Song and Quotation in Two-Voice Motets for Saint Elizabeth of Hungary

By Catherine A. Bradley

The polyphonic motet has long been recognized as a preeminent genre for the intertextual and quotational play that abounds not only in music of the Middle Ages, but also in the visual arts and in literary, philosophical, and theological writings.¹ Music's potential to layer different texts—allowing them to sound simultaneously—and to control their presentation in time is unique. Musical compositions can prescribe exactly the combination of several individual singing voices, specifying the moment and context in which a particular melody and its accompanying words should occur. The precision with which texts may be positioned in musical structures is exploited to the full in the motets that originated and flourished principally in thirteenth-century Paris, and which place in simultaneous dialogue up to four independent poetic and melodic lines. Individual parts within a polyphonic whole may additionally quote or allude to preexistent material (poetic or melodic or both), thereby conjuring—in the imaginations of poets, composers, singers, readers, and listeners—contextual associations external to the work in question. Scholars such as Sylvia Huot, Gerald Hoekstra, and Suzannah Clark have richly underlined the possibility of subtle meanings in motets, particularly the multilayered allegories and ironies enacted when a sacred Latin plainchant quoted or “held” in the lowest voice (the tenor) serves as a foundation for several different upper-voice French texts invoking secular song topics.² Ardis Butterfield and Jennifer Saltzstein, meanwhile, have demonstrated the remarkable potential of refrain quotations—short phrases of music and French text circulating across and within romance, chanson, and mo-

A version of this article was presented at the 2015 Annual Meeting of the Medieval Academy of America in Notre Dame. I wish to thank Elizabeth Eva Leach, Sara Lipton, and Susan Rankin, who generously offered extensive feedback on earlier drafts. I am also greatly indebted to the journal's anonymous readers for their invaluable comments and suggestions.

¹ Sylvia Huot's seminal monograph, *Allegorical Play in the Old French Motet: The Sacred and the Profane in Thirteenth-Century Polyphony* (Stanford, 1997), was instrumental in establishing the intertextual and quotational potential of thirteenth-century motets. Similar approaches to polytextuality in music of the fourteenth century were pioneered in studies by Margaret Bent, “Polyphony of Texts and Music in the Fourteenth-Century Motet: *Tribum que non abhorruit/Quoniam secta latronum/Merito hec partimur* and Its ‘Quotations,’” in *Hearing the Motet: Essays on the Motet of the Middle Ages and Renaissance*, ed. Dolores Pesce (New York, 1997), 82–103; and Anne Walters Robertson: see her *Guillaume de Machaut and Reims: Context and Meaning in His Musical Works* (Cambridge, UK, 2002), esp. 79–186. The current article draws methodologically on these and related studies.

² Huot, *Allegorical Play in the Old French Motet*; Gerald Hoekstra, “The French Motet as Trope: Multiple Levels of Meaning in *Quant florist la violete/El mois de mai/Et gaudebit*,” *Speculum* 73/1 (1998): 32–57; and Suzannah Clark, “‘S'en dirai chançonete’: Hearing Text and Music in a Medieval Motet,” *Plainsong and Medieval Music* 16/1 (2007): 31–59.

tet repertoires—to evoke and connect their various host genres.³ Fused with liturgical plainchant, the upper-voice love songs of vernacular motets often had sacred (typically Marian) resonances, and their composition and performance seems principally to have been the preserve of well-educated clerics.⁴ Yet although medieval evidence concerning the function of motets is sparse, it is improbable that French-texted pieces were sung within the Divine Office or Mass, and it seems that they were instead intended for informal devotional or festive environments.⁵ Thirteenth-century motets themselves and their contexts of creation and use therefore powerfully reflect complex interactions between sacred and secular spheres in medieval culture more broadly.

Unsurprisingly, interpretative close readings of motets have been focused almost exclusively on the three- or four-part polytextual pieces that offer the most spectacular opportunities for multivocal combination. But the sheer number of texts and voices in such polytextual motets threatens their aural comprehensibility in performance. In consequence, the validity of imbuing motets with semantic significance has come under attack, most notably by Christopher Page: the sonic effects of three- and four-voice motets and questions as to what extent meanings can be understood by a listener continue to be debated in literary and musicological studies.⁶ However, one particular type of motet presents no such problem. This is the two-voice motet, which combines a single texted upper voice—where each syllable of text corresponds to just one note (or a few short notes) of melody—with a melismatic tenor chant, which sustains one prolonged syllable of text for many notes. Despite the emphasis on polytextuality in current scholarship, two-voice motets in fact comprise nearly half of the extant thirteenth-century motet corpus.⁷ This article aims to redirect attention towards these little studied two-voice pieces, thereby setting questions of text interpretation deliberately apart from those of audibility, in the

³ See Ardis Butterfield, *Poetry and Music in Medieval France: From Jean Renart to Guillaume de Machaut* (Cambridge, UK, 2002), esp. 75–102; and Jennifer Saltzstein, *The Refrain and the Rise of the Vernacular in Medieval French Music and Poetry* (Cambridge, UK, 2013).

⁴ On Marian symbolism in motets, see the recent study by David J. Rothenberg in *The Flower of Paradise: Marian Devotion and Secular Song in Medieval and Renaissance Music* (New York, 2011). On contexts and personnel for the composition and performance of thirteenth-century polyphony, see Christopher Page, *The Owl and the Nightingale: Musical Life and Ideas in France 1100–1300* (London, 1989), 134–54.

⁵ On medieval evidence (and the lack of it) concerning performance contexts for motets, see Mark Everist's summary in "The Thirteenth Century," in *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Music*, ed. Mark Everist (Cambridge, UK, 2011), 67–86, at 85. Emma Dillon demonstrates a devotional function for certain vernacular motets: see *The Sense of Sound: Musical Meaning in France, 1260–1330*, *The New Cultural History of Music* (Oxford, 2012), 287–328. Festive aspects of vernacular motets are illuminated by Christopher Page: see *Discarding Images: Reflections on Music and Culture in Medieval France* (Oxford, 1993), 43–64.

⁶ See Page, *Discarding Images*, 65–111, and Page's later development of these arguments in "Around the Performance of a Thirteenth-Century Motet," *Early Music* 28/3 (2000): 343–57. See Clark's summary of the debate and response to Page in "S'en dirai chançonete," 31–35, where she demonstrates ways in which meanings may be made audible in a four-voice motet. By contrast, Dillon's recent monograph, *The Sense of Sound*, broadly accepts Page's hypothesis that precise semantic signification dissolves in the sonic experience of a polytextual motet.

⁷ See my analysis of the proportion of two-voice versus polytextual thirteenth-century motets in Catherine A. Bradley, "Seeking the Sense of Sound," *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 139/2 (2014): 405–20, at 407–8.

analysis of a newly identified quotational network of monophonic melodies and two-voice vernacular motets associated with Saint Elizabeth of Hungary.⁸

Canonized in 1235, Elizabeth of Hungary was venerated throughout late medieval Europe.⁹ As a female, lay, married, and noble saint, she blended multiple identities, and much has been written about her life, in recent as well as in medieval times. Yet Elizabeth's status as the focus of a pair of thirteenth-century two-voice motets—which combine liturgical plainchant borrowed from an Office for the saint with a single upper voice in the vernacular—is highly unusual and has not been closely investigated.¹⁰ This article explores reasons why Elizabeth of Hungary received special musical treatment in the thirteenth century, revealing ways in which musical compositions engaged with and reflected aspects of her biography and identity.

Motet tenors were almost invariably selected from a well-established plainchant stock of widely disseminated liturgical melodies that had a history of polyphonic treatment. It was a recognizably special circumstance that two thirteenth-century motets should take as their plainchant foundation an obscure and localized melody accompanied by the text *DECANTATUR*, drawn from the earliest Office specially created for Saint Elizabeth at Cambrai in Northern France.¹¹ In both motets, this unconventional *DECANTATUR* tenor—a passive form of the verb *decantare*, to sing, chant, or recite—supports a French-texted upper voice in the courtly love-song idiom, concluding with a refrain quotation. Vernacular motets typically addressed themselves to female subjects, either a noble lady in a love song or a shepherdess in a *pastourelle*.¹² But although there was considerable slippage between the languages of earthly and heavenly love (especially pertaining to the Virgin Mary), any specific or close engagement with the life of a particular saint was otherwise very rare.¹³ Remarkably, the first of the motet texts on the *DECANTATUR* tenor,

⁸ Two recent interpretative discussions of two-voice motets by Edward H. Roesner and Sean Curran are notable exceptions. See Edward H. Roesner, “*Subtilitas and Delectatio: Ne m’a pas oublié*,” in *Cultural Performances in Medieval France: Essays in Honor of Nancy Freeman Regalado*, ed. Eglal Doss-Quinby, Roberta L. Krueger, and E. Jane Burns (Cambridge, UK, 2007): 25–43; and Sean Curran, “Feeling the Polemic of an Early Motet,” in *Polemic: Language as Violence in Medieval and Early Modern Discourse*, ed. Almut Suerbaum, George Southcombe, and Benjamin Thompson (Farnham, UK, 2015): 65–94.

⁹ See, for instance, Dieter Blume and Matthias Werner, eds., *Elisabeth von Thüringen: Eine europäische Heilige; Aufsätze* (Saint Petersburg, 2007); and Christa Bertelsmeier-Kierst, ed., *Elisabeth von Thüringen und die neue Frömmigkeit in Europa* (Frankfurt, 2008).

¹⁰ Hagiographical aspects of the Elizabeth motet *Un chant renvoisie/DECANTATUR* were probed by Mark Everist in 1994 before the plainchant source of the *DECANTATUR* tenor from an Office for Saint Elizabeth was known: see his *French Motets in the Thirteenth Century: Music, Poetry and Genre* (Cambridge, UK, 1994), 137–38. Barbara Haggh-Huglo was the first to identify the motet tenor in *Un chant renvoisie*, a discovery that has facilitated the current article: see Barbara Haggh, ed., *Two Offices for Saint Elizabeth of Hungary: “Gaudeat Hungaria” and “Letare Germania”* (Ottawa, 1995), xv.

