colleagues certainly contributed to create a new consciousness toward the advertising trade on a national basis, but also confirmed the interest of various, powerful actors to reform the trade.

The system of committees, first set up by the Trondheim club proved especially valuable in the reform effort. This system could also have been a reason why the Trondheim club was more active than the Kristiania association in the initial years. By establishing committees it was

possible to divide and organize the various tasks of the club, and ensure a more concentrated effort in these areas.

The first two advertising clubs formed the basis of operation for the reform effort where the committees became important instruments. With Millar as their leader, these clubs began to undertake tasks that must be seen as an effort of structural professionalization, namely establishing advertising education and a control office for licensing advertising agents. It is to these tasks or phases we must now turn.

Chapter 3

Knowledge, Education and Science

When Millar first started his work to establish an advertising education the idea was completely original to most people involved with advertising in Norway. At least no one could conceive of such an education in Norway until the coming of Millar. In this chapter I will explain how Millar and his colleagues in the advertising movement endeavored to accumulate and systematize knowledge and establish educational facilities. I argue that for Millar, the establishment of an education would serve several functions in professionalizing the advertising trade.

When analyzing the educational ideas of Millar and his colleagues, it is important to discern between three different concepts. First of all, Millar wanted to educate a group of advertising experts, along the lines of the versatile expert referred to in the previous chapter, for which he adopted the name “advertising consultant”. The idea was that these experts would establish themselves as professional consultants and eventually take over all the planning of advertising for the advertisers.²³⁰ Secondly, Millar wanted a better education in advertising of the advertisers themselves and argued that the trading schools, being the advertisers’ own educational institutions should implement an education.²³¹ Finally, Millar and his colleagues in the Trondheim club discussed the need to work for the best possible education of draftsmen and writers (which must be seen as a prototype of the copywriter) and other specialists to assist both the advertisers and future advertising consultants.²³² Millar was not very elaborate on how he envisaged this education, and focus was on educating the advertisers and advertising consultants. I will therefore concentrate on the first two concepts.

First I will establish how Millar and other advertising pioneers envisaged the education of the advertisers and advertising consultants and why this was important. Then I will look at the means utilized to realize these concepts, namely *Romilla Revue* and Millar’s advertising textbook, the trading schools and eventually the first advertising school, Reklameskolen i Kristiania or the Advertising School of Kristiania. This will clarify what was achieved towards realizing the educational concepts I have concentrated on. Finally, I will explain how Millar

²³⁰ “Landsforeningen”, *Romilla Revue*, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 4.

²³¹ Kimi, Editorial, p 2.

²³² Romilla, “Vor Programtale”, p 2.

endeavored to establish advertising research and the concepts he had of advertising “science”, that would serve as a base of knowledge on which to construct education. It is important to note that Millar’s concepts are sometimes ambiguous and therefore pose an interpretive challenge. E.g., Millar is unclear on exactly how the advertising consultants would be educated and how their education would be structured, and if they were to be educated in the trading schools or in a separate institution. If they were to be educated in the trading schools, this would imply that both future advertisers and advertising experts, in other words both potential client and professional would be educated in the same institution, which seems peculiar. Another reason for perplexity is the sometimes interchangeable use of the terms “advertising specialist”, “advertising expert” and “advertising consultant”, where seemingly “advertising specialist” and “advertising expert” can imply the same, but “advertising specialist” can and usually does refer to specialists from the third concept such as copywriters and draftsmen. I have perceived “advertising expert” and “advertising consultant” as the same idea, where the expert must be seen as the prototype of the consultant, as “consultant” enters Millar’s discourse later on, but the two terms nonetheless display similar characteristics. The apparent ambiguousness of Millar is probably due to changing conceptions as work with education progressed.

Concepts of education

Before analyzing the educational concepts it is necessary to have an understanding of trust between professionals and their clients. In the previous chapter I talked briefly about trust between clients and professionals and how these relations are characterized by an epistemic asymmetry, where the professionals possess knowledge that their client lack but require, and that a client’s trust in a professional implies a trust in the expertise of the professional.²³³ As Millar himself stated, “the employment of a consultant is a question of trust.”²³⁴ If they (meaning the club-movement) were to educate advertising people, continued Millar, they needed to ensure that the consultants received the respect entitled to them by their education and experience in advertising. Now, it seems quite paradoxical that Millar wanted the businessmen or advertisers who were potential clients, to gain a greater knowledge of advertising at the same time as he wanted to educate advertising experts whom these clients should hire as expertise, as this would

²³³ Grimen, “Profesjon og tillit”, p 200.

²³⁴ Millar, ”Reformer på Reklamens område”, p 1.

apparently level out the epistemic asymmetry. According to Harald Grimen epistemic asymmetry has several consequences: first of all the professional or expert, who is the one with knowledge, achieves control over what has been called “the definition of the situation”.²³⁵ The client, lacking the same knowledge as the expert, does not have the cognitive resources to challenge this definition. Thus, the one with knowledge can describe the situation and decide what measures are to be taken. Because the client does not possess the same cognitive resources as the expert, he cannot challenge the perceptions of the expert. E.g., a patient must seek a different doctor to challenge the diagnosis of his first doctor. Further, epistemic asymmetry exists not only by theoretical knowledge but also by practical knowledge. E.g., a patient does not know what to do or *how* to do it. Asymmetry by practical knowledge is more difficult to change than by theoretical knowledge, because it is not possible to become practically equivalent by reading theory. Practical and theoretical knowledge are acquired in different ways. Further, a client who expands his theoretical knowledge does not automatically gain practical knowledge.²³⁶ The different forms of education Millar envisaged must be seen as an effort to crystalize this epistemic asymmetry and thus create trust in the future advertising professionals.

Lecturing the advertisers

In the previous chapter I explained how Norwegian advertising pioneers complained that the advertisers were unskilled in advertising and did not comprehend its economic importance. Millar claimed that Norwegian businesses generally employed outdated selling methods. The businesses, he continued, did not understand that the world had invented a new method that was superior to all others, namely modern advertising. Therefore, even when they attempted to advertise they had no understanding of “what a sensitive instrument this new method is or the skill required to use it”.²³⁷ Millar seemed discouraged by what he deemed the incompetency of the advertisers and thought the stupidity that most advertisers could commit without guidance was incredible. He therefore demanded that they were properly lectured in advertising theory.²³⁸

By enlightening the advertisers in both advertising theory and new practical approaches they could be led to realize the importance and utility of advertising for their businesses. When

²³⁵ Grimen, “Profesjon og tillit”, p 200-201.

²³⁶ Ibid.

²³⁷ R.-R.s Redaktion, “R.-R.s Sakkyndige Reklameraad”, p 5.

²³⁸ Millar, “Den Nye Reklamebevægelse”, (Oktobernummer 1916), p 4.

Millar published his first textbook based on articles from *Romilla Revue*, he wrote that it was meant as a practical guide for advertisers.²³⁹ If advertisers employed the methods in these articles it could prove to them that modern advertising actually worked and convince them to take advertising seriously. Further, by educating the advertisers on correct practice, Millar believed that advertising profits would increase significantly.²⁴⁰ This would prove its worth. Thus it was a means to work for a better understanding of advertising in the business community and perhaps establish trust in this, for most advertisers, novel form of knowledge. Millar also thought that lecturing the advertisers on new advertising theory would contribute to raise the standard of advertising practice and thus the standing of advertising in society. Before a sufficient number of advertising experts could be educated for the advertisers to hire, many would continue to arrange their own advertising. Thus, it was important to ensure that their advertising was conducted in a best possible way by providing them with theoretical insight.

Foremost however, Millar's effort of lecturing the advertisers on theory was a means to persuade them that modern advertising was a grand trade based on abstract knowledge. We can say that the advertisers had to be educated into realizing the epistemic asymmetry that existed between them and the experts. In order to convince the advertisers that there did exist a new selling method, they had to be provided with some knowledge about it. In educating the advertisers in modern advertising, Millar endeavored to transform them into clients and create a need of which they were not previously aware, thereby attempting to create a market for advertising expertise. Enlightening the advertisers could make them realize that they did not possess enough cognitive resources to define their advertising situation. For example, they might have realized that they needed an advertising expert to tell them if they advertised enough, if they advertised in the right type of media and if their advertising was reaching out to their potential customers. Or, how they could perform a successful advertising campaign. Lecturing was in this sense another form of "advertising for advertising", where pioneers advertised not only for the use of novel advertising doctrines but also for the use of experts. If the future businessmen were not properly lectured in advertising theory they would have no conception of how important advertising was for the success of their businesses. Millar gave the example of a wholesaler Hansen who had never advertised his whole life, until he was inspired by a lecture on advertising.

²³⁹ "Reklamelære", *Romilla Revue*, (Høstnummer 1916), p 3.

²⁴⁰ R.-R.s Redaktion, "R.-R.s Sakkyndige Reklameraad", p 5.

After having tried it once, claimed Millar, the wholesaler declared that not a sales method in the world could outdo rational advertising.²⁴¹

Apparent here is also Millar's realization of the potential economic rewards for an advertising professional. Even though Norwegian businessmen apparently had little knowledge of advertising, the total sum of advertising expenditures was substantial. Millar estimated that advertisers spent around 30 million kroner annually on different forms of advertising.²⁴² At the same time as he urged business professionals to implement advertising education in the trading schools, Millar urged them to hire "professional advertising men – with special insight and experience in the advertising trade – to lead this branch of Your business activity in an expert and rational way."²⁴³

At this point we can ascertain that establishing an epistemic asymmetry was a two pronged effort. As discussed in the previous chapter, the advertisers had to be convinced to trust in the expertise of and thus hire advertising experts, through an effort of persuasion. Secondly, the advertisers had to be lectured in advertising theory to realize that they lacked significant knowledge in this field, and that they needed it. The corresponding educational task in the effort of professionalizing the advertising trade was educating the advertising experts to supply this expertise.

Educating the advertising experts

Millar's 1913 speech before the Mercantile Club of Trondheim symbolizes the entry of professional ambition to the Norwegian advertising trade. In this speech, Millar disclosed ambitions of creating advertising experts and implement systematically planned advertising campaigns.²⁴⁴ With the establishment of *Romilla Revue*, Millar would continuously argue for the need to educate advertising experts, and emphasize the relationship of trust between expert and client which resulted from epistemic asymmetry.²⁴⁵

In a Lutheran fashion, Millar wrote that he had developed a handful of theses' that he would "nail to the church gate", to clarify his statements. I.e. the theses' stated that advertising

²⁴¹ Millar, "Reklameklubber og Reklameopgaver", bilag.

²⁴² Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, p 59.

²⁴³ Kimi, Editorial, p 2.

²⁴⁴ Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, p 35.

²⁴⁵ Romilla, "Hvad Aaret Har Bragt", p 2.

"Landsforeningen", *Romilla Revue*, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 4.

was a trade which required years of study and practice. The first premise of the advertising expert was that he knew “the art of advertising”. It required both an innate ability or vocation and education.²⁴⁶ Further, business leaders with other duties could not lead their own advertising, because they did not have the required amount of time or skill to do so. Therefore, wrote Millar, fully educated advertising experts were needed, “to whom the businessman entrusts his advertising and whom he trusts as he would his doctor or lawyer or architect.”²⁴⁷ A sufficient number of advertising experts, Millar argued, should be supported to establish themselves as advertising consultants, so that even the smallest businesses would have the possibility of hiring expertise. Conclusively, Millar pointed out that these experts would prepare a better advertising than any business manager himself could do, not because they had better knowledge of the business, but because they had better knowledge of advertising. Millar pronounced that there would never be a proper form of advertising until there existed people who were completely dedicated to the trade.²⁴⁸ How would these consultants operate?

From the fall of 1915, Millar developed his concept of these experts. In the program of *Romilla Revue*, he explained that the journal worked to provide a best possible education for copywriters, draftsmen and advertising experts or consultants. Millar also elaborated on how this consultant would operate once educated: from their own agency or bureau they managed the advertising of several non-competing companies. Millar and his colleague Knudsen underlined that the work of this expert was juxtaposed with the work of the advertisement agencies and his task was first of all to help the advertiser to gain clarity in his field. This was probably to emphasize that the consultant and his agency was not in competition with the advertisement agencies, but similar to advertising agencies worked for and received their remuneration from the advertisers. The consultant constructed advertising plans, provided text and drawing, prepared advertisements and decided where they should be published. As assistants the consultant required skilled copywriters and draftsmen.²⁴⁹ Thus it was important to work for a better education of these specialists as well. The idea of the consultant as self-employed is important as autonomy is fundamental for the activities of a profession. This implies for example the right to practice

²⁴⁶ Romilla, “En Reklamemand med Bran(d)chekundskap”, p 2.

²⁴⁷ Millar, “Den Nye Reklamebevægelse”, (Oktobernummer 1916), p 5.

²⁴⁸ Ibid.

²⁴⁹ Romilla, ”Vor Programtale”, p 2.

professionally qualified discretion in complex situations and resist attempts from others to define the content of the work or the guidelines by which the work is controlled.²⁵⁰

The predominantly theoretical lecturing of the advertisers I have argued, was foremost a means to increase their interest in advertising. If, as Millar envisaged, the consultant would receive years of study and practice, this would certainly create an epistemic asymmetry between them and their clients, by providing the consultant with practical knowledge as well. Other advertising specialists such as copywriters and especially draftsmen certainly possessed a form of practical knowledge that was not obtainable through theory. With these specialists as assistants, the consultant would have considerable expertise at his disposal.

Means of education

Romilla Revue and the first advertising textbook

Romilla Revue was the initial effort at establishing an educational journal not only for advertising practitioners but also for the advertisers.²⁵¹ Millar would regularly publish articles on advertising theory, articles that would subsequently constitute his first advertising textbook.²⁵² He also invited persons whom he referred to as “advertising specialists” to share their knowledge in the journal. This group consisted of advertising specialists and businessmen from various businesses with years of experience in advertising. For example, the wholesaler B. J. Brodersen shared his advertising knowledge from extensive experience with advertising the coffee-brand “Kronekaffe”, and Director K.O Karlsen explained how he conducted advertising campaigns for the chocolate producer “Nidar”.²⁵³ Both brands still exist today. These specialists all had their own conception of how advertising was conducted, but a common trait was the importance of employing systematically planned advertising or advertising campaigns.²⁵⁴ Millar claimed that *Romilla Revue* had been criticized for only embodying the theoretical aspect of advertising. He thus invited these experts or specialists to share their practical experiences, for example how they conducted their advertising and on which principles. Because of the broad distribution of *Romilla*

²⁵⁰ Hughes, *The Sociological Eye: Selected Papers*, pp 375.

²⁵¹ Editorial, *Romilla Revue* (Juli 1915), p 1.

²⁵² Romilla, “Reklame-Lære”, p 2.

²⁵³ Karlsen, “Et aars reklame for “Nidar””, p 5.

Brodersen, “Min Reklame for “Kronekaffe””, p 6.

²⁵⁴ “Nærværende Nummer”, *Romilla Revue*, (Oktober 1914), p 6.

Revue, Millar thought that shared advertising wisdom would reach and interest many Norwegian advertisers.²⁵⁵

As noted in Chapter 1, Millar published his textbook *Lærebok i Reklame* in the Fall of 1916. Svein Linge Solberg describes the book as a collected representation of the principles of modern advertising. Further, Solberg writes that after Millar had practiced his advertising knowledge through *The Tourist News*, Nordenfjeldske Dampskibsselskap and the campaign for Andreas Moe, he wrote down his experiences in this book.²⁵⁶ We can add that the book was based on American and British advertising theory, tried in and adapted to Norwegian circumstances. In the preliminary chapter the book defines advertising and its important function and place in society. Chapters include theory on the different forms of advertising such as “Personal advertising”, “Newspaper advertising”, “An advertising campaign”, “Drafts” and many other forms.²⁵⁷

Although Millar characterized his textbook as a “practical guide” for the advertisers, its practical value is questionable. It says more about the different forms of advertising and even though Millar elaborated briefly on how to conduct the different forms, I do not believe they left the advertisers with a very clear idea on how to proceed. The book contained many different forms of advertising without anyway for the advertisers to know which form of advertising would suit their business better, let alone how to combine different forms of advertising into an extensive advertising campaign. The book did contain a chapter on Millar’s first advertising campaign which I elaborated on in Chapter 1. Although this provided some insight, it only explained how a campaign could be implemented for a particular type of business. This points to a division between theoretical and practical knowledge where the advertisers could become aware of what needed to be done regarding their advertising, but to a lesser extent know how to organize it. They could be conscious of the need for a cliché or printed image for an advertisement, but did not know where to get it. Was it better to hire a freelance draftsman or find a print shop for the image? And how to combine this image with text or copy? Millar’s notion was that although advertisers could develop a high degree of theoretical knowledge they would never gain the practical knowledge of a fully educated advertising expert. He also argued that advertisers were generally too busy to handle their own advertising, which makes sense

²⁵⁵ “Reklame i Praksis”, *Romilla Revue*, (November 1915), p 7.

²⁵⁶ Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, pp 73.

²⁵⁷ Romilla, *Lærebok i Reklame*, pp 9.

considering the many forms of advertising and the amount of work required to execute each of them. Let alone the planning and execution of an advertising campaign that required a multitude of different experts. If advertising lectures were introduced in the trading schools this would certainly give future advertisers theoretical insight and perhaps also practical insight to some degree. However, Millar implied that their main occupation were as business professionals and the time they could sacrifice on learning advertising would be limited. The book also contains a chapter on advertising consultants, where Millar argues that nothing is more reasonable for the businessman than to leave his advertising to such a consultant.²⁵⁸ The book thus gave the advertisers theoretical insight *and* persuaded them to hire expertise. It could also be seen as an effort to interest its readers to become such a consultant. This might imply that Millar envisaged advertising consultants being educated in the trading schools at some point in the future, as this book was meant to constitute the curriculum for use in advertising lectures at the trading schools.

