Child trafficking in Europe: what is the paediatrician's role?

A statement by the European Academy of Paediatrics

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

Child trafficking is among the most lucrative criminal activities in the world and growing rapidly. Poverty, natural disasters, armed conflicts and in particular migration put vulnerable children at high risk of trafficking. Accurate statistics on child trafficking are not available due to its illegal nature. Moreover, trafficking may not be consistently recorded and reported by European countries, mainly because of different perceptions as to who is considered a victim of trafficking. Around 4,000-5,000 children were identified as presumed victims of trafficking in European Union countries from 2013 to 2014; this is an underestimate of the problem since many victims go unrecognized. Trafficking is linked with issues such as forced marriage, begging, labour or domestic servitude, slavery and prostitution as well as other forms of sexual abuse such as child pornography. It may also involve the use of children as soldiers, or for criminal activities such as theft and drug smuggling, removal of organs or selling neonates, infants or children for adoption. Child victims of trafficking should be promptly identified in order to provide them with the necessary care as well as to prosecute the traffickers and stop their illegal activity. Healthcare professionals should be appropriately trained to keep a careful eye out for any hidden signs of trafficking in children. The European Academy of Paediatrics calls on our governments, intergovernmental organisations, paediatricians and healthcare professionals to collaborate so as to improve the identification and healthcare of victims and to contribute to the disbanding and prosecution of child traffickers by reporting such situations.

24

- **Keywords:** European Academy of Paediatrics; trafficking; child trafficking; migration;
- 26 health care; advocacy

Definitions and context

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

51

52

The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC)¹ (a child is defined here as a person below the age of eighteen) guarantees to "consider in all actions the best interests of the child" (Art. 3). In particular, signatory states and parties undertake to "protect the child from all forms of sexual exploitation and sexual abuse... including unlawful sexual practises" (Art. 34) and to "take all appropriate national, bilateral and multilateral measures to prevent the abduction of, the sale of or traffic in children for any purpose or in any form" (Art. 35). Among several definitions of child trafficking, the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking and the United Nations define child trafficking as the "recruitment, transfer, harbouring, and/or receipt of a child, including the exchange or transfer of control over the child, for the purpose of exploitation". ²³ There are no clear boundaries in the definitions of trafficking; in some cases they include forced labour, gender-based violence and sexual exploitation, while in others they do not. This explains the complexity of gathering uniformly accepted and valid statistical data. However, as far as health providers are concerned, such distinctions should not impact on the quality of care they provide. Child trafficking is a growing and lucrative criminal activity in many parts of the world. Several circumstances foster trafficking, such as armed conflicts, natural disasters and above all, at least within the European community, migration.⁴⁵ Unaccompanied migrant children who cross international borders are particularly defenceless while en route to, or upon arrival at, their destination.⁶⁷ Depending on the circumstances, trafficking is linked with issues such as forced marriage, begging, labour or domestic servitude, slavery, prostitution, child pornography and other forms of sexual abuse; it may also involve using children as soldiers, or for criminal activities such as theft and drug smuggling,

removal of organs, or selling neonates, infants or children for adoption.

The objective of this statement is to draw the attention of paediatricians to harmful situations which are still not well recognized, deeply violate the CRC and cause suffering as well as short and long-term harmful consequences.^{8 9}

The extent of child trafficking

Accurate statistics on child trafficking are not available because of its illegal nature. Moreover, trafficking may be inconsistently recorded and reported by European countries, mainly because of different perceptions as to who is considered a victim of trafficking. Children are trafficked across borders, but they are also trafficked within European countries for labour or domestic activities, for criminal activities and for sexual exploitation. In 2012, the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) reported that the overall number of trafficking victims may currently be as high as 20.9 million worldwide, and that the annual number of new victims was in the range of 2 to 4 million, 50% of victims being children aged from zero to eighteen. It is estimated that 76% of sexual transactions with underage girls start on the Internet, and that two million children are subjected to prostitution in the global sex trade.