¹¹ See the complete edition of and introduction to this Office—*Gaudeat Hungaria, jubilet Thuringia*—and the later *Letare Germania* Office for Elizabeth by Haggh, *Two Offices for Saint Elizabeth of Hungary*, who linked the composition of this Office to Cambrai, as discussed below.

¹² On textual themes and approaches in vernacular motets, see the overview by Susan Stakel in *The Montpellier Codex*, part 4, *Texts and Translations*, ed. Joel C. Relihan and Susan Stakel, *Recent Researches in the Music of the Middle Ages and Early Renaissance* 8 (Madison, 1985), xvi–xx.

¹³ Explicit focus on a particular saint is more common in Latin than in vernacular motets, but, as discussed in more detail below, Everist identifies just one other motet in the entire thirteenth-century

Un chant renvoisie, prefaces a standard love song with an explicitly hagiographical opening in praise of Elizabeth. The second, *Amis, vostre demoree*, does not mention the saint by name: owing to a scribal misidentification of the DECANTATUR tenor in the motet's sole surviving manuscript source, *Amis, vostre demoree* has never previously been connected with Elizabeth of Hungary.¹⁴ In this context, however, it is significant that the vernacular motet text is an unusual *chanson de femme* in the female voice.

I investigate here the veneration and invocation—explicit and implicit—of Elizabeth in these two unusual motets, considering ideas of song, singing, and voice, both within the pieces themselves and in relation to the saint's identity and vita. Tracing a hitherto-unrecognized web of interrelated motets, refrains, and chansons, I demonstrate shared musical, semantic, gendered, and geographical contexts that resonate strongly with those of their associated Elizabeth plainchant. I argue that the DECANTATUR tenor could function as a cue, prompting a listener, reader, singer, or composer to think not only about acts of singing and song making but summoning a specifically female persona and voice, potentially bringing into play the wider content of the host plainchant responsory from which the DECANTATUR melody is just a short snippet, the broader Office of which this responsory is a part, the place—Cambrai—at which it was conceived and presumably performed, and perhaps most importantly, the life and cult of Saint Elizabeth herself.¹⁵

Methodologically, this approach owes much to the pioneering work of Huot, in particular. At the same time, it seeks to ground the study of motet texts and contexts more deeply within the domain of musical analysis, closely appraising musical details and evaluating them against wider generic and compositional conventions, as well as the particular melodic, rhythmic, and harmonic circumstances of the work in question. In the interpretation of motets, musical discussion has focused predominantly on their sonic dimension, a consequence of concerns about text intelligibility. Scholars such as Clark, Lisa Colton, and Emma Dillon identify aspects of a musical setting that might depict or differentiate particular moments in its accompanying text, considering their effects on the listener's ear.¹⁶ The sounding charac-

repertoire that could be described as hagiographical: see his *French Motets in the Thirteenth Century*, 135–38.

¹⁴ The tenor of *Amis, vostre demoree* was mislabeled as PRO PATRIBUS in Montpellier, Bibliothèque interuniversitaire, Section de médecine, MS H. 196. Hendrik van der Werf first noted that this tenor melody was identical with the DECANTATUR tenor in *Un chant renvoisie* in his *Integrated Directory of Organa, Clausulae, and Motets of the Thirteenth Century* (Rochester, NY, 1989), 135. When the plainchant source of the DECANTATUR melisma was later identified by Haggh-Huglo in 1995, however, she remained unaware of the additional appearance of this melody in *Amis, vostre demoree*. In their edition of the text *Amis, vostre demoree*, Eglal Doss-Quinby, Joan Tasker Grimbert, Wendy Pfeffer, and Elizabeth Aubrey noted that it shared its tenor melody with *Un chant renvoisie* but did not know of Haggh-Huglo's identification of the DECANTATUR source: see their *Songs of the Women Trouvères* (New Haven, 2001), 202.

¹⁵ Recent studies by Michael Alan Anderson, in particular, have focused on the musical aspects of saints' cults. See his *St. Anne in Renaissance Music: Devotion and Politics* (Cambridge, UK, 2014), and—in the field of thirteenth-century motets—his “Fire, Foliage, and Fury: Vestiges of Midsummer Ritual in Motets for John the Baptist,” *Early Music History* 30 (2011): 1–54.

¹⁶ See Clark, “S'en dirai chançonete”; Lisa Colton, “The Articulation of Virginity in the Medieval *Chanson de nonne*,” *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 133/2 (2008): 159–88; and Dillon, *The Sense of Sound*.

teristics of motets are not neglected in this article: I pinpoint, for instance, characteristics and circumstances that might heighten the aural recognition of a musical or textual phrase as a quotation borrowed from another work. Yet analytical engagement serves also as a vital means to test and establish relationships within and between works and, significantly, to judge the chronological direction of quotations. It is hoped that the results of such close musical engagement—illuminating thirteenth-century interactions between clerical and lay cultures, practices of quotation, and conceptions of song, voice, and female sainthood—are of broader disciplinary relevance. In order to compensate for the occasionally technical nature of the discussion, as well as for the intricacy of the material itself, I offer as Figure 1 a diagram that maps and summarizes quotational relationships in the proposed intertextual network (as in a conventional stemma, height is used to indicate relative chronology).

SINGING ABOUT SONG IN THIRTEENTH-CENTURY CAMBRAI:
AN EARLY ELIZABETH OFFICE

Saint Elizabeth of Hungary (1207–31) was of royal birth, daughter of King Andrew II of Hungary, and married to Ludwig IV, landgrave of Thuringia. Following her husband's death, Elizabeth sent her children away and renounced her wealth and position in society. She cared for the sick in a hospital that she founded in Marburg, dedicated to Saint Francis, where she died aged twenty-four. The pan-European popularity of Elizabeth's cult may be explained by several aspects of her life and identity, which powerfully encapsulated new types and aspects of sainthood emerging in the late twelfth and thirteenth centuries. Perhaps most important among these is her femininity, at a time when there occurred radical changes in literacy and in formalized devotion for women, principally through the foundation of the all-female lay communities of Beguines in Northern Europe.¹⁷ Simultaneously responding to and inspiring such female devotion, there was a surge in the number of female saints between 1100 and 1400, with the percentage of women saints almost doubling in the thirteenth century.¹⁸ Like the majority of late medieval sainted women, Elizabeth was aristocratic and she was a lay woman, more unusually a married one. Her sanctity lay in the renunciation of these worldly attributes, choosing instead a life of humility and suffering. The emphasis on Elizabeth's body and physicality, her attitudes to food, to dress, and especially her desire for mortification of the flesh is typical in the lives of female saints. This bodily focus represents a tension inherent in the fact that the vitae of saints such as Elizabeth were principally stories told by men, just as sensual Marian motets were composed by clerics.¹⁹

¹⁷ See the discussion and historiographical overview of a "woman's movement" in the thirteenth century in Jocelyn Wogan-Browne and Marie-Élisabeth Henneau, "Liège, the 'Medieval Woman Question,' and the Question of Medieval Women," in *New Trends in Feminine Spirituality*, ed. Juliette Dor, Lesley Johnson, and Wogan-Browne (Turnhout, 1999), 1–32. See also Walter Simons, *Cities of Ladies: Beguine Communities in the Medieval Low Countries 1200–1565* (Philadelphia, 2001).

¹⁸ See Caroline Walker Bynum, *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (Berkeley, 1987): 13–30, esp. 20.

¹⁹ On the writing of female saints' lives by men, see John W. Coakley, *Women, Men, and Spiritual Power: Female Saints and Their Male Collaborators* (New York, 2006).

Fig. 1. Map of Intertextual Relationships in the DECANATATUR Network

Fig. 1 (Continued)

Elizabeth's spiritual confessor, Master Conrad of Marburg, who was renowned for his advocacy of physical mortification, instigated her canonization.²⁰ He at once wielded authority and power over the holy woman under his tutelage and demonstrated a fascination with her potent spirituality, stemming in large part from the "otherness" of her womanhood. Conrad's initial efforts in promoting her canonization ensured the longevity and vitality of Elizabeth's cult, which is underlined by the existence of several thirteenth-century lives in the vernacular, most notably *La vie sainte Elysabel*, in rhyming couplets, by the Parisian trouvère Rutebeuf.²¹ In addition to her shrine at Marburg, devotion to Elizabeth was strong in France, particularly in the north, and also in the neighboring Low Countries, where, upon her canonization, Elizabeth was honored as a patron saint of the Beguines.

It is therefore unsurprising that the earliest extant plainchant Office, or *Historia*, for Elizabeth emanated from northern France. More notable is the fact that this Office—*Gaudeat Hungaria, jubilet Thuringia*—seems principally to have been confined to this region. *Gaudeat Hungaria* was quickly supplanted by later alternative Offices that enjoyed a much wider dissemination: a complete copy of *Gaudeat Hungaria* with musical notation survives only in a single antiphoner from Cambrai, dated to the 1290s (Cambrai, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 38). Barbara Haggh-Huglo has uncovered remarkable evidence in the contemporary writings of the monk Henry of Brussels that securely links the conception of this Office specifically to Cambrai, even identifying its creators by name. Henry of Brussels stated that Brother Gerard, monk of Saint-Quentin-en-Isle near Cambrai, "composed elegantly worded antiphons and responsories" to be sung on Elizabeth's feast day (November 17), while "neumas [i.e., melodies] were joined to the same antiphons and responsories" by Peter, canon of Saint-Aubert of Cambrai.²²

The composition of Elizabeth's first Office for use at Cambrai seems particularly appropriate. Elizabeth's heart was sent there as a relic, while her skull went further south to Besançon. *Gaudeat Hungaria* is recorded with melodies only in the Cambrai antiphoner, but the text of this Office circulates without musical notation in three additional sources, one of which is a fifteenth-century breviary from Besançon (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS lat. 10487). The two remaining text-only records of the Office are also chronologically later than the Cambrai antiphoner, and they stem from places without such an explicit Elizabeth connection: a fourteenth-century breviary from Mons (Douai, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 146)

²⁰ Conrad addressed a *Summa vitae* to Pope Gregory IX in 1232. See the translation in Kenneth Baxter Wolf, *The Life and Afterlife of Saint Elizabeth of Hungary: A Testimony from Her Canonization Hearings* (Oxford, 2010), 91–95.