Education in the trading schools

Millar and the Trondheim club worked to persuade the trading schools of the country to implement advertising instruction for lecturing the future businessmen or advertisers. They also demanded a textbook to be developed for use in the lectures.²⁵⁹ Because the trading schools educated the future advertisers, Millar thought it was logical that they should lecture these advertisers in advertising as well. Millar pointed to the significant amount of money being spent each year on advertising and the skill and knowledge required to turn this amount into profitable advertising. Addressing the business professionals, Millar argued that since *they* were the ones who used all this money for advertising, one would expect that in their “educational facilities the opportunity was given for the future businessmen to receive education in what advertising is, what it wants and what it can and cannot do”.²⁶⁰

Simultaneously as the first two advertising clubs were established Millar gave speeches in these clubs where he endeavored to gain adherents for the cause of establishing advertising instruction. Millar and the Trondheim club addressed various trading schools in the effort to persuade them to implement advertising lectures in their curriculum, but the Kristiania

²⁵⁸ Romilla, *Lærebok i Reklame*, pp 9.

²⁵⁹ Millar, “Den Nye Reklamebevægelse”, (Oktobernummer 1916), p 4.

²⁶⁰ Kimi, Editorial, p 2.

association was not as forthcoming. A definitive advantage for the Trondheim club compared to their colleagues in the capital was the fact that they already counted directors of several trading schools amongst their members.²⁶¹ In May 1915 it was decided that Mykland Handelsskole and Trondheim Handelsskole (Trading School of Trondheim) would include advertising lectures in their curriculum starting the next school year.²⁶² However, already in July 1915 Millar was able to try his ideas at Mykland Handelsskole where he held three lectures in advertising. As teaching material Millar used articles from his series “Reklamelære” (“Teachings in Advertising”), which he had published regularly in *Romilla Revue*, and would eventually constitute Millar’s textbook.²⁶³

Also Bergen Handelsgymnasium (Bergen Trading College) and as we saw in the last chapter Kristiania Handelsgymnasium, were well disposed towards an advertising education, but the interest they displayed did not immediately result in the implementation of advertising lectures. In Bergen it might have been due to the lack of an advertising club who could organize this, and in Kristiania it was due to lack of organizational skills in the Advertising Association. In any event, the educational goals of the Kristiania association were very modest. They planned to arrange two lectures a year held by the advertising experts Alf Adler and Harry Høst.²⁶⁴ The educational ambitions of the advertising pioneers of Kristiania were clearly not on a level with Millar’s. Among the committees established by the Trondheim club, one committee worked exclusively with the establishment of advertising instruction.²⁶⁵ The task of the committee was to obtain information on teaching hours and curriculum from the trading schools of the country, in order to find space for advertising instruction in the timetable. Further, the question of suitable teachers and the approach to be taken for the introduction of an advertising instruction would be resolved.²⁶⁶ The process of introducing advertising lectures in the trading schools around the country was seemingly a slow and difficult process. The only trading schools that successfully implemented advertising instruction were Mykland Handelsskole and Trondheim Handelsskole.

²⁶¹ “Klubmeddelelser”, *Romilla Revue*, (Mai 1915), p 7.

²⁶² “Vi Har Hørt”, *Romilla Revue*, (Mai 1915), p 7.

²⁶³ “Reklameundervisning”, *Romilla Revue*, (Juli 1915), p 7.

²⁶⁴ “Vi Har Hørt”, *Romilla Revue*, (August 1915), p 3.

²⁶⁵ “Klubmeddelelser”, *Romilla Revue*, (Mars 1916), p 6.

²⁶⁶ *Ibid.*

These schools employed Millar's textbook as curriculum for their lectures.²⁶⁷ Unfortunately it has proved difficult to find information on the frequency of these lectures.

If advertising instruction could be introduced in the trading schools nation-wide, this would lead to increased knowledge of advertising in the business community. The recognition the advertising trade could gain through becoming an institutionalized area of study, would certainly contribute to a reform of the advertising field where higher standards of advertising practice would become a requirement. In this way advertising could also be established and recognized as an important area of the business system where expertise was needed. This point can be substantiated by referring to a letter written by the Danish advertising pioneer Christian Drastrup to *Romilla Revue*. Drastrup was advertising manager of the department store Magasin du Nord in Copenhagen. He underlined that advertising lectures should be introduced in the trading schools, because it would create an interest in advertising and the significance of advertising.²⁶⁸

In the early stages of discussing the education of advertising experts Millar and some of his peers envisaged these experts being educated in the trading schools. Millar claimed that on the continent a university had given a PhD for a dissertation on advertising and that in England candidates were going directly from the university to the advertising offices. Unfortunately, he did not care to elaborate on exactly where this PhD had been granted.²⁶⁹ He wondered why the Norwegian trading schools should not be able to implement a similar education. Other, powerful advertising pioneers around the country consented to Millar's ideas, such as C. G. Schioldborg, advertising manager of the manufacturer Chr. Bjelland Co. He believed the time was ripe for the education of advertising specialists and that advertising lectures should be introduced in the trading schools. In Norway, stated Schioldborg, the advertising trade was still in its infancy. Even so he was convinced that advertising would soon constitute an interesting and lucrative sphere for a large group of trained or skilled individuals.²⁷⁰

Convincing the trading schools to implement such an education would have some obvious advantages. The trading schools were already established educational institutions. As such they would be able to supply courses, teaching staff and perhaps also teaching material, not to mention actual classrooms. Any new subjects in advertising would be connected to the standard

²⁶⁷ "Reklameundervisning", *Romilla Revue*, (Høstnummer 1916), p 5.

²⁶⁸ Drastrup, "Kontrolkontorsaken set fra dansk standpunkt", p 3.

²⁶⁹ Romilla, "En Reklamedebat", p 7.

²⁷⁰ Schioldborg, "Vore Opgaver", p 4.

curriculum in the trading schools that could contribute to raise the standards and status of advertising practitioners. This would lift a heavy burden off Millar and the advertising clubs, as establishing an educational institution from the ground up would require a considerable amount of work and resources. Attempting to develop formalized educational programs in trade or business schools might be typical considering the professionalization effort of advertising reformers also in other countries. Laird states that this was commonplace in the U.S, where advertising reformers recognized that specialized skills in law and medicine required qualifying formal education. Accordingly, they sought to develop the advertising field with these professions as a model.²⁷¹

Exactly how Millar envisaged the education of the consultant is unclear. As Millar developed his ideas for the National Association, his ideas for how the advertising consultant would be educated changed. Initially he imagined that this association would be the center of and coordinate the education of these experts in the trading schools.²⁷² But as work was started to have the trading schools implement advertising lectures, Millar altered his understanding of how the National Association would establish the education of consultants. It was perhaps in the realization that the trading schools were working too slow that Millar thought the consultant had to be educated in a different way. Millar realized that for a complete education of advertising experts and other specialists to develop, a broader institutional framework and more resources were required than the trading schools possessed.²⁷³ In a speech he gave at the advertising congress Millar argued that “despite our efforts to introduce systematic instruction in the art of advertising, we realize that there will never be a proper form of advertising until there exist people who are completely dedicated to the trade.”²⁷⁴ The few hours of advertising lectures the trading schools could provide, were not enough to produce well-educated advertising people, Millar concluded.²⁷⁵ He thus came to view the establishment of advertising lectures in the trading schools and the establishment of an education for advertising consultants as independent tasks.

²⁷¹ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, p 320.

²⁷² Millar, “Reklameklubber og Reklameopgaver”, bilag.

²⁷³ Millar, “Den Nye Reklamebevægelse”, (Klubnummer 1917), p 2.

²⁷⁴ Millar, “Den Nye Reklamebevægelse”, (Oktobernummer 1916), p 5.

²⁷⁵ Millar, “Den Nye Reklamebevægelse”, (Klubnummer 1917), p 2.

Eventually, Millar seems to have moderated his ambitions of a National Association organizing this education, and instead focused on inducing the already existing advertising clubs to sacrifice more time in the effort to establish a proper education for advertising experts.²⁷⁶ Complications in the effort to implement advertising education was also typical in countries where advertising was prominent. In the U.S for example, the issue was subject of much debate on what such an education should entail and which institutions should set the standards for it. There was also a debate between those who questioned the need for an education at all, the traditionalists and the progressives who worked to establish formalized education. This first group claimed that the world of business was too particularistic and attempts to systematize the field could even be harmful. On the other side the progressives wanted to systematize the field to approach scientific status.²⁷⁷ Reluctance towards the effort of systematizing this area of the business system, might explain why Millar struggled to introduce advertising lectures in the trading schools. This argument will be further substantiated as we look at how Millar endeavored to establish a “sales-study” below. As the process of establishing advertising lectures in the trading schools proved too slow and inefficient for the ambitions of Millar, and the possibility for a National Association to organize an education seemed far off, Millar sought an alternative solution in the effort to establish a proper advertising education.

The Advertising School is established

After the advertising congress, it seemed as though the Trondheim club would mainly focus on the task of establishing a control office. Millar would perform some missionary work of his own to preach the gospel of advertising education. As noted, a few trading schools implemented advertising lectures in a rather tentative way.²⁷⁸ It was not until Millar moved to the capital and took charge of the Kristiania association that the work for an advertising education really accelerated.

On the first membership meeting with Millar as chairman in November 1917, he gave the association the task of immediately organizing a plan for evening instructions in advertising, and possibly also “in the greater subject of “sales-study”” in Kristiania.²⁷⁹ Developing a sales-study

²⁷⁶ Ibid.

²⁷⁷ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, pp 320.

²⁷⁸ “Vi Har Hørt”, *Romilla Revue*, (Februar 1918), p 4.

²⁷⁹ Millar, “De Nærmeste Opgaver”, p 4.

was Millar's initial effort to develop research on advertising. Concurrently he performed a statistical analysis of the turnover for the advertising business, which he put to around 30 million kroner. Millar then contacted Kristiania Handelskammer (Kristiania Chamber of Commerce) and presented them with his statistics and a curriculum that was greatly appreciated. Millar's work also seems to have inspired the Book-Printers Association as secretary-general B. A. Wium came and held a lecture titled "an advertising school in Kristiania" at the next membership meeting. After the lecture, the Advertising Association of Kristiania gave its support to the establishment of an advertising institute, with the goal of implementing two two-month courses a year in different forms of advertising. When Millar confirmed the interest and willingness of establishing an advertising school among his colleagues, he returned to the Chamber of Commerce, which had decided it was willing to nominate an administration and provide free locales, given that the Advertising Association financed the operation of the school.²⁸⁰ In the spring of 1918 The Advertising Association of Kristiania and the Chamber of Commerce cooperated diligently to facilitate the establishment of the school. Millar solved the financing issue by literally walking around the city and seeking out company managers to have them sign up for annual contributions.²⁸¹ This included newspapers, advertisement agencies, printers and "larger advertising consumers". In this way it was possible to offer free lectures.²⁸² The Chamber of Commerce under which the Stock Exchange committee was an important driving force for the Advertising School, appointed the wholesaler Olaf Meyer and stock exchange commissioner Reidar Due as administration, together with Millar who represented the Advertising Association of Kristiania. Because no one applied for the manager position, Millar himself undertook the task of leading the instruction, something he had extensive experience with from his time as a language teacher and lecturing on advertising in Trondheim.²⁸³

The purpose of the school was threefold. Millar seems to have suspended his ambition of educating advertising consultants. Looking at the teaching hours the Advertising School provided at this early stage, it is obvious that it was not yet possible to have fully educated advertising experts. Educating consultants became a more distant goal for Millar, but the foundation of the Advertising School was certainly an important step towards this goal, although it would take time

²⁸⁰ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, p 86.

²⁸¹ Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, p 92.

²⁸² "Reklameskolen", *Romilla Revue*, (April 1918), p 3.

²⁸³ Munthe-Kaas, *Reklameforeningen*, p 128.

for the school to expand. Another reason why it was not yet possible to educate consultants was one of clarification. Millar reckoned that before the advertising clubs could persuade businessmen to hire advertising consultants and before the consultant could be educated to his position, they needed to work out what this position would actually entail. This should be done immediately stressed Millar, with deference to both the business community and the advertising men.²⁸⁴

First of all then, the goal was to educate a group of skilled advertising practitioners. Looking at the curriculum developed by Millar might give an idea of the expertise these practitioners could offer. It was a 20-hour course based on Millar's textbook. Lectures would be held in two-hour classes once a week. Initially Millar and his secretary, Einar Munthe-Kaas, did the teaching before additional teachers were employed.²⁸⁵ Among these were the draftsman Leif R. Anthonisen and Dagfinn Tollefsen²⁸⁶, who pioneered the art of copywriting in Norway.²⁸⁷ Millar also invited other external experts to talk about the different fields of advertising.²⁸⁸ Together with this rather proficient staff, Millar organized a systematic curriculum. The school provided both a course for beginners and a separate course for experienced students. It was initiated by "unfolding" the advertising trade before the new students, train them to recognize the forms of advertising around them and clarify what advertising was. Munthe-Kaas was responsible for the next part that treated the history of advertising and the theoretical aspect of advertising. Then, the planning of advertising would be taught, where the students would learn how to plan the advertising for different types of advertisers, according to the need and advertising budget of the business. Dagfinn Tollefsen was giving a course on the preparation of what was called "advertising material", that was needed to implement an advertising plan. This included letters, brochures, newspaper advertisements and posters among other effects. The text and images in this material had to be adapted to the respective businesses. Next, Anthonisen lectured on how to execute advertising campaigns. An advertising campaign required cooperation between different advertising people: one man writes copy, one makes drafts, another does the planning. Other tasks included distribution and calculating expenses. Finally, Anthonisen treated the mechanical

²⁸⁴ Millar, "De Nærmeste Opgaver", p 4.

²⁸⁵ Munthe-Kaas, *Reklameforeningen*, p 130.

²⁸⁶ In 1917 Tollefsen was hired by the advertising agency W.C Fabritius og Sønner to become the first full-time copywriter in Norway. See Dalseg, *RRF-50 år, IFM-25 år*, p 21.

²⁸⁷ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, p 84.

²⁸⁸ "Reklameskolen i kommende aar", *Verdens Gang*, 18.11.1919, p 5.

processes of advertising that “every advertising man must know”. This included typography, clichés, lithography, matrices etc.²⁸⁹ Thus, it seems that the purpose of the school was to educate advertising experts with versatile knowledge, as a prototype of the advertising consultant, but also specialists such as copywriters and draftsmen.

On the opening day of the school, Millar proclaimed its second purpose: It was to be a cultural center for advertising and an institute from which the trading schools of the country could derive advertising knowledge.²⁹⁰ Millar hoped that the establishment of the Advertising School would speed up the process of implementing advertising lectures in the trading schools.²⁹¹ Where he had previously envisaged a National Association occupying this task, Millar now had a real institution where advertising knowledge and resources could be accumulated to assist the trading schools with systematic lectures in advertising. The Advertising School would both educate advertising experts and work as a resource base for the trading schools to ease their work with implementing advertising lectures, thus working from two sides to establish advertising as a respected field of expertise.

The school was inaugurated on the 2nd of October 1918. For the opening day Millar had invited the minister of finance plus managers from the biggest businesses, to create a flamboyant opening for the students. None of these appeared which signifies that politically and economically, the idea of educated advertising experts and advertising as a systematized field of knowledge, was still regarded as something inessential to society in Norway. Regarding the students however, the school was opened with significant popularity. 60 students applied out of which 21 were enlisted.²⁹² Exactly who these students were and what became of them is difficult to assess, but we know that for example Thor Bjørn Schyberg who became a prominent advertising manager and expert and later manager of the school, was one of the first to graduate. From November 1918 until April 1919, lectures were given every Wednesday evening. 16 students graduated to signify the first successful semester of the school. The issue of hiring competent teachers was a challenge for Millar in the establishing period of the school. The trade being taught was in itself recently developed and there was little experience on which to build. The number of applying students also dropped drastically in the first couple of years, down to

²⁸⁹ Ibid.

²⁹⁰ Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, p 93.

²⁹¹ Kimi, “Kimi’s Drøm Nr 2”, p 1.

²⁹² Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, p 92.

eight at its lowest.²⁹³ Considering the circumstances, it is not difficult to imagine that the school encountered some difficulties in its founding years. Einar Munthe-Kaas recollected that there was generally very low interest in advertising in the years 1919-1920, which might have been due to changing circumstances after the war where people were struggling to reorient themselves.²⁹⁴ This lack of interest applied to the advertising community itself, and certain forces within the Kristiania association allegedly counteracted Millar and his ideas. The period of low activity among the advertising pioneers might have come as a reaction to a period of high activity where Millar achieved quite a lot through his work with both the Trondheim club and the Advertising Association of Kristiania, at the cost of significant energy.²⁹⁵ In the Fall of 1920 came the stock market crash, which led to the formation of organizations focusing on reduced consumption. The general notion in society after the crash was one of saving more and consuming less, as a reaction to the superfluous consumption during the war.²⁹⁶ Under these circumstances advertising was probably not the most popular or sought after trade. In a brochure that was published for the 50-year anniversary of the school, the establishment of the school was described as an incredible feat. Let alone the consent of the “honored institution” Kristiania Børs (Kristiania Stock Exchange) to connect its name to the school. Millar received much credit for his fervent interest and perseverance in the founding years of the school.²⁹⁷

After a challenging phase of establishment, the school quite rapidly developed into an economically and technically strong institution, as the number of applicants increased, more teachers were employed, new subjects were established and teaching hours expanded.²⁹⁸ This might be explained by Millar’s persistent effort to persuade the business professionals of the importance of advertising, but I believe it was also a result of a more momentous undertaking. Before establishing the Advertising School, Millar and his colleagues had taken charge of the Government loan campaign of 1918, where they were given the opportunity to display the function of modern advertising not only to the business community, but also the politicians and the public at large.²⁹⁹ Towards the end of the war, Norway was facing a grave scarcity of goods.