According to a recent report by the European Commission,¹⁰ for the period 2013-2014, there was a total of 15 846 'registered victims' (both identified and presumed) of trafficking within the EU, of whom at least 15% were children. The top five EU countries of citizenship for registered victims in 2013-2014 were Romania, Bulgaria, the Netherlands, Hungary, and Poland. According to other sources,^{14 15} more than 5,000 children were identified as presumed victims of trafficking in EU countries between 2010 and 2012.¹⁴ They were mainly victims who were forced to carry out criminal activities, begging, drug production and benefit fraud.

Migrant children are at particular risk of becoming victims of trafficking if they are separated from their parents or if the accompanying adult is not the real parent or guardian. Unaccompanied migrating adolescents are particularly vulnerable to all forms of violence, especially sexual exploitation and rape, as they are often heavily dependent on the assistance of adults whom they meet while escaping from their country or from a life-threatening environment. Child and human trafficking in general have been proven to increase after a surge of migration. In 2015, more than 400,000 children applied for asylum in Europe, of whom two-thirds were younger than 14 years of age. In addition, a quarter of these children were unaccompanied at the time of registration. During the same year, 250 000 children were reported as missing; 2% of these were unaccompanied migrant children who had disappeared from institutional care. For example, a survey conducted in Italy in 2016 showed that 78% of children experienced trafficking conditions during their migration journey, mainly in transit countries.

Identifying victimized children and providing health care

Child victims of trafficking need to be identified promptly for two reasons. The first and most important is to protect them and to provide them with necessary care. The second reason is to enable effective prosecution of the traffickers, and thus put a stop to their illegal activities. The primary task of any healthcare provider, especially a paediatrician who suspects trafficking, is to ensure the safety of the child and initiate a thorough evaluation of the situation.

There are no conclusive symptoms that make it possible to identify children who have been trafficked. Healthcare professionals should be alerted by 'red flag' situations. Some recent publications propose short screening instruments (developed in the United

States), ^{19 20} but these tend to focus on sexual exploitation and as such may be inappropriate in certain situations or cultural contexts. Global warning signs include post-traumatic stress syndrome reactions and other mental symptoms, such as extreme anxiety or depression. Denial may also occur, especially among children who are still under the control of criminals. Young children without identification papers and accompanied by an adult, unwillingness or hesitation to answer questions, possible signs of abuse, and poor personal hygiene are other red flags which should raise suspicion. ²¹ If forced to participate in adult activities, children and adolescents may also have adopted behaviours or language unusual for their age. In addition, hypervigilance while being examined, caution or mistrust towards healthcare professionals, anxiety about sitting in a waiting room full of other people, and apprehension of medical procedures may all be signs of abuse experienced while being trafficked.

Some communication techniques may improve the trust of a child suspected of trafficking, such as sitting down with them at eye level, maintaining eye contact, and meeting immediate physical needs. In every circumstance involving adults who are not the child's parents, the child should be separated from the accompanying person when interviewed and explicitly granted privacy and confidentiality. One important issue is that of interpreting: 9 the support of a person fluent in both languages and with a good knowledge of the child's culture of origin is very helpful.

Victims of trafficking often present with somatic and mental health problems.²² These may include issues such as nutritional deficiencies, infections brought from their country of origin or contracted during a migration journey (tuberculosis, worms, etc.), dermatological problems linked with poor hygiene, sexually transmitted infections often linked with sexual abuse by people smugglers, as well as chronic headaches, sleep

dysfunction and functional disorders. Mental health conditions or sequelae such as posttraumatic stress syndrome should be evaluated and treated as well.

As with any situation involving child victims of abuse and neglect, the healthcare providers or team should report the case to the relevant authorities. The meagre available epidemiological data suggest that these situations often go unrecognized or are not officially notified. Healthcare professionals are extremely well-placed to identify and disclose cases of trafficking.