²¹ See the edition of Rutebeuf's *Vie* and of his Latin models in Edmond Faral and Julia Bastin, eds., *Ceuvres complètes de Rutebeuf*, 2 vols. (Paris, 1960), 2:60–166. A translation of Elizabeth's canonization documents is available in Wolf, *The Life and Afterlife*, 83–216. Portions of Rutebeuf's *Vie* and two further vernacular lives of Saint Elizabeth—one from Cambigneul, near Arras—are translated in Brigitte Cazelles, *The Lady as Saint: A Collection of French Hagiographic Romances of the Thirteenth Century* (Philadelphia, 1991), 151–71.

²² I quote Haggh-Huglo's translation, Haggh, *Two Offices for Saint Elizabeth of Hungary*, xiv. Haggh-Huglo suggests that the "neumas" mentioned here refer, in the more specific sense of the term, to extended concluding melismas (like that on *DECANTATUR*), which were occasionally furnished with syllabic texts (or prosulae): see *ibid.*, xvi.

and a Franciscan breviary from Rouen dated to 1412 (Baltimore, Walters Art Museum, MS W 300).²³ Nonetheless, the northern French and Flemish provenance of the manuscripts, copied outside Paris and in relative proximity to Cambrai, might explain the presence of *Gaudeat Hungaria* in these breviaries, further strengthening the geographical identity of this Office as a particular manifestation of Elizabeth's cult.

The fifth matins responsory of the *Gaudeat Hungaria* Office, *Ante dies exitus*, is the source of the polyphonic tenor quotation, DECANTATUR (see Example 1).²⁴ The significance of a long and florid "sung" melody accompanied by this text could not have been lost on medieval composers, and the tenor's host responsory more broadly exhibits a preoccupation with ideas of song and singing (see Table 1).²⁵ *Ante dies exitus* focuses on a notably musical miracle that reportedly occurred on Elizabeth's deathbed, the singing of a bird that the saint joined in song.²⁶ This moment is described in detail in Rutebeuf's *Vie*,²⁷ which itself is closely modeled on the earlier account of the occurrence in the Latin deposition of 1235, *Dicta quatuor ancillarum*, offered by four of Elizabeth's female companions for the process of her canonization:

When my lady blessed Elizabeth lay on her deathbed, I heard the sweetest voice, which seemed to come from within her sweet neck as she lay facing the wall. After an hour she turned and said to me: "Where are you my beloved?" I responded: "Here I am" and then I added: "Oh my lady! You were singing so sweetly!" She asked me if I had heard the singing and I said that I had. She said: "I tell you, a little bird situated between me and the wall was singing most joyfully to me. Inspired by its voice, it seemed fitting for me to sing along." This happened only a few days before her death.²⁸

Although at some chronological and geographical distance, the rhymed text of *Ante dies exitus* accurately reflects the content of this official report, details that may also have been known to Brother Gerard (the creator of its text) through Rutebeuf's vernacular paraphrase. Gerard's responsory describes how, before the day of her death, a bird sang from Elizabeth's throat, producing a seemingly hybrid voice, described both as "dulce" (sweet) and "modula" (suggesting something like musical, melodic, or modulated).²⁹ The word DECANTATUR—the crucial verb, which later became a self-sufficient melodic unit in its own right—falls at an important structural moment in its host responsory: it marks the close of the opening section

²³ The sources of *Gaudeat Hungaria* are listed in Clemens Blume and Guido M. Dreves, eds., *Historiae rhythmicae: Liturgische Reimofficien des Mittelalters, Fünfte Folge*, *Analecta Hymnica* 25 (Leipzig, 1897), 263. I thank Lynley Herbert of the Walters Art Museum for her help in identifying MS W 300 as the 1412 breviary listed in a private collection by Blume and Dreves.

²⁴ This example is reproduced from Haggh-Huglo's edition, Haggh, *Two Offices for Saint Elizabeth of Hungary*, 13. Slurs indicate ligatures and liquescents are shown by joined pitches.

²⁵ I thank Henry Parkes and Eleanor Giraud for their assistance with the translation in Table 1.

²⁶ See Elizabeth Eva Leach, *Sung Birds: Music, Nature, and Poetry in the Later Middle Ages* (Ithaca, 2007) for a study of relationships between birdsong and medieval music.

²⁷ Faral and Bastin, *Œuvres complètes de Rutebeuf*, 2:160, lines 1979–94.

²⁸ Wolf, *The Life and Afterlife*, 214–15.

²⁹ The precise meaning of the term is unclear, but see the entries for "modula" and its derivatives in Michael Bernhard, ed., *Lexicon musicum latinum medii aevi*, available online at <http://www.lml.badw.de/lmlonline/index.htm>.

R. An - te di - es ex - i - tus ei - us col - lo ce - li - tus

a - vis mo - du - la - tur. * A qua vo - ce mo - du - la dul - ce cum a - vi - cu - la

me - los de - can - ta - tur.

V. lam vi - ci - no trans - i - tu pro - phe - ta - li spi - ri - tu E - ly - za - beth do - na - tur.

Example 1. Responsory *Ante dies exitus* from *Gaudeat Hungaria* Office

TABLE 1
Text and Translation of *Ante dies exitus*

<i>Respond</i>	
Ante dies exitus	Before the day of her departure
eius collo celitus	from her throat
avis modulatur.	a bird sings divinely.
A qua voce modula	By which musical voice
dulce cum avicula	with the little bird
melos decantatur.	a sweet melody is sung.
<i>Verse</i>	
Iam vicino transitu	With her passing already approaching,
prophetali spiritu	with the breath of the prophets
Elyzabeth donatur.	Elizabeth is given up.

(the respond), a juncture at which an extended musical elaboration is conventional. The extended melisma on the penultimate syllable of DECANTATUR, however, is noticeably more expansive than any other moment in *Ante dies exitus*, or indeed, as Haggh-Huglo noted, within the entire *Gaudeat Hungaria* Office.³⁰ This reflects the explicitly musical nature of the DECANTATUR text, as does the character of the melisma itself, which is strikingly lyrical, initially playing with trios of pitches that explore the interval of a third. It is significant also that this DECANTATUR melody expands and elaborates musical material that was previously heard in conjunction with the words “a qua voce modula” (marked by a dashed box in Example 1). The two portions of this chant pertaining most directly to voice and song, therefore, receive similar and highly songlike settings. The effect of musical repetition at DECANTATUR underlines a listener’s consciousness of the act of singing further still, so that this long and lyrical melisma constitutes a direct musical expression of its text.

THE HAGIOGRAPHICAL MOTET *UN CHANT RENVOISIE/DECANTATUR* IN CONTEXT

Despite the limited transmission for the earliest Saint Elizabeth Office as a whole, the most overtly and elaborately musical responsory, *Ante dies exitus*, had a continued and independent existence. Haggh-Huglo discovered the music and text of this responsory in a sixteenth-century processional from Bruges (Brussels, Bibliothèque royale, MS IV 210), a source used by the Beguines.³¹ This is the only musical concordance for any complete chant from the *Gaudeat Hungaria* Office outside of the Cambrai antiphoner. That said, the *Ante dies exitus* responsory appears in the Bruges processional not in the context of *Gaudeat Hungaria* but alongside two antiphons for Elizabeth from the later and more popular Office, *Letare Germania*.

Just as *Ante dies exitus* was excerpted from its host Office in the Bruges processional, so the melisma accompanying the final syllables “-tatur” of DECANTATUR (marked by a box in Example 1) was in turn excerpted from this host responsory

³⁰ Haggh, ed., *Two Offices for Saint Elizabeth of Hungary*, xv.

³¹ Barbara Haggh, “The Beguines of Bruges and the Procession of the Holy Blood,” in *Uno gentile et subtile ingenio: Essays in Honour of Bonnie J. Blackburn*, ed. M. Jennifer Bloxham, Gioia Filocamo, and Leo Franc Holford-Strevens (Turnhout, 2009): 75–85, at 78–79.

as an independent tenor quotation in the motet repertoire. The selection of this particular tenor is unconventional in three principal respects. First, and as noted above, it stems from a narrowly disseminated and specialized saint's Office, rather than one of the standard and well-known Office responsories, or Alleluia and Gradual chants for the Mass, that had served also as the basis of earlier sacred compositions. Second, polyphony in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries is usually reserved for the concluding responsories of a nocturn, the third, sixth, and ninth responsories, but never the fifth. Third, the *DECANTATUR* melisma is part of a choral portion of the respond, again breaking established liturgical conventions in earlier sacred polyphonic genres that tenors should be drawn only from the sections of plainchant sung by soloists.

Such an unusual tenor choice must have been motivated by the particular circumstances of the two-voice motet *Un chant renvoisie/DECANTATUR*, where the *DECANTATUR* melody is complemented by an upper voice, whose vernacular text in praise of Elizabeth is equally atypical in being hagiographical (see Example 2).³² This texted upper voice makes explicit reference to two events in the saint's life (see Table 2).³³ The first is another occurrence involving both song and birds that reportedly occurred just after Elizabeth's death; it is surely related to, but nonetheless distinct from, the earlier deathbed-birdsong moment described in the responsory *Ante dies exitus*.³⁴ *Un chant renvoisie* refers instead to the occasion when a large group of birds on the roof of the church in which Elizabeth's body reposed reportedly burst into song, as if performing funeral rites for her; the motet additionally mentions a posthumous triple resurrection miracle ("three are raised from the dead") that occurred at Cambrai.³⁵ *Un chant renvoisie* appears uniquely in Paris, Bibliothèque de l'Arsenal, MS 3517–3518 (in 3517 at fol. 14r, hereafter Arsenal 3517–3518), a manuscript dated to the 1270s. Arsenal 3517–3518 was long thought to have been copied in northern France and in Picardy in particular, but Alison Stones has re-

³² All motet transcriptions below are my own. Ligatures are indicated by square brackets, conjuncturae by dashed slurs; plicas are shown by a line through the stem; and original text spellings are retained. Capitalization, punctuation, and text-line numbers are editorial. Square brackets indicate editorial musical insertions. Haggh-Huglo convincingly suggested that Peter of Cambrai may have been the composer of this motet, as well as of the Office *Gaudeat Hungaria*: Henry of Brussels described him as a composer of "conductus" (*sic*), opening the possibility that Peter was skilled in polyphony as well as monophony. See Haggh, *Two Offices for Saint Elizabeth of Hungary*, xvi.