²⁹³ Einar Munthe-Kaas, *Reklameforeningen*, p 134.

²⁹⁴ *Ibid.* p 136.

²⁹⁵ *Ibid.*

²⁹⁶ Myrvang, *Temmet eller Uhemmet*, p 132-133.

²⁹⁷ Steen, Olsen, *75 år 25 Oktober 1993: Glimt fra en historie*, pp 14-15.

²⁹⁸ Munthe-Kaas, *Reklameforeningen*, pp 134-135.

²⁹⁹ This campaign where advertising became a political tool in gaining the support of the masses for a cause and where the power of advertising was demonstrated to society, can be compared to the work of the Committee of

The government appointed national hero Fridtjof Nansen as envoy to the U.S where he worked out a deal for the purchase and import of necessary foodstuffs.³⁰⁰ To disburse the import of these goods the government established a 50 million kroner domestic loan and invited the people to buy bonds in order to fulfill it. The government established their own advertising campaign to induce people to buy bonds.³⁰¹ The campaign was not very successful and few people understood the importance of buying bonds. Towards the final subscription date, the government was strongly criticized by the editor of *Morgenbladet* C. J Hambro for not hiring expertise to implement such a campaign.³⁰² Upon reading this, Millar realized that this was a chance to prove the effectiveness of modern advertising. After convening a meeting with the Advertising Association of Kristiania, Millar got in contact with the prime minister. With only a few weeks until the subscription date was due and only about a fourth of the loan fulfilled, the prime minister agreed to give Millar and the association responsibility for advertising the loan.³⁰³ Millar and the association quickly organized a new advertising campaign. In ten days, they not only fulfilled the original loan on 50 million kroner, but raised an additional 38 million. With a budget of 43.000 kroner they had certainly proved that advertising, conducted in a systematic and professional way, was an effective and highly yielding method of selling. This might certainly have contributed to raise the interest in modern advertising among the business professionals and persuaded many of the use for advertising education.³⁰⁴ It thus seems peculiar that the minister of finance did not display more interest in the Advertising School.

The final purpose of the school was to establish research on advertising to systematize the field and develop a scientific education. But even before the Advertising School was established, Millar had begun to develop ideas of a science that would benefit both advertising experts and the advertisers.

Public Information and advertising experts in the U.S during WW1. See for example Pope, "The Advertising Industry and World War 1", pp 4-25.

³⁰⁰ Myrvang, *Temmet eller Uhemmet*, p 132.

³⁰¹ Munthe-Kaas, *Reklameforeningen*, p 126.

³⁰² Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, p 86.

³⁰³ Dalseg, *Fra Markskrigeri*, p 78.

³⁰⁴ Munthe-Kaas, *Reklameforeningen*, p 126.

Ambitions of an advertising science

In the early stages of establishing an advertising education, Millar as mentioned called for a scientific education of advertising people. Throughout *Romilla Revue*, advertising was consistently referred to as a science, without explaining why it was or what exactly made it a science. At times it was probably part of an effort to gain respectability for the advertising trade, as alluded to in Chapter 1. Millar and his friend H. J. Jewell typically referred to the U.S and England as countries where advertising science had reached an optimal state. Seemingly, advertising was a science in Norway as well, but in a less advanced state, perhaps because Norwegian advertising did not conduct any of its own research.³⁰⁵ The fact that Millar was greatly influenced by developments in American advertising, and thus aware of how the Americans had endeavored to develop an “advertising science” for use in business colleges, might have been what convinced him of the need to implement advertising research in Norway on which to establish an advertising education.³⁰⁶ What was entailed in Millar’s idea of an advertising science can be explained by four different concepts: development of a sales-study, empirical research, the appliance of psychological laws to advertising and placing advertising within the national economy.

In the fall of 1917, Millar started to develop what he called “sales-study”, a concept that must be seen as a prototype of modern day marketing. This involved establishing a study of how the different parts of the business system could work together in an optimal way, to rationalize the business system as whole. Millar thus appealed to a group of business professionals for assistance in this project. In January 1917 he held a lecture for Handelsreisendes Forening (Association of Commercial Travelers), on the idea of writing a scientific book of sales-work called *Salgslære (Sales-Study)*.³⁰⁷ Millar started his speech by telling the audience of a dream he had. In his dream he had seen a shooting star and been granted a wish by a Christmas angel. He had wished for a large factory, a large retail store, money for advertising and a staff of people to sell his goods, all of which were granted. The only thing he lacked was someone to teach his employees to sell these goods. What he needed was a man who had made it his vocation to make sales-plans. He looked everywhere but could find no one whose profession it was to tell him how to instruct his salesmen. Millar thought that surely there was someone who had been a

³⁰⁵ Romilla, “Resultater og Hvordan Man Kan Måle Dem”, p 4.

³⁰⁶ Schultze, ““An Honorable Place”, pp 24.

³⁰⁷ Romilla, “Salg og Videnskap”, p 2.

commercial traveler, or had their own retail store and understood advertising, who had written a book for the trading schools to use for their lectures in “the art of making sales plans and selling”.³⁰⁸ To his own disappointment he found no such book. When he woke from his dream, Millar continued, he thought that it should be possible to write such a book.

He then asked his audience if they would help him to start writing this book immediately, after which he explained how he conceived of this process and what should be the contents of the book: first of all it would explain the place of sales-work in the national economy.³⁰⁹ The first chapter treated the issue of sales plans with factors such as the market, customers, goods and the sales-machinery. Advertising had a prominent role within these factors. Other chapters included “manufacturers selling through advertising” and “retail selling”. On the chapter of how to advertise as a manufacturer Millar elaborated briefly on how to make advertising plans. He told his audience that he would not treat this topic too thoroughly because they, meaning him and his audience, would later write a book exclusively on how to plan advertising.³¹⁰

Millar did not get the response he had hoped for. He described his lecture as an attempt to interest the commercial travelers in a scientific exploration of their own vocation. After Millar’s lecture the Association of Commercial Travelers’ own journal *Den Norske Handelsreisende*, wrote an article where they evaluated and criticized Millar’s lecture. They concluded that the ability to sell was so individual that a sales-study did not exist at all. Millar was quick to counter this harsh conclusion. Shortly after, he clarified his arguments in *Romilla Revue* where he replied that “the word selling is more comprehensive than your article presumes.”³¹¹ The world of selling consisted of many different types of salesmen stated Millar: for example one sells by advertising, another through retail and a third as a commercial traveler. A fourth man sold by all these methods systematically combined. The salesmen also offered different things. One sold goods, the other knowledge and a third sold services or expertise. The problem according to Millar was the lack of a superior sales plan. Advertising and commercial travelers, he stated, were only part of the bigger “sales-machinery”.³¹² This was the reason he thought that so much of the Norwegian advertising was worthless and unprofitable: not only was advertising done without an

³⁰⁸ Millar, “Salgsmetoder og Salgslære”, (Salgslærenummer 1917), pp 4.

³⁰⁹ Ibid.

³¹⁰ Millar, “Salgsmetoder og Salgslære”, (Kontrollkontornummer 1917), p 2.

³¹¹ Romilla, “Salg og Videnskap”, p 2.

³¹² Ibid.

advertising plan, it was conducted without cooperation with the other parts of the sales-work. To lay the foundation for this cooperation, the different salesmen “*must* be educated in their trade” asserted Millar. He then implored the Norwegian commercial travelers again, to “take their part in the development of the science of sales...”, which he explained as “the doctrine of sales in all its trades.”³¹³ This debate can thus be compared to that between traditionalists and progressives in the U.S and underlines reluctance among business professionals at the time to systematize methods of sales and advertising.

To substantiate his arguments further, Millar elaborated on his conception of science. He maintained that it was not difficult to answer the question of whether it was possible to scientifically explore sales-work. It was sufficient claimed Millar, to point out the rich literature brought forth by American sales experts and the educational facilities established in the U.S. However, the question applied to Norwegian circumstances, and therefore Millar deemed it necessary to clarify the terms in use.³¹⁴ He gave a rather extensive definition of what science was. Essentially, it stated that science was a form of research conducted to establish laws of universal validity, by finding what universally binds together certain individual occurrences and what separated them from others. Science was to create an orderly cosmos of realization from the lawless chaos of single observations. He referred to the work of Carl Von Linné as a great example of how science was conducted and concluded that *it was* possible to formulate a doctrine of sales. Exactly how he would conduct research Millar did not elaborate on, other than that it should be done in cooperation as soon as possible so that the trading schools could start teaching this science to the future salesmen.³¹⁵ When work to establish the Advertising School was initiated, Millar expressed his wishes that he wanted sales-study to be one of the possible subjects.³¹⁶ Thus he might have hoped to develop a sales-study at the future Advertising School. Sales-study or a science of sales was thus a science of which advertising would only be one part, where the goal was to establish laws for how advertising and the other parts of the business system functioned together. Establishing a sales-study involved establishing a novel science based on scientific research performed by different business professionals and advertising people working together.

³¹³ Ibid.

³¹⁴ Ibid.

³¹⁵ Ibid. p 3.

³¹⁶ “De Nærmeste Opgaver”, *Romilla Revue*, (Februar 1918), p 4.

The second concept of advertising science implied the accumulation of empirical knowledge and establishing scientific laws from the results. For example, Millar emphasized the benefit of studying the results of an advertising campaign, especially for a newly established company. By performing such a study he claimed, one could be sure that the results were due to the effect of the campaign and not other factors such as connections or previous advertising work. This was of interest to the advertising science claimed Millar.³¹⁷ At the inauguration of the Advertising School in the fall of 1918, Millar gave a speech on the status quo of the advertising business where he underlined that much work was still needed to reform the field of advertising. To realize the forthcoming tasks Millar put a lot of faith in the newly established Advertising School, and placed a heavy emphasis on the need for research. Millar said he was astonished by the fact that in a country where a significant amount was spent year after year on advertising, there was little effort to accumulate and utilize the experiences gained from the advertising campaigns.³¹⁸ Exactly how he thought such research should be conducted, Millar did not elaborate on. Perhaps he meant it as a challenge for the Advertising School to establish a research program from which scientific laws for advertising practice could be established. Accumulating knowledge would not only be done by gaining new empirical knowledge, but also by establishing an advertising library. Millar was frustrated with the amount of energy spent to solve problems, which in other countries had been solved a long time ago. By seeking enlightenment in books, many struggles would disappear Millar argued.³¹⁹ The library would probably contain books on advertising science and other relevant literature.

The third concept involved the application of psychological laws to the field of advertising. In the U.S, an advertising science had been developed since the beginning of the 20th century. It was the professor of psychology at Northwestern University, Walter Dill Scott, who pioneered the application of psychology to the field of advertising. As this implied the application of social science to an area of business, it became known as scientific advertising. Many people believed that psychology could elucidate the laws of human behavior. Application of psychological laws would thus make advertising more exact and effective, ensuring a maximum yield on advertisers' budgets. Although there were other attempts to create an advertising science, for example by connecting it to other sciences and systematizing advertising practices, the connection with

³¹⁷ "Reklame i Praksis", *Romilla Revue*, (November 1915), p 7.

³¹⁸ Millar, "Reformer på Reklamens område", p 1.

³¹⁹ *Ibid.*

psychology established firm roots and was seen, especially in Norway, as the essence of advertising science.³²⁰ This is evident when looking at Millar's textbook and several articles in *Romilla Revue*, where Dill Scott's law of suggestion is seen as an essential advertising technique. At the inauguration of the Advertising School, Millar expressed his views that psychological research needed to be established in Norway as well. He wondered how many people were actually interested in the study of psychological and advertising-related laws that determined which advertisements would be profitable. At least 30 million kroner, Millar claimed, was used per year to "create public opinion." It was done, he continued, by the use of suggestion among other techniques and the study of suggestion had been coined by the academic field of psychology.³²¹ Further, Millar asserted that any advertising campaign was based on the study of the psychological laws that stirred the large public. He therefore wondered if it was not appropriate to demand that psychologists should assist in elaborating these "abstract laws", as advertising people had no time to do the research themselves but the research was nonetheless essential to their advertising work.³²² According to Millar, Norwegian advertising practitioners were not strangers to the use of psychological techniques and thus American advertising science. He seemed interested in establishing cooperation between the Advertising School and psychologists, to develop new research based on Norwegian circumstances.

Finally, Millar wanted to connect advertising to economic science, in what must also be seen as a challenge to the newly founded Advertising School. He expanded on his argument that advertising was part of the "sales-machinery" and described it as a "big wheel" in this system.³²³ The study of this system, claimed Millar, belonged to the doctrine of National Economy that was taught and studied at every university. Using neon sign advertising as an example Millar asked what function this kind of advertising had in the national economy. Were these advertisements an unnecessary waste of the resources of society or not? The issue, he stated, had to be considered in connection with several other factors, which together constituted the work area of the national economist. This question applied to any form of advertising. Further, Millar explained that

³²⁰ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, p 320.

³²¹ Millar, "Reformer på Reklamens område", p 1.

See also Schultze, "An Honorable Place", for more information on how Dill Scott developed the application of psychology to the study of advertising and Scott, *The Psychology of Advertising*, for more insight on this and other theories.

³²² *Ibid.*

³²³ *Ibid.*

advertising people had many questions for the national economists. E.g., if it was true that advertising was such an important facility to increase the wealth and prosperity of the nation, and if businesses should advertise most during prosperous or unprosperous times. With the significant amount of money being spent on advertising, Millar asked the national economists to show the advertising men how to utilize these means in a best possible way for the good of the economy and country. When looking at the scientific context it should be mentioned that an effort to apply different social and economic sciences to advertising might be something typical of professionalization efforts in the field of advertising. Again, to take developments in the U.S as an example, this characterized the debate of advertising reformers in the beginning of the 20th century. The central issue was how applied science could raise the efficiency of advertising which implied increased productivity and profits for both advertisers and advertising experts.³²⁴

Millar endeavored to establish research not only for the education of advertising practitioners and experts, but also for the advertisers through sales-study. Having research on sales-study established in the trading schools, would cohere with Millar's ambition for the Advertising School to be a center of resources for the trading schools. Sales-study and connecting advertising to the national economy I believe, would serve a common purpose in the effort to crystallize advertising as an important area of the economy where expertise was needed. Scientific research would be the basis for establishing education that educated both expert and client, again underlining the importance of education for establishing advertising as a field of expertise. Millar's vision of psychologists and economists contributing to develop an advertising science could also be interpreted as an ambition of gaining contact with the universities. A characteristic of professionalization processes is that professional training schools which do not develop within universities, eventually seek contact with these. This is done for example to develop research programs on which the base of knowledge can be expanded. Professional practice is then based on this systematic and generalized knowledge.³²⁵ From Millar's point of view, connecting the Advertising School to a university would also solve the issue of finding competent teachers. This argument can be substantiated with Millar's ambition of establishing a

³²⁴ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, pp 317.

³²⁵ Wilensky, "The Professionalization of Everyone?", pp 144.
Barber, "Some Problems in the Sociology of professions", pp 673.

docent position in advertising, established at the Technical University College of Trondheim, and the University of Kristiania, that he expressed in an earlier discourse on advertising education.³²⁶

Conclusion

Millar's educational concepts were meant to serve several functions. First of all to lecture the businessmen or advertisers in advertising theory to make them realize that advertising was significant for the success of their businesses. Further, to convince them that advertising was an extensive field or actually a science requiring expertise to be conducted in an optimal way. This would convince the advertisers of an epistemic asymmetry between them and the experts. Introducing advertising lectures in the trading schools would also work to create interest in advertising in the business community. *Romilla Revue* pursued a similar task. Through this professional journal it was possible to raise more interest in advertising not only among business graduates but also among already established businessmen. The purpose was thus to create a market for advertising consultants. Educating the businessmen or advertisers in advertising would also establish higher standards and requirements for advertising practice, contributing to the overall reform of the advertising field. Then, to offer expertise to the advertisers, advertising experts or consultants had to be educated and equipped with both theoretical and practical knowledge. The consultant who would possess a form of knowledge and skill which the advertisers lacked, and whose knowledge made him as important to the advertiser as the advertiser's doctor or lawyer, epitomized Millar's idea of an advertising professional. Millar's educational concepts thus enhances the image of a dual professionalization. Educating the advertisers and creating a need for expertise was a premise for establishing advertising consultants. At the same time solutions were sought of how to educate these consultants.