Preventing and combating child trafficking: a role for paediatricians and healthcare providers

Child trafficking can be combated by implementing several global measures, such as eliminating the root causes such as migration, armed conflicts, poverty and socioeconomic demand, recognizing and caring for vulnerable children at risk of trafficking and identifying the traffickers. This applies in particular to migrant children: the European Commission's recommendations on the protection of migrant children, ²³ as well as other publications, ⁶ highlight the need to protect migrant children against all forms of trafficking at the various stages of their migration journey, including the need to improve the identification of children after their arrival in Europe, to train personnel involved in their reception and assessment, and to ensure that children receive adequate treatment. A recent study revealed a lack of guidelines across Europe on how to handle migrant children. ²⁴ Moreover, the EU has published several documents that highlight the importance of trafficking and offer a gender-specific and victim-centred legal and policy framework for combating and preventing trafficking in human beings. ²⁵ ²⁶

Healthcare professionals should be sensitized and trained in the recognition, assessment,
care, legal considerations, and referrals to appropriate services regarding child trafficking
Trained physicians are significantly more likely to identify and refer a suspected victim.
For instance, a recent study showed that short-term training of emergency department
providers increased their self-reported recognition of trafficking victims. ^{27 28} In addition
to being able to recognize trafficking, healthcare providers should ensure that victims
receive adequate care and support, and realize that they also have a role to play as
advocates of the rights of these vulnerable children. ¹

- The EU's strategy for the eradication of human trafficking ²⁶ was developed to support the implementation of its anti-trafficking directive. Five pillars of the strategy are:
 - Building effective information gathering and implementing new intelligence sources in counter-trafficking measures and responses, including the creation of EU-wide systems for data collection
 - 2. Enhancing coordination and cooperation among key stakeholders, promoting multi-sectorial and multidisciplinary approaches, and addressing the training needs of professionals responsible for children (in addition to paediatricians, psychologists, GPs, social workers, educators, etc.)
 - Identifying, protecting and assisting victims of trafficking, with particular emphasis on protecting children who appear to be particularly liable to become victims
- 4. Improving the prosecution of traffickers and prosecuting human trafficking as a serious crime
 - 5. Advocating for the prevention of human trafficking

Interdisciplinary collaboration is the cornerstone in combating child trafficking.

Healthcare professionals seeking to report cases of child trafficking often lack the requisite knowledge of reporting procedures and relevant services available in their community. Moreover, because child trafficking is a transnational crime, its elimination requires transnational action, including effective coordination and communication between sectors and across borders. Many countries in the EU have developed or are developing policies and programmes that are directed specifically at human trafficking,²⁹ including legislative measures, coordinated anti-trafficking actions at a national level, implementation of national reporting centres, national awareness campaigns, systems for funding victims, awareness raising of professionals and so on. Some countries such as the UK report regularly on the progress that has been made.³⁰

A Call to Action

Along the lines of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child,¹ in September 2015, the world adopted the 2030 Sustainable Development Agenda, which includes a target for trafficking (Target 5.2).³¹ This goal calls for an end to trafficking and violence against children as well as to all forms of violence and exploitation regarding women and girls.

Given the paucity of valid data on the trafficking of children, the virtual absence of European scientific publications in the field and the lack of specific skills of paediatricians and healthcare professionals, the European Academy of Paediatrics (EAP) suggests, on the basis of available documents, several ways of improving the situation.^{8 9} First of all, all national and local governments should put in place a valid system for recording the name, origin and age of child victims of trafficking, and work together to create a valid database. For instance, the EU's Schengen Information System (a cross-

border database) could be especially useful as a tool for tracking down child victims. It currently contains more than 30,000 alerts on missing adults and almost 60,000 alerts on missing minors. Secondly, healthcare professionals, in particular paediatricians engaged in epidemiological and clinical research, should develop projects in the field of trafficking that tackle issues such as how to address cultural barriers and biases, how to facilitate the integration of victims into their new environment, how to address mental health sequelae of exploitation, etc. Further, large cities and paediatric hospitals should develop identification and intervention protocols in interprofessional teams, which would contribute to the acquisition of specific skills by physicians and nurses as well as psychologists, interpreters, social workers and lawyers with cross-cultural expertise. Academic centres and training institutions should include sessions in their curricula sessions that deal specifically with the issue: all paediatricians should at the very least learn how to recognize potential trafficking and how to react. In addition to their role as practitioners dealing with individual situations, paediatricians in Europe have an important role to play on a more systemic level. The EAP urges paediatric societies and national bodies as well as policy makers to put the prevention of trafficking high on their agenda.