³³ I thank Huw Grange for his assistance with the transcription and translation of the text in Table 2, which is adapted from that in Everist, *French Motets in the Thirteenth Century*, 137.

³⁴ Previous discussions of this motet have understandably conflated these two miracles: see Everist, *French Motets in the Thirteenth Century*, 137; and Haggh, *Two Offices for Saint Elizabeth of Hungary*, xv. I believe that the stated time of the miracle as *after* Elizabeth's death, the use of the plural (birds), and the lack of any reference to the saint herself singing (so carefully described in the *Ante dies exitus* responsory) establish the miracle depicted in *Un chant renvoisie* as distinct from that in *Ante dies exitus*.

³⁵ This second birdsong miracle is recounted in the *Dicta quatuor ancillarum*: see Wolf, *The Life and Afterlife*, 215–16. It does not, however, appear in Rutebeuf's *Vie*. Neither does Rutebeuf (nor any of his Latin models) make specific reference to a triple resurrection at Cambrai. Yet Elizabeth was well known for resurrection miracles more generally, and Rutebeuf speaks of the many resurrections that occurred after Elizabeth's own death. See the translation in Cazelles, *The Lady as Saint*, 168, lines 2147–48.

cently proposed that it emanated instead from a more northeasterly center of manuscript production in the Artois region: perhaps from Théroutanne, Saint-Omer, or Arras.³⁶ This proximity to plainchant sources for the *Gaudeat Hungaria* Office and—particularly if Arsenal 3517–3518 was copied in Arras—to Cambrai is significant, as is the nature of Arsenal 3517–3518 itself and the position of *Un chant renvoisie* within it.

Arsenal 3517–3518, a manuscript largely devoted to vernacular poetry rather than a polyphonic *liber motetorum*, contains two clusters of polyphonic motets. Both are groups of very widely disseminated Latin Marian motets, and *Un chant renvoisie* is not among them.³⁷ Instead, this vernacular motet comes at the end of a short collection of monophonic devotional songs in French and Latin located between the Latin and the vernacular tables of contents for Gautier de Coinci's *Miracles de Nostre Dame*. This seems to confirm the place of the motet within a more popular devotional and a Marian milieu: it is vernacular hagiography of a sacred woman, of a kind steeped in the idioms of courtly love song. Like the connection between the Virgin Mary and the secular Marion, or the dual religious and courtly connotations of “dame” on which Gautier played, Elizabeth also has a worldly parallel as *Ysabelle* in motets and songs.³⁸ Elizabeth is never explicitly mentioned in Gautier's *Miracles*, but Nancy B. Black has noted that Gautier celebrated a very similar type of holy woman, one possibly even modeled on Elizabeth, in his *Noble fame de Rome* story.³⁹ In this narrative—which may have been conceived as an independent text but later circulated in the second part of the *Miracles*—Gautier's Empress is, like Elizabeth, both married and of noble birth. The Roman Empress does not simply use her wealth for the benefit of the poor but, in the emerging mode of female sainthood of which Elizabeth is a notable example, actively renounces privilege to embrace suffering in poverty.⁴⁰

As emphasized above, motets that might be described as hagiographical, those referring to specific details of a saint's life rather than simply offering directed praise or petition, are notably rare. Mark Everist has demonstrated that just one other thirteenth-century motet text, the quadruplum of *De la vierge Katherine/Quant froidure trait a fin/Agmina militiae/AGMINA*, resembles *Un chant renvoisie* in its

³⁶ See Alison Stones's appendix 4 in *Gautier de Coinci: Miracles, Music and Manuscripts*, ed. Kathy M. Krause and Alison Stones (Turnhout, 2006), 374.

³⁷ See Friedrich Ludwig's description and inventory of this source in his *Repertorium organorum recentioris et motetorum vetustissimi stili*, 2 vols. in 3, complete edition by Luther A. Dittmer (New York, 1964–78), 1.2:594–602. The first cluster of motets is apparently a later addition to Arsenal 3517–3518, inserted at the opening of the manuscript. The second group of polyphonic pieces is, however, germane to the collection, appearing in the second volume (MS lat. 1518), a continuation of the manuscript containing *Un chant renvoisie* (MS lat. 1517).

³⁸ *Ysabelle* features in the incipits of two motets, both uniquely recorded in Montpellier H. 196: *Ma loyauté m'a nusi/A la bele Yzabelot/OMNES* (fols. 225v–227r) and *Entre copin et bourgeois/Je me cuídoie/BELE YSABELOS* (fols. 277v–279r). This flexible vernacularization of Elizabeth as *Ysabelle*, rather than the more correct *Elysabel*, is not unusual. Yet it may be significant in the light of Rutebeuf's life of the saint, which was written for Queen Isabelle of Navarre and therefore encouraged a flattering conflation between the names of its subject and its dedicatee.

³⁹ See Nancy B. Black, *Medieval Narratives of Accused Queens* (Gainesville, 2003), 31. Gautier's *Noble fame de Rome* is not, however, included within the *Miracles* as recorded in Arsenal 3517–3518.

⁴⁰ See Black, *Medieval Narratives of Accused Queens*, 26.

a

1. Un chant ren-voi - sie et bel 2. di - rai de sainte Y - sa - bel 3. de cui fi - sent li oi - sel

b

4. en leur cans feste a sa mort 5. A li ser - vir mais m'a - cort 6. car - des ver - tus me re - cort

a

7. c'a Cam - brai fait de nou - vel 8. la pe - rent si biau jou - el 9. ou sont re - ve - scu troi mort.

II

Example 2. *Un chant renvoisie/DECANTATUR*, Arsenal 3517–3518, fol. 14r

40 45

10. Tort dame ai, quant vo - stre con - fort 11. re - quis - n'ai, par ma fo - li - e, 12. du mal

50 55

qui me contr-a - li - e 13. dont sans - vous ne - vi - vrai - mi - e, 14. pour che - vous re - quier et -

60 65

pri - e 15. de cuer - en - tier - et loi - al 16. Dous cuers - a - le - gies mon - mal 17. qu'i - ne m'o - chi - e.

Example 2 (Continued)

TABLE 2
Text and Translation of *Un chant renvoisie*

1. Un chant renvoisie et bel	7a -el	A merry and beautiful song
2. dirai de sainte Ysabel	7a -el	I shall sing about Saint Elizabeth
3. de cui fisent li oisel	7a -el	whom the birds celebrated
4. en lour cans feste a sa mort.	7b -ort	in their songs at her death.
5. A li servir mais m'acort	7b -ort	I accord myself to serving her henceforth
6. car des vertus me recort	7b -ort	for I recall the miracles
7. c'a Cambrai fait de nouvel	7a -el	that she performs of late in Cambrai
8. la perent si biau jouel	7a -el	there such fine treasures are on show
9. ou sont revescu troi mort.	7b -ort	where three are raised from the dead.
10. Tort dame ai, quant vostre confort	8b -ort	I am wrong, Lady, when your comfort
11. requis n'ai, par ma folie,	8c -ie	I have not requested, by my folly,
12. du mal qui me contralie	8c -ie	from the pain that afflicts me
13. dont sans vous ne vivrai mie,	8c -ie	that without you I shall never survive,
14. pour che vous requier et prie	8c -ie	and so I beg and beseech you
15. de cuer entier et loial	8d -al	wholeheartedly and loyally
16. Dous cuers alegies mon mal	7d -al	Sweet heart, ease my pain
17. qu'i ne m'ochie.	5c -ie	so that it doesn't kill me.

explicit engagement with the vita of a particular saint.⁴¹ This text for Saint Katherine also honors a female saint in the vernacular, and it is uniquely preserved in a strikingly similar source context, the so-called La Clayette manuscript, Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS nouv. acq. fr. 13521 (fol. 377r–v).⁴² *De la vierge* appears here among the collection of polyphonic motets that constitutes the codex's only musical section. La Clayette is otherwise chiefly an anthology of religious vernacular texts, containing the rhymed *Vie de sainte Catherine* as well as an incomplete copy of Gautier's *Miracles*.⁴³ Vernacular, devotional, and principally non-musical books, then, seem to have been the natural context for hagiographical motets, which enjoyed a comparatively more limited and apparently a different kind of circulation on the fringes of the polyphonic motet as a genre.

SONGS UPON AND WITHIN SONGS IN *UN CHANT RENVOISIE/DECANTATUR*

The presence of *Un chant renvoisie* in the feminine context of Gautier's *Miracles* and in Arsenal 3517–3518—a devotional manuscript produced at a time and place close to that of the Cambrai Office for Saint Elizabeth—goes some way to explaining the unprecedented appearance of the DECANTATUR melody in the context of a polyphonic motet. Nevertheless, particular characteristics of this tenor itself surely rendered it attractive to a motet creator. In addition to the lyricism of the DECANTATUR melody, this tenor quotation from the *Ante dies exitus* responsory has the

⁴¹ Everist, *French Motets in the Thirteenth Century*, 135–38.

⁴² The AGMINA motet tenor, while more widely employed than DECANTATUR, is also similarly unconventional in its musical context. AGMINA is derived from the choral portion of the responsory *Virgo flagellatur* for Saint Katherine, which does not feature in any earlier liturgical polyphony.

⁴³ See the recent study of this manuscript by Sean Paul Curran, "Vernacular Book Production, Vernacular Polyphony, and the Motets of the 'La Clayette' Manuscript (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, nouvelles acquisitions françaises, 13521)" (PhD diss., University of California, Berkeley, 2013).

very clear and conventional tonal profile desirable in a polyphonic foundation. Opening and closing with the final pitch, F, the melisma remains within an octave above this pitch, principally exploring the space between F and its cofinal C, which is clearly delineated at the outset of the melody by the rising F–A–C gesture.⁴⁴ Textually, *Un chant renvoisie* not only engages with the implied broader responsory context and connotations of the DECANTATUR melisma, but it also plays on the isolated local meaning of its tenor word.⁴⁵ This motet literally adds a song on top of a song. Now with two singing voices in polyphony, it opens self-referentially with the declaration that a “merry and beautiful song” is to be sung, additionally referring to the birdsong that had previously accompanied Elizabeth’s death. The beginning of the piece seems musically to be self-consciously songlike (see Example 2). The upper voice is initially remarkably florid—perhaps an attempt to mimic the bird-song—and the first nine lines of the text are part of a repetitive musical structure, an *aba* form (each section corresponding to a system in Example 2), where the first three lines of text are set to a melody that recurs in a decorated form for lines 7–9. This musical repetition is complemented by the poetic rhyme scheme: the *a* sections are characterized by an “-el” rhyme (labeled *a* in Table 2), while the *b* section introduces a new rhyme, “-ort,” which returns at line 9 to close the repetition of the opening *a* material.