Regarding the realization of Millar's various projects, not so much was achieved in this period. Two of the trading schools in Trondheim introduced a few hours of advertising instruction in the form of lectures, for which Millar wrote a textbook. Millar was perhaps too ambitious in his hopes that a National Association could be established in the near future to coordinate education in the trading schools. At the same time he probably hoped that the trading schools would be more cooperative and find more time for developing advertising instruction. Because of the reluctance and slowness of the trading schools, Millar sought an alternative

³²⁶ Millar, "Reklameklubber og Reklameoppgaver", bilag.

solution that eventually materialized in the Advertising School. In this project, at least a group of business professionals proved genuinely interested and optimistic about establishing advertising education and were in fact of paramount importance for the establishment of the school. With this achievement we can argue that a significant step was taken towards realizing the educational concepts and formed a strong basis for further development. Although it would take time to develop fully educated consultants, it was possible to educate a prototype of this consultant or a form of advertising expert. Thor Bjørn Schyberg was a good example of this. Schyberg proved Millar's conception that to become an advertising expert, education was not enough: it also required an innate ability or a vocation. Although he only had a few hours of education from the Advertising School, where he was the top student, Schyberg became a prominent and influential advertising expert. According to Christine Myrvang he represented a new generation of admen that revolutionized the advertising trade during the interwar period.³²⁷

The Advertising School was an institution from where research could be conducted and where work in cooperation with other scientific disciplines, especially psychology, was a possibility. A scientific basis for the education of advertising consultants would certainly equip them with an abstract knowledge and superior form of expertise. Establishing research must be seen as an effort to gain more knowledge of the field of advertising, increasingly expanding the epistemic asymmetry between advertisers and advertising experts. Millar and his peers often complained about advertisers wasting money on cheap advertising. If advertising could be made into an exact science it would certainly prove to the advertisers the effectiveness and profitability of modern advertising. Although Millar wanted to develop a science of sales to benefit the advertisers as well, it seemed difficult to gain support for this idea, testifying that Millar's ideas were sometimes too ambitious or ahead of their time. Millar might have realized that it was too much work to establish an independent science like this, especially with so little interest from the business professionals in the project. Even so, he developed the foundation for the future trade of marketing. Connecting advertising with scientific disciplines could also contribute in giving the advertising trade a more respected standing in society and thus elevate the status of advertising practitioners.

³²⁷ Steen, Olsen, *75 år 25 Oktober 1993: Glimt fra en historie*, pp 16.
Myrvang, *Forbruksagentene*, p 79.

The Advertising School became a long-lasting institution and changed its name to Markedsføringskolen (The Marketing School) in 1965 as a result of the increasing importance of marketing in the curriculum. Markedsføringskolen was the predecessor of Norges Markedshøyskole or NMH (Norwegian School of Marketing) that was established in 1989 and became part of BI Norwegian Business School in 1992.³²⁸

Finally, the effort of establishing educational facilities was a component in an ultimate goal of educating all those who wanted to work in the advertising trade. If credentials could be made a requirement to work in the advertising trade, it would be possible to control the entry to the field and ensure a certain level of competence among all the practitioners in the field.

³²⁸ Steen, Olsen, *75 år 25 Oktober 1993: Glimt fra en historie*, pp 1.

Chapter 4

Licensing and Control

Instituting a control office was, together with establishing education, one of the first and most important tasks of the Trondheim club and the Advertising Association of Kristiania. What the idea and function of a control office entailed will be explained throughout the chapter.

Controlling advertising ventures and agents was seemingly one of the most interesting issues for established advertising experts and practitioners but also advertisers. Already in January 1915 the Trondheim club started discussing the question of establishing an office for this purpose and in June 1915 the club decided to make this task a priority.³²⁹ In this chapter I will look at how Millar, through both the Trondheim club and the Advertising Association of Kristiania, cooperated with the business community and to a certain extent the tourist industry, to establish a control office. The idea of developing a control office resulted from the wish of Norwegian advertising pioneers, to gain to control with the overflow of advertising ventures and agents and limit the entry to this area of the advertising trade.³³⁰ Although the pioneers managed to establish this office, it was short-lived and the initiative was essentially a failure. Even so, the process of establishing the office and the question of why it was a failure is interesting, as it highlights intentions for cooperation between different members of Millar's advertising class and impediments to the professionalization.

First, I will establish how the groups of advertising ventures and agents operated and thus why Millar and other pioneers saw it as an essential task to instigate some means for control. Here I divide the agents into three groups, where I separate between advertising agents as essentially a group of respectable workers, and the agents that composed the overflow. In Millar's mind, the overflow seemed to consist of a group of fraudulent agents and a group of honest yet incompetent agents. Then I will look at initial attempts and efforts to deal with the overflow of agents, before moving on to the ideas of and discussions between Norwegian advertising pioneers of how control could be gained and how a control office could be established. Here I emphasize that the control office, by introducing licensing, would ideally have a dual function of both controlling the entry to one area of the advertising trade and reform

³²⁹ Knudsen, "Kontrolkontoret", p 4.

³³⁰ Editorial, *Romilla Revue*, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 2.

practices in this area. Finally, I will explain how the control office was established. Through the text I will look at possibilities for why it was a failure, which I then discuss in the conclusion. Establishing a control office was as a measure to gain legitimacy for the advertising trade among the advertisers and the public. In order to persuade the public and especially the businesses of the important function of advertising, it was of great importance to rid the advertising field of its connection with fraudulent projects and agents, but also to change the practice of many incompetent agents. This effort is comparable to the “Truth in Advertising” movement in the U.S, which endeavored to develop mechanisms of pressure for advertising practitioners to adjust to ethical standards.³³¹ As alluded to in Chapter 2, such attempts of self-regulation were also directed at the public opinion. However, ideas of a control office or similar institutions are not visible in the American context. Even though vigilance committees were established these worked mainly to persuade dubious practitioners to reform their practices and did not have any licensing function.³³² It has also proved difficult to find evidence of similar institutions in Norway, particularly in my period of research but also in Norwegian commercial history in general. However, the professionalization of accountants in Norway may provide a similar example that I will discuss towards the end of the chapter.

Advertising ventures and agents

Before explaining how advertising ventures and agents operated, it is important to note that we are looking mainly at Millar’s description of the situation, and as such part of his argumentation for the need to establish a control office.

I have chosen to use the translation “advertising agent” for the group of practitioners the Norwegian advertising pioneers termed “annonceagenter” or “annonseamlere”.³³³ These terms translates directly to “advertisement agent” or “advertisement collector” respectively. In American advertising literature the term “advertising agent” is used to describe a similar type of practitioner and it is thus a useful collective term.³³⁴ According to Millar these agents usually worked for a “reklameforetagende” or “annonceforetagende” which translates to “advertising

³³¹ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, p 242.

³³² Schultze, “Professionalism in Advertising”, p 66.

³³³ *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 8, (August 1915), pp 1-7.

³³⁴ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, pp 156.

venture” or “advertisement venture”. These ventures were, as he explained: “books, brochures, calendars and other more or less arbitrary publications, established mainly as a source of revenue for the publisher...”.³³⁵ The job of the agent was to travel around to various advertisers and sell advertising space in these publications from which they then received commission. It is difficult to find figures on how much commission they received. However, a usual figure for agents in other countries is 15 %.³³⁶ In Millar’s view, these agents were primarily a group of respectable workers who sought out advertisers to offer them advertising space that could benefit their business and were genuinely interested in pleasing both advertiser and publisher. As can be deduced from Millar’s description, these agents worked for properly conducted publications, probably also newspapers, and had knowledge of how the venture they worked for could be of advertising value to a business.³³⁷ As mentioned in Chapter 2, Millar wanted these agents to become members of and form a separate group within the Advertising Association of Kristiania, a proposition to which the agents declined. It was probably because advertisers usually paid a certain percentage in advance and because there were no requirements to establish an advertising venture, that this area of the advertising field had become overflowed. Per Vogt claimed that a general lack of criticism towards the establishment of new businesses with often obscure purposes, characterized Norwegian commerce in the period. The circumstances might thus have paved the way for advertising ventures.³³⁸

Although this overflow was a composite of many different ventures and actors, it is possible to divide them into two groups. First, the field attracted a large group of dubious and fraudulent advertising ventures and agents that operated in different ways. That they constituted a large group can be substantiated by looking at a collective statement from several advertising pioneers, saying that this group had become a scourge.³³⁹ Several advertisers also complained that these agents frequently visited them.³⁴⁰ According to Millar, some ventures were established mainly to collect advance payment from advertisers. Further, he stated that dubious and fraudulent persons who had little knowledge of how to manage a publication, e.g. of distribution

³³⁵ Miro, ”Reklameforetagender – Og Holde Øie Med Dem”, p 6.

³³⁶ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, pp 156.

³³⁷ Miro, “Verdiløse Og Verdifulle Annoncetilbud”, p 2.

³³⁸ Vogt, *Jerntid og Jobbetid*, pp 142.

³³⁹ “Rapport Fra Landskomiteen”, *Romilla Revue*, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 2.

³⁴⁰ Riis, “En Glasmesters Reklame”, p 6.

Berg, “Lundgreens Enke’s Reklame”, p 4.

and editing, often conducted these ventures. Millar explained that if a man were “on his knees” the advertising trade would always be open to him. Here it was easy to make a quick profit by deceiving one’s fellow man by issuing an advertising venture.³⁴¹ Both Millar and Harry Høst conceived that to many people with a desperate need for money, establishing an advertising venture or working as an advertising agent was a last resort. Thus, it was seemingly quite easy to con an advertiser for the advance payment. But how did these agents operate? An interview Millar did with a police investigator from Kristiania sheds light on the matter. The investigator explained that an advertising agent would for example promise the advertiser a certain distribution, print run etc., and convince him to advertise. The parties then signed a contract where the agent would demand a significant amount of the payment in advance. According to Millar, 50% or even the whole payment was not an unusual demand. In many cases, the publications did not hold what the agent had promised or was never published at all and the advertiser was swindled.³⁴²

Further, the investigator stated that some agents operated by only *claiming* to represent a publication, where no publication existed at all. Another apparent problem was that although there existed many honest advertising ventures, there was no guarantee that the agents they hired to solicit advertisements were honest. Millar’s colleague Johannes Knudsen, pointed out that many agents found work with an honest publication and in many cases took advantage of the goodwill of this publication among the advertisers.³⁴³ These agents would probably lie about distribution or solicit more advertisements than the publication could hold and keep the advance payment for these redundant advertisements. According to the police investigator, some agents also managed to collect the advance payment twice, first from the manager of the business and then from one of its employees. He regretted that a great number of fraudulent ventures and agents were reported to the police or came under police investigation.³⁴⁴

Second, Millar conceived that there existed many properly conducted ventures employing a group of honest advertising agents. However, he and other pioneers complained that these agents were employing a misguided work method. Judging from Millar’s description, these agents had little knowledge of how the publication they worked for could make the advertisements effective

³⁴¹ Miro, “Mer om Kontrollkontoret”, p 4.

³⁴² “Politiet Og Kontrollkontoret”, *Romilla Revue*, (Kontrollkontornummer 1917), p 6.

³⁴³ Knudsen, “Kontrollkontoret For Annonceforetagender”, p 4.

³⁴⁴ “Politiet Og Kontrollkontoret”, *Romilla Revue*, (Kontrollkontornummer 1917), p 6.

and profitable to the advertisers. This would for example include providing the advertiser with information on the dispersion of the publication, the purchasing power of the readership and their need for the advertiser's product.³⁴⁵ Information on the content and purpose of a publication was also important to the advertiser, claimed Millar. For example, it would be wrong to advertise in a publication if the advertiser did not agree with the editorial content. Further, Millar argued that a publication should be of interest to the public, which obviously was important if the advertising was to create sales, but also underlines the idea that the advertising trade worked in the service of society. However, he regretted that the main task for these advertising agents was to solicit advertisements mainly to secure a source of revenue, without much care for how the publication they worked for could benefit the advertiser.³⁴⁶ Few would thus bother to supply the advertiser with information of the publication.

Looking at Millar's and other advertising pioneer's descriptions, it seems that both fraudulent and honest agents employed similar methods for soliciting advertisements. This probably contributed to the chaotic circumstances and distrust in advertising agents. Millar told of an encounter he had with some of them, probably from his time working for Nordenfjeldske Dampskibsselskap: "They have a few empty parallelograms in a book to fill with advertisements, and when they have my stamp on the vacant space, when the contract is signed and a little advance has been paid, the interview is over to our mutual content."³⁴⁷ Advertisers often characterized the practice of the advertising agents as annoying, insistent and performed in a begging manner, as their goal was to solicit an advertisement from a business as quick as possible and then move on to the next business to solicit another. This was probably because of the competition in this area created by the overflow of ventures. This characteristic of the advertising agents also bear resemblance to the many speculators of the time, who worked intensively to sell shares with little mind for business ethics.³⁴⁸ The advertising agents added to or were perhaps influenced by the conditions of their time. Some were perhaps involved in both areas. The practice employed by most advertising agents was not only a nuisance, but it must also have made it difficult for the advertiser to separate between fraudulent and honest agents and know if he worked for an honest publication.

³⁴⁵ Miro, "Verdiløse Og Verdifulle Annoncetilbud", p 2.

³⁴⁶ Miro, "Reklameforetagender og Annoncesamlere", p 6.

³⁴⁷ Ibid.

³⁴⁸ Vogt, *Jerntid og Jobbetid*, pp 142.

A common resentment among the Norwegian pioneers was that every advertiser suffered because of the unrestricted access or possibility to establish advertising ventures and the lack of control with these.³⁴⁹ Advertising agents and their ventures not only competed with each other to sell advertising space but also with established publications, most importantly the newspapers Millar argued. Dubious or fraudulent advertising ventures with little advertising value was thus ousting the most formidable platform for advertising.³⁵⁰ Millar and several of his peers complained that because of this practice, many advertising budgets were wasted on paying for advertisement space in publications that were conducted in an unprofessional manner.³⁵¹

Initial efforts of control and the weakness of the advertisers

It was because of the plague of badly conducted ventures and fraudulent agents, and as Millar saw it, especially because of their practice that advertising agents in general were distrusted by advertisers. How did advertisers attempt to deal with the scourge of agents? Millar explained that many advertisers posted signs outside their business that said, “advertising offers received only through letters” or “advertising agents not accommodated”. Several advertising pioneers thought these signs were futile and counterproductive. A common argument was that they were less deterring to frauds and those working as agents because they could get no other occupation, than to respectable agents who had a beneficial offer to make.³⁵² Millar thought that by closing their doors to every agent, the businesses would not only close the door to the group of respectable agents, but also to any honest agent which publication could be of advertising value.³⁵³

Because there was no registration required to establish an advertising venture and no directory where the advertisers could find information about a publication’s distribution, readership etc. there was no way for the advertiser to secure trustworthy information of a venture when confronted with an offer. One way to obtain some knowledge of a venture was for the advertisers to contact one another and inquire if they had heard of or had any experience with this or that venture. While he lived in Trondheim, Millar reported that he received phone calls regularly from people asking him if he knew certain agents and if they could be trusted. To this

³⁴⁹ “Hvordan Vi Kan Hjælpe Hverandre”, *Romilla Revue*, (Juli 1915), p 6.

³⁵⁰ Miro, “Bør Ikke Reklamenæringen Beskyttes”, p 4.

³⁵¹ Knudsen, “Kontrolkontoret For Annonseforetagender”, pp 4-5.

³⁵² En Annoncebureauemand, “Hvad Læserne Mener”, p 4.

³⁵³ Miro, “Reklameforetagender og Annoncesamlere”, p 6.

Millar would answer that he had no opportunity to examine the offers made by these agents beforehand, nor any means to control that the promises made were upheld.³⁵⁴

A more sophisticated system of communication between advertisers to inhibit a superfluity of agents had been formed in the city of Stavanger. Here the merchant's association had decided that their members would only be allowed to advertise in the daily newspapers and a few other publications. If a member wanted to advertise in a different publication, he needed approval from the board of the association. Further, any advertising agent who made an offer to any of the members would be directed to the board for approval. If approved, the agent was free to solicit advertisements among members of the association.³⁵⁵

This sort of cooperation between advertisers was not prevalent, and seemingly advertisers generally did little to impede these agents. The boom period which implied a rising prosperity for business people in general, probably made many advertisers indifferent regarding how they spent their advertising budgets. Furthermore, as we saw in the previous chapter, advertisers spent a significant amount of money on advertising but there was no institute that lectured the advertisers on *how* they should advertise. Because they had little knowledge of a modern, systematically planned advertising, many advertisers probably had low criteria for how their advertisements were distributed, if they reached potential customers etc. Advertising pioneers such as Høydahl Ohme typically complained that advertisers did not seem to care much for how their advertising budget was spent, as long as the advertising was cheap.³⁵⁶ According to Millar they were often overflowed by offers which in most cases they had no ability to assess.³⁵⁷ H. J. Jewell pointed out that when Norwegian advertisers spent their money they were usually not able to “distinguish the good from the bad”, often entrusting their money to cunning advertising agents who offered unproductive advertising space.³⁵⁸ This might have been another reason why it was important to work for a better understanding of advertising among the advertisers. With more knowledge the advertisers would also demand more information and guarantees from the agents, which could have made it more difficult for fraudulent ventures to operate. Millar suggested that until an eventual control office could be established, the advertisers should demand proper information

³⁵⁴ Millar, “Den Nye Reklamebevægelse”, (Oktobernummer 1916), p 4.

³⁵⁵ Holgersen, ”Vore Opgaver”, p 4.

³⁵⁶ Høydahl Ohme, “Kontrolkontoret For Reklameforetagender”, p 7.

³⁵⁷ Miro, “Bør Ikke Reklamenæringen Beskyttes?”, p 4.