225

226

227

228

208

209

210

211

212

213

214

215

216

217

218

219

220

221

222

223

224

Conflict of interest: Nothing to declare

229 References

- 230 1. UNICEF. Convention on the rights of the child. [United Nations; Human Rights, 231 Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights 1990.
- 232 http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/ProfessionalInterest/crc.pdf

233

234 2. Committioner UNOotH. Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in 235 Persons Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations 236 Convention against Transnational Organized Crime. 2000. New-York, 237 http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/ProfessionalInterest/ProtocolonTrafficking.pdf

238

239 3. Council of Europe. Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in 240 Human Beings. s [Council of Europe] 2005:19 pp.: Council of Europe, 241 https://rm.coe.int/168008371d

242

243 4. International Organization for Migration. Addressing human trafficking and 244 exploitation in times of crisis. Evidence and recommendations for further action to 245 protect vulnerable and mobile populations. [International Organization for Migration 246 (IOM)] 2015:51 pp. Geneva: International Organization for Migration, 247 https://publications.iom.int/books/addressing-human-trafficking-and-exploitation-248 times-crisis-evidence-and-recommendations-0

249

250 5. Goldhagen J, Kadir A, Fouad M, et al. The Budapest declaration for children and youth 251 on the move. Lancet Child & Adol Health 2018;2(March):164-65.

252

253 6. McLeigh JD. Protecting Children in the Context of International Migration: children in 254 migration require greater protection from violence, exploitation, and discrimination. 255 Child Abuse Negl 2013;37(12):1056-68.

256

257 7. Union E. Asylum and migration into the EU in 2015. Publications Office of the 258 European Union, Luxembourg. [European Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA)] 259 2016:44 pp. Luxembourg: European Union, file:///C:/Users/pmichaud/Downloads/fra-260 2016-fundamental-rights-report-2016-focus-0_en.pdf

261

262 8. UNICEF Innocenti Research Center. Child Traficking in Europe, A Broad Vision to 263 Put Children First. 2008:68 pp.: UNICEF Innocenti Research Center, 264 https://www.unicef-irc.org/publications/pdf/ct_in_europe_full.pdf

265

266 9. Zimmerman C, Centre GVH, Borland R. Caring for Trafficked Persons. Guidance for 267 Health Providers, IOM/UN.GIFT/London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, 268 Geneva. Geneva: London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, 269 http://publications.iom.int/system/files/pdf/ct_handbook.pdf

270

271 10. European Commission. Report on the progress made in the fight against trafficking in 272 human beings. [European Commission] 09.05.2018. 2016. Brussels: European 273 Commission, https://ec.europa.eu/anti-

274 trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/report_on_the_progress_made_in_the_fight_again 275 st_trafficking_in_human_beings_2016.pdf

- 277 11. Europol. Situation Report. Trafficking in human beings in the EU, Europol, . Secondary Situation Report. Trafficking in human beings in the EU, Europol, 2016. 278 279
- https://ec.europa.eu/anti-

- trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/situational_report_trafficking_in_human_beingseuropol.pdf.
- 12. Chung RJ, English A. Commercial sexual exploitation and sex trafficking of adolescents. Curr Opin Pediatr 2015;27(4):427-33.