A highly decorated upper voice featuring prominent musical and poetic repetitions creates a strong songlike identity for the opening of the motet. The *aba* structure, however, does not correspond exactly to a conventional chanson or motet form. Monophonic chansons of the troubadours and trouvères typically had, instead, a tripartite AAX, or *pedes cum cauda*, structure frequently adopted also in motets, featuring the repetition of an initial music *pes*, or foot (*A*), followed by a longer coda (*X*).⁴⁶ Yet each foot, or *A*, section was itself typically made up of two contrasting musical ideas (*a* and *b*). It is therefore probable that the beginning of *Un chant renvoisie* could have been understood as the beginning of an internal *abab* form (corresponding to the *AA* sections of a larger AAX design) but cut off before the final *b* section.⁴⁷

The resulting sense of disruption—of a conventional *abab* chanson and motet opening unexpectedly curtailed and interrupted—is strongly underlined by the status of the initial section (perfections 1–36, text lines 1–9) of *Un chant renvoisie* as a

⁴⁴ The tenor of *Un chant renvoisie* precisely matches the version of this chant in the later Cambrai antiphoner, apart from the introduction of eleven additional pitches before the final note of the melody (which are absent also in the version of this chant in the Bruges processional). It is likely that the motet creator extended the chant quotation to suit its new polyphonic context, adding a passage sympathetic to the character of the preceding melodic units. Such an extension is very unusual, but not unprecedented. See Hans Tischler, *The Style and Evolution of the Earliest Motets (to circa 1270)*, Musicological Studies 40, 4 vols. (Ottawa, 1985), 1:147, n. 18.

⁴⁵ DECANTATUR is the only tenor in the thirteenth-century motet repertoire explicitly to refer to or describe the act of singing. Before its plainchant source was identified, therefore, Everist plausibly proposed that this text might have been a simple canon: see *French Motets in the Thirteenth Century*, 138.

⁴⁶ For a study of the AAX form in song and motets, see Gaël Saint-Cricq, “A New Link Between the Motet and Trouvère Chanson: The Motet-*pedes cum cauda*,” *Early Music History* 32 (2013): 179–223.

⁴⁷ I thank the journal’s anonymous readers for suggesting this interpretation.

musical and textual entity that is curiously set apart from the rest of the piece.⁴⁸ From perfection 37 onwards, the point at which a listener might have expected the *b* material of the opening section to return, the musical idiom of the upper voice instead becomes noticeably plainer, and any large-scale formal repetition ceases. The beginning of this second section is additionally marked by an elongated first note accompanying the word “tort,” resulting in an extended five-perfection phrase that disturbs the motet’s previously regular four-perfection units, as well as the synchronization of its upper-voice and tenor phrase endings. Furthermore, a fundamental change in the underlying rhythmic pattern in the tenor at perfection 36—from three-note to seven-note groupings in the chant—straddles this formal juncture. This rhythmic alteration in the middle of a melodic statement of the DECANTATUR plainchant is both striking and atypical in a motet.⁴⁹

A musical disruption at perfection 37 is matched poetically by an abrupt shift at line 10 of the text from the very specific details of Elizabeth’s miracles to the much more generic idiom of a courtly love song. A male protagonist addresses directly a beloved (unnamed) “dame,” for the love of whom he is suffering. Like Elizabeth, she is clearly a noble lady, rather than any lowly shepherdess. New rhymes (labeled *c* and *d* in Table 2) are introduced in this new section and the regular seven-syllable lines of the motet’s opening are superseded by eight-syllable ones. Significantly, the beginning of text line 10, “Tort dame,” is also marked by a small colored initial *T* in its manuscript source, confirming its separation from the motet’s opening. Despite their stark differentiation, the two halves of the motet are undeniably part of the same piece. There are no stylistic indications that the second section represents genuinely independent musical material that was simply combined with the opening of a motet crafted specifically for the Saint Elizabeth tenor. Musically, the change in the upper voice at perfection 37 falls in the middle of a statement of the tenor quotation and exhibits none of the stylistic signs of a preexistent song or motet voice accommodated to a new plainchant context. Poetically, the different structural moments in *Un chant renvoisie* are similarly integrated by rhyme: the “-ort” rhyme at the end of the first section in line 9 is taken up in line 10, just as the internal “-al” rhyme of the motet’s concluding refrain in line 16 is prepared in line 15.

The beginning of this terminal refrain, “*Dous cuers alegies mon mall/qu’i ne m’ochie*” (van den Boogaard 623, hereafter vdB), is similarly treated to an internal colored initial in Arsenal 3517–3518.⁵⁰ This is a much more conventional scribal practice, observable also in mid-thirteenth-century song manuscripts, such as the Chansonnier de Noailles (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS fr. 12615) and the Chansonnier du Roi (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS fr. 844).

⁴⁸ The time unit of a perfection corresponds to the length of a dotted quarter in transcription.

⁴⁹ See Tischler, *The Style and Evolution of the Earliest Motets*, 1:148.

⁵⁰ The appearance of vdB 623 in *Un chant renvoisie* was not listed in Nico van den Boogaard’s catalog of refrain texts, *Rondeaux et refrains du XIIIe siècle au début du XIVe*, Bibliothèque Française et Romane, Série D: Initiation, Textes et Documents 3 (Paris, 1969), 148. It is also absent from the online database by Mark Everist and Anne Ibos-Augé, “Musique, poésie, citation: le refrain au moyen âge / Music, Poetry, Citation: The Medieval Refrain,” http://medmus.soton.ac.uk/view/abstract_item/623.html. Tischler previously noted the musical and textual concordance for vdB 623 in *Un chant renvoisie* (*The Style and Evolution of the Earliest Motets*, 2:122, no. 265), as did Everist (*French Motets in the Thirteenth Century*, 137) in a purely textual context.

It reflects—as in this case, a degree of poetic integration notwithstanding—the often musically and textually disruptive character of refrains that may serve to highlight their special status as refrains or refrain quotations. It seems possible, therefore, that the marked shift in poetic and musical voice at perfection 37, to which the manuscript scribe also drew attention, functioned in analogous fashion: the new and more generic character of this material was intended also to break the motet's narrative frame, interrupting any expectation of the *abab* form characteristic of the opening of a chanson and playing further on ideas of singing by creating the sense of different songs within a song.

A sense of disruption was surely also the intended effect of the motet's closing refrain, vdB 623, but here both a symptom and an aural signal of quotation. The final refrain couplet features a change of rhyme and shorter poetic lines, and musically it initiates a new upper-voice phrase unit of six perfections, accompanied by an interruption in the rhythmic pattern of the DECANTATUR tenor. This alteration of the established tenor rhythm in perfections 59–63 tellingly caused the scribe some difficulties, and he mistakenly omitted three notes of the tenor chant quotation (supplied in square brackets in Example 2). This change in the tenor pattern produces, in perfection 61, a rare simultaneous break in both voices (the first since perfection 20) just before the refrain commences. In addition to drawing attention to the refrain, the rhythmic manipulation of the tenor chant, in combination with an abnormal moment of dissonance between upper voice and tenor in perfection 65 (marked by a dashed box in Example 2), strongly indicates that vdB 623 must constitute a musical quotation in *Un chant renvoisie*.

Textually, the refrain's poetic material seems a fitting quotational choice for the motet context. The apostrophe “dous cuers” could have been a subtle reference to the location of Elizabeth's heart as a relic at Cambrai, the place specifically mentioned in the motet text and from which its tenor chant originated. Moreover, the refrain's plea to be spared from pain and death seems appropriate for a motet in praise of a saint whose physical suffering, though willing and in the service of God, was nonetheless extreme and who eventually gave her life to caring for the sick. As Brigitte Cazelles observed, the “ideology of suffering” is fundamental both to narratives of vernacular hagiographies (particularly of female saints) and secular romances, for which the common experience of love—human and divine—“seems inevitably grounded in pain.”⁵¹

QUOTATIONAL CONTEXTS FOR A CLOSING REFRAIN

The probability that the closing refrain of this hagiographical Elizabeth motet would have been recognized as such—as a borrowed snatch of song, sounding in combination with the end of the borrowed DECANTATUR plainchant—is corroborated by the circulation of its text and melody in the context of another, much more widely transmitted two-voice motet, *Douce dame sanz pitie/SUSTINERE* (see Example 3).⁵² Unlike *Un chant renvoisie*, uniquely recorded in the apparently periph-

⁵¹ See Cazelles, *The Lady as Saint*, 75.