³⁵⁸ Jewell, “Om Reklame”, p 2.

when confronted by unfamiliar agents.³⁵⁹ Establishing a control office and educating the advertisers might thus be seen as parallel processes towards the goal of limiting the entry of fraudulent ventures.

Ideas for control

The idea and aspiration of gaining control with the profusion of advertising agents and ventures had occupied the minds of many Norwegian advertising pioneers and advertisers for years.³⁶⁰ However, it was not until the emergence of Millar and the establishment of the Trondheim club and the Advertising Association of Kristiania that a real effort was made towards this task. As we saw in Chapter 2, the Advertising Association of Kristiania put the task of counteracting humbug advertising on the agenda of the advertising clubs. From the outset, Harry Høst and his colleagues aspired to raise the advertising agents' standard of practice and establish a system that guaranteed their honesty. They discussed the idea that, being member of the association would establish such a guarantee: when confronted with an offer the advertiser could thus inquire if the agent and the venture he worked for was a member of the Advertising Association. Further, Scheibler argued for the need to ensure that future advertising agents were learned people who performed their work expertly. It was the concept of the Kristiania pioneers that the association in itself would function as a control institution.

This concept is comparable to Geoffrey Millerson's theory of qualifying associations as a type of professional organization.³⁶¹ Millerson performed an empirical study of professional associations in Great Britain, where he conceived that many of these associations could be described as qualifying associations, which attempt to qualify individuals for practice in a particular occupation. The goal of the qualifying associations is to qualify their members to act in a certain capacity. A secondary function of this qualification is to control entry into a profession. Millerson stated that these tests of competence are necessary to build professional status as well as professional standards. Similar to the qualifying associations, the Kristiania association would ideally operate with a dual purpose of both qualifying and advancing the technique involved in the practice of an area.³⁶² However, the Kristiania association would qualify *one* group of

³⁵⁹ Miro, "Reklameforetagender – Og Holde Øie Med Dem", p 6.

³⁶⁰ En Annoncebureauemand, "Hvad Læserne Mener", p 4.

³⁶¹ Millerson, *The Qualifying Associations*, p ix.

³⁶² *Ibid.* pp 28.

practitioners to work within the advertising trade, whereas the qualifying associations consisted of members from a single occupational group that qualified members for that same occupation. Further, qualifying associations also contributed to train and educate the professionals which they then examined.³⁶³ If the Kristiania association also planned on undertaking such a function is unclear. They did have in mind to contribute with advertising lectures in the trading schools, but these lectures were foremost directed at the advertisers. However, the association did probably envisage having an examining function, as they would contribute to recruit those who were apt to work as agents. The goal of the Kristiania pioneers was first of all to provide protection for the advertising trade and especially the advertisers.³⁶⁴ The association never realized such a function however, perhaps as a consequence of its difficult founding period.

In any event, the initial fervor of the Kristiania pioneers inspired Millar and the Trondheim club to begin agitating this cause in earnest. Through the organizing of the Trondheim club and by employing *Romilla Revue*, a discussion started among advertising pioneers across the country on how control could be achieved through establishing an institution independent of the advertising clubs. The scourge of dubious advertising ventures affected all the major parts of the advertising trade, including newspapers and the advertisement agencies that worked for them, and the advertisers themselves. Millar's ideas and proposals thus quickly caught the attention of representatives from these areas and the issue of how a control office could be established was debated with great interest. In the summer of 1915, the Trondheim club established a committee to clarify the issue. As the committee began probing the Norwegian advertising trade, it soon became evident that a control office was generally an interesting idea, and for many a long awaited institution.³⁶⁵

Registration and identification

In the initial discussions, the director of the National Association of Norwegian Tourism, T.A Heiberg, proposed that advertising agents should be taxed. By taxing agents, Millar agreed, it would be possible to register those who operated as agents but not to control their activities. Millar was not sure if this would be a sufficient measure.³⁶⁶ He proposed instead that the activity

³⁶³ Høst, "Hvad Vi Arbejder For", p 6.

³⁶⁴ Ibid.

³⁶⁵ "Rapport Fra Landskomiteen", *Romilla Revue*, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 2.

³⁶⁶ Miro, "Mer om Kontrollkontoret", p 4.

of collecting advertisements should become subject to licensing. He envisaged that a central office was established in Kristiania, where all advertising ventures had to be registered and evaluated. This office would decide whether or not an advertising venture would receive identification proving that it was a serious and properly conducted undertaking.³⁶⁷ To receive identification Millar conceived, owners of a venture would be required to provide the control office with information regarding their publication's print run, method of distribution, where it was printed, the purpose of the publication and the nature of the content among other details. Millar's idea was that a control office would decide whether or not to approve an advertising venture on the basis of the information it received. If approved, this information would be printed on the identification card, which the agent was required to present to the advertiser when making an offer. The identification card would then function as the advertiser's guarantee that a venture was properly conducted and that the promises made by an advertising agent was upheld.³⁶⁸ Johannes Knudsen regarded the identification cards as a cheap and effective insurance system: it would safeguard the advertisers from fraudulent agents and ensure the effective use of the advertising budget.³⁶⁹ Of course, any publisher could lie about this information only to receive an identification. However, Millar was confident that a control office would deter this kind of activity. Because every venture had to register, any deception would be discovered promptly.³⁷⁰ Millar stated that it would also be the task of the office to monitor perpetually if the agent or publisher maintained his promises. On the other hand, the advertisers had to be persuaded to never accept an advertising agent unless he presented this identification. As a measure Millar proposed to print advertisements for the control office in the newspapers on a regular basis. The advertisement would have the text: "To advertisers! Never involve yourself with an advertising agent without asking: "Can I see your identification from the Control-Office for advertising"".³⁷¹ In this way, and perhaps rather fitting, advertising would be a means in the effort to reform the advertising trade. Millar thus relied on the newspapers to assist in the matter. He envisioned that if only a few advertisers refused to discuss an advertising offer without being presented with identification, every venture would be forced to go to the control office.³⁷²

³⁶⁷ Ibid.

³⁶⁸ Ibid.

³⁶⁹ Knudsen, "Kontrolkontoret For Annonceforetagender", p 4.

³⁷⁰ Miro, "Mer om Kontrolkontoret", p 4.

³⁷¹ Miro, "Bør Ikke Reklamenæringen Beskyttes?", p 5.

³⁷² Ibid.

By gathering information on the advertising ventures, Millar thought the control office would be able to create a register or directory of these ventures and their agents. From this directory, the advertisers could acquire information about advertising ventures if they sought to find a relevant and trustworthy publication for their advertising. Based on this register, several advertising pioneers imagined that a control office would also undertake the task of actively guiding the advertisers and educate them on which publications were credible and beneficial for their advertising.³⁷³

Identification to reform practices

Millar and a few of his colleagues agreed that the issuing of identification cards with information about the publication, would contribute to reform the misguided practices of many advertising agents. Millar argued that the task of the advertising agent should not be to “seize” advertisements, but to provide the advertiser with information.³⁷⁴ The kind of information a business owner needed to evaluate whether a publication was a valuable platform for advertising would thus be printed on the agents’ identification cards. If the agents commenced to seek out advertisers with the purpose of acquainting them with valuable statistics pertaining to the publication they worked for, Millar was convinced that the advertisers would soon regard these agents as respectable workers and not as importunate agents.³⁷⁵ By acquiring identification, the advertising agents would be greeted with the trust an honest and hard-working man deserved, one of Millar’s colleagues contemplated.³⁷⁶ Thus, the establishment of the control office would contribute to mitigate the general disfavor of advertising agents among the advertisers, by separating them from a dubious form of practice, and perhaps lay the foundation for a better cooperation between these two groups. Millar hoped that eventually, the advertisers would replace their signs of “advertising offers received only through letters” with “advertising offers committed to my advertising consultants.” This notion points to a connection between the concept of educating advertising consultants and the idea of establishing a control office. Permeating the discussion of a control office was the idea that advertising agents, once equipped with identification, would be directed to the advertiser’s consultant or expert advisers when

³⁷³ Høydahl Ohme, ”Kontrolkontoret For Reklameforetagender”, p 7.

³⁷⁴ Miro, ”Verdiløse Og Verdifulle Annoncetilbud”, p 2.

³⁷⁵ Ibid.

³⁷⁶ En Annoncebureauand, ”Hvad Læserne Mener”, p 4.

making an offer.³⁷⁷ Seemingly, the advertising agents were a factor external to the advertisers that necessitated the position of the advertising consultant.

Administration

Many different actors of the advertising trade consented to these ideas. E.g., The National Association of Norwegian Tourism and Norsk Hotelforening (Norwegian Hotel Association) spoke for the tourist industry. Major advertisers such as Chr. Bjelland & Co. and the biggest steamship companies, plus the National Association of the Business Community displayed great interest. These businesses and associations emphasized that any advertiser who wanted reassurance that their advertising was effective and advantageous and more confident circumstances in the advertising trade, would definitively support the establishment of such an institution. Several of the largest and oldest advertisement agencies such as Heroldens Annoncebureau and Høydahl Ohme's Annonce-expedition also expressed their support. Finally, all the major newspapers of Trondheim, including *Trondhjems Adresseavis*, displayed optimism and approval of this project.³⁷⁸ The premises for cooperation between these different actors and the advertising clubs to establish an institution for control was therefore promising. Given that the idea was supported by such a range of powerful actors makes it all the more curious that the office was a failed initiative.

Regarding the issue of who should administer this office and enforce control, the advertising pioneers had different conceptions. Several of the advertisement agencies expressed that a control office should be established as a public institution or in cooperation with the police or the Stock Exchange. Høydahl Ohme said he found it peculiar that the authorities had not adopted control and certification in this area of the advertising trade, considering the fact that the police often handled advertising ventures and agents.³⁷⁹ Millar seemed reluctant to call upon the assistance of any public authority or institution. He was in serious doubt of the ability of the police to issue or deny licenses or identifications in a competent way. Millar proposed instead that the National Association of the Business Community consolidated with the Magazine-owners Association, the National Association of Advertisement Agencies and the eventual

³⁷⁷ "Rapport Fra Landskomiteen", *Romilla Revue*, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 2.

³⁷⁸ "Kontrolkontoret for Reklameforetagender", *Romilla Revue*, (August 1915), p 7.

³⁷⁹ Høydahl Ohme, "Kontrolkontoret For Reklameforetagender", p 7.

National Association of Advertising. Each of these associations would appoint a member for a control committee, and this committee would establish a control office and employ a director.³⁸⁰ Millar's proposal would prove to be the most realistic and viable, albeit with modifications.

Even if the control office was established without public authorities, advertising pioneers claimed that the office had a legitimate claim on the interest of the public. Because the control office would impede fraudulent and dubious ventures, the large public would be exempted from a myriad of ineffective and meaningless advertisements.³⁸¹ Again, we see an example where advertising pioneers legitimate their reform work by claiming that it was beneficial to the public and common social interests, in the term of Flexner.³⁸² This example also highlights the effort of the advertising pioneers, where they sought to gain legitimacy for advertising not only among the advertisers but also among the public.

A fruitful cooperation: The process of establishing a control office

The pressing need felt by several actors of the advertising trade to control or regulate the inflow of advertising agents, might explain why the process of establishing a control office went relatively swiftly. Especially active in the initial stages was director Heiberg. It has proved difficult to obtain biographical data on Heiberg. We know that he became director of the National Association of Norwegian Tourism in 1907. He was very active in preaching the cause of modern advertising in general and particularly concerned with reforming the advertising of the Norwegian tourist industry.³⁸³ Heiberg held speeches in and cooperated with both the Trondheim club and the Advertising Association of Kristiania on the matter of control.³⁸⁴ He also addressed the government to contribute, especially on the issue of taxing advertising agents. As the government proved reluctant to involve itself in the matter, Heiberg came to rely more on the effort of the advertising clubs and supported Millar's ideas of introducing licensing or identification.³⁸⁵ In the initial stages, the issue of the control office seemed to create a fertile ground for cooperation between the Trondheim club and the Kristiania association. Harry Høst

³⁸⁰ Miro, "Mer om Kontrollkontoret", p 4.

³⁸¹ Holgersen, "Vore Opgaver", p 4.

³⁸² Flexner, "Is Social Work a Profession?", p 156.

³⁸³ Welle-Strand, *Reiseliv Og Samfunn*, pp 24.

³⁸⁴ "Klubmeddelelser", *Romilla Revue*, (September 1915), p 5.

³⁸⁵ *Ibid.*

was especially active in this work where he contributed to an exchange of ideas between the clubs, and traveled to Trondheim to give lectures to his colleagues.³⁸⁶

In conjunction with probing the enthusiasm in the advertising trade of establishing a control office, the committee established by the Trondheim club reached out to the National Association of the Business Community. The committee, also called the “control committee”, was invited to the board meeting of this association in the Fall of 1915, where two of its members presented its work and ideas for establishing an office.³⁸⁷ Confirming the willingness of the business community to cooperate and the positive feedback on the work of this committee, the Trondheim club decided to send out invitations to several institutions, requesting that they each appointed a member for a national control office committee. The National Association of the Business Community requested that Trondhjems Handelsforening (Business Association of Trondheim) appointed a member on its behalf, where B. J. Brodersen was chosen. As mentioned in Chapter 2, Brodersen was director of a successful wholesale business established in 1901, specializing in selling the coffee brand “Kronekaffe”. Millar described him as a pioneer in the field of advertising, as he had developed experience over many years and established an advertising department for his business.³⁸⁸ Brodersen was now elected chairman of the committee.³⁸⁹ The National Association of Advertisement Agencies appointed Rasmus Høydahl Ohme as their representative, while the magazine owner and printer J. Kr. Myklebust represented the interests of the press. Millar and Høst represented the Trondheim club and Kristiania association respectively, in what constituted the first national committee, with the sole purpose of establishing a control office.³⁹⁰

The national committee was consolidated during the early months of 1916. The initial task of the committee was to develop a plan for how the control office should be established. At the advertising congress the committee was given the opportunity to present their plan before many of the different and important actors of the advertising trade. The plan was based on the ideas developed by Millar and his peers in the initial discussions of the control office, with some alterations and additions. The committee had decided that the control office would not undertake

³⁸⁶ “Klubmeddelser”, *Romilla Revue*, (Januar 1916), p 6.

³⁸⁷ Knudsen, “Kontrolkontoret”, p 4.

³⁸⁸ Brodersen, “Min Reklame for “Kronekaffe””, p 6.

³⁸⁹ “Vi Har Hørt”, *Romilla Revue*, (Oktobernummer 1916), p 6.

³⁹⁰ “Rapport Fra Landskomiteen”, *Romilla Revue*, (Kongresnummer 1916) p 2.

the task of guiding the advertisers on which publications could be beneficial to their businesses, or issue recommendations on which publications the office considered favorable for advertising purposes. The office would have two main tasks. The first task was to request written accounts from the publishers of advertising ventures or their agents, stating the publication's print run, distribution, purpose, contents etc. It was the task of the director of the office to decide whether to issue identifications after having evaluated the information and controlled that the information was correct. Furthermore, the director would establish a register of advertising ventures and agents. The other task was to control if the publisher maintained the promises made. Controlling the print run and method of distribution would require cooperation with the printers and post-offices.³⁹¹ For these purposes the office would utilize the identification cards initially created by Millar. The office would leave it to the advertisers themselves or their consultants to decide, on the basis of the identifications they were presented with, if a publication was appropriate for their advertising. Finally, it was decided that the administration of the office should have representatives from the National Association of the Business Community, the Norwegian press, the National Association of Advertisement Agencies and the advertising clubs.³⁹² The thought was that, in order for the office to wield sufficient authority to generate respect and esteem for its decisions, the administration should be appointed by these "big corporations".³⁹³

The plan of the national committee was promptly adopted by the advertising congress. Further, a proposal stating that the present national committee should be augmented with "businessmen" from around the country was endorsed. The augmented committee the congress decided, should be constituted immediately as it was given the task of raising funds for and establish a control office based on the plan of the national committee. Finally, the present committee was given the task of enrolling additional members.³⁹⁴

Initially, the process of enrolling members and raising funds proved quite a challenge to the committee. Millar, Brodersen and Myklebust appealed to advertising communities outside Trondheim and Kristiania, such as Stavanger and Bergen to establish local control committees. The idea was that the elected chairmen of these committees would become members of the

³⁹¹ Ibid. p 3

³⁹² Ibid.

³⁹³ "Reklamekongressen – Og Efter", *Romilla Revue*, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 7.

³⁹⁴ Romilla, "Reklame-Kongressen", p 2.

national control committee and contribute to raise funds.³⁹⁵ The issue of raising funds in particular seemed to occupy the control committee for the next few months. In the spring of 1917, the committee held a series of meetings in Kristiania. As mentioned in Chapter 2, one of the purposes of the meeting was to gain the support of the Advertising Association of Kristiania to raise funds, where Millar proposed that the board of the association should work as a “fund-raising committee”. This proposal never materialized because of the difficult times the association was facing. The apparent indifference in advertising communities around the country, to support the forthcoming control office might underline the effects of the boom period. If the boom period made advertising people in the capital indifferent to non-profitable organizational work, this could certainly also have been the case for advertising people around the country. Difficulties in gaining support for and the eventual failure of the control office, might be partly explained by a disinterestedness among advertising people to establish mechanisms of trust and introduce a form of trade ethics in such a chaotic time. In any event, the series of meetings in Kristiania proved fruitful for the control committee. Present at these meetings was the secretary of the National Association of the Business Community, Curt Selmer.³⁹⁶ It is likely that through discussions, Selmer and the control committee came to an understanding and agreement that, the secretariat of the National Association of the Business Community would function as the administration of the control office.