288

294

299

302

312313

314

315

316

320

324

- 286 13. Moore JL, Kaplan DM, Barron CE. Sex Trafficking of Minors. Pediatr Clin North Am 2017;**64**(2):413-21.
- 14. Cancedda A, De Micheli B, Dimitrova D, et al. Study on high-risk groups for trafficking in human being. [European Commission] 2015:90 pp. Luxembourg:
 European Commission, https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/study_on_children_as_high_risk_groups_of_trafficking_in_human_beings_0.pdf
- 15. European Union. Trafficking in human beings.2015:142. Luxembourg: European
 Union, https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/eurostat_report_on_trafficking_in_human_beings
 298 _-_2015_edition.pdf
- 300 16. Baauw A, Ritz N. Towards better healthcare for migrant and refugee children in Europe. Eur J Pediatr 2018;**177**(2):161-62.
- 303 17. Baauw A, Rosiek S, Slattery B, et al. Pediatrician-experienced barriers in the medical
 304 care for refugee children in the Netherlands. Eur J Pediatr 2018.
 305
- 18. International Organization for Migration. 'Mixed Migration Flows in the
 Mediterranean and Beyond Analysis: Flow monitoring surveys The human
 trafficking and other exploitative practices prevalence indication survey', IOM,
 Geneva. [International Organization for Migration (IOM)] 2017:15 pp. Geneva,
 http://migration.iom.int/docs/Analysis_Flow_Monitoring_and_Human_Trafficking_S
 urveys_in_the_Mediterranean_and_Beyond_26_April_2017.pdf
 - 19. Armstrong S. Instruments to Identify Commercially Sexually Exploited Children: Feasibility of Use in an Emergency Department Setting. Pediatr Emerg Care 2017;**33**(12):794-99.
- 20. Greenbaum VJ, Dodd M, McCracken C. A Short Screening Tool to Identify Victims
 of Child Sex Trafficking in the Health Care Setting. Pediatr Emerg Care
 2018;34(1):33-37.
- 321 21. Shandro J, Chisolm-Straker M, Duber HC, et al. Human Trafficking: A Guide to
 322 Identification and Approach for the Emergency Physician. Ann Emerg Med
 323 2016;68(4):501-08 e1.
- 325 22. Stanley N, Oram S, Jakobowitz S, et al. The health needs and healthcare experiences of young people trafficked into the UK. Child Abuse Negl 2016;**59**:100-10.
- 23. European commission. The protection of children in migration. Secondary The protection of children in migration 2017:17 pp. Brussels: European commission, https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/what-we-
- do/policies/european-agenda-

332 migration/20170412_communication_on_the_protection_of_children_in_migration_e 333 n.pdf 334 335 24. Carrasco-Sanz A, Leiva-Gea I, Martin-Alvarez L, et al. Migrant children's health 336 problems, care needs, and inequalities: European primary care paediatricians' 337 perspective. Child Care Health Dev 2017 338 339 25. European Union. Directive 2011/36/EU of the European Parliament and of the 340 Council of 5 April 2011 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and 341 protecting its victims, and replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/629/JHA. 342 Strasbourg: European Union, 2011:11 pp. 343 344 26. European Commission. The EU Strategy towards the Eradication of Trafficking in 345 Human Beings 2012–2016. Secondary The EU Strategy towards the Eradication of 346 Trafficking in Human Beings 2012–2016 [European Commission] 2012:20 pp. 347 Brussels: European Commission, https://ec.europa.eu/anti-348 trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/the_eu_strategy_towards_the_eradication_of_traff 349 icking_in_human_beings_2012-2016_1.pdf 350 351 27. Beck ME, Lineer MM, Melzer-Lange M, et al. Medical providers' understanding of 352 sex trafficking and their experience with at-risk patients. Pediatrics 2015;135(4):e895-353 902. 354 355 28. Grace AM, Lippert S, Collins K, et al. Educating health care professionals on human 356 trafficking. Pediatr Emerg Care 2014;30(12):856-61. 357 358 29. European Commission. TOGETHER AGAINST TRAFFICKING IN HUMAN 359 Brussels: European Commission., 2018. 360 361 30. Gravett B. Countering Human Trafficking: The UK's Efforts. Secondary Countering Human Trafficking: The UK's Efforts 2015:44 pp.: Geneva Centre for the 362 363 Democratic Control of Armed Forces, 364 https://www.dcaf.ch/sites/default/files/publications/documents/1511DCAF-MSS-365 GravettTHB-UK.pdf

31. United Nations General Assembly. Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for

Sustainable Development. 25 09 2015 ed. New-York: United Nations General

366367

368

369

370

Assembly, 2015:35 pp.