⁵² Example 3 offers a transcription of the motet as recorded in Wolfenbüttel 1099, where perfections 13–30 of the upper voice are erroneously copied a tone too high (corrected in Example 3). The indi-

eral manuscript Arsenal 3517–3518, *Douce dame sanz pitie* appears in two of the largest Parisian motet collections of the thirteenth century—Wolfenbüttel, Herzog August Bibliothek, MS Guelf. 1099 Helmst., and Montpellier, Bibliothèque inter-universitaire, Section de médecine, MS H. 196—as well as in the Noailles and Roi chansonniers.⁵³ Not only did the latter motet evidently circulate more widely, then, but it is also found in earlier and more mainstream polyphonic manuscript contexts, exhibiting a very stable musical and textual transmission across its various appearances.⁵⁴

The possibility that the creator of *Un chant renvoisie* was familiar with *Douce dame sanz pitie*, so well represented in extant manuscript sources, is strengthened by several further similarities between the two motets, in addition to their shared refrain. *Douce dame* is on the Marian tenor SUSTINERE (also associated with the alternative text PORTARE), and it exploits the same trope of devotion addressed to a beloved lady: a male narrator here complains of his unrequited love, once again referring explicitly to the song he is singing.⁵⁵ Musically, the rhythmic treatment of the SUSTINERE tenor also recalls that of DECANTATUR in *Un chant renvoisie*, in that both motets unusually vary the rhythmic patterns in which their repeated plainchant melodies are presented. Although the phase of melodic and rhythmic tenor repetitions can shift to produce variety in motets, alterations to the profile of the tenor's rhythmic pattern itself are much less common.⁵⁶ *Douce dame sanz pitie* plays not only with its underlying tenor pattern but also, and more unusually, with the tenor's rhythmic mode. Each of the three statements of the SUSTINERE quotation corresponds to a different rhythmicization in a different mode (as shown by the layout of Example 3), enacting a gradual acceleration from groups of fifth-mode ternary

cation of B flats is sporadic (as it is also in the versions of the motet in the Noailles and Roi chansonniers): these sources never notate flats in the tenor here, but Wolfenbüttel 1099 provides a B flat signature only from perfection 31 onwards of the upper voice. The question of accidentals does not arise in the versions of the motet in Montpellier H. 196 and in the Saint Victor manuscript (Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS lat. 15139), which are copied a fifth higher, beginning their tenor chant on C, the more typical pitch level for the SUSTINERE melody. It may be significant that the transposed version of the motet in the Wolfenbüttel, Noailles, and Roi manuscripts facilitates the presentation of vdB 623 at the same pitch as in *Un chant renvoisie*.

⁵³ For full details of the transmission of *Douce damelsustinere*, see the entry no. 272 in Friedrich Gennrich, *Bibliographie der ältesten französischen und lateinischen Motetten*, Summa Musicae Medii Aevi 2 (Frankfurt, 1957). Its music is additionally reworked as an untexted clausula in Saint Victor, with *Douce dame sanz pitie* cued only as a marginal incipit.

⁵⁴ Poetically, the appearance of the refrain in *Douce dame sanz pitie* differs from that in *Un chant renvoisie* only in its use of the plural “maus” (pains) rather than singular “mal.” Musically, the various versions of *Douce dame sanz pitie* themselves vary slightly in their decorations and figurations, but without obscuring the refrain's basic melodic contour and identity. Everist and Ibos-Augé posit an additional text-only concordance for refrain 623 (in *Le livre d'amorettes*, Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS lat. 13091) that I consider doubtful.

⁵⁵ On the interchangeability of the texts SUSTINERE and PORTARE for this tenor melody, see Dolores Pesce, “Beyond Glossing: The Old Made New in *Mout me fu grief/Robin m'aime/Portare*,” in Pesce, *Hearing the Motet*, 28–51, esp. 38–41. See the translation of *Douce dame sanz pitie* in Relihan and Stakel, *Texts and Translations*, 68.

⁵⁶ See Tischler, *The Style and Evolution of the Earliest Motets*, 1:148. Tischler notes that changes in tenor pattern are most common in two-voice French motets, but even here, they occur only in around one in four cases.

1. Dou - ce - da - me - sanz pi - tie 2. cui j'ai mon cuer. ot - roi - e 3. ne l'a - vez pas des deg - nie. 4. fors por - ce qi - s'a - mi - li - e 5. dou tout a vos - tre - cou - ment. 6. Au - tre - don ne vos de - mant - 7. por ce - que vos -

SUS - TI - NE -

ai ser - vi - e 8. de mon - chant, 9. fors que mes cuers ait con - gie - 10. qi soit de vos - tre mes - ni - e 11. qar sanz ce ne -

vi - vrai mi - e 12. Douz cuers a - le - gez mes maus 13. q'il ne m'o - ci - ent.

RE

Example 3. *Douce dame sanz pitie/sustinere*, Wolfenbüttel, Herzog August Bibliothek, MS Guelf. 1099 Helmst., fols. 228v-229r

longs, to the longs and breves of mode two, and finally to the successive breves of mode six. This tenor acceleration, moving through three different rhythmic modes, is surely the motet's most distinctive compositional feature, for which only one comparable example exists in the entire thirteenth-century corpus.⁵⁷ It is rendered especially striking by the concluding tenor statement in the fast-moving sixth rhythmic mode, so rarely employed in a tenor voice.⁵⁸ This unusually rapid tenor accompanies the motet's terminal refrain in a near note-for-note combination that is remarkably virtuosic, since both of the melodies involved—SUSTINERE and refrain 623—seem to be genuine quotations. Wolf Frobenius noted in a brief evaluation of this motet that its closing refrain has an unusual propensity to parallel octaves with the tenor (marked by dashed lines in Example 3).⁵⁹ The voices additionally move in uncharacteristic and dissonant parallel seconds at the end of perfection 46 (marked by a dashed box in Example 3), confirming that two preexistent melodies, tenor chant and refrain, are being combined and quoted simultaneously here.

Since vdB 623 was apparently quoted in *Douce dame sanz pitie* as well as in *Un chant renvoisie*, this indicates a larger circulation for the refrain than extant written sources currently attest (see Figure 1). Even though it seems that vdB 623 did not originate in *Douce dame sanz pitie*, it remains likely that the creator of *Un chant renvoisie* knew the refrain in the context of this frequently copied motet and that his rhythmic treatment of the DECANTATUR tenor could have been inspired by the more spectacular arrangement of SUSTINERE in *Douce dame sanz pitie*. Whatever its origins, in vernacular monophony or in polyphony, the refrain shared by these motets must have been a well-known musico-textual unit, widely disseminated in writing since at least the mid-thirteenth century. Those encountering the Elizabeth motet *Un chant renvoisie*—whether or not they were alert to highly specific connections with the Marian motet *Douce dame*—could, therefore, have recognized the refrain text and melody at its conclusion, realizing that the close of this song about song on the preexisting DECANTATUR tenor, with of all its musical connotations, was marked by another sung quotation.

In addition to playing with ideas of song at multiple levels—through quotation, explicit textual reference, musical depiction, and formal disruptions that signal songs-within-songs—*Un chant renvoisie* demonstrates a similar complexity with regard to voice. The tenor quotation DECANTATUR arguably evokes Elizabeth's own voice, since it describes and depicts a melody sung by the saint herself. Simultaneously, the upper voice begins with what might be safely assumed to be the male first-person protagonist typical of vernacular motets, a singer adding his song to sing about Elizabeth. After this self-contained song, the voice shifts to become that of an incontrovertibly masculine lover in a more conventional love song whose object is a noble lady (whether an earthly one or an allegory for the heavenly Eliza-

⁵⁷ This is *Amours qui tant m'a greve/Des confortes ai este longuement/ET SUPER* (Gennrich, *Bibliographie*, nos. 544–46a), whose tenor employs fifth, first, and sixth modes. See the overview of tenor patterns offered by Tischler in *The Style and Evolution of the Earliest Motets*, 1:132–42.

⁵⁸ Only 13 motets out of a sample of over 350 pieces feature tenors that are entirely or partially in the sixth rhythmic mode. See Tischler, *The Style and Evolution of the Earliest Motet*, 1:119–31.

⁵⁹ See Wolf Frobenius, "Zum genetischen Verhältnis zwischen Notre-Dame-Klauseln und ihren Motetten," *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 44/1 (1987): 1–39, at 16. Frobenius refers to *Douce dame sanz pitie* as SV 35.

beth remains ambiguous, perhaps deliberately). Finally, this vernacular text closes with a third shift in voice marked by the quotation of a well-known refrain, which could be read as the culminating expression of a male lover but might also—given the refrain’s personal plea to be spared pain, and like its accompanying tenor quotation—invoke the voice and expression of Elizabeth herself.

A HIDDEN DECANTATUR MOTET: *AMIS, VOSTRE DEMOREE*

I have argued that the unusual choice of the DECANTATUR plainchant as a polyphonic motet tenor was motivated by the exceptional circumstances of the hagiographical motet *Un chant renvoisie*. This tenor, however, unexpectedly reappears in one other motet context, in conjunction with the upper voice *Amis, vostre demoree*, which lacks any explicit reference to Saint Elizabeth. The use of DECANTATUR here is perplexing, and it has not yet been properly acknowledged or investigated, since the chant melody is wrongly labeled as PRO PATRIBUS in the only surviving copy of *Amis, vostre demoree* recorded in the Montpellier codex (see Example 4). Melodically, its tenor is identical to that in *Un chant renvoisie* in Arsenal 3517–3518.⁶⁰ That the Montpellier H. 196 scribe misidentified it is understandable: PRO PATRIBUS is a very common motet tenor, in the same F tonality, which shares its opening three pitches (F–A–C) with DECANTATUR. Evidently, this Parisian scribe did not know the unexpected Cambrai chant, and he supplied or corrected the tenor text as PRO PATRIBUS either in error (after a cursory glance at the melodic incipit) or owing to the lack of any convincing alternative identification.

This scribe’s unfamiliarity with the DECANTATUR melody is revealing and is further confirmation of the tenor’s status as unusual. But the creator of *Amis, vostre demoree* was undeniably aware of the connotations of this atypical chant melody associated with Saint Elizabeth when he selected it as the basis of his motet. A shared musical incipit, which has previously escaped scholarly notice, confirms that the composer of *Amis, vostre demoree* knew the hagiographical motet on the same tenor. The upper voice of *Amis, vostre demoree* is in the first, rather than the second, rhythmic mode, but its opening phrase nonetheless clearly invokes the beginning of *Un chant renvoisie* (see Example 5). Although the decoration of pitches differs slightly between the two motets, the melodic outline is incontrovertibly the same. And since this melody appears in conjunction also with the same chant tenor—similarly arranged in groups of three pitches—the harmonic relationship between upper voice and tenor is identical in both contexts (save at the beginning of perfection 3, marked by a box in Example 5). This consistency in melodic and harmonic details, in addition to the fact that the quotation very obviously occurs in the same place, at the opening of both pieces, renders it particularly audible. And the correspondence does not end there. As noted above, the opening phrase of the upper voice returns in *Un chant renvoisie* (creating its initial *aba* form) in conjunction with the repetition of the tenor melody. Remarkably, this is also the case in *Amis, vostre demoree*, where—although its first two pitches are altered (marked by a dashed box

⁶⁰ The tenor of *Amis, vostre demoree* matches exactly the extended version of the DECANTATUR plainchant in *Un chant renvoisie*, discussed in n. 44 above.