Shortly after these meetings, the control committee sent the association a formal letter where it was suggested that the secretariat of the association would take charge of the control office so long as the control committee would see to the initial organization of the office and secure its economic basis for the first five years. The control committee was convinced that it was sufficient to secure the operation of the office for the initial five years, because by this time the government would have realized the importance of the matter and thus contribute with funding. This underlines the ambition of state intervention in the advertising trade. Although advertising pioneers did not seem interested in governmental regulation, many seemed discontented with the passive stance of the government.³⁹⁷ This attitude might be seen as an ambition, if not toward legal licensure, than at least of obtaining some governmental backing. Appealing to the government for support in protecting the area of work, are seen as typical traits of

³⁹⁵ “Klubmeddelelser”, *Romilla Revue*, (Oktobernummer 1916), p 3.

³⁹⁶ Munthe-Kaas, *Reklameforeningen*, p 120.

³⁹⁷ Editorial, *Romilla Revue*, (Februar 1918), p 1.

professionalization in Wilensky's "The Professionalization of Everyone?" and Barber's "Some Problems in the Sociology of the Professions". Further, the committee had made a few additions to the original plan of a control office. They proposed that the National Association of the Business Community appointed members to a committee of advertising experts to advise the office and possibly function as a court of appeal in case of protests from publishers. Finally, the letter stated that the committee considered this association the *only* authority appropriate to perform control because its decision would always be unbiased and blameless.³⁹⁸

Kontrollkontoret for Reklame or the Control office for Advertising was established on October 25, 1917. In addition to Curt Selmer and the remaining secretariat of the association, Millar was appointed to manage the office, which was located in the Kristiania Stock Exchange.³⁹⁹ The Control office was short-lived. Selmer was very active in the initial period of service, but after the association was reorganized and Selmer resigned, there was seemingly little interest within the association to keep the office operative. The association was reorganized in October 1919 to attain more political power. This was a result of the war experience where governmental intervention in the economy increased, which implied a new form of competition between state and private commerce. Increased governmental intervention also implied that the function of the association became superfluous and decreased its authority, which prompted the members to reorganize it.⁴⁰⁰ Exactly when the Control office was closed is difficult to find proof of, but it must have been sometime between the reorganization in October 1919 and Selmer's resignation in June 1920. Still it is unclear exactly why the association abandoned the Control office. Judging from later accounts, given for example by Myklebust and Johannes Knudsen, the faith of the office seems like a painful and embarrassing topic, which might explain why they say little about its lifespan.⁴⁰¹ Even so, the Norwegian advertising pioneers did not abandon the idea. Trondhjems Reklameforening or The Trondheim Advertising Association (the successor of the Trondheim club) managed to establish a local control office in 1931 in cooperation with the Business Association of Trondheim and Trondhjems Haandverk og Industriforening (Craft and Industrial Union of Trondheim).⁴⁰² In an article in *Dagsposten* from 1934, then chairman of the

³⁹⁸ Knudsen, "Kontrollkontoret", p 4-5.

³⁹⁹ "Kontrollkontoret", *Romilla Revue*, (Novembernummer 1917), p 7.

⁴⁰⁰ Hodne, *God Handel*, p 123.

⁴⁰¹ Myklebust, "Gamle Minner", p 6.

⁴⁰² Rode, "Trondhjems Reklameforening Gjennem 20 år", p 1.

Trondheim Advertising Association F. W. Rode, stated that such offices had been established in several other cities and that Oslo was awaiting a solution. Exactly which cities, the author says nothing of.⁴⁰³

Are there examples of similar institutions within the history of Norwegian industry and commerce? The professionalization of Norwegian accountants provide certain similarities. This process roughly also coincides with the period when the control office was established. At the beginning of the 20th century accountancy was an area of work connected with dubious practices and treated with skepticism by public authorities and parts of the business community, especially shareholders. The activity of auditing accounts did not require any education or authorization.⁴⁰⁴ In 1910 a new law was passed which decreed all stock companies to hire independent accountants, in order to counteract economic fraud connected to the establishment and operation of stock companies. In connection to this, the Kristiania Chamber of Commerce and practicing accountants agreed on and arranged for an organized authorization. To become an accountant authorized by the Stock Exchange, five years of practice as an accountant and an examination became a requirement. The case of the accountants is similar to the case of the Control office, in the way that an institution of the business community took responsibility for counteracting fraud and introducing authorization to work in an area of industry and commerce. Both institutions were also located and connected to the Kristiania Stock Exchange. Respectively, these institutions would contribute to raise the standard of practice among accountants and ideally among advertising agents. As the authorization of accountants was significant for the professionalization of this group, the control office also supported the professionalization of the advertising trade. Finally, the willingness of the business community to establish both institutions can be explained by intentions to enhance trust within the area of commerce.⁴⁰⁵

Conclusion

The idea of establishing a control office grew out of the necessity to control fraudulent ventures and agents and thus establish a system of licensing for *one* area of the advertising trade. Even so, Millar envisaged a more extensive control of advertising practitioners, towards which the control

⁴⁰³ Ibid. p 10.

⁴⁰⁴ Gulbrandsen, "Revisorene", pp 476.

Bjørsvik, Nilsen, *Norges Handelshøyskole i 75 år*, p 163.

⁴⁰⁵ Gulbrandsen, "Revisorene", p 472.

office was a first step. As it became evident that a control office would probably be established, Millar started discussing the need to control other areas of the advertising trade as well. He called for the need to control the future advertising consultants and advertising teachers and wondered if these should also be licensed.⁴⁰⁶ Whether this was to be a task of the control office is unclear. Millar gave the instruction committee and the consultant committee of the Trondheim club the task of clarifying if and how these practitioners should be licensed.⁴⁰⁷ Geoffrey Millerson described it as a characteristic of professional organizations to endeavor to control the entry to a profession. In our case, Millar's effort and ideas display ambitions of controlling the entry into the broader advertising trade. Regarding licensing in empirical studies of professionalization, it is usually seen as the effort of one occupational group to gain a state licensure, which gives this group jurisdiction over a work area and excludes other competing groups.⁴⁰⁸ For Millar the goal of licensing was first of all to exclude incompetent agents from the advertising trade, thus ensuring professional conduct in this area. At the same time licensing would contribute to reform the practice of many agents. Millar's ideal control office might thus also be compared to a qualifying association in *function*, as it would both qualify and advance the technique through licensing. However, the membership would be different as it did in fact not consist of any representatives from the advertising agents. It was also an institution independent of the advertising clubs.

Millar did at one point express the thought that identification or licensing would function together with education to limit the entry to work in the advertising trade. At this point Millar might have been influenced by the professionalization effort in the U.S where reformers sought to combine education with licensing to limit the entry to the "advertising profession".⁴⁰⁹ Millar hoped that when education was established, it would then be possible to demand that those who wanted to work or in the advertising line of business, produced documentation that they had knowledge of the trade. Seemingly, this not only applied to those who wanted to establish advertising ventures or work as advertising agents, but to any advertising practitioner. This also

⁴⁰⁶ Millar, "Den Nye Reklamebevægelse", (Klubnummer 1917), p 2.

⁴⁰⁷ Millar, "En Reklameklubs Opgaver", p 4.

⁴⁰⁸ See for example Wilensky, "The Professionalization of Everyone?", p 145.

⁴⁰⁹ Even though U.S reformers talked of "limiting the entry to the advertising profession", it was not a closed profession at the time, nor is it today. Although a committee was established for this purpose, I have not found evidence of what this committee was able to achieve, nor if any limiting function was successfully enforced. See Schultze, "'An Honorable Place'", pp 22.

underlines that Millar had ambitions of a more extensive control with different advertising practitioners such as the forthcoming consultants.⁴¹⁰ In any event, the control office was potentially an ideal institution for professionalizing the advertising trade. At the same time it could contribute to develop the need for advertising consultants. By ensuring the honesty of ventures and agents, advertisers would be inclined to receive these agents. At the same time they would require expert assistance to evaluate the offers, or at least Millar would attempt to persuade them of this. Looking at Millar's ambitions it is evident that he wanted to create a connection between the advertising agents and consultants, as part of his project to reinvent the advertising trade.

Establishing a control office was a project around which, Millar could gather powerful members of his advertising class and to a certain extent create a cooperation between them. Especially important was the cooperation of the business community. The National Association of the Business Community proved well disposed towards the idea. This was a part of their own ambition to gain more control over actors in the broader field of commerce.⁴¹¹ Given the support and cooperation by different and powerful actors of the advertising trade, the sudden demise of the office was unexpected. What caused this? First, an apparent problem was that no advertising agents were represented. This implied that a significant group of practitioners would be controlled by a small group external to their ranks. This can explain why advertising agents wanted to establish their own association. Although several agents allegedly approved of the idea and thought it was a much needed initiative, many probably also found it undemocratic. The fact that the government did not sanction the office could also have been because they saw it as such. This would have been crucial for the existence of the office. If it had become a governmental institution or at least received government funding it might have been kept in operation. But, during the boom period such measures were probably the least of the government's concern. The same might be said about the National Association of the Business Community after it was reorganized. At this point this association was occupied with tasks important to their own trade, such as counteracting new laws of commerce, tax politics, and governmental trading which competed with the private trading they represented.⁴¹² At that time the association did probably not have the time to worry about impeding fraudulent advertising agents. The effects of the War

⁴¹⁰ Miro, "Bør Ikke Reklamenæringen Beskyttes?", p 4.

⁴¹¹ Hodne, *God Handel*, pp 123.

⁴¹² *Ibid.* p 92, 123-126.

thus indirectly contributed to the failure of the control office, as this was seemingly a result of the association's reorganization. As the association was in many aspects in opposition to the state, any effort to cooperate with or gain government backing for the control office would also be out of the question.⁴¹³

Introducing licensing must also be seen as an effort to establish a more ethical conduct within the advertising trade and establish trust in advertising agents. As the practices of fraudulent agents gave the advertising trade a bad reputation in general, impeding these would create trust and build legitimacy for the advertising trade as a whole. Although many actors from advertising and business communities gave moral support for the idea, material support seemed to be lacking when it came to actually establishing the office. Many probably saw it as a futile attempt to counteract fraudulent agents and introduce a more ethical practice in a period characterized by a "decay of the spiritual and moral habitus of the people".⁴¹⁴ The indifference to business ethics brought about by the boom period, which Per Vogt portrayed, might also be a reason why the control office was unsuccessful. There was not enough interest in such work and probably little confidence in ethics among advertising communities in this period. The failure to establish local control committees and gain more interest in the cause on a nation-wide basis might also have been fatal, as professionalization must necessarily happen on a national level. The concept of a control office thus failed to pass the critical, or perhaps in our case failed to convince the *uncritical* mass.

⁴¹³ Ibid. pp 116.

⁴¹⁴ Vogt, *Jerntid og Jobbetid*, p 211.

Conclusion

Introduction

The purpose of this thesis has been to analyze how advertising pioneers endeavored to professionalize the Norwegian advertising trade in the years 1914-1918. This was a highly active period in terms of organizing and exchange of ideas between various actors of the advertising trade, much at the behest of Robert Millar. Through organizing, the advertising pioneers made several achievements during this period. Even though the professionalization continued from the beginning of the 1920s, much of the groundwork was laid between 1914-1918, and so much was achieved that it is possible to talk about phases of a professionalization process within this short period. By analyzing the ideas and intentions of the advertising pioneers and further how these ideas were converted into actions, in the light of professional theory and a socio-economic historical context, I have made several interesting findings. These findings contribute with new insights in the history of professions and knowledge of professionalization processes, and depict an interesting historical phenomenon in social and economic history.

As mentioned in the Introduction chapter, the fact that the period was highly active has affected the methodology and delimitation of my thesis, and this thesis thus contributes to highlight exactly how important this short period was for the further development of the Norwegian advertising trade.

To conclude my thesis I will bring together my findings with the research questions I started out with. First, I will go through the phases of the professionalization process and its underlying ideas and intentions. Then, I will summarize the ideas for how and the argumentation for why advertising consultants should be developed, and explain how the two concepts of professionalization were connected. I will also discuss my findings against the theory of professionalization. An interesting question is also why the professionalization process in some ways abruptly ended after 1918.

The professionalization of the advertising trade in Norway has similarities with similar developments in other countries and professionalization processes of other occupational groups, but also display some unique features. In fact, the professionalization effort of the Norwegian advertising pioneers is essentially different from existing theories of professionalization because of its dual character.

The Phases of Professionalization

The first phase of the professionalization was the founding of *Romilla Revue*. Although the establishment of professional journals has usually not been emphasized as a characteristic in empirical studies, it has been fundamental in the professionalization of several occupational groups such as accountants and librarians.⁴¹⁵ What triggered the establishment of *Romilla Revue* was Millar's critical article on the newspapers' neglect of advertising. As the newspaper *Verdens Gang* refused to print his article, Millar established his own journal. There were also several other reasons why Millar wanted to establish a professional journal for advertising. First of all, Millar got the idea from reading American and British advertising journals, where he discovered how journals were employed to legitimate advertising and spread knowledge. Through *Romilla Revue* Millar realized that he could disseminate new knowledge on advertising, share his experience as an expert and express his views on how the trade should function. Further, he would use the journal to advocate "expert-advertising" and argue for the need to establish advertising consultants. Several other advertising pioneers also wrote articles and shared their knowledge and expertise in the journal. This included newspapermen, advertising managers of major companies and also wholesalers and retailers. The journal was a medium where Norwegian pioneers could exchange knowledge and ideas, advocate and legitimate the cause of advertising and discuss how the advertising trade could be reformed. The journal was directed at the newspapers and advertisers. Millar argued that the newspapers should reorganize and become more effective platforms of communication.

Furthermore, the journal was meant as a base of knowledge, where advertising practitioners, but especially advertisers could find useful advice on how to advertise. Millar worked to convince businesses and especially wholesalers to show more interest in advertising and employ methods such as advertising campaigns. Many wholesalers were pioneers in the area of advertising, where they had built up substantial expertise through years of experience. The journal was a publication in which Millar could introduce ethical guidelines and persuade advertising practitioners and advertisers to adhere to an informal ethical code, by connecting

⁴¹⁵ Bjørsvik, Nilsen, *Norges Handelshøyskole i 75 år*, p 163.
Ansteinsson, "Norsk Bibliotekforening gjennom 25 år", pp 5.

advertising with Christian principles. The connection between advertising and Christianity was one way of introducing ethical thinking to the advertising trade. There are also other examples that might be seen as ethical reflections within the discourse of the pioneers. We can say that *Romilla Revue* was both a base of knowledge and an ethical guidebook.

The first advertising clubs grew out of *Romilla Revue* as Millar employed the journal to propagandize the need to establish clubs or associations. The establishment of the first advertising clubs and the beginning of the club-movement signifies the most important phase of the professionalization. There were some different intentions between the first two advertising clubs. Foreign influence was important for how clubs were established. The Norwegian pioneers were inspired by American and British ideas of professional advertising associations. However, the Norwegian pioneers had their own intentions for the function of these clubs. Millar envisaged small discussion clubs around the country where the different representatives of his advertising class were represented, as exemplified by the Trondheim club. Unlike some professional associations, the advertising clubs consisted of members from different occupational groups, and were cross-occupational organizations. By gathering the different actors of the advertising trade in discussion clubs, it would be possible to exchange ideas and establish a better cooperation between actors. As Millar stated, it was necessary for the different actors of the advertising trade to get a better understanding of each other's work. By invoking what he called a class attachment, ensuring cooperation and understanding, Millar endeavored to reinvent the advertising trade and make different actors more aware that they belonged to a broad, important trade where they were dependent on each other. In reforming the advertising trade the different actors all had different parts to play. As a collective force, their task was to legitimize the function of advertising in society and raise the status of the advertising class.

As Millar had a difficult time gaining support for his views in the capital, he referred to the ethical guidelines of "Advertising and Christianity", which displays that these also applied to cooperation between the different members of the advertising trade. Consolidation in the clubs could also have been a premise for a more ethical conduct between parts of the trade with conflicting interest, and thus for developing a more effective trade. Høst's conception was essentially similar to Millar's although some of the intentions were different. Høst's intentions of immediately counteracting fraudulent advertising, might point to the fact that he was more influenced by American advertising associations such as the Associated Advertising Clubs of

America. Another sign of this was that he wanted a more forceful association directly, based on the membership of managers from different parts of the advertising trade. However, the essence was that the different parts of the advertising trade were represented, to ensure a better cooperation between these. Høst's idea of an advertising association had resemblances to Millerson's conception of a qualifying association. Although it is unclear if the Kristiania association also intended to train and educate agents, they did endeavor to contribute with establishing advertising lectures in the trading schools, which might have been a step towards this. Høst emphasized a more direct relationship between advertising clubs and newspapers and a better cooperation between the newspapers and advertisement agencies, in order to reform the advertising trade. We have seen how the association struggled to get a foothold in its establishment phase. Advertising pioneers such as Einar Munthe-Kaas, blamed this on the circumstances caused by the boom period, where many of those involved in the advertising trade cared little for unprofitable association work. However, there were probably other reasons for this, as the Trondheim club remained highly active during the period. One reason was Millar's fervor and organizational skills. Further, small discussion clubs with modest goals were probably ideal at the time, as many of the ideas of the advertising pioneers were original to the advertising trade and thus needed to be tried and discussed before realized.

Millar also displayed ambitions of a National Association to lead and organize the reform work of the New Advertising Movement. Although this idea proved too ambitious at the time, it underlines that Millar and his colleagues in Trondheim were aware that professionalization had to be achieved on a national level and that isolated local processes were insufficient. Similar to the AACA this association would work for a more truthful advertising in order to gain trust in the trade. The National Association would also organize propaganda work to promote the trade. This was done for example by emphasizing that advertising served public interest, as it contributed to material and cultural progress and the availability of goods at a lowest possible price. Persuading the public of this would be part of the effort to gain prestige and status for the trade. Propaganda would also be a means to work for a better understanding of advertising among advertisers and newspapers. The notion that advertising contributed to the progress of society was typical in the legitimization effort in the U.S and Great Britain as well. To Millar, the work for progress was also part of a religious conviction to fulfill the plan of God.

Further, ambitions of national reform led the Trondheim club to arrange the first advertising congress in Scandinavia, which represents another phase of professionalization. Here they managed to gather a substantial and versatile group of people from around the country, representing different parts of the advertising trade. Thus it was possible to discuss reform on a national scale and organize towards this cause. Regarding empirical studies of professionalization, congresses are not viewed as a phase in itself. However, congresses have been valuable in the professionalization of other occupations. As the congress contributed towards professionalizing the advertising trade and Millar viewed congresses as one of the most important institutions for reform, it should be considered as a phase in the professionalization. On the agenda of the advertising congress were the issues of advertising education and establishing a control office.

I have analyzed two of Millar's educational concepts in this thesis. Even though there is evidence of other concepts, the sources are not yielding enough to give a proper analysis of these. In any case, Millar's emphasis on the two concepts I have analyzed underlines their importance. First of all his intention was to introduce advertising lectures in the trading schools to educate the future advertisers. This was to raise the standard of practice regarding advertising work. Further it was to make advertisers aware of the importance of advertising for their businesses and that expertise was needed. In other words, the future advertisers had to be made conscious of the advertising trade and the epistemic asymmetry that existed between them and experts. Although only a few trading schools implemented advertising lectures, for which Millar developed a textbook, it seems that several trading schools were genuinely interested in the idea. If the Advertising Association of Kristiania had been more successful in its initial period and done more towards introducing advertising lectures in the well-disposed Kristiania Handelsgymnasium, this might have had important implications for the professionalization. In any event the few hours of advertising lectures given at the trading schools of Trondheim, did indicate some form of progress in the professionalization as advertising gradually gained recognition as a significant area of the business system. Millar's textbook was also an important development as it symbolized advertising as a doctrine of its own, and was a first building block for advertising education.

Apparently, Millar initially envisaged the trading schools educating advertising experts as well. The process of establishing advertising lectures in the trading schools proved slow.

Nevertheless, circumstances in the capital provided a different opportunity for Millar and his colleagues to establish an educational institution. The establishment of the Advertising School was an important phase in the professionalization process. Another professional ambition that led to the establishment of the Advertising School was the intention of developing advertising research and advertising as a “science”. With this school it was possible to build up an education of advertising experts or consultants based on scientific research, and at the same time provide the trading schools with teaching material for advertising lectures. Thus, the potential function of this school was significant, as it would both contribute to professionalize the advertising trade and prepare the professionals that would work in it. It is also possible that Millar appealed to the universities and hoped that the Advertising School could become part of a university or at least cooperate with academics from psychology and economics.

The final phase of the professionalization was defined by the establishment of the control office. Establishing a control or licensing institution was one of the first main issues of the Trondheim club, with the intention of limiting and controlling the entry to one area of the advertising trade. Regarding professionalization theories the control office is a unique feature. Not only as an institution but also because of its intended purpose where a small group from the business community would control the access of a broader group of practitioners to work in the advertising trade. Although the boom period did not cause the inflow of advertising ventures and agents, it probably contributed to it as the period left many people bankrupt from speculation. It was at the same time a period of high cost of living, and it is not unlikely that many people also sought work as advertising agents. Some were probably also spawned by the possibilities for soliciting shipping share advertisements, and then broadened their operation to include other advertisers as well. Although there were several factors contributing to the bad reputation of advertising in general, fraudulent ventures and agents was obviously one of the main factors. If the advertising trade was to be taken seriously, and for the argumentation of the advertising pioneers when advertising their own trade to be trustworthy, it was highly necessary to rid the trade of these ventures and agents. By establishing a control office, they would also show the advertising public that they were actually doing something about it.

Establishing a control office was also meant to establish trust between advertising agents and advertisers. Parts of the business community seemed quite interested in the idea. The intentions of the advertisers who took part in the professionalization was probably to secure a

safer advertising trade where they could be sure that their advertising budgets were spent effectively. For the newspapers, magazine owners and advertisement agencies the idea of licensing ventures was interesting as it would reduce competition for advertising revenue. Further, the office would have the dual function of impeding fraudulent elements from establishing within the advertising trade, but also ensure a higher standard of practice among agents in general. Thus it was also another effort of introducing ethical guidelines to the advertising trade. At this point we can ascertain that Millar sought to introduce ethical guidelines in different ways, both through *Romilla Revue* and by obligating agents to adhere to an ethical conduct through registering. The effort of the control office was in some ways similar to the AACA and its “Truth in Advertising” movement. However, the Norwegian pioneers did not establish a formal ethical code, perhaps because there was no national association that could work to enforce it. With the lack of a formal ethical code the professionalization differed not only from the American reform effort, but also from professionalization processes in general. Millar did also display ambitions of controlling the entry of other practitioners such as consultants and teachers. This idea might point to a characteristic of professionalizing a trade, where it is necessary to control those who work within various occupational groups constituting the trade through education, credentials and licensing.

A reason for the dramatic professionalization was that the Norwegian advertising trade developed in a less “organic” way than say, the American. In the U.S, the advertising trade developed and professionalized over a substantial period of time starting from the middle of the 19th century, in accordance with and driven by changing market circumstances.⁴¹⁶ The Norwegian advertising trade was in many aspects lagging behind the development in the U.S. Yet, Norwegian advertising pioneers and especially Millar received much influence and conceptual basis’ from the U.S and Great Britain, which they sought to introduce to and impose on Norwegian circumstances. In other words, what in the U.S had taken several decades to develop, Norwegian advertising pioneers sought to implement more or less directly. This explains to some extent why Millar and his peers were met with significant opposition in their effort but also why much was achieved in a short period. Although influence from abroad was consequential, it should not be exaggerated. The Norwegian pioneers processed the influences they received and

⁴¹⁶ Laird, *Advertising Progress*, pp 182.

adapted them to Norwegian circumstances. Further, the Norwegian pioneers were mainly driven by their own intentions, which were intensified by foreign influence.

Millar played an important role in this process as it was mainly through his ideas and intentions that the professionalization was initiated. He was the main driving force in the initial period of professionalization. Millar was a highly versatile expert who had built up his expertise over time. He gained his experience from working with advertising in the tourist industry, where he also functioned as an advertising agent and learned about the important function of advertising in publications. He became advertising manager of Nordenfjeldske Dampskibsselskab or NFDS, where he could discharge his talent and gain substantial experience in managing the advertising for a major company, which implied a broader contact and cooperation with the different parts of the advertising trade. As one of a few Norwegian companies, NFDS had established their own advertising department. Millar thus discovered the importance of a separate advertising department in companies. It was through his position in NFDS he got in touch with advertising knowledge and developments in the U.S and Great Britain. He became very interested in how advertising experts and the advertising trade functioned in these prominent countries. Combined, his experience and influence gave him an idea of how the advertising trade was supposed to function. This idea gave him the intentions of reforming the Norwegian advertising trade to become his ideal of an advertising trade.

Even though Millar's ideas and intentions dominated much of the reform discourse, it is important to take into account the ideas and intentions of the other Norwegian advertising pioneers like Harry Høst, Johannes Knudsen, H. Scheibler, Rasmus Høydahl Ohme and B. J. Brodersen, especially considering the versatility of these actors as they represented different parts of the advertising trade. Although they worked towards a common goal, the newspapermen, advertisers, trading school directors, advertisement agencies, advertising experts and the tourist industry had different intentions for taking part in professionalizing the advertising trade as well as similar ones.

Advertising consultants

Millar was a self-made advertising expert. It was probably on the basis of his own experience and skills combined with models from abroad, that he developed the idea of advertising experts or consultants. At the same time he might have been influenced by developments in a period of

professionalization. He often referred to lawyers and architects as model professions. These professions began organizing shortly before the turn of the 20th century.⁴¹⁷ It is therefore not unlikely that Millar was inspired by the effort of other occupational groups to reach professional status. The discussion around the concept of advertising consultants clearly signifies that, especially Millar but probably also several of his colleagues, had an apparent understanding of which the traditional professions were and why they enjoyed a privileged status in society. As Millar was convinced of the important function of advertising in society and that working with advertising required special skills and vocation, he envisaged the development of advertising experts with status as a profession. According to Millar, the service an advertising consultant offered and the function of this profession was as important as that of doctors, dentists, priests, lawyers and architects.

An interesting question is how Millar envisaged advertising consultants gaining control or jurisdiction over an area of work and why this was unsuccessful. Like other professions at the time the consultants would offer their services in a free market. Thus it would be important to ensure that the consultants were the only occupation who were allowed to offer such services and further that advertisers would have to seek out an advertising consultant for planning their advertising. Because Millar says little on this matter in the sources this is of course speculative. Millar did not seem interested in any governmental control or state licensing to become a consultant. In many cases he seemed reluctant to appeal to the government for assistance in the general reform work. Millar did discuss a control of those who were to work as consultants but did not elaborate on how they were to be controlled. It is not unlikely that he envisaged a private institution such as the control office for this purpose, where a certain education offered for example by the Advertising School was necessary to become a licensed consultant. This can to some extent be compared to the case of Norwegian architects in the same period. The title of the architect was not protected by law, which implied that practically anyone could establish as an architect. Norske Arkitekters Forbund (Norwegian Architect Association) was established to attain legal protection of the title. Until this was achieved however, the association demanded a certain education and practice to become a member. This would guarantee that architects in the association were properly qualified, but still did not impede others from this area of work.⁴¹⁸ As

⁴¹⁷ Myhre, "The Middle Classes of Norway, 1840-1940", p 132.

⁴¹⁸ Skogheim, "Arkitektene: Autonome kunstnere og byggherrenes tjenere", p 90.

there was definitely a potential market for the services of advertising consultants, the failure to secure jurisdiction was perhaps because of the failure to establish and maintain an institution for control. Even if Millar had appealed to the government to introduce state licensing, the government in this period did not seem very interested in the area of advertising.

The concept of advertising consultants might be original regarding advertising history. In the U.S for example, advertising professionals developed inside the advertising agencies or as in-house experts for major companies. Norwegian pioneers were also aware of this practice and Harry Høst argued for the development of advertising experts inside the advertisement agencies. However, Millar envisaged the consultants as an independent group of professionals, who were not attached to any single advertisement agency or company, but were available for any company or advertiser to hire. As mentioned, wholesalers and retailers dominated the Norwegian market. Few of these had the ability or insight to establish their own advertising departments, according to several advertising pioneers. This might have been another reason why Millar saw the need for consultants to whom the wholesalers could turn. A definitive challenge was of course that the advertising consultant was an imagined profession, and that the professionals had to be created before they could claim their professional status. This problematic and seemingly arduous course of professionalization brings us to what I deem the main find of my thesis.

Dual professionalization

The professionalization of the Norwegian advertising trade was a dual effort where the professionalization of the trade as a whole was a premise for the professionalization of advertising consultants.

In order to develop the advertising consultants, Millar and his colleagues were very much dependent on the cooperation of the advertisers who were also the potential clients. *Romilla Revue* was directed mainly at advertising practitioners and advertisers or “the advertising public” as Millar also called them. Articles with appeals to the advertisers, in particular the wholesalers, to hire advertising experts permeated the journal. The journal thus had the function of both convincing advertisers to hire consultants and provide them with insight on modern advertising doctrines. As we have seen, the journal was also a means in the effort to lecture the advertisers in advertising. Together with introducing advertising lectures in the trading schools, these were means to make the advertisers conscious of advertising as a significant area of the business

system, and further that it was an area requiring expertise. The lecturing of the advertisers was done to prepare the ground for the forthcoming consultants and establish trust in their knowledge, and at the same time create a need for these consultants. Exactly how these consultants were to be developed remains unclear. Millar might have realized early in the process that educating consultants in the trading schools was not realistic. Millar's colleague Johannes Knudsen also expressed that it was important to incorporate the concept of consultants among the business community, possibly before an effort to establish education was initiated. Millar probably intended for the Advertising School to occupy this function eventually. However, the capacity of the school remained too small to educate full time consultants.

The advertising clubs also had several functions as a premise for the establishment of advertising consultants. First of all, by consolidating the different actors of the advertising trade and establishing a better cooperation between these, the advertising trade would become an effective and crystalized area of work, within which the advertising consultant would have a meaningful position. Further, as the club would have both advertisers and advertising experts or consultants as members, they were arenas where trust between these two groups, in other words between expert and client, could be established. Included in the effort of establishing trust was the conviction that the experts worked in the service of the client and for the client's benefit. We can say that, together with lecturing the advertisers, consolidation in the clubs where means to negotiate an area of work for advertising experts and consultants. Millar also envisaged that a National Association would work to establish and educate the consultants and at the same time persuade the advertisers to hire them. Both local clubs and the National Association Millar imagined, would endeavor to raise the status of his advertising class. Raising the status of the advertising trade as a whole and ridding it of dubious connotations, was perhaps a premise for an advertising consultant to be taken seriously and attain professional status.

Finally, Millar conceived that, as the control office contributed to reform the practice of advertising agents and created trust between these and the advertisers, it would also necessitate the position of the consultant. The advertisers would open their businesses to advertising agents but would not have the time nor ability to evaluate the offers themselves. Therefore, Millar envisioned that they would hire advertising consultants to make sure their advertising budgets were utilized effectively.

The end of the first professionalization process

Several incidents in the period 1918-1919 marks the end of what I have seen as the initial professionalization of the Norwegian advertising trade. But why did it end in this rather abrupt fashion? In Chapter 3 I briefly discussed Munthe-Kaas' argument that, after a period of high activity where the Advertising School had been established and the Government loan campaign had been implemented, a period of low activity came as a necessary reaction. Looking back at the Government loan campaign in 1955, Millar explained that the campaign was so time consuming that he had to suspend *Romilla Revue*.⁴¹⁹ The campaign was perhaps a blessing and a misfortune at the same time for the advertising trade. Even though it certainly proved the worth of advertising to the public and public authorities, it came at the cost of a valuable medium. The Norwegian advertising trade would not have a similar journal until the establishment of *Propaganda* in 1922, also an initiative of Millar. This journal would become much more influential and extensive than its predecessor, as it was published on a monthly basis until 1960. Most likely, the control office also ended at some point in 1919, under curious circumstances. As discussed in Chapter 4, the business community might have seen it as too undemocratic and the concept failed to convince the critical mass. Even though these incidents indicate a more or less concrete end of the initial professionalization, there were also important continuous developments. The advertising clubs remained active together with the Advertising School. These institutions would keep developing and become important building blocks for the next phase of professionalization from the beginning of the 1920s.

Reflections on future research possibilities

This thesis focuses on an important yet relatively narrow period of Norwegian advertising history. It thus functions as a valuable basis for research on subsequent periods, especially how the Norwegian advertising trade developed in the interwar years. The interwar years contain some excellent sources with the extensive journal *Propaganda*, founded by the Advertising Association of Kristiania. Millar also developed a public relations theory which he published in his books *The Uncharted Amazon* in 1924 and *Training the Pilot* from 1925. In the 1930s the radio was introduced to the Norwegian society, which implied an unprecedented media for advertising. This is just to mention a few interesting topics.

⁴¹⁹ Solberg, *Historien om Robert Millar*, p 45.

Regarding my period of research, a broader comparative study with professionalization efforts by advertising reformers in other countries could be an interesting approach. A closer look at developments in for example Great Britain and especially Germany, another country where advertising was very advanced compared to Norwegian circumstances could be fruitful.

From a history of the professions point of view, it would be interesting to look for similar occurrences of dual professionalization or examples where reformers endeavor to professionalize a broader trade.

Sources and Bibliography

Sources

Journals and newspapers

Dagsposten, 1934.

Norske Intelligenssedler, 1917.

Romilla Revue, 1914-1918.

Verdens Gang, 1919.

Books, brochures and other printed sources

Dalseg, Trygve. *Fra Markskrigeri til Markedsføring: Et reklamehistorisk tilbakeblikk*, Oslo: Oslo Salgs –og Reklameforening, 1965.

———. *RRF-50 år, IFM-25 år: Registrerte reklamebyråers forening 1933-1983, Instituttet for markedsføring 1958-1983*, Oslo: Foreningen, 1983.

Fox, Stephen. *The Mirror Makers: A History of American Advertising and its Creators*, New York: William Morrow and Co. Inc, 1984.

Hess, Herbert W. "History and the present status of the "Truth-in-Advertising" Movement as Carried on by the Vigilance Committee of the Associated Advertising Clubs of the World", *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, Vol 101, (May 1922), pp 211-220.

Laird, Pamela Walker. *Advertising Progress: American Business and the rise of Consumer Marketing*, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1998.