1. A - mis, vos - tre - de - mo - re - e 2. me fait d'a-mours a - ce - le - e 3. sen - tir les do-lours, 4. car vos-tres est toz 5. mes cuers s'il tant voz - a - gre - e, 6. et ser - ra - tous jors, 7. Ne ja se ce n'est - par voz

PRO PATRIBUS

8. n'en voel es - tre - de - se - vre - e, 9. puis-qua vos me sui - do-nee. 10. Et biaux cuers douz, 11. quant plus me har et des - traint li - ja - lous, 12. tant ai ge m'ice en a mor ma pen se - e.

Open Closed

ad lib

Example 4. *Amis, vostre demoree/pro PATRIBUS [sic]*, Montpellier H. 196, fol. 249r

The image displays two pages of musical notation for two-voice motets. The left page is for 'Amis, vostre demoree' and the right page is for 'Un chant renvoisie'. Each page features two staves: a soprano staff and a tenor staff. The left page has two systems of music. The first system shows the beginning of the motet with the lyrics '1. A - mis, vos - tre de - mo - re - e'. The second system, marked with a double bar line and a repeat sign, shows a later part of the motet with the lyrics '8. n'en voel es - tre de - se - vre - e,'. The right page also has two systems. The first system shows the beginning with the lyrics '1. Un chant ren - voi - sie et bel'. The second system, also marked with a double bar line and a repeat sign, shows a later part with the lyrics '7. c'a Cam - brai fait de nou - vel'. Both pages include a section labeled 'DECANTATUR' in the tenor staff. The notation includes various musical symbols such as clefs, notes, rests, and bar lines.

Example 5. Comparison of Upper-Voice Openings in *Amis, vostre demoree* and *Un chant renvoisie*

in Example 5)—the motet’s initial upper-voice phrase is reprised along with the DECANTATUR melody in the tenor.⁶¹

In considering the direction of influence between these two motets, I have argued that the uncharacteristic selection of DECANTATUR as a tenor in the motet repertoire must have been instigated by *Un chant renvoisie*. This hagiographical motet is also, therefore, the logical progenitor in terms of the musical incipit shared by *Amis, vostre demoree* (see Figure 1), a hypothesis confirmed by considering the quoted opening melody, and its repetition along with that of the tenor chant, in context (see Example 4). In *Amis, vostre demoree*, these phrases are much more florid than the rest of the upper voice, which otherwise only rarely subdivides long notes. The beginning of the motet and of its second statement of the tenor chant also has a different and richer harmonic character that is aurally very noticeable. The quoted incipits employ consistent contrary motion between voices exploiting a variety of intervallic combinations between upper voice and tenor, which elsewhere in *Amis, vostre demoree* are confined principally to octaves and fifths.

THE GENDERED AND GEOGRAPHICAL RESONANCES OF A CLOSING REFRAIN

It is certain, then, that the composer of *Amis, vostre demoree* knew *Un chant renvoisie*, adopting the unusual plainchant tenor of this hagiographical motet as well as parts of its upper voice. Although the accompanying text in *Amis, vostre demoree* makes no specific reference to Saint Elizabeth, several of its characteristics now emerge as significant in this context. *Amis, vostre demoree* is one of just twenty out of over three hundred motets in Montpellier H. 196 that is in the female voice (see Table 3).⁶² The gender of the complaining *je*—once again bemoaning the

⁶¹ The only further variant in this upper-voice repetition is the omission in perfection 28 of the A passing tone previously heard in perfection 3 of *Amis, vostre demoree*, thereby matching the version of this phrase found in *Un chant renvoisie* more exactly.

⁶² See Anna Kathryn Grau, “Representation and Resistance: Female Vocality in Thirteenth-Century France” (PhD diss., University of Pennsylvania, 2010), 184. The text and translation in Table 3 is reproduced from Doss-Quinby et al., *Songs of the Women Trouvères*, 202.

TABLE 3
Text and Translation of *Amis, vostre demoree*

1. Amis, vostre demoree	8a	-ee	Beloved, your absence
2. me fait d'amours a celee	8a	-ee	makes me feel the pains
3. sentir les dolours,	5b	-ours	of secret love,
4. car vostres est toz	5b	-oz	for my heart is yours
5. mes cuers, s'il tant voz agree,	8a	-ee	entirely, if it should please you,
6. et sera tous jors.	5b	-ors	and always will be.
7. Ne ja se ce n'est par voz	7b	-oz	And never unless it is by you
8. n'en voel estre desevree,	8a	-ee	do I wish to be parted from it,
9. puis qu'a vos me sui donee.	7a	-ee	since I have given myself to you.
10. Et biax cuers douz,	4b	-ouz	And fair sweet heart,
11. <i>quant plus me bat et destraint</i> <i>li jalous</i>	10b	-ous	<i>the more the jealous one beats</i> <i>and oppresses me</i>
12. <i>tant ai ge miex en amor</i> <i>ma pensee.</i>	11a	-ee	<i>all the more do I have love in</i> <i>my thoughts.</i>

pain of love—only becomes apparent at the very end of the motet when the singer's jealous lover is revealed as masculine ("li jalous"). This male lover is addressed directly in the motet's terminal refrain, "*Quant plus me bat et destraint li jalous/tant ai ge miex en amor ma pensee*" (the more the jealous one beats and oppresses me/all the more do I have love in my thoughts, vdB 1555). Up until this point, this upper voice could safely have been assumed to be that of a typical masculine love song that was probably composed and performed by men. The final revelation, that it has in fact been the expression of a woman, is not merely an allusion to its tenor quotation but profoundly reflects the agency inherent in the DECANTATUR tenor as depicting and reenacting a miraculous melody sung by Elizabeth herself.

The figure of a *mal mariée* complaining about a husband or lover is an admittedly common trope in female-voiced motets, but it has a particular resonance in association with the DECANTATUR tenor. As was well known, Elizabeth had sworn obedience to her spiritual guardian, Master Conrad, by whom she was encouraged in vows of poverty and chastity and in self-flagellation. In the Cambrai Office *Gaudeat Hungaria* from which the DECANTATUR tenor is drawn, Conrad's relationship to the saint is the topic of the second responsory (*Sub Conrado, Dei viro*), which describes Elizabeth's fear of her master and the abstinence he enforced.⁶³ References specifically to beatings encouraged or sanctioned by Conrad are also found in many accounts of Elizabeth's life. The *Dicta quatuor ancillarum* records occasions on which Elizabeth asked to be beaten as well as a specific instance when Master Conrad ordered that she be whipped for disobedience.⁶⁴ Rutebeuf's *Vie* also emphasizes Conrad's influence over Elizabeth and her resulting desire to "chastise her flesh."⁶⁵ The very widely disseminated *Legenda aurea*—a late thirteenth-century collection of hagiographies by Jacobus de Voragine—underlined the sever-

⁶³ See Haggh, *Two Offices for Saint Elizabeth*, 9.

⁶⁴ See Wolf's translation in *The Life and Afterlife*, 198 and 212.

⁶⁵ See Cazelles's translation in *The Lady as Saint*, 158, lines 700–12.

ity of the lashes inflicted on Elizabeth by Conrad, marks of which were reportedly still visible after three weeks had passed.⁶⁶ Iconographically, this aspect of Elizabeth's devotion was characteristic also: a psalter (Paris, Bibliothèque Sainte-Geneviève, MS 2689) considered by Stones to record "one of the earliest manifestations in France of the cult of Saint Elizabeth of Hungary" contains a full-page miniature of the saint being flagellated.⁶⁷ It is most unlikely, therefore, that the subject of the atypically female-voiced refrain concluding the DECANTATUR motet *Amis, vostre demoree* is a coincidence. The refrain's moral, moreover—that the more one is beaten the more one loves—operates powerfully in this allegorical context. While its beatings are physical and worldly, its loving is abstract in thought, and these circumstances pertain directly to Saint Elizabeth, whose bodily mortifications served the purpose of bringing her closer to God in prayer and soul.

The closing motto "*Quant plus me bat*" is drawn to a listener's attention in the motet *Amis, vostre demoree* by its clearly defined musical character as a refrain. Conventionally, a complementary pair of musical phrases accompanies the refrain's poetic couplet. Beginning identically, each phrase leads to a different cadence, the first ending on a tonally open sonority, which is effectively closed by the second (see Example 4). This balanced, songlike repetition in itself enhances the refrain's status as a self-consciously "sung" musical unit, and there are contextual indications that the refrain additionally constitutes a genuine melodic quotation. The two stressed dissonant seconds between upper voice and tenor in perfections 38 and 43 contrast with the harmonic grammar of the motet as a whole, as does the seventh created between the two voices at the end of perfection 36 (marked by dashed boxes in Example 4).

This is confirmed by external evidence: "*Quant plus me bat*" circulated widely as a musico-textual unit independently of the motet *Amis, vostre demoree*, attested in several contexts that predate Elizabeth's death (see Figure 1).⁶⁸ The refrain most probably originated in a monophonic chanson by Monois d'Arras, a monk turned trouvère who was active in Artois and in the courts of northern France in the first half of the thirteenth century. "*Quant plus me bat*" concludes every one of the six stanzas of his song *Amours me fait renvoisier et chanter*, a chanson consistently attributed to him in all three of its surviving manuscript sources.⁶⁹ Monois' song is an unambiguous *chanson de femme* from the outset, a poetic conceit in which male trouvères occasionally indulged.⁷⁰ The text of its entire first stanza appears also in the context of the romance *Roman de la violette* (dated to the late 1220s), and

⁶⁶ See Jacobus de Voragine, *The Golden Legend: Readings on the Saints*, trans. William Granger Ryan, 2 vols. (Princeton, 1993), 2:302–18, no. 168.

⁶⁷ Alison Stones, "Notes on the Artistic Context of Some Gautier de Coinci Manuscripts," in Krause and Stones, *Gautier de Coinci: Miracles, Music and Manuscripts*, 88 n. 33. See also 86.

⁶⁸ Everist offers a brief overview of the transmission and a comparative transcription of this refrain in "The Thirteenth Century," 82–83.

⁶⁹ Monois's song is recorded with music in the *Chansonniere du Roi*, fol. 118v. Its text only is preserved in Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS fr. 12615, fol. 118r, and in Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, MS Reg. lat. 1490, 44(48)r.