Lien, Bertil. *Den Moderne reklamen i Norden startet i Trondheim : med en irsk prest*, Trondheim: Bennett Reklamebyrå, 1998.

Munthe-Kaas, Einar. *Reklameforeningen i Oslo gjennom 25 år*, Oslo: Foreningen, 1940.

Myhre, Jan Eivind. "“Mellomklassens fremstød”": Middeklassen I norsk samfunnsformasjon og kultur ca. 1870-1940 i et internasjonalt perspektiv", *Dugnad*, Nr 1, 1994. pp 43-63.

Myrvang, Christine. *Temmet eller Uhemmet: Historiske Analyser på Konsum, Kultur og Dannelse*, Oslo: Pax Forlag, 2004.

Romilla. *Lærebok i Reklame*, Trondheim: Aktietrykkeriet, 1916.

Schultze, Quentin J. “”An Honorable Place”: The Quest for Professional Advertising Education”, *The Business History Review*, Vol 56, No 1, (Spring 1982), pp 16-32.

———. “Professionalism in Advertising: The Origin of Ethical Codes”, *Journal of Communication*, Vol 31, Nr 2, (June 1981), pp 64-70.

Skretting, Kathrine. “Ikke bare Reklame”, 25.11.-29.12.1989 : *utstilling i Nordenfjeldske kunstindustrimuseum i anledning Trondheim markedsforenings 75-årsjubileum*, Trondheim: Trondheim Markedsforening, 1989.

Steen, Martin. Olsen, Børge. *75 år 25 Oktober 1993: Glimt fra en historie: Fra Reklame til Markedsføring*, Oslo: Norges Markedshøyskole, 1993.

Vogt, Per. *Jerntid og Jobbetid: En Skildring av Norge Under Verdenskrigen*, Oslo: Johan Grundt Tanum, 1938.

Manuscripts

Solberg, Svein Linge, *Historien om Robert Millar og Markedsføringsfaget i Norden*. Trondheim: Bertil Lien, 2013.

Bibliography

Journal and newspapersarticles

Adeler, Alf. “Er Reklame en Parasit?”, *Romila Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 2, (Februar 1915), p 2.

Barber, Bernard. “Some Problems in the Sociology of professions”, *Daedalus*, Vol 92, Nr 4, (Fall, 1963), p 669-688.

Berg, Sverre. “Lundgreens Enke’s Reklame”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 6, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 4.

- Brodersen, B. J. "Min Reklame for "Kronekaffe"", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 5, (Vaarnummer Mai/Juni 1916), p 6.
- Drastrup, Hr. "Kontrolkontorsaken set fra dansk standpunkt", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 5, (Kontrolkontornummer 1917), p 3.
- Eni. "Reklame-konsulenter", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 8, (August 1915), pp 6-7.
- En Annoncebureauemand. "Hvad Læserne Mener", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 1, (Programnummer 1917), p 4.
- Flexner, Abraham. "Is Social Work a Profession?" *Research on Social Work Practice*, Vol 11, Nr 2, (March 2001), pp 152-165.
- Holgensen, Kjøpmand. "Vore Opgaver", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 12, (December 1915), p 4.
- Høst, Harry. "Hvad Vi Arbejder For". *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 9, (September 1915), pp 6-7.
- Høydahl Ohme, Direktør. "Kontrolkontoret For Reklameforetagender", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 8, (August 1915), p 7.
- Jewell, H. J. "Om Reklame", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 4, (April 1915), pp 2-3.
- . "Om reklameklubber", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 4, (April 1915), p 6.
- Karlsen, K.O. "Et aars reklame for "Nidar"", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 11, (November 1915), p 5.
- Kimi. Editorial, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 3, (Mars 1915), p 2.
- . "Kimis brev", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 6, (Juni 1915), p 2.
- . Editorial, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 2, (Paaskenummer 1917), p 2.
- . "Kimi's Drøm Nr 2", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 5, Nr 2, (Mars 1918), p 1.
- Kinnear, Serviss. "Reklame og Kristendom", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 1 (Januar 1915), pp 3-5.
- Knudsen, Johannes. "Hvad Vi Vil", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 3, (Mars 1916), pp 2-3.
- . "Kontrolkontoret For Annonceforetagender", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 7, (Høstnummer 1916), pp 4-5.

- . “Kontrolkontoret”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 5, (Kontrolkontornummer 1917), pp 4-5.
- Meyer, Ludvig. “Réclame”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 10, (Oktober 1915), p 3.
- Millar, Robert. ”Reklame og Reklamens Mænd: Hvorfor er standsfølelsen så liten hos Norske Reklamefolk?”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 1, Nr 1, (Oktober 1914), p 6.
- . Editorial, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 4, (April 1915), p 2.
- . “Reklameklubber og Reklameopgaver”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 4, (April 1915), bilag.
- . “Den Nye Reklamebevægelse”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 8, (Oktobernummer 1916), p 4-5.
- . “Salgsmetoder og Salgslære”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 3, (Salgslærenummer 1917), pp 4-7
- . “Den Nye Reklamebevægelse”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 4, (Klubnummer 1917), pp 2-3.
- . “En Reklameklubs Opgaver”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 4, (Klubnummer 1917), pp 4-5.
- . “Salgsmetoder og Salgslære”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 5, (Kontrolkontornummer 1917), p 2.
- . “De Nærmeste Opgaver”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 5, Nr 1, (Februar 1918), p 4.
- . ”Reformer på Reklamens område”, *Verdens Gang*, Vol 52, Nr 261, 18.11. 1919, p 1.
- Miro. “Reklameforetagender og Annoncesamlere”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 2, (Februar 1915), pp 6-7.
- . “Bør Ikke Reklamenæringen Beskyttes”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 7, (Juli 1915), pp 4-5.
- . “Mer om Kontrolkontoret”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 8, (August 1915), pp 4-5.
- . ”Reklameforetagender – Og Holde Øie Med Dem”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 4, (April 1916), p 6.
- . “Verdiløse Og Verdifulle Annoncetilbud”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 6, (Novemberrnummer 1917), p 2.
- Myklebust, J. Kr. “Gamle Minner”, *Dagsposten*, Vol 58, Nr 276, 24.11.1934, p 6.

- Parsons, Talcott. "Professions", *The International Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences*, Vol 11, (1968) pp 536-547.
- Pope, Daniel. "The Advertising Industry and World War 1", *The Public Historian*, Vol 2, Nr 3, (Spring, 1980), pp 4-25.
- Riis, Asbjørn. "En Glasmesters Reklame", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 1, (Programnummer 1917), p 6.
- Rode, F. W. "Trondhjems Reklameforening Gjennem 20 år", *Dagsposten*, Vol 58, Nr 276, 24.11. 1934, p 1.
- Romilla. "Den bedste reklame og hvad den er", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 1, Nr 1, (Oktober 1914), p 2.
- . "En Reklamedebat", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 1, Nr 1, (Oktober 1914), pp 3-7.
- . "Reklamestandens Opgaver", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 1, Nr 3, (December 1914), pp 4-5.
- . "Den Lokale Reklamemand", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 3, (Januar 1915), p 2.
- . "Manden som kommer", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 1, (Januar 1915), p 6.
- . "Knut Framgaards Avis", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 2, (Februar 1915), p 4.
- . "Reklame-Lære", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 5, (Mai 1915), pp 2-3.
- . "Et Reklame-Felttog", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 5, (Mai 1915), pp 4-5.
- . "Reklamens Mænd i Samarbeide", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 5, (Mai 1915), p 6.
- . "Går vi Fremad", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 6 (Juni 1915), p 6.
- . "Hvad Aaret Har Bragt", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 9, (September 1915) p 2.
- . "Resultater og Hvordan Man Kan Måle Dem", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 4, (April 1916), p 4.
- . "Tegninger og Plakater", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 5, (Vaarnummer Mai/Juni 1916), p 4.
- . "Reklame-Kongressen", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 7, (Høstnummer 1916), p 2.
- . "En Reklamemand med Bran(d)chekundskap", *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 8 (Oktobernummer 1916), p 2.

———. “Vor Programtale”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 1, (Programnummer 1917), pp 2-3.

———. “Salg og Videnskab”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 3, (Salgslærenummer 1917), pp 2-3.

R.-R.s Redaktion. “R.-R.s Sakkyndige Reklameraad”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 3 (Mars 1915), p 5.

Schioldborg, C. G. “Vore Opgaver”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 2, (December 1915), p 4.

Schwarzkopf, Stefan. “What Was Advertising? The Invention, Rise, Demise, and Disappearance of Advertising Concepts in Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Europe and America”, *Business and Economic History On-Line*, Vol. 7, (2009), pp 1-27.

Wilensky, Harold L. “The Professionalization of Everyone?”, *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol 70, Nr 2, (September 1964), pp 137-158.

Journal and newspaper articles without author

“De Nærmeste Opgaver”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 5, Nr 1, (Februar 1918), p 4.

Editorial. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 4, (April 1915), p 2.

———. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 5, (Mai 1915), p 1.

———. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 7, (Juli 1915), p 1.

———. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 5, Nr 2, (Februar 1916), p 2.

———. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 6, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 2.

———. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 5, Nr 1, (Februar 1918), pp 1-2.

“Hvordan Vi Kan Hjælpe Hverandre”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 7, (Juli 1915), p 6.

“Klubmeddelelser”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 1, (Januar 1915), p 6.

———. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 5, (Mai 1915), p 7.

———. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 6, (Juni 1915), p 7.

———. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 9, (September 1915), p 5.

———. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 1, (Januar 1916), p 6.

- . *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 2, (Februar 1916), p 7.
- . *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 3, (Mars 1916), p 6.
- . *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 8, (Oktobernummer 1916), p 7.
- . *Romilla Revue*, Vol 5, Nr 3, (April 1918), p 2.
- “Kontrolkontoret”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 6, (Novemhernummer 1917), pp 4-5.
- . *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 6, (Novemhernummer 1917), p 7.
- “Kontrolkontoret for Reklameforetagender”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 8, (August 1915), p 7.
- “Landsforeningen”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 6, (Kongresnummer 1916), pp 4-5.
- “Nærværende Nummer”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 1, Nr 1, (Oktober 1914), p 6.
- “Politiet Og Kontrolkontoret”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 4, Nr 5, (Kontrolkontornummer 1917), p 6.
- “Rapport Fra Landskomiteen; Til Utredning av Spørsmålet; “Oprettelse av et kontrolkontor for annonseforetagender””. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 6, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 2.
- “Reklame i Praxis”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 11, (November 1915), p 7.
- “Reklame-klubber”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 1, Nr 2, (November 1914), p 6.
- “Reklamekongressen”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 5, (Vaarnummer Mai/Juni 1916), p 7.
- “Reklamekongressen – Og Efter”, *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 6, (Kongresnummer 1916), p 7.
- “Reklamelære”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 7, (Høstnummer 1916), p 3.
- “Reklamens Mænd Og Deres Samarbeide”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 1, Nr 3, (December 1914), p 6.
- “Reklameskolen”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 5, Nr 4, (April 1918), p 3.
- “Reklameskolen i kommende aar”. *Verdens Gang*, Nr 261, 18.11.1919, p 5.
- “Reklameundervisning”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 7, (Juli 1915), p 7.
- . *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 7, (Høstnummer 1916), p 5.

“Romilla Revue’s arbeidsprogram”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 7, (Høstnummer 1916), p 5.

“Vi Har Hørt”. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 5, (Mai 1915), p 7.

———. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 2, Nr 8, (August 1915), p 3.

———. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 3, Nr 8, (Oktobernummer 1916), p 6.

———. *Romilla Revue*, Vol 5, Nr 1, (Februar 1918), p 4.

Books and brochures

Abbott, Andrew. *The System of Professions: An Essay on the Division of Expert Labor*, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1988.

Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, London: Benedict Anderson, 1983.

Bjørsvik, Elisabeth. Nilsen, Yngve. *Norges Handelshøyskole i 75 år: «En læreanstalt av høieste rang»*, Bergen: Fagbokforlaget Vigmostad og Bjørke AS, 2011.

Brandal, Nikolai. Brazier, Eirik C. Teige, Ola. *De Ukjente Krigerne: Nordmenn i Første Verdenskrig*, Oslo: Humanist Forlag, 2014.

Cunningham, Stanley B. *The Idea of Propaganda: A Reconstruction*, Westport: Stanley B. Cunningham, 2002.

Dansk Reklame-Forening og Nordisk Reklamekongress, *Nordisk Reklamekongress i København 1931: foredrag, plakater, resolutioner, billeder*, København, 1931.

Habermas, Jürgen. *Borgerlig Offentlighet –Dens Fremvekst og Forfall: Henimot en teori om det borgerlige samfunn*, translation by Elling Schwabe-Hansen, Helge Høibraaten, Jon Øien, Oslo: Gyldendal, 1971.

Hodne, Fritz. *God Handel: Norges Handelsstands Forbund Gjennom 100 År*, Oslo: Fritz Hodne, 1989.

Hughes, Everett C. *The Sociological Eye: Selected Papers*, New Jersey: Transaction Inc., (1971) 1984.

Johnson, Terence J. *Professions And Power*, London: Macmillan, 1972.

Kjeldstadli, Knut. *Fortida er ikke hva den en gang var: En innføring i historiefaget*, Oslo: Universitetsforlaget, 1992.

Larson, Magali Sarfatti. *The Rise of Professionalism: Monopolies of Competence and Sheltered Markets*, New Brunswick: Transaction Publishers, 2013.

Millerson, Geoffrey. *The Qualifying Associations: A Study in Professionalization*, New York: The Humanities Press, 1964.

Myrvang, Christine. *Forbruksagentene*, Oslo: Pax Forlag, 2009.

Molander, Anders. Terum, Lars Inge. *Profesjonstudier*, ed. Anders Molander, Lars Inge Terum, Oslo: Universitetsforlaget, 2008.

Romilla. *Lærebok i Reklame*, Trondheim: Aktietrykkeriet, 1916.

Scott, Walter Dill. *The Psychology of Advertising: In Theory and Practice*. Boston: Small, Maynard & Co, 1902.

Slagstad, Rune, Messel Jan. *Profesjonshistorier*, ed. Rune Slagstad, Jan Messel, Oslo: Pax Forlag, 2014.

Welle-Strand, Erling. *Reiseliv Og Samfunn: Landslaget for Reiselivet i Norge 1903-1978*, Oslo: Notrabooks, 1978.

Part of publication

Ansteinsson, John. "Norsk Bibliotekforening gjennom 25 år.", in *Norsk Bibliotekforening: Jubileumsskrift, 1913-1938*, ed. John Ansteinsson, Arne Kildal, Nancy Kobro, Oslo: J. M. Stenersens Forlag, 1938.

Berghoff, Hartmut. Scranton, Philip. Spiekermann, Uwe. "The Origins of Marketing and Market Research: Information, Institutions, and Markets", in *The Rise of Marketing and Market Research*, ed. Hartmut Berghoff, Philip Scranton, Uwe Spiekermann, New York: German Historical Institute, 2012.

Fauske, Halvor. "Profesjonsforskningens faser og stridsspørsmål", in *Profesjonstudier*, ed. Anders Molander, Lars Inge Terum, Oslo: Universitetsforlaget, 2008.

Grimen, Harald. "Profesjon og tillit", in *Profesjonsstudier*, ed. Anders Molander, Lars Inge Terum, Oslo: Universitetsforlaget, 2008.

Gulbrandsen, Trygve. "Revisorene", in *Profesjonshistorier*, ed. Rune Slagstad, Jan Messel, Oslo: Pax Forlag, 2014.

Messel, Jan. "Sosialarbeiderne", in *Profesjonshistorier*, ed. Rune Slagstad, Jan Messel, Oslo: Pax Forlag, 2014.

Molander, Anders. Terum, Lars Inge. "Profesjonsstudier – en introduksjon", in *Profesjonsstudier*, ed. Anders Molander, Lars Inge Terum, Oslo: Universitetsforlaget, 2008.

Myhre, Jan Eivind. "The Middle Classes of Norway, 1840-1940", *The Scandinavian Middle Classes*, ed. Tom Ericsson, Jørgen Fink, Jan Eivind Myhre, Oslo: Unipub Forlag, 2004.

Siegrist, Hannes. "Professionalization as a process: patterns, progression and discontinuity", in *Professions in Theory and History: Rethinking the Study of the Professions*, ed. Michael Burrage, Rolf Torstendahl, London: SCASSS, 1990.

Skogheim, Ragnhild. "Arkitektene: Autonome kunstnere og byggherrenes tjenere", in *Profesjonshistorier*, ed. Rune Slagstad, Jan Messel, Oslo: Pax Forlag, 2014.

Webpages

Markedsforbundet, "Om Markedsforbundet", <http://markedsforbundet.no/om-oss/>, found 30.9.2014.

Markedsforbundet, "Lokalforeninger", <http://markedsforbundet.no/lokalforeninger/>, found 30.9.2014.

Bennett Reklamebyrå, <http://www.bennett.no/>, found 3.10.2014.

Kreativt Forum, <http://kreativtforum.no/>, found 3.10.2014.

Knut Kristian Hauger, <http://kampanje.com/archive/2011/10/try-er-norges-beste-reklamebyra/>, found 3.10.2014.

BI Handelshøyskolen, <http://www.bi.no/bachelorstudier/pr-og-markedskommunikasjon/oversikt/>, found 3.10.2014.

Hogskoleutdanning.no, <http://www.hogskoleutdanning.no/search/utdanninger?q=reklame>, found 3.10.2014.