⁷⁰ On *chansons des femmes* by male trouvères, see Wendy Pfeffer, "Complaints of Women and Complaints by Women: Can One Tell Them Apart?," in *The Court Reconvenes: International Courtly Literary Society* 1998, ed. Barbara K. Altmann and Carlton W. Carroll (Cambridge, UK, 2003), 125–32.

the refrain text is quoted within a mid-thirteenth-century Latin commentary by Gérard de Liège on illicit and Godly love, where it serves as a vernacular gloss to illustrate “amor fortis.”⁷¹

The authorial association of this refrain with Monois d’Arras is geographically significant, constituting yet another link to the northern French region in which the DECANTATUR plainchant and the hagiographical motet *Un chant renvoisie* seem to have been conceived and disseminated. It is tempting to make a further connection between the first line of Monois’ song, *Amours me fait renvoisier et chanter*, and the incipit of the hagiographical motet *Un chant renvoisie*, quoted musically in *Amis, vostre demoree*. Although employing conventional vocabulary, this lexical similarity between a host chanson and a motet model could have further encouraged the choice of Monois’ refrain in *Amis, vostre demoree*. In any case, such traces of a northern French heritage for all three quoted components of the motet—plainchant, motet model, and refrain—underline a tradition of polyphonic composition outside of the Parisian contexts with which polyphony is more usually associated.

Carol Symes and Saltzstein have recently explored the sophisticated intellectual and cultural milieu in the city of Arras, where highly educated cleric-trouvères such as Adam de la Halle turned to polyphonic composition in the later thirteenth century.⁷² These northern French musicians were often educated in Paris and well acquainted with the city’s musical practices: the motet *Un chant renvoisie*, though itself unrecorded in manuscripts of the “central” Parisian repertoire, nonetheless quoted a refrain that circulated in precisely such contexts. Conversely, several other identifiably northern French compositions made their way into Parisian compilations. Like *Amis, vostre demoree*, Adam’s Arrageois motets are recorded in Montpellier H. 196. Montpellier H. 196 also contains the curious and unique motet *A Cambrai avint l’autrier*—the only other thirteenth-century motet, along with *Un chant renvoisie*, to mention this city by name—whose tenor is designated SOIER.⁷³ Surely a local joke, this short and rather bawdy piece describes the actions of Sohiers the cooper, who left Cambrai to become mixed up with the Beguines at nearby Campître. Thomas Walker has identified the SOIER tenor with a plainchant melody from a popular and conventional source of motet tenors, which raises the question as to why it is so oddly labeled, not with the “correct” liturgical text, but with a corruption of the name of the motet’s protagonist.⁷⁴ This seems to indicate a different

⁷¹ For editions of these texts see Gerbert de Montreuil, *Le Roman de la violette ou de Gerart de Nevers*, ed. Douglas Labree Buffum, Société des Anciens Textes Français (Paris, 1928); and Gérard de Liège, *Quinque incitamenta ad Deum amandum ardentem*, ed. André Wilmart, *Analecta Reginensia*, Studi e Testi 59 (Vatican City, 1933), 205–47.

⁷² See Carol Symes, *A Common Stage: Theater and Public Life in Medieval Arras* (Ithaca, 2007); and Saltzstein, *The Refrain and the Rise of the Vernacular*, 80–113 (on song culture in Arras) and 114–48 (on Adam de la Halle).

⁷³ *A Cambrai/SOIER* is recorded in an appendix of four motets (two Latin, two French) at the end of fascicle 3 of Montpellier H. 196 (fols. 83v–86v). A tradition of referring to specific locales is also evident in several Parisian motets, most notably *On parole de batre/A Paris soir et matin/FRESE NOUVELLE*. See the discussion of this motet in Dillon, *The Sense of Sound*, 86–90.

⁷⁴ See Thomas Walker, “Sui Tenor Francesi nei motetti del ’200,” *Schede medievali: Rassegna dell’officina di studi medievali* 3 (1982): 309–36, at 322–24. The plainchant melody is drawn from the well-known Gradual *Propter veritatem*.

approach to the texting of plainchant tenor quotations in compositions from the north of Paris, perhaps a lack of concern for plainchant labels, which may also explain why the DECANTATUR tenor in *Amis, vostre demoree* was open to misidentification. Within this northern French context, the emphasis on the woman's heart given to her beloved in *Amis, vostre demoree* is more likely to have been read allegorically: as Saint Elizabeth—whose voice is summoned in the closing vernacular refrain and in its accompanying tenor—literally offering her heart for the veneration of the people of Cambrai.

CONCLUSIONS

Thirteenth-century motets on the plainchant tenor DECANTATUR invite interpretation, since the quotation of this melody from a short-lived Cambrai Office for Saint Elizabeth of Hungary was an unconventional choice of semantic significance. In the hagiographical motet *Un chant renvoisie*, not only are the symbolic associations of the DECANTATUR tenor with Elizabeth and Cambrai made explicit in the vernacular upper-voice text, but—as a musical and poetic whole—the motet plays also on ideas of song, singing, and voice in ways that evoke the saint's vita and persona. The only other motet to use the DECANTATUR tenor, *Amis, vostre demoree*, has never previously been considered in the liturgical context of its plainchant quotation or in relation to *Un chant renvoisie*. Although *Amis, vostre demoree* does not name Elizabeth, it opens with a direct musical reference to the beginning of the hagiographical motet *Un chant renvoisie* and closes with a female-voiced refrain quotation from a song by Monois d'Arras, which powerfully encapsulates a defining aspect of the saint's identity, as a woman subjected to masculine violence. In tracing the provenance of plainchant sources for the DECANTATUR tenor, investigating refrain concordances and their host contexts, reading motets against their broader manuscript contents, and with reference to contemporary accounts of Elizabeth's life, this article has established concrete quotational and semantic connections, positing a new intertextual network of musical compositions.

Such a detailed frame of cultural reference has facilitated the reconstruction of musical and textual cross-references that are often otherwise obscured, in some cases irrevocably, by the passing of time and the loss or lack of written sources. No other plainchant tenor in the thirteenth century can be so neatly connected to a particular time and place as DECANTATUR. The responsory *Ante dies exitus* must post-date Elizabeth's canonization in 1235, and the excerption of the DECANTATUR tenor clearly occurred before its host Office (*Gaudeat Hungaria*) was largely supplanted by the more popular Elizabeth Office (*Letare Germania*) in the later thirteenth century. Geographically, the connection of this chant to Cambrai and its surrounding regions depends not on the problematic identification of any Parisian or "peripheral" musical style but rather on documentary evidence from Henry of Brussels and on the dissemination of *Un chant renvoisie* and its explicit reference to Cambrai. The quotation of a well-known refrain by an Arrageois trouvère in *Amis, vostre demoree* is additionally significant, and the copy of this motet in Montpellier H. 196 also proves that the DECANTATUR tenor was not immediately recognizable to one Parisian scribe. Despite multidirectional musical exchanges between Paris

and northern France, then, the DECANTATUR tenor evidently remained a local phenomenon. Its unusual specificity—geographical and chronological—usefully enables interpretive parameters to be drawn with uncharacteristic precision.

This intimate knowledge of the DECANTATUR tenor additionally allows us to glimpse contexts and practices for this melody that can no longer be accessed. It is almost unprecedented that the two motets quoting the DECANTATUR melody in fact constitute the earliest witnesses to their plainchant source. Records of these motets predate by around two decades the first surviving manuscript of the Office *Gaudeat Hungaria*, which must previously have circulated orally and perhaps in documents now lost. The refrain that concludes *Un chant renvoisie* (vdB 623) presents a similar case. It is apparently quoted in both of its extant instantiations, and tantalizingly this invites speculation about the refrain's unknown origins and their possible semantic significance in the context of the hagiographical DECANTATUR motet. Was this refrain also, for instance, associated with a woman's voice or with a "local" northern French trouvère? Might an original lost host chanson or motet have chimed with any details of Elizabeth's life? Even in a network such as this one—where the surviving evidence seems unusually propitious and complete—there exists the potential for yet further intertextual subtleties that remain beyond the possibilities of current knowledge.

The musical evocations of Saint Elizabeth of Hungary analyzed here advocate for the repertoire of straightforwardly audible, seemingly simple, two-voice motets as an important locus for sophisticated and complex layers of meaning and quotation. In a motet for two voices, two different types of song—a liturgical plainchant and a vernacular refrain—may clearly be heard and quoted at the same time, exploiting the potential of individual melodies and texts to recall almost instantly all manner of varied contexts and instantiations. Such quotations can additionally draw attention to the act of singing within a motet, which may also self-consciously evoke and play with ideas of song through self-referential texts or through particular repetitive, formal, and melodic procedures. A two-voice motet is therefore polyphonic, not just in its combination of individual voices but also in its ability to conjure, through sound, additional and external musical and poetic contexts, genres, and performative acts. In essence, this is a form of polytextuality or polyvocality, but one that is rarely discussed, owing to scholarly preferences for interpreting motets in three or four voices. That polyvocal semantic play resides in two-voice motets, whose intelligibility is not in question, constitutes substantial evidence in favor of interpretative readings of three- and four-voice polytextual motets, whatever their aural impact: if subtle allusions and cross-references can be convincingly demonstrated in two-voice works, then it is logical to conclude that such techniques were applied also in motets combining up to three different syllabic texts, which afforded even greater scope for multilayered meanings.

A complex intersection of lay and clerical cultures characterizes both the figure of Elizabeth of Hungary and the two-voice motets of which she is the focus. Elizabeth is a saint and a lay woman; at once the object of formal liturgical devotion as well as the subject of vernacular vitae in the mode of literary romance. Vernacular motets on the Elizabeth tenor DECANTATUR similarly exploit—through quotation and allusion—the symbolic potential of both Latin liturgical plainchant and worldly

French-texted love songs. Yet the individual symbolism of sacred and secular components is amplified in two-voice motets through their simultaneous and intelligible combination in sound. The result, in a pair of thirteenth-century two-voice motets about Elizabeth of Hungary, is vivid and distinctively musical hagiography of a saint for whom song itself had particular significance.

Catherine A. Bradley is Associate Professor at the University of Oslo (e-mail: catherine.bradley@imv.uio.no)